

This electronic thesis or dissertation has been downloaded from the King's Research Portal at <https://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/portal/>



The Frankish church and women from the late eighth to the early tenth century : representation and reality.

Hodgson, Andrea Mary Elisabeth

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author and no quotation from it or information derived from it may be published without proper acknowledgement.

END USER LICENCE AGREEMENT



Unless another licence is stated on the immediately following page this work is licensed

under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International

licence. <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

You are free to copy, distribute and transmit the work

Under the following conditions:

- Attribution: You must attribute the work in the manner specified by the author (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
- Non Commercial: You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
- No Derivative Works - You may not alter, transform, or build upon this work.

Any of these conditions can be waived if you receive permission from the author. Your fair dealings and other rights are in no way affected by the above.

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact librarypure@kcl.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

THE FRANKISH CHURCH AND WOMEN FROM THE LATE EIGHTH TO THE
EARLY TENTH CENTURY: REPRESENTATION AND REALITY

Andrea Mary Elisabeth Hodgson
King 's College, London

A dissertation
submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in the University of London

August 1992.



ABSTRACT.

THE FRANKISH CHURCH AND WOMEN FROM THE LATE EIGHTH TO THE
EARLY TENTH CENTURY: REPRESENTATION AND REALITY.

An introductory chapter explains the aims of the thesis and why certain sources have been used. In chapter one the sources are described and their interpretative problems outlined.

The thesis is in two sections. The first deals with women in the religious life and has three chapters, chapters two to four. Chapter two examines legislative statements of Church reform covering four main areas - the differences between nuns, canonesses and religious women living in the world; the question of access to and from the community by inmates and outsiders; the role of the abbess; and the women and their life inside the religious communities. Chapter three looks at hagiography and the predominating images of female sanctity, explaining these through an analysis of the authorship, date and provenance of the sources. The hagiographical images of monastic life are compared with the legislative statements already examined. Chapter four deals with women and the liturgy, analysing ordination and consecration rites for abbesses, virgins, widows and deaconesses.

The second section, chapters five to seven, considers women in the secular life. Chapter five looks at women and marriage practices, comparing the Church's reforming attitudes on legitimate marriages and divorce as evidenced in the prescriptive sources with fragmentary evidence of actual practice; also who essentially controlled marriage is examined. Chapter six looks at the ritual of marriage, analysing the liturgical provision. This is then set alongside an examination of attitudes concerning the theology of marriage and the perceived obligations of wives in the treatises on marriage, penitentials, episcopal statutes and hagiography. Chapter seven examines attitudes to women as child-bearers and child-carers in three main areas: female fertility and childbirth; women practising child destruction; and finally nurturing,

biological and spiritual, by mothers and other women including godmothers. Comparison of liturgical provision and prescriptive evidence is also made with maternal images in the hagiography.

A concluding chapter draws together the foregoing and considers how the concept of gender might be applied to taboos about women. Hence chapter eight deals with the Frankish Church's treatment of women as threatening impurity to the priest, the sanctuary and the sacraments.

TABLE OF CONTENTS.

Preface

List of Abbreviations

Introduction	16-31
Chapter 1. <u>THE SOURCES</u>	32-82
Chapter 2. <u>WOMEN IN THE RELIGIOUS LIFE: THE EFFECTS OF THE REFORMS.</u>	83-144
I. Forms of Religious Observance	
[1] Nuns and Canonesses	83-98
[2] Smaller Communities and Individual Women Religious	98-104
II. The Religious Life in Practice	
[1] The Cloistering of Women Religious	104-114
[2] The Abbess:	
{i} The Abbess Outside the Convent	114-121
{ii} The Abbess Inside the Convent	121-128
[3] Women Religious:	
{i} Social Composition	129-131
{ii} Responsibilities of the Religious Life	131-144
Chapter 3. <u>IMAGES OF WOMEN IN HAGIOGRAPHICAL TEXTS: SAINTLY WOMEN, MONASTIC WOMEN.</u>	145-196
I. Genre: Writers and Recipients	145-159
II. Dominant Images in the Texts	
[1] The Abbess	159-165
[2] Nobility	165-170
[3] The Intercessor	170-174
[4] Passive and Independent	175-179
[5] <u>Magistra</u>	179-182

	[6] Virgin/ <u>Sponsa Dei</u>	182-184
	[7] Maternal and Domestic Images	184-191
	[8] Women Saints as Images for Women	191-196
Chapter 4.	<u>THE LITURGICAL PROVISION FOR WOMEN RELIGIOUS</u>	197-234
	I. Ordination Rites for Abbesses	197-213
	II. The Consecration of Virgins and Benediction of Widows	213-222
	[1] Virgins: Nuns and Canonesses	222-228
	[2] Widows	228-230
	III. Deaconesses	230-234
Chapter 5.	<u>WOMEN AND THE REGULATION OF MARRIAGE: THE CHURCH'S PERCEPTION OF WOMEN AS WIVES</u>	235-289
	I. Legitimate Marriages: Enquiry and Public Nuptials	237-242
	II. Women and the Control of Marriage	242-248
	III. Abduction	248-258
	IV. <u>Desponsatio</u> and <u>Dotatio</u>	258-260
	V. Wives and Concubines	260-265
	VI. Monogamy and the Dissolution of Marriage	265-277
	VII. Incest and Consanguinity	277-289
	VIII. Marriage as an Attractive Alternative to Monasticism?	288-289
Chapter 6.	<u>THE RITUAL AND SACRAMENT OF MARRIAGE</u>	290-331
	I. Women in Nuptial Liturgy	290-311
	II. Women and the Sacrament of Marriage	311-331

Chapter 7.	<u>CHILD-BEARERS, CHILD-CARERS: PERCEPTIONS OF "MATERNITAS".</u>	332-371
	I. Infertility and Childbirth	332-347
	II. Contraception, Abortion and Infanticide	348-360
	III. Perceptions of <u>Maternitas</u>	360-371
Chapter 8.	<u>CONCLUSIONS. RELIGIOUS AND SECULAR: WOMEN AS A GENDER.</u>	372-379
Table I		146
Table II		147
Bibliography		380-407

PREFACE.

First and foremost I should like to thank my supervisor Dr. Janet L. Nelson who has been consistently helpful and supportive throughout all the stages of this thesis. As a historian she has given me, in generous measure, all the benefit of her knowledge to guide me through the difficult terrains of both the ninth-century Frankish kingdoms and the theory (?) of women's history. As a friend she has also given me much advice and encouragement, giving me the confidence to complete the work.

I should also like to thank Dr. Patricia Morison who kindly shared with me her views on the Vita Maurae, and gave me some useful pointers on approaches to hagiography. My thanks are also due to Dr. Lyndal Roper who read my work on transvestism and whose helpful comments made me think more carefully about approaches to gender. On this last point I am also indebted to the Women's History Seminar at the Institute of Historical Research which greatly contributed to the development of my ideas about women's history. My thanks are also due to the Institute's New Ideas on the Early Middle Ages Seminar where I read several papers and benefitted from the group's rigorous criticism.

Two fellow students also working on the ninth century deserve mention: Elizabeth Lockwood pointed me in the right direction on matters concerning Lupus of Ferrières, and Elizabeth Ward often discussed with me her views on the Empress Judith which had implications for my own work. I should also like to thank Michelle McFarling and Virginia Bainbridge whose little think-tank on "big ideas" in the Middle Ages helped my own thoughts.

I owe much to those family and friends, especially Michelle, and Claire Dutton, who have expressed an interest in my work and its progress. My parents have also been a great source of support; my father's input on biblical women has been most appreciated. I also wish to thank my

husband's secretaries, Louise, Mandy and Anna, who have helped me with the machinations of word-processing software.

Finally, a principal debt of gratitude is owed to my husband, Ian Bramley. Throughout the years that this thesis has taken to complete he has unfailingly supported me with great love, patience and belief. His practical assistance, both with the thesis itself and taking care of all other matters freeing me to concentrate solely on the work in hand, has been invaluable. As this thesis would never have been written without his support, it is right that it has been written for him.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<u>AB</u>	<u>Annales Bertiniani</u> , G. Waitz, (ed.), <u>MGH</u> SRG, 5, (Hanover, 1883).
<u>Admonitio Synodalis</u>	"Une <u>Admonitio Synodalis</u> de l'époque carolingienne. Étude critique et édition.", R. Amiet, (ed.), in <u>Medieval Studies</u> , 26, 1964, pp.12- 82.
<u>AF</u>	<u>Annales Fuldenses</u> , F. Kurze, (ed.), <u>MGH</u> SRG, 7, (Hannover, 1891).
<u>Annales [E.S.C.]</u>	Annales. Économies. Sociétés. Civilisations, (Paris, 1946 ff).
<u>Anonymous of Freising</u>	<u>MS Clm. 6241</u> printed in "Studien zu Benedictus Levita, II, Capitula episcopi cuiusdam Frisingensia, E. Seckel (ed.), in <u>NA</u> , 29 (1904) pp.287-94.
<u>ASS</u>	Acta Sanctorum, Joannes Bollandus, (ed.), (Antwerp and elsewhere, 1643-1867).
BN	Bibliothèque Nationale
<u>Capitula Presbyterorum</u>	<u>MS Clm.3851</u> printed in "Die Münchener Hs 3851, 3852, mit einer compilation von 181 Wormser Schlüssen", V. Krause (ed.), in <u>NA</u> , 19, (1894), pp.117-18.
<u>CCM</u>	Cahiers de Civilisation Médiévale, (Poitiers, 1958 ff).
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina, (Turnhout 1953ff).

- Clm.6333 MS Clm.6333 printed in "Die Text der bayerischen Synodal Statuten von Reischach und Freising", P.A. Dold, (ed.), in DA, 8, (1950), pp.368-76.
- CNRS Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique et de l'Université de Paris.
- Codex Vat. reginae Codex Vat. reginae Christinae 425
Christinae 425 fol.103 fol.103 printed in "Reise nach im fol.103 Jahre 1901", A. Werminghoff, (ed.), in NA, 27, (1902), pp.588-89.
- DA Deutsches Archiv für Geschichte des Mittelalters, (Berlin, 1936ff).
- Deshusses I Le sacramentaire grégorien: ses principales formes d'après les plus anciens manuscrits, J. Deshusses, (ed.), I, Le sacramentaire, le supplément d'Aniane, [Spicilegium Friburgense, 16], (Fribourg, 1971).
- Deshusses II Le sacramentaire grégorien: ses principales formes d'après les plus anciens manuscrits, J. Deshusses, (ed.), II, Textes complémentaires pour la messe. [Spicilegium Friburgense, 24], (Fribourg, 1979).
- Ecclesiastical Reginonis libri duo de synodalibus
Discipline causis et disciplinis ecclesiasticis, F.G.A. Wasserschleben, (ed.), (Leipzig, 1840).
- EHR English Historical Review, (London, 1906 ff).

<u>Flodoard</u>	<u>Historia Remensis Ecclesiae</u> , <u>MGH</u> SS, 13, pp.409-599.
<u>FMS</u>	Frühmittelalterliche Studien, (Berlin 1967ff).
<u>IS</u>	<u>Institutio sanctimonialium Aquisgranensis</u> , <u>MGH</u> Conc. II i, pp.421-56.
<u>J.Eccles.Hist.</u>	Journal of Ecclesiastical History, (London, 1950 ff).
<u>J.Med.Hist.</u>	Journal of Medieval History, (Amsterdam, 1975 ff).
<u>Leofric</u>	<u>The Leofric Missal</u> , F.E. Warren, (ed.), (Oxford, 1883).
<u>MA</u>	Le Moyen Age, revue trimestrielle d'histoire et de philologie, (Paris, Bruxelles, 1928ff).
<u>Mansi</u>	Sacrorum Conciliorum Nova et Amplissima Collectio [31 vols.], J.-D. Mansi (ed.), (Florence, 1757-98).
<u>MGH</u>	Monumenta Germaniae Historica inde ab a. c.500 usque ad a.1500, (Hannover and elsewhere 1836ff).
<u>MGH Capit. I</u>	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Capitularia regum Francorum, I.
<u>MGH Capit. II</u>	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Capitularia regum Francorum, II.
<u>MGH Capit. Episc.</u>	Monumenta Germaniae Historica Capitula episcoporum.
<u>MGH Conc. I</u>	Monumenta Germaniae Historica,

Concilia aevi Merovingici.

MGH Conc. II

Monumenta Germaniae Historica,
Concilia aevi Karolini, 2 vols. and
supplement.

MGH Conc. III

Monumenta Germaniae Historica,
Concilia aevi Karolini, (843-859),
vol.3.

MGH Epp. Karol.

Monumenta Germaniae Historica,
Epistolae Karolini aevi.

MGH Libri Mem.

Monumenta Germaniae Historica Liber
Memorialis.

MGH SRG

Monumenta Germaniae Historica,
Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum
scholarum.

MGH SRM

Monumenta Germaniae Historica,
Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum.

MGH SS

Monumenta Germaniae Historica,
Scriptores (in Folio).

MIÖG

Mitteilungen des Instituts für
Österreichische
Geschichtsforschung, (Innsbruck
1948ff; Ergänzungsbd. 1947 ff).

Miracula Waldburgis

Miracula Waldburgis Monheimensia, A.
Bauch, (ed.), Ein bayerisches
Mirakelbuch aus der Karolingerzeit.
Die Monheimer Walpurgiswunder des
Priesters Wolfhard, [Eichstätter
Studien XII], (Regensburg, 1979).

Missale Francorum

Missale Francorum, L.C. Mohlberg,
(ed.), [RED series maior, fontes 2],
(Rome, 1957).

<u>Missale Gallicanum vetus</u>	<u>Missale Gallicanum vetus</u> , L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED series maior, fontes 3], (Rome, 1958).
<u>Missale Gothicum</u>	<u>Missale Gothicum</u> , L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes 5], (Rome, 1961).
<u>MS</u>	Manuscript
<u>NA</u>	Neues Archiv der Gessellschaft für ältere deutsche Geschichtskunde, (Hannover, Berlin, 1876-1935).
<u>PL</u>	Patrologia Latina, J.-P. Migne, (ed.), [221 vols], (Paris, 1841-64).
<u>PRG I</u>	<u>Le pontificale romano-germanique du dixième siècle</u> , C. Vogel and R. Elze, (eds.), [Studi e Testi 226], (Vatican City, 1963).
<u>PRG II</u>	<u>Le pontificale romano-germanique du dixième siècle</u> , C. Vogel and R. Elze, (eds.), [Studi e Testi 227], (Vatican City, 1963).
<u>Quadripartitus</u>	<u>Antiqua canonum collectio qua in Libris de synodalibus causis compilandis usus est Regino Prumensis</u> , E.L. Richter, (ed.), (Marburg, 1848).
<u>RED</u>	Rerum ecclesiasticarum documenta
<u>RH</u>	Revue Historique, (Paris 1876ff).
<u>RHE</u>	Revue Historique Ecclésiastique, (Louvain, 1900ff).
<u>Sac. August.</u>	<u>Liber sacramentorum Augustudonensis</u> ,

O. Heiming (ed.), [CCSL CLIXB],
(Turnhout, 1984).

Sac. Engol.

Liber sacramentorum Engolismensis, P.
Saint-Roch (ed.), [CCSL CLIX],
(Turnhout, 1987).

Sac. Fuld.

Sacramentarium Fuldense saeculi X,
[Quellen und Abhandlungen zur
Geschichte der Abtei und der Diözese
Fulda, 9], G. Richter and A.
Schönfelder (eds.), (Fulda, 1912),
[reprinted Henry Bradshaw Society,
101, 1972-77].

Sac. Gelas.

Liber sacramentorum Romanae aeclesiae
ordinis anni circuli [Cod. Vat. Regin.
lat. 316], L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED,
series maior, fontes 4], (Rome, 1960).

Sac. Gellon.

Liber sacramentorum Gellonensis, A.
Dumas (ed.), [CCSL CLIX], (Turnhout,
1981).

Sac. Veron.

Sacramentarium Veronense, L.C.
Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior,
fontes I], (Rome, 1956).

SCH

Studies in Church History,
[Ecclesiastical History Society],
(London, 1964ff).

SMRH

Studies in Medieval and Renaissance
History, (Lincoln, Nebraska, 1964ff).

Spoletto

Settimane di Studio del Centro
Italiano di Studi sull'Alto Medioevo.

TRHS

Transactions of the Royal Historical
Society, (London, 1871ff).

Vat. Ottob. 261

MS Vat. Ottobonianus 261 fol.130-135
 printed in "Reise nach Italien im
 Jahre 1901", A. Werminghoff, (ed.),
 in NA, 27, (1902), pp.580-87.

Vita Pusinnae

"La plus ancienne Vie de sainte
 Pusinne de Binson, honorée en
 Westphalie", B. de Gaiffier, (ed.),
Analecta Bollandiana, 76, (1958),
 pp.214-23.

Vita Verenae

Vita Prior in Die heilige Verena von
 Zürzach: Legende, Kult, Denkmäler, A.
 Reinle, (ed.), [Ars docta, 6], (Basel,
 1948), pp.26-31.

Wasserschleben

Die Bussordnungen der abendländischen
 Kirche, F.W.H. Wasserschleben, (ed.),
 (Halle, 1851).

INTRODUCTION.

The present study is intended to add to the study of women's history from the late eighth to the early tenth century in the regna which constituted the Carolingian empire.¹ However, the thesis does not claim to be a comprehensive study of all women in these kingdoms in this period. Such an attempt would have failed because of the difficult but necessary task of interpreting and synthesising all sources available for this period. Such difficulties behind producing any general study of women in a medieval period explain why, despite the growth of medieval women's history in recent years, more collections of essays under a generic title than general studies have been produced.² Where general studies for the whole of the medieval period have been attempted, they have been rather too wide-ranging with the earlier middle ages comparatively neglected.³ It is therefore more useful to conduct more detailed but limited studies. This has been the case in Anglo-Saxon women's studies which offer useful

¹ For the sake of convenience the term "the Frankish kingdoms" will be used to include all the regna of the Carolingian empire although some of these were not "Frankish". The term is now widely used, see R. McKitterick's The Frankish Kingdoms under the Carolingians 751-987, (London, 1983); but it was not one used in the Carolingian period.

² Susan Mosher Stuard (ed.), Women in Medieval Society, (Philadelphia 1976); Derek Baker (ed.), Medieval Women, [SCH, Subsidia I], (Oxford, 1978); Julius Kirschner and S.F. Wemple (eds.), Women of the Medieval World, (Oxford, 1985); Werner Affeldt and Annette Kuhn (eds.), Frauen in der Geschichte VII, [Interdisziplinäre Studien zur Geschichte der Frauen im Frühmittelalter], (Düsseldorf, 1986); M. Erler and M. Kowaleski (eds.), Women and Power in the Middle Ages, (Athens, Georgia, 1988); J.T. Rosenthal, (ed.), Medieval Women and the Sources of Medieval History, (Athens, Georgia, 1990); W. Affeldt (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter. Lebensbedingungen - Lebensnormen - Lebensformen, (Sigmaringen, 1990); M. Rouche, (ed.), Les Femmes au Moyen Age, (Maubeuge, 1990).

³ S. Shahar, The Fourth Estate. A History of Women in the Middle Ages, [trans. Chaya Galai], (London, 1983); E. Ennen, The Medieval Woman, [trans. E. Jephcott], (Oxford, 1989).

parallel evidence for this present enquiry. Therefore the thorough work by Dagmar Schneider on the religious life of Anglo-Saxon women is more useful than the general survey of women in Anglo-Saxon England by Christine Fell which is rather descriptive and suffers from a certain degree of insularity.⁴

Therefore, this thesis is specifically a study of the attitudes expressed towards women by the Frankish Church and an attempt to assess from these the reality of some women's lives.⁵ Such a strategy is partly dictated by the nature of the sources since they emanated principally from male ecclesiastics. However, this period was one where the Church, in both its secular and monastic roles, was one of few dominant institutions. Its role was pivotal in influencing the other significant social elements - kingship and the family; and it, in turn, was influenced by them. The Frankish Church also functioned within the context of powerful secular traditions - some of which it found usefully complementary but others a source of tension. The working out of these processes affected women in particular ways which require examination.

It is further justified to examine women from the specific angle of the Frankish Church since this was a

⁴ Christine Fell, Cecily Clark and Elizabeth Williams, Women in Anglo-Saxon England and the Impact of 1066, (London, 1984). However, Schneider's thesis, Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life. A study of the status and position of women in an early medieval society, (unpublished D.Phil thesis for the University of Cambridge, 1985), whilst demonstrating an awareness of continental parallels perhaps too uncritically applies evidence for Saxony (for example, the Vita Liutbirgae, Ibid. p.144) to the Anglo-Saxon context.

⁵ It is justified to use the term "the Frankish Church" as a convenient phrase which was how J.M. Wallace-Hadrill applied it; The Frankish Church, (Oxford, 1983). It was also used in this way by Rosamond McKitterick; The Frankish Church and the Carolingian Reforms 789-895, (London, 1977). However, I am aware that many churches-Saxon, Bavarian, Aquitanian, East and West Frankish-constituted the whole to which I am referring under this umbrella term.

period of important Church reform. The attitudes of Frankish churchmen toward women and their efforts to project particular ideal female roles, were part of a strategy to regulate and control the behaviour of women. Thus an enquiry into the success or otherwise of these attempts is merited. The reformers hoped to encompass all members of the Church - secular and religious, male and female; but this enquiry will ascertain whether the sources reveal a greater degree or different forms of attempted control over women. Despite the acknowledged limitations of these chosen boundaries, "insofar as images of women relate to what really goes on, we can infer from them something about that social reality". ⁶

Looking at women in this period of reform, which was part of what is more often called the "Carolingian Renaissance", is of particular interest because some feminist historians have followed the thesis of Joan Kelly-Gadol. ⁷ She took the Italian Renaissance as her model affirming that, "to take the emancipation of women as a vantage point is to discover that events that further the historical development of men, liberating them from natural, social, or ideological constraints, have quite different, even opposite, effects upon women". ⁸ Her approach has been applied to the study of women in the ninth century by Suzanne Wemple who has written the only

⁶ Joan Kelly-Gadol, "Did Women Have a Renaissance?", in R. Bridenthall, C. Koonz and S.M. Stuard, (eds.), Becoming Visible. Women in European History, (Boston, 1987), pp.176-201, at p.176.

⁷ Kelly-Gadol, Ibid. But for a different interpretation: "women were pushed to marginal positions in the structure of medieval society. Although these changes seem indisputable, yet the response they support, that women did not have a Renaissance, is not entirely satisfactory"; David Herlihy, "Did Women have a Renaissance?: A Reconsideration", Medievalia et Humanistica, 13, (1985), pp.1-22, at p.18. Yet, Herlihy's riposte, which is based on the prominence of charismatic women, is also only a partial explanation based on another suspect methodology, the study of "heroines".

⁸ It is, however, unclear exactly what Kelly-Gadol meant by "historical development"; nor does she say which men she was referring to.

comprehensive study to date of women in the Frankish kingdoms in this period.⁹

However, Wemple's acceptance of Kelly-Gadol's model, as a means of interpreting the effects of the Carolingian reforms on women's lives, has led her to misinterpret certain key sources notably the legislative corpus. In so doing she compares the ninth century unfavourably with the Merovingian period. She regards it as a period of repression for women in both the religious and the secular life so that "excluded from institutions of authority [women] were relegated to more passive, sexually determined roles both in secular life and in the monasteries".¹⁰ Hence in the religious sphere, "nuns and canonesses were isolated from the mainstream of religious, political and intellectual life". Further, "the precipitous drop in the number of women saints in the ninth century suggests that female sanctity did not thrive in a culture that rigidly specified and limited the role of women in religion".¹¹ Women in the secular life,

⁹ "the ascent of institutions in which women had a limited role or none at all resulted almost invariably in the constriction of female roles"; S.F. Wemple, Women in Frankish Society. Marriage and the Cloister 500 - 900, (Philadelphia, 1981), p.195. Although Wemple's is the only general study, there are more detailed enquiries as in Silvia Konecny's study of royal women of the Carolingian family; Die Frauen des karolingischen Königshauses: Die politische Bedeutung der Ehe und die Stellung der Frau in der fränkischen Herrscherfamilie vom 7. bis zum 10. Jahrhundert, [Dissertationen der Universität Wien. 132], (Wien, 1976).

¹⁰ Wemple, Ibid. p.194.

¹¹ Wemple, Ibid. p.192. Jane Schulenburg similarly concluded that the seventh and early eighth centuries were "an especially positive age in the development of women's monasticism", since women had easy access to political and economic power; that the ninth-century reforms curtailed the free expression of female monasticism, (Ibid. p.278) and that fewer female houses were founded since women were now more likely to endow jointly with husbands and other family members rather than independently; "Women's Monastic Communities, 500-1100: Patterns of Expansion and Decline", SIGNS, Journal of Women in Culture and Society, 14, (1988), pp. 261-292, at pp.291, 278, 287. See also Schulenburg's "Strict active enclosure and its effects on

Wemple argues, fared no better. So that although the Frankish Church, "enhanced the dignity of married women", "significant as these gains were for the eventual emancipation of women , they appear less impressive against the broader consequences of the imposition of monogamy".¹² These, she argues, were an increase in the abuse of wives, and their removal from political and cultural concerns into a private life of nurturing and housekeeping.

These conclusions need re-examination not only because of the misinterpretation of certain sources and a failure to implement accurate gender-analysis, but also because they rest on anachronistic feminist theory. In explaining what they see as the trend toward female emancipation some feminist historians have sought to explain periods of "oppression" as a fall from grace from a halcyon era. Wemple's arguments for the ninth century rest on such a "golden-age" assumption: in the Merovingian period women had a degree of freedom of action in stark contrast to women in the Carolingian period.¹³ It is questionable whether the Merovingian period bears such a positive reading or the Carolingian such a negative one. So although the rejection of periodisation has its merits for the study of women's history, for the Carolingian period (or indeed any period), "any notion of unilinear progress towards the "emancipation" of women... needs to be heavily

the female monastic experience (500-1100) in J.A. Nichols and L.T. Shank, (eds.), Medieval Religious Women I. Distant Echoes, (Kalamazoo, 1984), pp.51-86. These arguments are emphasised by the designation of the tenth and eleventh centuries, before the Gregorian Reform, as a "feminist Benedictine revival" by Mary Skinner; "Benedictine Life for Women in Central France, 850-1100: A Feminist Revival", in Nichols and Shank, (eds.), Distant Echoes, pp.87-113. But see the review of Distant Echoes by Judith McClure which highlights such an approach as "methodologically flawed, owing "more to the influence of modern feminism than to the period under discussion"; EHR, 102, (1987), p.1005.

¹² Women, p.193.

¹³ "Women were less marginal in Merovingian than in Carolingian society"; Women, p.194.

qualified, even abandoned".¹⁴ Wemple's arguments rest on other anachronisms such as the assumption that women exercised "choice" on entering a monastery or deciding on a particular marriage strategy.¹⁵ It is doubtful whether this concept in a modern sense can be usefully applied to this period; it also begs the question whether "choice" was exercised by either gender. It is therefore important to reassess precisely what was gender-specific to women.

Hence for a study of women in both the religious and secular life four main types of sources will be used: legislative sources in the form of capitularies, council decisions and episcopal statutes; penitential handbooks; hagiography; and liturgy. Schneider noted that the sheer immensity of the sources for Anglo-Saxon women meant that she was forced to examine one aspect of women's lives—the religious life; but she argued that this would still give some insights into the position of women in Anglo-Saxon society generally.¹⁶ However, the sources for the Carolingian period are much greater than those for the Anglo-Saxon period as a whole, especially the conciliar legislation; but there are several reasons why it is legitimate to limit the range of sources and bridge the religious/secular divide. Since Wemple has already undertaken a general study it is essential to study one particular group of sources in detail, not least as they yield more than was hitherto realised. Further, the sources are not confined to religious women but reveal an interest in secular women. Indeed for a fuller understanding I would suggest that it is important to look at both religious and secular women. So whilst not devaluing Schneider's approach, I have decided to limit the range of sources which in any case proved to be a very large corpus.

¹⁴ J.L. Nelson, "Commentary on the papers of J. Verdon, S.F. Wemple and M. Parisse", in W. Affeldt (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, pp.325-332, at p.332.

¹⁵ Women, p.168.

¹⁶ Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life, pp.4,9.

The study will be presented in two parts. For both the first section - women in the religious life, and the second - women in the secular life, questions will be posed via three source-based lines of enquiry which are complementary and occasionally overlapping. First, the norms of behaviour which were prescribed in the capitularies, council decisions, episcopal statutes and regulatory texts such as the penitentials will be examined. Then images of ideal female behaviour will be investigated primarily through hagiography in the case of religious women; for secular women the hagiographical sources will be supplemented by liturgical and penitential material, episcopal statutes and also some of the theological treatises concerning marriage. Lastly, enquiry into liturgy will reveal what the Frankish Church perceived to be the areas of women's lives that required or deserved liturgical provision. Where possible these findings will be compared with comments in other sources which may throw light on the reality of some women's lives.

Therefore, the first section constitutes an enquiry into the determination with which the reformers attempted to prescribe for the lives of women pursuing a religious life. Hence it will be asked what form of religious life did the Frankish Church envisage for women; was this more often as nuns or canonesses? Was there a permissible alternative to a religious life inside a convent? To examine the religious communities in more detail it will be necessary to look at the woman at the head of the religious community - the abbess. What was her role; and how did her authority and position compare with that of the abbot? Did her abbatial status transcend her gender? Apart from the abbess were there other positions of authority and what were these roles? An examination of the prescriptions concerning access to and from communities by female inhabitants and male outsiders will augment enquiry into the power of abbesses and also into the question of segregation of monastic inmates from secular and religious persons of the opposite sex. This last consideration will help to illuminate whether women religious really were

isolated from contemporary religious, intellectual and political trends. With regard to the role of women inside their communities it will be asked what kind of women became nuns and canonesses -what was their status, age or marital position; and did the expected role of the ordinary nun or canoness correspond to that of the monk?

All of this will help ascertain whether convents at this time played the kind of special role that Karl Leyser pointed to in his seminal work on female Ottonian monasticism in the tenth century. Leyser argued that the removal of women to convents protected them from "the incestuous advances of their own kin", and thus ensured that the family did not have to provide for a large number of heirs which might have resulted from this and also from "the advantages women enjoyed as survivors and sharers of inheritances".¹⁷ This study will throw light on whether convents had a unique role in the Carolingian period, whether this was beyond the confines of Saxony and for similar reasons to do with the family and the legal position of women, and/or because women religious played a unique role.

Evidence from the prescriptive texts provides the background for an enquiry into the hagiography. The pattern and provenance of female hagiography will be explained. The reasons for the dominance of particular images will be sought; and it will be asked whether any of these images were gender-specific to women. The images presented will tell us whether hagiographical descriptions correspond with, or qualify the prescriptions concerning the role of the abbess; these texts will also add information concerning the lifestyle and responsibilities of ordinary women religious. In particular, hagiographical evidence will illuminate the relationship of the nun or canoness with her family. Hagiographical descriptions of convents will illuminate the question of the segregation of the sexes; and it can be asked whether the gender of

¹⁷ Karl Leyser, Rule and Conflict in an Early Medieval Society: Ottonian Saxony, (London, 1979), pp.49-73, at pp.64,70.

the community's patron saint affected the access of persons to the shrine there.

This first section ends with recourse to the liturgy. Analysing ordination and consecration rites will tell us from a new perspective how the Frankish Church regarded religious women. Several questions may be asked - how were women religious categorised; did ordination, consecration and benediction pertain to different kinds of women; do the rites always make provision of a gender-specific nature or are definitions other than gender apparent; and does liturgy evidence provision for existing needs or was it an attempt to present an official designation of women religious?

The second section examines women in the secular life. Again, the prescriptive texts will be examined first to ask how Church reformers attempted to affect the lives of secular women in the area of marriage. Did the Church successfully influence the lives of women by prescribing the implementation of Christian marriage ritual? Further, did the reforms uniformly impose monogamy, prevent easy divorce and successfully enforce Christian norms of morality through stricter rules governing consanguinity and incest; and what implications for women did all this have? Who controlled marriage practices and to what extent were women involved? Did the Church's views on marriage make it a more or less attractive alternative to monasticism for women?

Further to the prescriptive evidence, nuptial liturgical provision will be examined - what form it took and how women were specifically provided for. Analysis of the liturgy's image of women as wives will be set alongside an examination of attitudes towards married women in the penitentials, episcopal statutes, treatises on marriage¹⁸ and hagiography. These will generate enquiry into what constituted the Church's expected role for women within

¹⁸ Although these are not one of my principal sources it is useful to consider them here; see n.24 below.

the conjugal relationship: were women expected to possess certain wifely attributes; and how were women perceived regarding the sexual aspect of marriage?

As the roles of wives and mothers are closely linked, a similar examination will be made of the liturgical provision for mothers alongside comments on mothering and nurturing in the other sources. Thus the aspects of a mother's experience the Church chose to liturgically provide for will be identified and examined. In addition it will be asked what attitudes did the prescriptive sources express about women's role as mothers - was fertility, the potential to prevent conception, procure abortions, and commit infanticide treated in a gender-specific way? Finally it will be asked with recourse to all the sources whether maternitas was perceived to be simply a biological function; what were the perceived duties of maternitas and were they regarded as particular responsibilities of women?

This last point will highlight the fact that although the religious life and the secular life will be dealt with in separate sections, there was a degree of overlap between the two categories. Hence in the concluding chapter the dichotomy between religious and secular will be bridged via an examination of the Frankish Church's attitudes towards women as a gender as a threat of impurity to priests, sanctuary and sacraments. This can be done not least because the Frankish Church regarded all women as "lay" whether they were nuns and canonesses or wives and mothers. This will help an assessment of how far in certain circumstances women were perceived as a single social group, separate from the rest of a (male) society of priests and monks, and noble and non-noble laity; even though there was the definition of society as simply clerical (priests and monks) and non-clerical (laymen and women, and women in the religious life). ¹⁹

¹⁹ The title of Shulamith Shahar's book, The Fourth Estate, unfortunately not covering the ninth and tenth centuries, is an ironical comment on the medieval view of the (male) constituents of society as oratores, bellatores

In applying the concept of gender, the work of Joan Scott has proved useful.²⁰ Her analysis of gender as a constitutive element of social relationships and also as a means of signifying relationships of power has clearly helped in an examination of an institution such as monasticism and the abbess' exercise of power; it also illuminates a study of the position of women as wives and mothers within the power structures of the family. Yet gender is only useful as a concept so long as it does not become a rigid theory. It gives more insights into the subject than pre-determined, twentieth-century notions of sex-roles. The assumption that biological function always determines sex-roles is of limited usefulness: biological function, relevant to the position of biological mothers, may have little to do with the roles of other women. Other criteria may crosscut, or interact with gender. For example, status and gender need to be looked at concurrently in an assessment of the position and power of abbesses; age and status as well as gender affected the control of marriage.

Essentially, however, any enquiry must be based on a set of sources and hence is partly dictated by the interests of their writers. In this thesis this means an imbalanced concentration on noblewomen. The provenance and purpose of the sources I have chosen to study means they have little to say about female slaves, peasants or women of other races such as Jewish women. On the other hand, the sources' geographical coverage is quite wide. The study therefore deals with women from quite distinct areas - the East and West Frankish regna, Bavaria, Saxony and Aquitaine.

While considerations of space have imposed their own limitations, some subjects have been well covered

and laboratores.

²⁰ Joan Scott, "Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis", American Historical Review, 91, (1986), p.1053-1075.

recently. Therefore, I shall not be looking at queens in any detail. ²¹ Nor, since my time span is the period of the late eighth to the early tenth century, will I be dealing with women in the context of the Anglo-Saxon missionary Church. Hence I will not be referring to the correspondence of Boniface of Mainz ²²; but female missionary activity has been dealt with recently elsewhere. ²³ Nor have I done more than glance at treatises on marriage, the specula coniugatorum. ²⁴ I am aware of the importance of Dhuoda's Manual as the only source known to have been written by a woman in this

²¹ For the Frankish context: Konecny, Die Frauen des karolingischen Königshauses; J.L. Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels: Brunhild and Balhild in Merovingian History", reprinted in Politics and Ritual in Early Medieval Europe, (London, 1986), pp.1-48; Pauline Stafford, "Charles the Bald, Judith and England" and Jane Hyam, "Ermentrude and Richildis", both in M. Gibson and J.L. Nelson (eds.), Charles the Bald: Court and Kingdom, [BAR International Series, 101], (Oxford, 1981), pp.137-151 and pp.153-168; Elizabeth Ward, "Caesar's Wife: the Career of the Empress Judith, 819-829" in R. Collins and P. Godman (eds.), Charlemagne's Heir. New Perspectives on the Reign of Louis the Pious, (Oxford, 1990), pp.205-27 and "Agobard of Lyons and Paschasius Radbertus as critics of the Empress Judith" in SCH, 27 (1990), pp.15-25, her thesis on the Empress Judith is also forthcoming. For an examination of Saxon queens see P. Corbet, Les saints ottoniens, (Sigmaringen, 1986). For the Anglo-Saxon context see P. Stafford's "Sons and Mothers: Family Politics in the Early Middle Ages", Medieval Women, (ed.) D. Baker, (Oxford, 1978), pp.79-100; "The King's Wife in Wessex 800-1066", Past and Present, 91, (1981), pp.3-27; and for a wider study her Queens, Concubines and Dowagers: The King's Wife in the Early Middle Ages, (London, 1983).

²² Indeed, generally, I will not be looking at letter collections such as those of Alcuin or Lupus of Ferrières although some written by Hincmar of Rheims will be referred to.

²³ On the Anglo-Saxon mission see Schneider, Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life, pp.223-242; F. Lifshitz deals with female missionary activity in the hagiographical context, "Les Femmes Missionnaires: L'Exemple De La Gaule Franque", RHE, 83, (1988), pp.5-33.

²⁴ These are thoroughly examined by Pierre Toubert, "La théorie du mariage chez les moralistes carolingiens", Il matrimonio nella società altomedievale, Spoleto, 24, (1977), pp.233-285.

period: again several others have looked at her work.²⁵ But my own study is concerned with how the (largely male dominated) institution of the Frankish Church regarded its female members; so that Dhuoda's work forms, in a sense, an interesting contrast as an exercise in self-representation.

My four main groups of sources provide a convenient structure. Moreover, they stand together as a group. They represent the "official" viewpoint of the Frankish Church and the representations it chose to portray; it is the purpose of this study to assess whether they reveal any degree of reality. Certain types of sources may give more indication of "truth" - narrative sources ²⁶, charters and polyptychs; but it was not my intention to look at these. The sources pertaining to women's control of property would constitute a study on their own and there was neither time nor space for a detailed examination here.

Further, others have dealt with the subject in some detail. David Herlihy counted the use of matronymics, the frequency of women appearing as contiguous owners and also as alienators of property in France, Germany, Italy and Spain from the eighth to the end of the twelfth century. He concluded that female control of landed property declined in the ninth century particularly in the latter

²⁵ J. Wollasch, "Eine adlige Familie des frühen Mittelalters: Ihr Selbstverständnis und ihre Wirklichkeit", Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, 39, (1957), pp.150-188; Pierre Riché, Dhuoda: Manuel pour mon fils [Sources Chrétiennes 225], (Paris, 1975); Peter Dronke, Women Writers of the Middle Ages, (Cambridge and London, 1984), pp. 36-54; James Marchand, "The Frankish Mother: Dhuoda", in K.M. Wilson (ed.), Medieval Women Writers, (Manchester, 1984), pp.2-29; M.A. Claussen, "God and Man in Dhuoda's Liber Manualis", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.43-52.

²⁶ Some analysis of the narrative sources of this period has been made though not specifically from the view of women's history. Most recently: J.L. Nelson, "The Annals of St. Bertin", and, "Public Histories and Private History in the work of Nithard", both reprinted in Politics and Ritual, pp.173-94, 195-237.

half. ²⁷ Wemple looked at the cartularies of Redon, Lorsch, Cluny, St. Vincent of Macon and Brioude and largely followed Herlihy's conclusions. ²⁸ However, there are several flaws in her supposition that the apparent decline in female land ownership was a direct result of the Frankish Church's success in preventing easy divorce. As she herself admits, the decline of female participation in recorded transactions in this period could in fact reflect women's generosity to the Church in the eighth century and also that women perhaps held on to their land more often in the ninth century. ²⁹ Further, contradictory evidence from widely differing regions render general arguments suspect. ³⁰

Wemple's findings for Brittany through the use of the Redon cartulary have recently been superceded by Wendy Davies' work, in which women and their land rights are firmly placed within the family context. ³¹ Davies

²⁷ "Land, Family, and Women in Continental Europe, 701-1200", reprinted in S.M. Stuard (ed.), Women in Medieval Society, pp.13-43; see also his Medieval Households, (Harvard, 1985) at pp.56-78.

²⁸ Women, pp.106-123.

²⁹ Ibid, p.108. A low survival rate of documents may also have affected her study. As Wemple acknowledges, we are reliant on what is visible to us: "If we combine the transactions in which women figure as donors and co-donors [in East Francia], we find a significant drop in the visibility of women controlling land after 840"; Ibid, p.109.

³⁰ Thus Wemple found that there were a lower number of female actors in the Auvergne and the Maconnais ruled by Roman law [Women, pp.113-114] than in East Francia, [Ibid, p.109]. However, she found that the position was reversed in these areas when it came to women acting jointly with men; Ibid, pp.109,115-116.

³¹ Small Worlds. The Village Community in Early Medieval Brittany, (London, 1988), esp. pp.72-80, pp.167-169. Davies found that Breton women like their brothers could inherit land from their fathers and also alienate it; but it is unclear whether women's land was automatically transmitted to their offspring although it could be given through choice. Further, despite "some tendency for the male interest to dominate, women were still capable of acting alone". For example, women could have sole control of the "morning gift" and widows could act as guardians of their children's interests; moreover

rejected Wemple's conclusion that there was a change from communal (kin) to conjugal ownership of land in ninth-century Brittany. ³² Wemple commented that her findings really only have relevance for noble women. Davies also found evidence for noble women handling property ³³; but she argued that the Breton machtierns which included at least one woman were not aristocrats. ³⁴

Emily Coleman has looked at the St. Germain polyptych which gives some evidence for female peasants. ³⁵ She found that coloniae, women of free status, were more likely to marry servile men than coloni. She argued that this was because the presence of several male kin meant women were unlikely to gain control of the family plot. She found, however, that their and their children's status was not affected by marrying a man of servile status. Yet it is

as machtierns, women exercised extensive property rights. However, her argument that "the lack of references to (nuns) probably reflects the fact that there were few or none", does not necessarily follow. Again, there may be a poor survival rate of evidence as for the Frankish kingdoms.

³² Ibid, pp.76-77, note 56.

³³ Ibid, pp.167-168.

³⁴ On the case of the machtiern Aourken, tiranissa in the plebs of Pleucadeuc and also the wives of machtierns possibly playing a public role; Ibid, p.78. That the machtierns were not aristocratic but part of the village community as "active go-betweens between aristocratic and non-noble free strata", Ibid, pp.164-87, at p.175. But see J.L. Nelson: "Davies writes of "effective quasi-independent action by widows" and "independent female action". But it was lords and patrons (not least Redon) who, as potential beneficiaries, ensured the recording of women's claims"; review of Small Worlds, in the Times Literary Supplement, April 28th, 1989, p.468.

³⁵ "Medieval Marriage Characteristics: A Neglected Factor in the History of Medieval Serfdom", Journal of Interdisciplinary History, 2, (1971), pp.205-219. See also L. Kuchenbuch, Bäuerliche Gesellschaft und Klosterherrschaft im 9. Jahrhundert. Studien zur Sozialstruktur der Familia der Abtei Prüm, [Vierteljahrshchrift für Sozial- und Wirtschaftsgeschichte, 66], (Wiesbaden, 1978) for information on women peasants recorded in the Prüm polyptych; and in the St. Germain and St. Victor polyptychs see Herlihy, Medieval Households, pp.62-78.

debatable whether even polyptychs and charters show reality for they present a partial view of women's lives. Jack Goody has argued that the Church in the early middle ages sought to further female control of property since this directly benefitted itself ³⁶; so these sources may also be representational, reflecting ecclesiastical interests.

Women's ability to own and alienate land is relevant for a study of women's relationship both to the Church as donors, and within the family as inheriting daughters, wives and widows. So although the group of sources that I have studied are quite different, I regard my material as to be set alongside those kinds of sources which perhaps reveal a greater degree of reality. If my main concern had been to seek reality I would have studied these other types of sources, but this enquiry is primarily one of how women were perceived by the Frankish Church; only secondarily can I attempt to assess whether that representation in any way accords with reality.

³⁶ Jack Goody, The Development of the Family and Marriage in Europe, (Cambridge, 1983), pp.103-56.

CHAPTER ONE.

THE SOURCES.

All the texts utilised in this study are in Latin, the language of government and the Church ¹; further, the texts were almost entirely written by clerics or monks, representative of the male ecclesiastical hierarchy ². The sources are representative of the Frankish Church only in a general sense. Textual provenance requires consideration since a text may indicate the interests of its redactor and/or specific regional traits. ³ While Regino of Prüm commented on the diversity of the "Frankish Church" ⁴, the Carolingian reform movement represented an attempt to impose certain ideals on all the Frankish and non-Frankish regna. Such ideals underpin all the sources, but the capitularies, conciliar decrees and episcopal statutes most clearly demonstrate "the aims and programme for the development of Frankish society as a Christian society" ⁵.

The Legislation.

The fact that the three types of legislation overlap in

¹ Latin marked the Franks as a ruling gens and as the chosen people of God; J.L. Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government" in R. McKitterick, (ed.), The Uses of Literacy in Early Medieval Europe, (Cambridge, 1990), pp.258-296.

² But see p.145 below.

³ Even General councils' prescriptions may have been responses to local matters. For example, concerning the Council of Ver (844) prescribing against female transvestism [pp.136-41 below] and the Council of Worms (868) allowing the ordination of deaconesses [pp.120-121 below].

⁴ Prologue to the Ecclesiastical Discipline, F.G.A. Wasserschleben (ed.), Reginonis libri duo de synodalibus causis et disciplinis ecclesiasticis, (Leipzig, 1840), p.2.

⁵ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.1.

content and form should not over-concern us. ⁶ One of their most important shared characteristics was that women were excluded from the legislative processes. Exceptions that arise relate to queens ⁷ or to women outside my regional boundaries ⁸; but their powers related to property as opposed to a formal, public decision-making role. Women's exclusion ⁹ bears on an interpretation of the legislation if it presents an attitude that women were more in need of regulation than men.

The king was the "protector and legislator" of the Church ¹⁰ but he had particular interests. Capitularies and episcopal statements present evidence about secular women through statements concerning correct marriage practices; but kings may have wished to interfere in aristocratic marital arrangements. ¹¹ Bishops were bound to care for the moral and physical welfare of female

⁶ "it is much more difficult to generalise about early medieval legislation than many historians have supposed. Partly, this is because of its variety, and partly because it yet refuses to fall neatly into clearly distinguishable categories"; P. Wormald, "Lex Scripta and Verbum Regis: Legislation and Germanic Kingship, from Euric to Cnut", in P. Sawyer and I.N. Wood, (eds.) Early Medieval Kingship, (Leeds, 1979), pp.105-138, at p.107.

⁷ The queen gave oral and written instructions to missi according to the Capitulare de Villis; Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", pp.273-4. The Empress Angelberga is an apparent exception presiding at a tribunal, calling the Council of Pavia (875), and intervening in charters: Stafford, Queens, pp.134-6, 138-9.

⁸ On Breton machtierns, see Introduction above, notes 31-34.

⁹ Rather untypically Wulfad of Bourges addresses both religious and secular karissimi fratres saying, sacerdotes vocamini, but also, O vos quoque, laicalis ordinis viri; MGH Epp. Karol., 6, p.189.

¹⁰ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.10. The capitularies were "at the service of an ideological programme", which "overwhelmingly presupposed ecclesiastical rulings which they endowed with royally supplied enforceability"; W. Ullmann, The Carolingian Renaissance and the Idea of Kingship, (London, 1969), pp.31,35.

¹¹ See pp.245-46 below.

religious within their dioceses ¹², but the king also had a responsibility. ¹³ This interest would be all the greater over royal convents.

As directives for sacerdotes (bishops and priests) episcopal statutes were intended as "handbooks, not only of administrative and liturgical procedure, but also of spiritual and social guidance". ¹⁴ Hitherto neglected for a study of women ¹⁵ they contain valuable information concerning laywomen within the priest's congregation ¹⁶; there is comparatively little in them about women religious. Convents required the services of a priest for the performance of the mass; hence there is some information on the interaction between priests and nuns. ¹⁷ A few of the statutes contain information on female monastic life suggesting that these texts were primarily for episcopal use and their jurisdiction over female religious. ¹⁸ That bishops had this care over nuns,

¹² Bishops were responsible for their entire flock: the Council of Mainz (813) prescribed the laity to obey them; MGH Conc. II i,c.8,p.262. But bishops had a specific supervisory role over convents, see p.89 below.

¹³ "De abbatissis quae canonice aut regulariter non vivunt episcopi requirant et regi adnuntiet, ut ab honore priventur"; Council of Frankfurt (794), MGH Capit. I, c.47,p.77.

¹⁴ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.45.

¹⁵ McKitterick's analysis of the statutes contains little about women, The Frankish Church, pp.45-79. Wemple concentrated on the conciliar and capitulary material; Women.

¹⁶ Especially relating to marriage, child-care and non-christian practices; chs.5, 6, and 7 below.

¹⁷ See p.110 below.

¹⁸ An anonymous early ninth-century text from Laon provides several chapters on the correct observance of the monastic life, with especial regard to female communities (abbesses, nonnanes and new entrants) which the bishop is exhorted to oversee; Laon MS201, PL89,cols.821-824. But this text also provides for areas of female lay life that the priest would have to control such as girls singing and dancing in church. The statutes of Walter of Sens are entirely concerned with monasticism including the regulation of convents; PL132, cols.717-20.

whereas abbots regulated monks, may be reflected in the preponderance and tone of these episcopal prescriptions.

Legislative material concerning religious women is, by definition, evidence for noblewomen; but the picture is less clear for secular women. Wulfad of Bourges was probably addressing aristocratic laymen as was Jonas of Orleans in the De institutione laicali.¹⁹ The legislation's preoccupation with marriage may reflect the nobility's concerns. McNamara and Wemple commented that it was impossible "to speak with assurance of the practical effects of the legislative efforts of the Church" and that much of the material concerned the "entanglements of the ruling class rather than the more ordinary marital arrangements of the majority".²⁰ However, the episcopal statutes reveal differing interpretations of marriage issues²¹ qualifying Wemple's rather static view of marriage trends.²² They also refer to other spheres of life such as spiritual kinship and consanguinity which

¹⁹ This was addressed to Count Matfrid of Orleans; PL106, cols.121-278; and n.9 above.

²⁰ Jo-Ann McNamara and S.F. Wemple, "Marriage and Divorce in the Frankish Kingdoms", in S.M. Stuard, (ed.), Women in Medieval Society, pp.95-124, at pp.95-96.

²¹ See chs.5 and 6 below on the statutes' treatment of marriage. Well-known differences were apparent between Hincmar and the Lotharingian bishops concerning the dissolution of Lothar II and Theutberga's marriage; Jean Devisse, Hincmar, Archevêque de Reims 845-882, [3 vols.] (Geneva, 1975), I, pp.367-466.

²² Wemple referred to the writings of Hincmar of Rheims but relied largely on the De Divortio rather than on his or other statutes; Women, pp.75-123. However prolific, Hincmar can not be taken as representative of ninth-century episcopal opinion on marriage. Jane Bishop also did not use the statutes; "Bishops as Marital Advisors" in J. Kirschner and S.F. Wemple, (eds.), Women in the Medieval World, pp.53-84. But Devisse compared other episcopal views to those of Hincmar for example, on consanguinity; Hincmar, I, pp.381-2.

impinge on any thorough discussion of marriage. ²³ As more localised initiatives the statutes provide some illustration of real behaviour, and they may also sometimes refer to non-noble women. This last must be only tentatively suggested.

Some capitularies ²⁴ are similar in form to synodal material ²⁵ as are some episcopal statutes. ²⁶ Therefore some capitularies and episcopal statutes texts were probably either copied from council transcripts or issued in response to a synod. Such processes fit a context where the legislative thrust of the reforms passed from the king to the bishops particularly via conciliar statements and episcopal statutes. ²⁷ An indicator of this last point is that the conciliar material comprises the largest part of the legislative corpus. Further, there was a shift from a royal initiative in the early years of the reforms to an

²³ These are overlooked by Wemple; Women, pp.75-96.

²⁴ For a definition of what constituted a capitulary see F.L. Ganshof, "L'usage de l'écrit en matière administrative", MA, 57, (1951), pp.1-25, [trans. by J. Sondheimer as "The use of the written word in Charlemagne's administration", The Carolingians and the Frankish Monarchy (Aberdeen, 1971), pp. 125-42]; McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.1-44; J.L. Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus under Charles the Bald", Politics and Ritual, pp.91-116.

²⁵ The "Capitula Karoli Magni" (803-13); the "Capitulare vel missorum vel synodalia" (813); and the "Capitula de presbyteris admonendis" (809), can be classified as episcopal documents; McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.18.

²⁶ Some parts of the manuscript, Clm 6333 are very similar to the Councils of Reisbach, Salsbourg, and Freising (800); P.A. Dold, "Die Texte der bayerischen Synodal Statuten von Reisbach und Freising", DA, 8, (1950), pp.368-76. Similar to these are the "synodal decisions" in Laon MS 201, PL89, cols.821-24. These may be related to a Burgundian council post 813 since they contain five of the decisions of the Councils of Mainz (813); McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.72.

²⁷ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, chs.1 and 2.

episcopal one ²⁸; by the late ninth century there were fewer royally convoked General councils. ²⁹ However, there also seems to have been fewer provincial Church councils ³⁰ or, at least, no record for many. ³¹ This, alongside the fact that a significant proportion of councils in this later period were diocesan ³², may suggest that bishops were overseeing the lives of women more directly in their own dioceses. An increasingly localised initiative is also evidenced by the episcopal statutes over half of which were produced after 843. ³³

Although capitularies were royal promulgations ³⁴, there is no surviving "official" archive. Private collections predominate, the most important being the capitularies of

²⁸ Charlemagne's "Reform Councils" of 813 are representative of royally-convoked legislation; but by 844 the bishops assumed the initiative, merely requiring royal assistance; McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.12-13,15-16.

²⁹ The more important in East Francia being Mainz in 852 and Tribur in 895; McKitterick, Ibid, p.50.

³⁰ McKitterick states that there were only two provincial councils called in all the Frankish kingdoms in the late ninth century - Cologne in 887 and Metz in 893; Ibid, p.50. But, Isolde Schröder's analysis of the West Frankish councils in this period, using a wider interpretation of what constituted a provincial council, suggests that although fewer in number than in the first part of the ninth century, there were twenty-two councils, (consisting of the churches from one province or from several provinces), between 886 and the Council of Trosly (909); Die Westfränkischen Synoden von 888 bis 987 und ihre Überlieferung, [MGH], (München, 1980), pp.7-13,100ff.

³¹ For example, two "provincial" councils took place in Rheims in 892, but are recorded only by Flodoard [MGH, SS, 13,Bk.4,c.6,1.8-23 and 1.19-33,pp.569,572]; Schröder, Westfränkischen Synoden, pp.115-6.

³² Schröder, Ibid, pp.100ff.

³³ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.49-50.

³⁴ Some capitularies are records of an assembly's collective deliberations and therefore evidence consensus politics: Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus", p.107; R. McKitterick, The Carolingians and the Written Word, (Cambridge, 1989), p.30.

Charlemagne and Louis the Pious compiled, circa 827, by Ansegis ³⁵; Hincmar of Rheims' collection ³⁶; Gherbald of Liège's collection ³⁷ and that of Benedictus Levita.³⁸ The pattern of capitulary survival is explained by the role of ecclesiastical archives as preservers of manuscripts. ³⁹ The redactors of conciliar material were also bishops or abbots. We know that Lupus of Ferrières wrote up the Council of Ver (844). ⁴⁰ However, the role of Hincmar in recording council proceedings was again probably vital.

The lack of an official capitulary archive presupposes a line between private and public actions which was often transgressed. ⁴¹ But "private" collections may constitute only a proportion of capitularies actually issued,

³⁵ MGH Capit. I, pp.382-450.

³⁶ Hincmar maintained a capitulary tradition under Charles the Bald as the hand behind 30 out of the surviving 58 capitularies, and as the preserver of a possible further 23; Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus", p.97. Subsequently, Nelson has qualified her view of Hincmar's role pointing to Mordek's identification of a non-Rheims provenance for MS Yale Beinecke 413; the varied local origins of three versions of the 853 capitulary of Servais; and the likely authorship of Abbot Gauzlin of St. Germain for the 877 capitulary of Quierzy; "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.289.

³⁷ MGH Capit. Episc., pp.3-42.

³⁸ PL97, cols.699-912. This collection may be "invaluable for fathoming the interests of contemporary ecclesiastics, but it never reached the wide public which Pseudo-Isidore did"; Walter Ullmann, Law and Politics in the Middle Ages, (London, 1975), p.130. Its mix of genuine and false capitularies is highlighted by Hubert Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien", in Hubert Mordek, (ed.), Überlieferung und Geltung normativer Texte des frühen und hohen Mittelalters, [Quellen und Forschungen zum Recht im Mittelalter; ed. R. Kottje and H. Mordek], (Sigmaringen, 1986), pp.25-50, at p.36.

³⁹ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.25-44; and concerning the role of monastic schools producing and preserving collections of secular leges, The Carolingians, pp.40-60.

⁴⁰ L. Levillain, Loup de Ferrières, Correspondance, (Paris, 1927-35), I, Ep. 43, p.182.

⁴¹ Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus", p.94.

reflecting the compiler's interests. Ansegis' collection has been criticised for containing only twenty-six out of a possible hundred capitularies for Charlemagne's and Louis the Pious' reigns. ⁴² But, if Ansegis' collection represents "a systematic, deliberate and carefully constructed selection" used by Carolingian kings as a digest ⁴³, we may attribute a didactic function to certain capitularies. Such an intention would explain why later capitulary copies are highly dependent on former collections, especially that of Ansegis ⁴⁴; and why some of the capitularies preserved by Hincmar have the form of rather generalised responses, despite being generated originally by actual problems. ⁴⁵

There may also have been a difference between conciliar texts with an immediate legislative function and those written up later with didactic intent. Jonas of Orleans' authorship for the Council of Paris (829) has been suggested because De Institutione Regia is included in the council proceedings. ⁴⁶ This indicates that important councils were altered and edited. ⁴⁷ Bishops in their dioceses used more abbreviated versions of councils ⁴⁸, so that the source we use, sometimes expanded with theological treatise, may be rather different from the original text. ⁴⁹

⁴² Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien", p.37.

⁴³ McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.35.

⁴⁴ Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus", pp.95,98,99.

⁴⁵ McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.36.

⁴⁶ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.22-3.

⁴⁷ The Council of Paris (829) as "a treatise on ecclesiastical organization" is quite different in form from earlier councils, except for Frankfurt (794); McKitterick, Ibid, p.22.

⁴⁸ McKitterick, Ibid, p.24.

⁴⁹ A Rule for canonesses was introduced in 816; but the final version of the Institutio Sanctimonialium (henceforth IS) including Hieronymus' letter to Eustochium, and extracts from Sts. Cyprian, Caesarius and Athanasius must have been drawn up some time after the

The editing of capitulary and conciliar texts is further evidenced by the manuscript tradition. None of the existing capitularies survive in the original, casting doubt over some texts' relevance for the date of their promulgation.⁵⁰ Much of the conciliar material survive only as later copies.⁵¹ It is also difficult to estimate the comparative importance of texts. While some councils and capitularies survive in one manuscript, others exist in several copies.⁵² Moreover, the survival of texts in several regional copies⁵³ may imply that they were implemented over a wider area.

As with the capitularies more episcopal statutes⁵⁴ survive from the West Frankish kingdoms including Theodulf of Orleans' Capitula written before the Reform councils of

proceedings at Aachen, MGH Conc. II i, pp.422-56.

⁵⁰ "wir... in die Reälitäten der Zeit keinen unverstellten Einblick hätten"; Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien", p.32.

⁵¹ The five Reform councils of 813 exist in three tenth-century manuscripts; and their survival in composite manuscript form further detracts from their original, diverse regional character; MGH Conc. II i, p.247. Also, McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.21-23.

⁵² Only one tenth-century manuscript survives for the Council of Reims (800) [MGH Conc. II i, p.205] whereas eight manuscripts survive for the IS including five ninth-century copies and another with ninth-century parts [MGH Conc. II i, p.422].

⁵³ Three of the four distinct forms of the capitulary of Servais (853) indicate different local origins; and the comparatively large manuscript family of the Edict of Pitres suggests preservation in multiple forms: Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.289.

⁵⁴ A proper appreciation of this corpus as a whole is relatively recent; see McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.45-79; and the critical edition by Peter Brommer, MGH Capitula Episcoporum, (Hanover, 1984). A small number of individual episcopal statutes have been examined; Peter Brommer "Die Quellen der Capitula Radulfs von Bourges", Francia, 5, (1977), pp.27-43; R. Amiet "Une Admonitio Synodalis de l'époque carolingienne. Étude critique et édition.", Medieval Studies, 26, (1964), pp.12-82.

813 and 18 other sets compiled after 843.⁵⁵ Gherbald of Liège's statutes represent the middle kingdom, again prior to 813⁵⁶, but there were also statutes by his successor Waltcauld⁵⁷ plus two later Trier texts.⁵⁸ The East Frankish kingdoms are also less well represented with Haito of Basle's statutes⁵⁹ and a handful of early ninth-century anonymous texts from Bavaria.⁶⁰

This regional and chronological pattern may be characterised by different intentions. It has been argued that early West Frankish statutes were devoted to "organizing their parishes and dioceses to form a society wholly Christian" both in religious and social terms.⁶¹ Statutes with a Bavarian provenance also evidence "a clear conception of the pastoral ideal".⁶² But Hincmar exemplifies how as "parochial and diocesan organization became more firmly established and government procedures more sophisticated, the statutes became more absorbed in matters of administrative detail".⁶³ However, there are very few statutes from Bavaria; textually and

⁵⁵ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.50.

⁵⁶ MGH Capit. Episc., pp.3-42.

⁵⁷ MGH Capit. Episc., pp.43-49.

⁵⁸ The Anonymous and Ruotger; MGH Capit. Episc., pp.53-70.

⁵⁹ MGH Capit. Episc., pp.203-19.

⁶⁰ Capitula Presbyterorum; V. Krause (ed.), "Die Münchener Hs 3851, 3852, mit einer compilation von 181 Wormser Schlüssen", NA, 19 (1894) pp.117-118; Anonymous of Freising: E. Seckel (ed.) "Studien zu Benedictus Levita, II, Capitula episcopi cuiusdam Frisingensia", NA, 29 (1904) pp.287-94; Laon MS 201 in PL89 cols.821-24; and Vat. Ottob.261: A. Werminghoff (ed.), "Reise nach Italien im Jahre 1901", NA, 27, (1902) pp.580-7 to which McKitterick assigns a south-east rather than a Rheims provenance; The Frankish Church, pp.73-4. The first two of these texts have clear similarities with Haito's statutes.

⁶¹ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.68.

⁶² McKitterick, Ibid, pp.72-3.

⁶³ McKitterick, Ibid.

chronologically they are similar so that the conclusion that they evidence a response to a less christianised area⁶⁴ should be tentative. Further, while Hincmar's statutes do seem preoccupied with administrative details, other West Frankish statutes, as much in the later as the early ninth century, still contain a pastoral content.⁶⁵ Perhaps Hincmar's statutes evidence a trend particularly strong in his diocese⁶⁶ which did not preclude concerns about non-christian practices.⁶⁷

Brommer's categorisation of the statutes allows comparison between successive bishops⁶⁸ but some statutes were more influential than others. While many of the anonymous statutes occur in one manuscript⁶⁹, there are many regional copies of the statutes of Theodulf of Orleans⁷⁰, Gherbald of Liège⁷¹, and the Admonitio Synod-

⁶⁴ McKitterick, Ibid, p.73.

⁶⁵ For example, the statutes of Rodulf of Bourges [MGH Capit. Episc., pp.227-68.] and Herard of Tours [PL121, cols.763-74].

⁶⁶ He was, as he states, a metropolitan bishop; PL125, col.773A.

⁶⁷ East Frankish bishops may demonstrate in legislative texts more initiative than their West Frankish contemporaries, presenting new solutions to old questions since West Frankish ecclesiastics had a greater knowledge of ancient church law; Wilfrid Hartmann, "Der Rechtliche Zustand der Kirchen auf dem Lande: Die Eigenkirche in der Fränkischen Gesetzgebung des 7. bis 9. Jahrhundert", Spoleto, 28, (1982), pp.397-441.

⁶⁸ Waltcauld of Liège's statutes are similar to the first and third of Gherbald's; MGH Capit. Episc. pp.43-9.

⁶⁹ For example, the Anonymous of Trier; MGH Capit. Episc., p.54.

⁷⁰ For example, Theodulf's first statute exists in 49 manuscripts, nine from the ninth and four from the tenth century; MGH Capit. Episc., pp.75-102.

⁷¹ The first set of Gherbald's statutes exists in 22 manuscripts. Also influential sets of statutes co-exist within the same manuscript: the ninth-century MS Paris BN Lat.2316 contains the second of Theodulf of Orleans' capitula and the first of Gherbald's statutes; this latter is also in the eleventh-century MS Camb. Corpus Christi 265 alongside both of Theodulf's statutes and those of

alis ⁷². Hence apparent "regional" characteristics of the original texts may not be applicable to areas using later copies.

Episcopal statutes may be more helpful than other categories of legislation in deciding "how far rules reflect social reality". ⁷³ Bishops stated that priests should have the statutes at hand ⁷⁴; and church inventories in Bavaria show that local priests possessed liturgical texts, a Canon poenitentialis, a Collectarium and, importantly, a liber canonum. ⁷⁵ Although these Bavarian inventories happen to have survived, there is no reason to assume that other churches did not have similar texts; the diocese of Rheims had similar, if fewer, inventories. ⁷⁶ However, certain areas may produce this evidence because of an active bishop and scriptorium such as at Freising ⁷⁷ and Rheims.

There is evidence for the publication of capitularies⁷⁸

Rodulf of Bourges; MGH Capit. Episc., pp.5-16.

⁷² This exists in 23 manuscripts from Mainz, Verona, Worms, Picardy and Provence; Amiet, "Une Admonitio Synodalis de l'époque carolingienne", pp.13-40.

⁷³ Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus", p.99

⁷⁴ "Ut sacerdos libros sibi necessarios correctos habeant, psalterium scilicet, lectionarium, evangelium, missalem, capitula, XL omelias et martyrologium..."; Ruotger of Trier, MGH Capit. Episc., c.5, p.63.

⁷⁵ Bavarian clerical inventories, "suggest that the thrust of the reforming efforts such as those of Gherbald and Haito or of the local episcopal statutes was not merely pious wish but actually penetrated down into the diocesan fabric and represented goals which were attainable for many country churches and priests", C.H. Hammer, "Country Churches, Clerical Inventories and the Carolingian Renaissance in Bavaria", Church History, 49 (1980), pp.5-17, at p.13.

⁷⁶ Hammer, Ibid.

⁷⁷ Hartmann, "Der Rechtliche Zustand der Kirchen auf dem Lande", pp.416-20.

⁷⁸ McKitterick The Carolingians, p.30. An 861 capitulary of Charles the Bald and the Edict of Pitres reveal the process of written and oral publication;

and for their implementation.⁷⁹ These include examples some ten years after promulgation⁸⁰ which illuminates the perceived force of some texts. Despite the lack of original capitulary texts, evidence for "original" transcriptions may suggest genuine, local application.⁸¹ Louis the Pious' instructions for counts and missi to make immediate copies⁸² may evidence not just the method but actual implementation.⁸³ The many forms of the capitularies⁸⁴, some of which clearly were "aides-mémoires"⁸⁵, are thus explicable.

Although "what gave a capitulary authority was not just its origin, but its reception"⁸⁶, implementation varied within a reign and regionally. Formless capitularies may denote strong kingship, and conversely capitularies of a more formalised nature (through their "writtenness") could

Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.288.

⁷⁹ The christianisation of Saxony and Carolingian coinage reforms were the results of capitularies being implemented; Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien", p.46.

⁸⁰ Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.291, note 171.

⁸¹ Rotulus compiled his own copy of rolls at Aachen in 816 and there is a parallel list from Charlemagne's reform councils of 813; Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien", pp.32-33.

⁸² Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.288.

⁸³ Missi probably had their own versions of texts taken from an official "archive", although it is impossible to definitely attribute any particular manuscript of capitularies to a lay as opposed to an ecclesiastical missus, Nelson, Ibid, pp.281-2. Some capitulary and legal collections may have been made for and by counts; McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.35.

⁸⁴ Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien", pp.31-3.

⁸⁵ The "Capitulare missorum in Theodonis villa" (805); McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.19.

⁸⁶ Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.284.

signify a weaker royal power.⁸⁷ More capitularies survive from the reign of Charles the Bald than for any other Carolingian reign possibly because of the Rheims scriptorium⁸⁸, particularly if Latin was more readily accessible to Romance than to German speakers.⁸⁹ There is no inevitable correlation between a greater number of capitularies and royal power.⁹⁰ Yet it remains problematic that no new capitularies survive or were produced after 888.⁹¹ Even though legislative collections were possibly used as digests⁹² the fact that Charles the Bald continued to issue capitularies which drew on earlier, respected legal texts⁹³ contrasts with this silence post 888. Nevertheless, "a large proportion of the fullest collections of capitularies" date from the late ninth or early tenth centuries.⁹⁴ This may demonstrate a continuing interest in the capitulary tradition and some continuity in early tenth-century Frankish regional

⁸⁷ "Weaker" kings being Louis the Pious and Charles the Bald; Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien", p.36. But see Nelson, Ibid, pp.290-1.

⁸⁸ "a highly differential degree of interest in written law on the part of the clerical élite, and specifically of Hincmar, as compared with prelates in other kingdoms... accounted for the distinctiveness of the West Frankish capitularies between c.840 and c.880"; Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus", p.97.

⁸⁹ Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.268.

⁹⁰ Fewer capitularies survive for the latter years of Louis the Pious' reign; also assemblies were called by Louis the German but capitularies do not survive; Nelson, Ibid, p.290.

⁹¹ McKitterick, The Frankish Kingdoms, p.331.

⁹² Frankish kings in this later period perhaps referred to and acted upon existing capitularies, and did not issue new ones, "simply because those already issued had acquired the status of a law code and were still being used"; McKitterick, Ibid, pp.331-2.

⁹³ Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus".

⁹⁴ McKitterick, The Frankish Kingdoms, p.331; The Frankish Church, pp.1-44.

administration. ⁹⁵

The legal vigour of conciliar material is debatable⁹⁶ but because of its sheer mass, compared to capitulary production, it may have had more effect on people's lives.⁹⁷ McKitterick provides the best rehearsal in English of the debate over the legal vigour of the capitularies and councils. ⁹⁸ Research into literacy within Carolingian government has overtaken this debate with an appreciation of the complementary use of the oral and written word.⁹⁹ How legislative texts were used may illuminate the relationship between reality and the ideals expressed in the texts. Clerical inventories furnish some evidence of their actual use by priests ¹⁰⁰; further, episcopal

⁹⁵ McKitterick, The Frankish Kingdoms, p.132.

⁹⁶ While McKitterick argued that to give councils legal currency the subscriptions of the bishops and the confirmation of the king were necessary, she also adds that the majority of the conciliar material and capitulary texts are recorded in a much less "official" format "without subscriptions, sometimes without preamble and date"; The Frankish Church, p.24. Mordek commented that synodal decrees did not require authentication to be binding, "Karolingische Kapitularien", p.31.

⁹⁷ Capitularies were an important contribution to the reforms but were ultimately limited because there were only three placita generalia per year; Mordek, "Karolingische Kapitularien" pp.47-50.

⁹⁸ McKitterick modified Ganshof's general analysis of capitularies as the king's oral promulgations of an assembly, The Frankish Church, pp.1-44. Nelson further modified Ganshof's view that the capitularies of Charles the Bald were necessarily weaker than Charlemagne's ["Legislation and Consensus"]; also Italian capitulary tradition parallels Charles the Bald's capitulary production [Nelson, "Literacy in Carolingian Government", p.289].

⁹⁹ "The implications of the capitulary evidence... are that levels of at least pragmatic literacy were high enough for there to be some relation between the ideal of the capitularies and the realities of Frankish society as far as communications are concerned"; McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.33.

¹⁰⁰ See n.75 above.

handbooks indicate episcopal initiative.¹⁰¹ Scriptoria from the West Frankish kingdoms evidence the best survival rate for texts since "most monasteries and cathedrals possessed a canonical collection of some sort".¹⁰² Although much sparser evidence survives for the East Frankish kingdoms and Bavaria¹⁰³ the fact that the majority of capitularies and council decrees survive in these episcopal handbooks indicates that "they were designed from the outset to serve as handbooks of reference for the ministering clergy".¹⁰⁴ This gives some indication of the practical way a bishop might use texts—the ancient conciliar material in conjunction with contemporary reform legislation. Ecclesiastical archives may have been used by clerics, learning and transmitting texts orally.¹⁰⁵

The didactic intention of much legislative material¹⁰⁶ explains its highly derivative nature. Capitulary and conciliar collections relied heavily on older collections especially the Dionysio-Hadriana — a set of Greek canons translated in the sixth century into Latin and given by Pope Hadrian to Charlemagne in 774, marking "official Carolingian recognition of the priority of Rome over national or local collections".¹⁰⁷ But older non-Roman

¹⁰¹ For a survey of cathedral and monastic library collections: McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.25-44; The Carolingians, pp.165-196.

¹⁰² McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.32.

¹⁰³ The entry in the Reichenau catalogue of 822, "capitula domni Karoli et domni Hladowici imperatorum", probably refer to royal capitula; McKitterick, Ibid, pp.28-9. On Reichenau's "thoughtful systemization" as evidence for a developing canon of knowledge; McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.181.

¹⁰⁴ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.43.

¹⁰⁵ Laici may also have had entry to ecclesiastical libraries; McKitterick, The Carolingians, pp.261-6.

¹⁰⁶ The Council of Tribur (895) states its intention to provide a work for future reference and instruction; McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.24-5.

¹⁰⁷ Wallace-Hadrill, The Frankish Church, p.294.

collections - the Vetus Gallica and the Hispana, as well as sets of canons like Pseudo-Isidore continued to be referred to.¹⁰⁸ The importance of these older canonical collections is attested by their widespread survival in ecclesiastical archives.¹⁰⁹ The inclusion of ancient conciliar material in contemporary legislation¹¹⁰ is relevant since it is often judiciously included and tailored, or subtly changed to fit contemporary requirements¹¹¹; biblical references were also used as analogies for contemporary circumstances.

Certain interpretations of the reforms' effect on women depend on viewing recurring prescriptions as evidence of their successful implementation.¹¹² Each case should be taken individually and contrasted where possible with other evidence; but, repeated prescriptions may reveal unsuccessful application.¹¹³ As the late ninth century evidences only copies of earlier capitularies this may also suggest that unsolved problems remained. The episcopal statutes are highly dependent on capitularies, ancient and more recent conciliar decrees and other

¹⁰⁸ Other canonical collections included the Dacheriana and the Hispana of Autun; Gerard Fransen, Les Collections Canoniques, [Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Occidental Fasc.10], (Turnhout, 1973).

¹⁰⁹ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.30-41.

¹¹⁰ The first 59 canons of the Admonitio Generalis, (789), comprises a résumé of the Dionysio-Hadriana; MGH Capit. I, pp.52-62.

¹¹¹ Although the Edict of Pitres deals with matters of defence its frequent references to earlier capitularies highlights a general point since "there is no sense here of merely formulaic repetition: the older provisions were often modified or supplemented"; Nelson, "Legislation and Consensus", p.98.

¹¹² Wemple, Women, pp.165-174.

¹¹³ The Synod of Frankfurt (794) reissued many of the disciplinary measures of the Admonitio Generalis thus relecting "the constant struggle against backsliding among Frankish clergy and monks"; Judith Herrin, The Formation of Christendom, (Princeton, 1987), p.441.

episcopal statutes. ¹¹⁴ Such derivation may represent symbolic, almost venerated, repetition; but this need not preclude the suspicion that aspects of women's behaviour remained unchanged. However, although Rodulf of Bourges relied on an influential precursor like Theodulf, his statutes are nevertheless "original". ¹¹⁵ Rodulf showed great variety in the selection of his material ¹¹⁶ perhaps having the particular needs of his diocese in mind. These arguments are relevant for other sets of statutes. ¹¹⁷

The Penitentials.

The penitentials mirror the legislation's concerns to regulate the lives of secular women through correct adherence to Christian precepts for marriage and motherhood; but penitentials provide additional information on aspects of day-to-day life, or at least the clerical perception of it. ¹¹⁸ Episcopal statutes gave the guidelines for priests to order the lives of the laity; penitentials then provided the priest with the means ¹¹⁹ to correct behaviour not in accordance with these guidelines. Provision of penances for lapses from a regular or canonical life, reveals information for the

¹¹⁴ The model for the episcopal statutes was probably a set of statutes ascribed to Boniface of Mainz; McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.47-9.

¹¹⁵ Brommer "Die Quellen der Capitula Radulfs von Bourges", pp.27-43.

¹¹⁶ Rodulf also derived material from the Councils of Mainz and Chalons (813); Ansegis; Halitgar of Cambrai's penitential; Hrabanus Maurus' De Institutione Clericorum; and the 853 Capitulary of Soissons: Brommer, Ibid, pp.42-43.

¹¹⁷ Ruotger of Trier's statutes are also very derivative from Theodulf's, but could be as relevant for the early tenth century. Other sets of statutes are straight copyings: Hildegard of Meaux' "entire statute is Theodulf's first set of capitula"; McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.62.

¹¹⁸ For example, the preparation of food and drink, working practices, sexual practices, and the practicalities of child-care.

¹¹⁹ Penances constituted living on bread and water and also sexual abstinence; less frequently, fines or the giving of alms were included.

behaviour of religious women, less plentiful in the episcopal statutes.

The term "penitentials" is used here to denote two types of texts. These are "exclusive penitentials (which) are contrasted with bodies of penitential canons with supplementary materials which make up larger collections".¹²⁰ Three broad strands can be identified: firstly, the series of insular and continental libelli constituting the "exclusive penitential" type dating from the sixth to the early ninth century ¹²¹; secondly, the period from the Carolingian reforms up to 900 which saw the development of the supplemented types of texts such as Theodulf's Capitula, the Penitentials of Halitgar of Cambrai and Hrabanus Maurus, and the Quadripartitus ¹²²; thirdly, the "post-Carolingian" grouping which includes Regino's

¹²⁰ P.J. Payer, "The Humanism of the Penitentials", Medieval Studies, 48, (1984), pp. 340-354, at pp.345-6.

¹²¹ These penitentials fall into two groups. Group 1) up to c.650 are a) gallic or breton; b) irish or celtic such as the Penitential of Vinnian; and c) columbanan. Group 2) covers the peak period for the penitentials from the mid-seventh century up to the Carolingian reform period, 813-850. These are a) insular penitentials both ancient (the Penitentials of Cummean and Theodore), and new (the Penitentials of Bede and Pseudo-Bede, the Penitentials of Egbert and Pseudo-Egbert and the Confessional of Egbert); b) continental penitentials which fall into four groups - i) a columbanan group including the Burgundian, Bobbio, Paris, Fleury, St. Hubert, Vindobonense and St. Gall "Simplex" Penitentials ii) a cummean-theodoran group including the Rheims and Bigotian Penitentials and the Excarpsus Cummeani; iii) a columbanan-cummean-theodoran group including the Merseburg and Martenian Penitentials and the Judgement of Clement; iv) a spanish group including the Vigilia Penitential; C. Vogel, Les "Libri Poenitentiales", [Typologie des sources du moyen age occidental, Fasc.27] (Turnhout, 1978), pp.60-80: supplemented by A.J. Frantzen, (Turnhout, 1985).

¹²² Vogel includes in this section the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore; Ibid, pp.81-4. But this is a Frankish compilation based on the libelli type; P.J. Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, (Toronto, London 1984), pp.60-2. Frantzen noted its "Halitgar-type" components, Les "Libri Paenitentiales", p.37.

Ecclesiastical Discipline. 123

The Capitula of Theodulf of Orleans contain a significant degree of penitential material ¹²⁴ and Regino of Prüm's Ecclesiastical Discipline contains much canonical material. ¹²⁵ This is explicable in terms of a response to the tenor of the reforms and the subsequent perceived practical use of the penitentials. The Council of Châlons (813) ordered that since penance should be meted out according to the ancient canons, Scriptural authority and ecclesiastical custom, penitential libelli should be repudiated and eliminated since they were marked by certain errors and uncertain authorship. ¹²⁶ For the same reason the Council of Paris (829) ordered bishops to seek out these texts and burn them. ¹²⁷ This evidence has been taken to argue that "the penitentials... were an ephemeral and ultimately despised intrusion into the Frankish Church", the main objection to them being "their illegitimate and undoubtedly foreign origin". ¹²⁸

However, the manuscript traditions of several of the earlier penitential libelli show that they continued to be copied in the ninth century. ¹²⁹ This indicating that

¹²³ Prior to the Decretum of Burchard of Worms this group of penitentials comprises pseudo-Roman types; Anglo-Saxon types such as the Pseudo-Egbert Penitential; and Regino's Ecclesiastical Discipline; Vogel, Ibid, pp.84-8 and Frantzen, pp.37-42.

¹²⁴ Vogel classified this text as a penitential, Ibid, p.84.

¹²⁵ Vogel doubts the relevance of the term "penitential" to describe the Ecclesiastical Discipline; Ibid, pp.87-8.

¹²⁶ MGH Conc. II i,c.38,p.281.

¹²⁷ MGH Conc. II ii,c.32,p.633.

¹²⁸ Rosamond Pierce, "The "Frankish" Penitentials", SCH, 11, (1975), pp.31-9, at pp.34,32.

¹²⁹ Ninth-century manuscripts survive for the Penitentials of Bede and Egbert: R. Kottje, Die Bussbücher Halitgars von Cambrai und des Hrabanus Maurus (ihre Überlieferung und ihre Quellen), (Berlin, 1980), p.207, note 180. A late eighth-century manuscript of the

these older penitentials continued to be used. Further, new Frankish penitentials in the style of the earlier libelli are "witness to the persistence of the older penitential tradition". ¹³⁰

Therefore the reformers at Châlons and Paris were possibly attempting to reform or regulate the penitentials rather than eradicate them. ¹³¹ Rodulf of Bourges condemned the use of penitentials. ¹³² But other bishops, whilst not explicitly recommending the use of penitentials, (and no other episcopal statutes condemn them), may have been using penitentials in practice. Their appreciation of the authority of ancient canonical texts alongside the usefulness of the penitential as a practical tool explains why and how "Frankish authors made distinctive use of the penitentials". ¹³³

Penitential of Vinnian survives, and the Penitentials of Cummean and Columbanus exist in a manuscript connected with Hrabanus Maurus from the second half of the ninth century; R. Kottje, "Überlieferung und Rezeption der irischen Bussbücher auf dem Kontinent", in H. Löwe (ed.) Die Iren und Europa im Frühmittelalter, (Stuttgart 1982) [1], pp.511-24.

¹³⁰ Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.62. Other penitentials produced in the ninth century included the Penitential of Fleury (775-800), the Judgement of Clement (800), the St. Gall "Simplex" Penitential (ninth century), the Martinian Penitential (ninth century) and the Rheims Penitential (850): Vogel, Les "Libri Paenitentiales", pp.75-9 and Frantzen, pp.30-3. The insular characteristics of these ninth-century Frankish texts should not be exaggerated; A.J. Frantzen, "The Significance of the Frankish Penitentials", J. Eccles. Hist., 30, (1979), pp.409-421, at p.409. Thus the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore is a Frankish compilation dating c.830/847; Vogel, Les Libri Paenitentiales, pp.82-3. Moreover, the Frankish tradition greatly influenced the Anglo-Saxon penitential tradition in the tenth century: A.J. Frantzen, "The tradition of penitentials in Anglo-Saxon England", Anglo-Saxon England, 11, (1983), pp.23-56.

¹³¹ Frantzen, "The Significance of the Frankish Penitentials", p.410.

¹³² MGH Capit. Episc., c.33, p.259.

¹³³ Frantzen, "The Frankish Penitentials", p.414.

The Penitential of Halitgar ¹³⁴, epitomises how "the Franks combined the penitential tariffs of the handbook with canonical decisions and theological instruction of a more formal, doctrinal kind". ¹³⁵ This penitential consists of six books. ¹³⁶ The first five deal with a general discussion of penance, the laity's sexual offences, and clerical offences using material derived from patristic sources, conciliar decrees and papal decretals. The sixth book, while claiming Roman authority to give the text orthodoxy, is in fact derived from various penitentials. ¹³⁷ In contrast, Hrabanus Maurus' Paenitentiale ad Otgarium ¹³⁸ contains no material from earlier penitentials; but Hrabanus' second penitential, the Paenitentiale ad Heribaldum ¹³⁹, although a reproduction of much of the first penitential clearly has knowledge of the Penitentials of Theodore and Egbert.¹⁴⁰ Hrabanus does not actually refer to Theodore as a penitential ¹⁴¹ nor does Halitgar acknowledge his use of penitential sources. However, the importance of Halitgar's Penitential is that it evidences how such a work was used practically: it "would be more serviceable than the two penitentials of Hrabanus Maurus, which are no more than

¹³⁴ Dated c.817-830; Kottje, Die Bussbücher Halitgars, p.5.

¹³⁵ Frantzen, "The Significance of the Frankish Penitentials", p.419.

¹³⁶ Books 1-5: PL105 cols.649-710; Book 6: Wasserschleben, pp.360-377.

¹³⁷ Kottje, Die Bussbücher Halitgars, pp.185-90; and especially the Penitential of Columbanus concerning sexual matters, Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.66.

¹³⁸ PL112, cols.1397-1424; dated by Kottje to 841-2, Die Bussbücher Halitgars, pp.6-7.

¹³⁹ PL110 cols.467-94 and dated by Kottje to 853; Ibid.

¹⁴⁰ Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, pp.68-71; Kottje, Die Bussbücher Halitgars, pp.204-212.

¹⁴¹ Hrabanus employs the term constitutiones and attributes three canons from Theodore to the Councils of Ancyra; Kottje, Die Bussbücher Halitgars, pp.210-11. In response to Reginbald, Bishop of Mainz, concerning a case of incest, Hrabanus Maurus again uses Theodore without acknowledgment; Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.69.

anthologies of conciliar and decretal sources". 142

The Quadripartitus comprises four books. The first three contain patristic fragments; but the fourth and by far the largest book consists of two parts, the first comprising a penitential in the strict sense and the second an amalgam of conciliar, patristic and decretal texts. 143 Thus the Quadripartitus is, like Halitgar's work, a compilation of the orthodoxy of canonical sources and the practicality of penitential material; and "as such it epitomises the dual character of the whole Carolingian Reform" where "penance was both a means and an end". 144

Thus bishops were using the libelli in their own post-reform way. 145 By the time of Regino's Ecclesiastical Discipline there had been a resolution of the tension which dictated "the tendency of official literature quite consciously to steer away from these manuals and their unofficial use". 146 Regino cites Roman authority but he also acknowledges the penitential authority of Theodore and Bede. 147 Regino's acceptance of Bede and Theodore "is itself evidence of the vitality of the Frankish

142 Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, pp.68-70.

143 E.L. Richter, Antiqua canonum collectio, (Marburg 1848). The sources of the Quadripartitus include the Excarpsus Cummeani, Halitgar's Penitential, the Pseudo-Egbert Penitential and material attributed to Bede; F. Kerff, Der Quadripartitus: Ein handbuch der karolingischen Kirchenreform. Überlieferung, Quellen und Rezeption, (Sigmaringen 1982), pp.54-66. While I have been unable to consult Richter's edition, Kerff provides a résumé of the sources of the canons in Book 4 and where they correspond to those in the Ecclesiastical Discipline, pp.93-114.

144 Review of F. Kerff, Der Quadripartitus; J.L. Nelson, The Legal History Review, 54 (1986), pp.410-413, at p.412.

145 So Hincmar may have been responsible for the Quadripartitus; Nelson, Ibid.

146 Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.71.

147 Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.1,c.96,p.26.

penitential tradition" ¹⁴⁸ and illustrates the continued use of the penitential tradition connected and not divorced from the canonical texts "to which they are clearly related". ¹⁴⁹

The manuscript survival for the penitentials created in response to the reforms is also significantly plentiful for the ninth century. Halitgar's Penitential exists as a single tradition in four ninth-century hands ¹⁵⁰; two further ninth-century copies exist with an appended section. ¹⁵¹ The Quadripartitus survives in nine manuscripts including two late ninth-century ones ¹⁵²; and the survival of the Ecclesiastical Discipline in four tenth-century manuscripts ¹⁵³ highlights continuity of penitential use.

Practical application is also illustrated by the fact

¹⁴⁸ Frantzen, "The Frankish Penitentials", p.415. Frantzen suggests that Regino was referring to a Pseudo-Bede text, pp.415-7. The many texts dubiously ascribed to Bede, Theodore and Egbert to give them extra authority are clarified by Vogel; Les "Libri Paenitentiales", pp.70-83.

¹⁴⁹ Frantzen, "The Frankish Penitentials", p.409.

¹⁵⁰ One of these, Reginensis 207, is very close to the actual date of the Penitential; Kottje, Die Bussbücher Halitgars, pp.84-6.

¹⁵¹ This is the De reparatione lapsi; the oldest copy, St. Gall 277, dates from the second quarter of the ninth century and has connections with Hrabanus Maurus and Fulda; Kottje, Ibid, p.86. Hrabanus' Paenitentiale ad Heribaldum exists in three ninth-century hands as does the Paenitentiale ad Otgari; but there are also three eleventh-century copies of the Paenitentiale Heribaldum with Halitgar's Book 6 appended to it; Kottje, Ibid, pp.111-139.

¹⁵² Vat.lat.1347 and Stuttgart HB VII 62; but the influence of the Quadripartitus was clearly greater than the manuscript survival suggests as it was a source for Regino of Prüm and the late Anglo-Saxon church via the Excerpta Egberti; Kerff, Der Quadripartitus, pp.67-76,78.

¹⁵³ Also one eleventh-century and a tenth or eleventh-century manuscript; J.T. McNeill and H.M. Gamer, Medieval Handbooks of Penance, (ed. and trans.), (Columbia, 1938), pp.439-40.

that some liturgical texts contained penitentials.¹⁵⁴ Moreover, a feature of Frankish penitentials ¹⁵⁵ is that they incorporate the liturgical ordo confessionis. This offers "insight into the procedure of confession and the psychological strategy which the priest used to induce candour in the penitent". ¹⁵⁶ The fact that the ordo was liturgical in origin and has links with the performance of public penance ¹⁵⁷ need not detain us here. ¹⁵⁸ Suffice to say that although some penitential compilers and other ecclesiastics refer to public penance ¹⁵⁹, such references do not mean that this system triumphed over the private penance system. In fact, "the two systems blended rather naturally... and it is easy to exaggerate the conflict between the two kinds of observance". ¹⁶⁰ It is likely that public penance was perceived to be appropriate for public sins ¹⁶¹ and private penance for private sins. ¹⁶²

Actual usage is suggested by the facts that some episcopal statutes instruct the priest to have a

¹⁵⁴ The PRG contains the Ecclesiastical Discipline; C. Vogel, Medieval Liturgy. An Introduction to the Sources. [Revised and trans. W.G. Storey and N. Rasmussen], (Washington, 1986), p.233.

¹⁵⁵ And English penitentials based on them; Frantzen, "The Frankish Penitentials", p.418; also, "The tradition of penitentials in Anglo-Saxon England".

¹⁵⁶ Frantzen, "The Frankish Penitentials", p.418.

¹⁵⁷ Frantzen, Ibid, pp.418-9.

¹⁵⁸ For a discussion of the origins and procedure of the two types of penance see Cyrille Vogel, Le pécheur et la pénitence au Moyen Age, (Paris, 1969).

¹⁵⁹ Regino of Prüm, Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.1 c.296,p.157; Hincmar of Rheims, PL125,c.13,col.776A.

¹⁶⁰ Frantzen, "The Frankish Penitentials", pp.418-9.

¹⁶¹ Incest was perceived as part of the public domain. The community were therefore not to associate with those guilty of incest; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.184,p.285.

¹⁶² A dichotomy described by Hrabanus Maurus; PL112,col.1400.

penitential ¹⁶³ and that Bavarian clerical inventories show that priests had these handbooks. ¹⁶⁴ As with the episcopal statutes, residual copies of penitentials may have been learned from and transmitted orally. ¹⁶⁵ Yet these points need not demonstrate either that penitentials were used properly or that they reflect reality. The view that penitentials were part of a missionary Church's efforts to deal with primitive Christianity is countered by the fact that penitentials continued to evolve in the ninth century. ¹⁶⁶ But because the penitentials were disseminated over time and space it is difficult to discern within them responses to regional differences when certain texts like the Penitential of Theodore were particularly influential. ¹⁶⁷ The use of material from earlier libelli and canonical sources is problematic; but continued use suggests that clerics regarded the material as still relevant.

The penitentials have hardly been utilised as a source for studying women. ¹⁶⁸ Comprehensive examinations concerning the development of penance have been conducted. ¹⁶⁹ Studies on marriage have made some use of the penitentials

¹⁶³ Hatto of Basle: MGH Capit. Episc., c.6, p.211; Gherbald of Liège: MGH Capit. Episc., III, c.9, p.40; also Interrogationis examinatis: MGH Capit., I, c.3, p.234, and Quae a presbiteri discenda sint; MGH Capit., I, c.7, p.235.

¹⁶⁴ N.75 above.

¹⁶⁵ Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.8.

¹⁶⁶ Frantzen, "The Frankish Penitentials", p.421.

¹⁶⁷ This seventh or early eighth-century penitential exists in 3 eighth-century, 2 eighth/ninth-century, 12 ninth-century and 3 ninth/tenth-century manuscripts; McNeill and Gamer, Medieval Handbooks of Penance, pp.432-6.

¹⁶⁸ Wemple uses the Judgement of Clement as evidence for the seventh century [Women, pp.141-2] whereas Vogel dates this text to c.800 [Les "Libri Paenitentiales", p.78]. Wemple also does not utilise post-reform ninth-century penitentials and one such, the Penitential of St. Hubert, is used as evidence for "Merovingian" marriage practices, Ibid, p.41 and note 76.

¹⁶⁹ Vogel, Le pécheur et la pénitence.

but usually for a study of law rather than of women.¹⁷⁰ References to homosexuality in the penitentials have been examined.¹⁷¹ Broader surveys of the sexual content have also been conducted¹⁷² and examined in particular for their information for contraceptive practices.¹⁷³ Some of the studies on marriage and on sexuality, especially Payer's work, contains much which is relevant for women, but the gender-specific nature of some of the material has been overlooked.¹⁷⁴

It is unlikely that the penitentials represent the results of clerics' prurient imagination.¹⁷⁵ Rather, "the persistence of certain regulations, selective borrowings, modifications made to previous canons, and new additions all indicate" that the penitentials "represent responses to actual experiences".¹⁷⁶ Therefore the penitentials were more of a clerical response to behaviour than a juridical set of texts. But we should be wary of following too closely Vogel's interpretation of the texts as not

¹⁷⁰ Raoul Manselli, "Il Matrimonio nei Penitenziali", Spoleto, 24, (1977), pp.287-315 which is more survey than analysis.

¹⁷¹ John Boswell, Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality, (Chicago 1980), pp.169-206.

¹⁷² P.J. Payer "Early medieval regulations concerning marital sexual relations", J.Med.Hist., 6, (1980), pp.353-376 and most useful is his Sex and the Penitentials; J. Brundage, Law, Sex and Christian Society in Medieval Europe, (Chicago, 1987), especially ch.4 although this concentrates on a later period.

¹⁷³ J.T. Noonan, Contraception. A History of its Treatment by the Catholic Theologians and Canonists, (Cambridge, Mass., 1965).

¹⁷⁴ However, for a gender-specific interpretation of some of the contraceptive penances see Noonan, Contraception, pp.160-1 and see below, pp.348-51ff.

¹⁷⁵ Although Theodulf of Orleans warned his priests not to list the various sins to lay penitents lest it gave them ideas which they had not previously thought of, MGH Capit. Episc., II,c.14,p.176.

¹⁷⁶ Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.12-13.

even instructional or didactic ¹⁷⁷ since it is unclear to what extent the penances were actually followed. Whilst the gravity of the penance probably reflects the perceived gravity of the offence ¹⁷⁸, this perception was clerical.

This clerical perception has implications for this study. The attitude that the priest needed the means to instruct and correct himself in order to do the same for the laity is reflected in ninth-century penitential tradition; hence it is significant that monachus present in monastic sources cited in the Quadripartitus is substituted by homo. ¹⁷⁹ But homo (or person) may not always denote men and women. Penitentials may reveal attitudes that particular sins were committed exclusively or mainly by women, and that consequently the sin was deserving of a greater penance; and/or that women deserved a greater penalty for sins that men also committed. ¹⁸⁰ This misogyny may not always have been successfully translated into repressive action; but a possible discrepancy between a male clerical view, as expressed in a penitential, of how women were likely to behave, and reality, requires consideration - especially if these views included an assumption of intention for crimes thought to be specific to women.

However, misogyny should not be always inferred if certain actions were customarily committed by women; the misogyny may only be secondarily presented by the

¹⁷⁷ Vogel, Les "Libri Paenitentiales", p.31.

¹⁷⁸ Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, pp.13-14, Appendix C, pp.129-134. The early penitentials do not always contrast sharply with the new penitential literature of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, the summae confessorum, in a lack of concern for the individuality of penitents; Payer, "The Humanism of the Penitentials and the Continuity of the Penitential Tradition", pp.340-354.

¹⁷⁹ Nelson, The Legal History Review, pp.412-13.

¹⁸⁰ T.P. Oakley already was aware that compilers of penitentials as "men of the reformer type" would be "far more sensitive to infractions of the moral code"; "The Penitentials as Sources for Medieval History", Speculum, 15, (1940), pp.210-23, at p.216.

inclusion of the action as a sin and the length of the penance. ¹⁸¹ Lesser penances for women may, inversely, reveal misogyny; a monk's penance for the same sin may be longer than a nun's because his higher status as religious rather than lay was perceived as worsening his transgression. The significance of omissions should also be examined since they too may reveal male attitudes-clerical and lay - to women. ¹⁸² The lack of references to particular behaviour does not mean that it did not occur. ¹⁸³

A final methodological problem is more acute for women than for men: namely identifying which women the penitentials were aimed at. The penitentials encompassed the whole populus christianus. For secular men and women alike it is difficult to establish the social status of the penitents. It is therefore difficult to decide how the behaviour of noblewomen differed from that of peasants. Penances for priests and monks are differentiated from those for the male laity. ¹⁸⁴ Women who had taken a religious vow - primarily noblewomen - are also differentiated from secular women and underwent punishment for lapses from their vows. But there are types of behaviour which could equally be attributed to religious as to secular women. ¹⁸⁵ The problem is compounded because all women were regarded as "lay". It is therefore important not only to note gender-differentiation but

¹⁸¹ A disapproving attitude also colours some modern interpretations of the penitentials; see Vogel's comment that the penitentials' material on sex, contraception and abortion gives a picture of a medieval "psychopathia sexualis"!; Les "Libri Paenitentiales", p.110.

¹⁸² For example, see pp.368-70 below.

¹⁸³ The penitentials do not refer to the sin of cannibalism but it is mentioned in other sources; Vogel, Les "Libri Paenitentiales", p.111.

¹⁸⁴ Penances for monks, priests, deacons, bishops are dealt with in a separate section in the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.1.

¹⁸⁵ The contamination of food, for example.

differentiation amongst women within the penitentials.

Hagiography.

Hagiography is a singular genre; but within it are distinct categories. The first of these are Vitae.¹⁸⁶ The Lives of female saints, written or rewritten in the period from the late eighth to the early tenth century, constitute the majority of hagiographical texts utilised here. Vitae consist of accounts of occurrences within the saint's actual lifespan and immediately after. Discrete, if related, categories are Miracula¹⁸⁷ and Translationes¹⁸⁸. Both Miracula and Translationes may constitute independent compositions, but they are often appended to earlier Vitae. For example, the Miracula of St. Austreberta¹⁸⁹ are ninth-century and the Virtutes of St. Geretrude¹⁹⁰ are late eighth-century additions to seventh-century Vitae. The Miracula of St. Waldburgis are of later ninth-century date appended to a probably eighth-century Vita.¹⁹¹ The Miracula and Translatio appended to the Vita of St. Glodesind are ninth-century additions to a Vita itself probably rewritten in the ninth century.¹⁹²

¹⁸⁶ René Aigrain, L'Hagiographie, ses sources, ses méthodes, son histoire, (Poitiers 1953); "les vies d'Ascetes en Occident", at pp.161-2.

¹⁸⁷ Following the Bollandists, Aigrain identified these as "les recueils de miracles des saints"; Ibid, pp.178-185.

¹⁸⁸ "Les récits d'inventions et de Translations"; Aigrain, Ibid, pp.186-92. For a comprehensive survey and analysis of Translationes see Martin Heinzelmann, Translationsberichte und andere quellen des Reliquienkultes, [Typologie de Sources du Moyen Age Fasc.33], (Turnhout, 1979).

¹⁸⁹ Miracula Austreberta, ASS, Feb. III, pp.423-29.

¹⁹⁰ MGH SRM, 2, pp.464-74.

¹⁹¹ Miracula Waldburgis Monheimensia, A. Bauch, (ed. and trans.), Ein bayerisches Mirakelbuch aus der Karolingerzeit. Die Monheimer Walpurgiswunder des Priesters Wolfhard, [Eichstätter Studien, Neue Folgen Band XII], (Regensburg, 1979).

¹⁹² Vita Antiquior s. Glodesindis, ASS, Iulii VI, pp.198-225.

The different types of hagiographical text were written for varying reasons but certain interpretative problems are shared. Although Vitae were written as biographies, and the Miracula and Translationes also seem to present narrative descriptions of events, these texts may not be viewed as part of an historical genre. Narrative extracts may have been inserted into some hagiographical texts to give the impression of historical authenticity ¹⁹³; but the historical value of hagiographical texts is often suspect because they drew on a particular literary tradition requiring the inclusion of recognised themes and stories. ¹⁹⁴

The recognised formulae for hagiography were taken from an extensive tradition including Athanasius' Life of St. Anthony and Sulpicius Severus' Life of St. Martin; but also the Lives of the Desert Fathers and Gregory the Great's Dialogues. Hagiographers in the ninth century also had Merovingian hagiography, particularly Gregory of Tours' saints' lives, and also the work of Bede. Patristic texts outlining the value of certain virtues also influenced the choice of topoi. ¹⁹⁵ Hagiography is not uniquely derivative; penitential handbooks have their own set of borrowings and inbuilt stereotypes as do annals and Mirrors of Princes, for example. However, hagiography's inclusion of "the marvellous" is especially problematic.

Yet if hagiography can only be used cautiously to elicit accurate historical information, prevailing attitudes concerning female sanctity are revealed through the images transmitted in the texts. The very fact of the texts'

¹⁹³ Paul Fouracre, The Career of Ebroin, Mayor of the Palace c.657-680, [unpublished Ph.D. thesis], (London, 1981), pp.20-21.

¹⁹⁴ F. Graus, Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger im Reich der Merowinger, (Prague, 1965), pp.39-59. Nor do the absence of topoi guarantee greater historicity; J.C. Poulin, L'Idéal de sainteté dans l'Aquitaine carolingienne d'après les sources hagiographiques 750-950, (Quebec, 1975), p.26.

¹⁹⁵ Virginity, for example; John Bugge, Virginitas. An Essay in the History of a Medieval Idea, (Hague, 1975).

stereotypes allows one to define types of sanctity.¹⁹⁶ A saint may go through several different models of sanctity over time to suit prevailing attitudes¹⁹⁷; thus fundamental traits of the spirit of the time may be revealed where generally contemporaneous hagiographical texts show an agreement of ideas and expressions.¹⁹⁸

If it has proved impossible to convincingly "formulate a method for separating the historical wheat from this fabulous chaff"¹⁹⁹, some valuable information can be identified. Original features in the midst of the stereotypes may be significant, although they should not be overplayed.²⁰⁰ Poulin stressed the importance of not studying hagiography in isolation.²⁰¹ Because different hagiographical texts were written for a variety of audiences, they provide valuable comparative evidence qualifying or confirming the images presented in sources such as the legislation and the penitentials.

This question of audience is closely intertwined with the function of hagiography and will be considered with recourse to specific texts.²⁰² However, the function of Miracula and Translationes are rather different from that of Vitae. Vitae, at least those written near to the date of the saint's death, had the primary purpose of edification; whereas accounts of posthumous miracles in Miracula and Translationes were less for edification than for the maintenance of the cult and the glorification of

¹⁹⁶ Poulin, L'Idéal de sainteté, pp.24-6.

¹⁹⁷ Poulin, Ibid, p.136.

¹⁹⁸ Poulin, Ibid, p.137.

¹⁹⁹ Jo-Ann McNamara, "A Legacy of Miracles: Hagiography and Nunneries in Merovingian Gaul" in J. Kirschner and S.F. Wemple, (eds.), Women of the Medieval World, pp.36-52, at p.36.

²⁰⁰ Poulin, L'Idéal de sainteté, p.25, note 86.

²⁰¹ Poulin, Ibid, p.137.

²⁰² See pp.156-59 below.

the institution maintaining the cult. ²⁰³ Thus the function of monastic communities both as redactors and recipients of the texts is crucial.

Prinz outlined how hagiography developed in the Merovingian period both as a response to the development of and then as a tool of royal and aristocratic familial monasticism. ²⁰⁴ As an integral part of a "politische Religiosität" hagiographical texts provided a powerful medium, which "stärkend und bestätigend auf das politische Ansehen der Sippe und Familie der Klosterstifter-und-herren zurückstrahlte". ²⁰⁵ The Arnulfings exemplified this process ²⁰⁶ and evidence that "Klosterpolitik" was a characteristic of the ninth century. This analysis requires consideration in respect to the hagiographical texts used in this study, especially if female Vitae and convents had a particular role.

The longer the gap between a saint's death and the appearance of a biography allows the interests of the institution based on the saint's cult to be written into

²⁰³ Martin Heinzelmann, "Une source de base de la littérature hagiographique latine: le recueil de miracles", in E. Patlagean and P. Riché, (eds.), Hagiographie cultures et sociétés IVe-XIIe siècles, [CNRS], (Paris, 1981), pp.235-57. These miracula post mortem were part of a tradition descended from the Virtutes s. Martini. However, the prolific production of Translationes in the ninth century also reflects a validation of the reforms - hence the popularity of certain Roman saints as compared to some contemporary or Merovingian saints; Heinzelmann, Ibid, pp.245-246.

²⁰⁴ F. Prinz, "Zur Geistigen Kultur des Mönchtums im spätantiken Gallien und im Merowingerreich" in Mönchtum und Gesellschaft im Frühmittelalter, (Darmstadt, 1976), pp.265-353.

²⁰⁵ Prinz, Ibid, p.325.

²⁰⁶ Through the Vita of St. Arnulf, the Vita and Translatio of St. Amand, and the Vita and Virtutes of St. Geretrud; Prinz, Ibid, pp.330-38. However, Prinz's conclusions apply primarily to Austrasian magnates possibly anticipating their eventual hegemony; Fouracre, The Career of Ebroin, p.26. See also J.L. Nelson "Queen s as Jezebels: Brunhild and Balhild in Merovingian History" in Politics and Ritual, pp.1-48 on the link between Balhild and her Vita, and royal "Klosterpolitik".

the biography. ²⁰⁷ Problems of interpretation arise with regard to Vitae concerning earlier seventh or eighth-century saints but revised in the ninth century. In the widest sense all hagiographical texts had a didactic intention, but rewritten Vitae may manifest interests more relevant to the time of writing than the time of the saint herself. Others have taken the view that ninth-century revisionists merely repaired barbarities of literary style and embellished the original with pious reflections designed to heighten the didactic value of the story.²⁰⁸ But the very fact that rewritten versions were undertaken signifies that certain images were still perceived to be relevant, and that there was the intention of reaffirming a saint's reputation. At the very least, "the context within which the writer operates is important... (since) sometimes contemporary problems or opinions invade a description of the past". ²⁰⁹ Thus it is sometimes inappropriate to use later texts uncritically for an earlier period. ²¹⁰ The inclusion of rewritten Vitae is therefore justified since merely counting "new" saints rather than the number of hagiographical texts produced may result in a distorted view of female sanctity and of female monasticism generally. ²¹¹

²⁰⁷ Fouracre, The Career of Ebroin, p.18.

²⁰⁸ McNamara, "A Legacy of Miracles", p.37. Hucbald's acknowledgment of the credibility and respect due to the authors of earlier versions of the Life of Rictrude is insufficient evidence to conclude that "there is no reason to suppose that (the many miracles) came from the imagination of her Carolingian biographer"; McNamara, Ibid, p.38. Hucbald's acknowledgment could be a literary device in order to present himself as part of a continuous and respected tradition; it would not have served his purpose to cast doubt on previous versions.

²⁰⁹ As in the attribution of nobility to Merovingian saints by Carolingian writers since inherited status seems to have impressed the Carolingians more than their forebears: Fouracre, The Career of Ebroin, p.27; and see pp.165-70 below.

²¹⁰ McNamara cites miracles from the ninth-century Vita Antiquior s. Glodesindis for an earlier period; "A Legacy of Miracles", pp.48,51-2.

²¹¹ See pp.149-56 below.

Prinz's comments concerning the connections between hagiographical texts and "Familienkloster" underlines the overwhelmingly monastic slant of the hagiographical texts. Hagiography may be described loosely as didactic but the comment that Vitae "formed the basis of popular preaching and devotional literature" ²¹² requires some qualification, at least for the texts used here in the ninth century. There is scant hard evidence that these hagiographical texts reached beyond monastic environs. The Benedictine Rule which many ninth-century monasteries followed provided for the reading of these illuminatory texts. ²¹³ But it is unclear to what extent hagiographical texts concerning female saints had a lay audience wider than the close aristocratic kin connected with a monastery. Prudentius, the author of the Vita Maurae, refers to how he preached a version of the saint's Life in church ²¹⁴; but doubt has now been expressed as to the validity of this Vita as evidence for the ninth century. ²¹⁵ Preaching and the use of homilies was an important constituent of the reforms ²¹⁶; but there is little evidence to suggest that these female saints' Lives

²¹² McNamara, "A Legacy of Miracles", p.38.

²¹³ J. McCann (ed. and trans.), The Benedictine Rule, (London, 1952), c.42, p.100.

²¹⁴ "sermo qui diebus solemnibus vobis facere consuevi, de vita gloriosa, et morte pretiosa sororis nostrae Maurae; Vita Maurae, PL115, cols.1367-76, at col.1367D.

²¹⁵ Dr. Patricia Morison very kindly informally discussed with me her forthcoming work on this text; she is of the opinion that the language of this text is too "conversational", denoting a vernacular tradition behind the Latin text, more representative of a much later period.

²¹⁶ Homiliary collections from Bavaria and Auxerre, and the particular role of Hrabanus Maurus furnishes evidence for the use of homiliaries for private devotion and for reading during the Office; moreover, the emphases of the material show that "the Frankish clergy saw Christianity primarily in terms of social living"; McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.80-114. Hammer also presented evidence for priests owning homiliaries, "Country Churches, Clerical Inventories and the Carolingian Renaissance", and n.74 above.

were used to edify other than a monastic audience.²¹⁷ This presents us with the possibility that the hagiography may often exemplify "a religious culture that was confined to the clerical and monastic orders".²¹⁸

Some light on the influence of these texts may be shed by the manuscript tradition. Some texts including the Vita Odiliae and the Vita Geretrudis including the Virtutes seem to have been especially influential²¹⁹; whereas other texts exist only in three or four later manuscripts.²²⁰ The manuscript survival is patchy and provides only a very rough way of gauging the contemporary influence of a saint's cult. However, the wide distribution of the texts' provenance may, despite the handicap of *topoi*, present images dependent on real regional differences.

²¹⁷ However, Hincmar's Vita Remigii [MGH SRM, pp.239-341] seems to be presented in lections which could be inserted into the liturgy; Devisse, Hincmar, pp.1020-31. But this Vita may have been specifically for the community at St. Rémi.

²¹⁸ J.L. Nelson, "On the Limits of the Carolingian Renaissance", Politics and Ritual, pp.49-67, at p.66.

²¹⁹ The Vita Odiliae exists in 37 manuscripts including two tenth-century ones; Levison (ed.) MGH SRM, 6, pp.24-9. The Virtutes of St. Geretrude exists in seven manuscripts including one from the eighth and another from the tenth century; Krusch (ed.) MGH SRM, 2, pp.446-74. The Vita Leobae exists in eight manuscripts including one from the eleventh century; Waitz (ed.) MGH SS, 15.1, pp.119-20. The Vita Bertilae exists in seven manuscripts including a tenth-century copy; Levison (ed.), MGH SRM, 6, pp.98-101. The Vita Balthildis B exists in five manuscripts including two tenth-century copies; Krusch (ed.), MGH SRM, 2, pp.475-81. Six manuscripts exist for the Vita Sadalbergae but none earlier than the twelfth century; Krusch (ed.), MGH SRM, 5, pp.45-9.

²²⁰ The Vita Anstrudis exists in only four manuscripts, the earliest being twelfth-century; Levison (ed.), MGH SRM, 6, pp.64-78. The Vita Chrothildis exists in five manuscripts, again the earliest being twelfth-century; Krusch (ed.) MGH SRM, 2, pp.341-42. The Vita Hathumodae exists in three manuscripts the earliest being fifteenth-century; Perz (ed.), MGH SS, 4, p.166. The Vita Liutbirgae exists in four manuscripts, the earliest from the fifteenth century; Perz (ed.), MGH SS, 4, p.158. The Translatio Balthildis survives in one tenth-century fragment; Holder-Egger, (ed.), MGH SS, 15.1, p.284.

A further aspect of the monastic slant running through the hagiography is its connection to the liturgy. Vitae were inserted into the liturgies associated with the saint's cult. But a particular function should be discerned with the development of Translationes in this period. Heinzelmann classified the ninth century as part of "die klassische Periode der Translations-berichte".²²¹ These accounts where the saint is moved should be viewed in conjunction with liturgical developments: the act of translation was a form of liturgical canonisation.²²²

The monastic slant of the texts may also mean that the texts filtered out those issues regarded as irrelevant, outside monastic interests and environs, including lay women's experiences. Moreover, if the images presented were primarily for a female monastic audience the images may have been tailored accordingly. The gender of the author impinges on this last point. As all the texts of certain authorship are by monks or bishops ²²³ male clerical perceptions of women will predominate. ²²⁴ The probability that nuns produced a variety of texts should not be excluded. Baudonivia ²²⁵ and Hugelberc of Heidenheim²²⁶

²²¹ Heinzelmann, Translationsberichte, pp.94-99.

²²² Heinzelmann, Ibid; and "Une source de base de la littérature hagiographique latine", p.246

²²³ See Table II, p.147.

²²⁴ As in other sources: for example, Regino of Prüm, quoted from the Council of Braga, to suggest that women were more prone to gossip while weaving; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk2,c.375,p.358.

²²⁵ Vita Radegundis, MGH SRM,2,pp.377-95.

²²⁶ Her authorship of the Hodoeporicon of St. Willibald was indicated by Bernhard Bischoff's discovery of a cryptogram to the text's Prologue; "Wer ist die Nonne von Heidenheim?", Studien und Mitteilungen zur Geschichte des Benediktinerordens, 49 (1931), pp.387-88. E. Hlawitschka suggested that the Vitae Amati, Romaricii Adelphi abbatum Habenesium may have been written by either a nun or cleric at Remiremont circa 750-850; Studien zur Äbtissinnenreihe von Remiremont (7.-13 Jh.), [Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für Landeskunde des Saarlandes,

are examples of women writing hagiographical texts in the seventh and eighth centuries. The rewritten Vitae of Balthild and Bertila may have been written alongside the Translatio Balthilidis by a nun or nuns from Chelles at the request of abbess Heilwig.²²⁷ Indeed, there is substantial evidence for convent scriptoria throughout the Frankish regna being actively involved in copying manuscripts and for nuns as letter-writers.²²⁸

Yet even if nuns were writing some of the Lives it is questionable whether they would necessarily project images of women different from those projected by male monks or clerics. Part of the answer to this will lie in the examination of female monastic culture.²²⁹ It is possible to compare Baudonivia's version of the Life of St. Radegund with that by Fortunatus.²³⁰ Baudonivia chose not to incorporate in her Vita Radegundis Fortunatus' comment "despite her (Radegund) being a woman".²³¹ However, this is evidence for the Merovingian period. It is difficult to be certain, in the light of the monastic context of the majority of the authors, and no definitely known female authorship for a ninth-century hagiographical text, that women wrote in a particularly feminine way. It has been suggested that certain earlier Vitae may reflect a feminine voice. Thus Wemple suggests that Aldegund "found

9], (Saarbrücken, 1963), p.16.

²²⁷ Krusch and Levison saw no reason not to date the Vita Balthildis B and the Vita Bertilae to the early ninth century; MGH SRM, 2, pp.478-9 and MGH SRM, 6, pp.98-9. The Annals of Metz may have been produced at Chelles under the auspices of Abbess Gisla, Charlemagne's sister, c.804-6; H. Hoffman, "Untersuchungen zur karolingischen Annalistik", Bonner Historische Forschungen 10 (Bonn, 1959), pp.53-61.

²²⁸ Especially at convents like Chelles; R. McKitterick, "Frauen und Schriftlichkeit im frühen Mittelalter", in H.-W. Goetz (ed.), Weibliche Lebensgestaltung im frühen Mittelalter, (Cologne, 1991), pp.65-118; J.L. Nelson, "Women and the word" SCH, 27, (1990), pp.53-78, at pp.74-5.

²²⁹ Ch.2 below.

²³⁰ MGH SRM, 2, pp.358-95.

²³¹ MGH, Ibid, c.1, p.364.

her own voice and gave expression to her own spiritual experiences" since she dictated a record of her visions to Abbot Subnuius. ²³² However, the point is that he was the scribe through whom her experiences were filtered. If this argument is suspect for Merovingian Vitae, it is equally problematic for the ninth century perhaps particularly for rewritten Vitae such as Hucbald's reworked Vita Aldegundis as new material was added. Anachronistic feminist constructions may have influenced the depiction of saints' Lives written by women in the seventh century "as eloquent witnesses to the true meaning of evangelical piety".²³³ The small number of known female authors of Vitae in the Merovingian period and the formulaic constraints of the genre weaken such an argument. Wemple's conclusion that Baudonivia attributed particularly maternal characteristics to Radegund is of interest, but many of the known male authors of ninth-century Vitae similarly concentrate on maternal imagery. ²³⁴

Liturgy.

Liturgical codices comprise some 10% of the surviving medieval manuscripts ²³⁵ and the ninth century witnessed a significant development both in terms of the numbers of liturgical texts and their procedures. The stimulus behind this proliferation may have been partly motivated by the efforts of Pippin III and Charlemagne ²³⁶ but, as with other aspects of the reforms, the greater thrust "of the production of liturgical texts continued to be a largely individual affair conducted by the different monasteries and dioceses". ²³⁷

²³² Wemple, Women, pp.185-6.

²³³ Wemple, Ibid, p.187.

²³⁴ See pp.184-91; 364-67 below.

²³⁵ Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.1.

²³⁶ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.115-54, at pp.128-132.

²³⁷ McKitterick, Ibid, p.129. F.S. Paxton concurs with this view, Christianising Death. The Creation of a Ritual Process in Early Medieval Europe, (Cornell, 1990),

Clerics required a series of texts - sacramentaries, lectionaries, antiphonaries, penitentials, psalters and homiliaries were deemed to be necessary for the correct exercise of the liturgy. ²³⁸ Sacramentaries and pontificals are the texts which have been utilised here. A Liber Sacramentorum provided prayers and formulas principally for the observance of the eucharist; but it also made provision for other aspects of the holy year including saints' days but also votive masses, rites of ordination, rites of passage (baptism, marriage and funeral prayers), and miscellaneous benedictions. The sacramentary contained only very basic indications for ceremonial; directions for liturgical action were provided in the Ordines. ²³⁹ The pontifical, for episcopal functions, represented the synthesis of the (eucharistic and non-eucharistic) prayers and formulas in the Sacramentary, with the corresponding rubric from the Ordines. ²⁴⁰

All the sources used in this study are peculiarly derivative, and the liturgy is no exception. The relevance of liturgical formulas lies in examining where and exactly how these borrowings were used. The earliest text is the Veronese Sacramentary ²⁴¹ which is based on earlier Italian sources (although no longer associated with Pope Leo I); it can be dated to about 600. ²⁴² The Veronese Sacramentary provides the earliest formulas for the consecration of virgins and nuptial benedictions. ²⁴³ The

at pp.92-4.

²³⁸ Hauto of Basle, MGH Capit. Episc., c.6, p.211; and n.74 above.

²³⁹ Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.135.

²⁴⁰ Vogel, Ibid, pp.226-247.

²⁴¹ Best represented in Verona MS 85; Sacramentarium Veronense, L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes I], (Rome, 1956).

²⁴² Mohlberg, Ibid, pp.lxiv-lxxxv.

²⁴³ Sac. Veron., 1103-1110, pp.138-40.

Veronese precedes a probably mid-seventh century Roman sacramentary - the Gelasian Sacramentary ²⁴⁴ which may have developed independently from the older texts behind the Veronese Sacramentary ²⁴⁵ and from a papal mass book, possibly of Gregory I. ²⁴⁶

Debate has centred on how the Gelasian Sacramentary reached the Frankish kingdoms. One school of thought suggests that the Gelasian Sacramentary was an assemblage of Roman materials put together with a view to use in the seventh century in England, and was brought to Paris in the 660s. ²⁴⁷ However, the survival of the Gelasian Sacramentary in one manuscript, Reginensis 316, probably produced at Chelles in the mid-eighth century ²⁴⁸ does not preclude the possibility that it arrived independently in the Frankish kingdoms. The Gelasian Sacramentary took on Gallican features such as episcopal benedictions, the blessing of salt for baptismal candidates, and the blessing of the Easter fire. Gallican rites, for which we have evidence from the early eighth century in the Missale Gothicum ²⁴⁹, the Missale Gallicanum vetus ²⁵⁰ and the

²⁴⁴ Liber sacramentorum Romanae ecclesiae ordinis anni circuli [Cod. Vat. Regin. lat. 316]; L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes 4], (Rome, 1960).

²⁴⁵ J. Deshusses (ed.), Le sacramentaire gregorien: ses principales formes d'après les plus anciens manuscrits, I, Le sacramentaire, le supplément d'Aniane; II, Textes complémentaires pour la messe, [Spicilegium Friburgense, 16 and 24], (Freiburg, 1971, 1979), at I, p.53.

²⁴⁶ There is some dispute over whether Gregory I actually produced a "sacramentary"; H. Mayr-Harting, The Coming of Christianity to Anglo Saxon England, (London, 1972), p.173.

²⁴⁷ C. Hohler, "Some Service Books of the Later Saxon Church" in D. Parsons (ed.), Tenth-Century Studies, (London, 1975), pp.60-83, 217-27.

²⁴⁸ Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.65, note 147.

²⁴⁹ Missale Gothicum, L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes 5], (Rome, 1961).

²⁵⁰ Missale Gallicanum vetus, L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes 3], (Rome, 1958).

Missale Francorum 251 in turn took on Roman influences. 252

From these traditions evolved a group of texts now called Eighth-century Gelasians. These were first identified as rescensions of Reginensis 316. 253 Then it was recognised that miscellaneous groups of mass sets and prayers already circulating in Francia influenced texts like the Sacramentaries of Angoulême 254, Gellone 255 and Autun. 256 Hence the Eighth-century Gelasians can be described as a combination of Frankish and Roman elements. 257 These Roman elements were probably a fusion of the Gregorian Paduensis 258 and the Gelasian Sacramentary. 259

This Paduan sacramentary (Padua MS D47) is descended from what Deshusses described as a "Type II Gregorian". 260 The "Type I Gregorian", in the form of the Hadrianum, arrived

251 Missale Francorum, L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes 2], (Rome, 1957).

252 For example, pp.215-16 below.

253 E. Bishop, "The Liturgical Reform of Charlemagne", Downside Review, 38 (1919), pp.1-16.

254 Liber sacramentorum Engolismensis, P. Saint-Roch (ed.), [CCSL CLIX], (Turnhout, 1987).

255 Liber sacramentorum Gellonensis, A. Dumas (ed.), [CCSL CLIX], (Turnhout, 1981).

256 Liber sacramentorum Augustudonensis, O. Heiming, (ed.), [CCSL CLIXB], (Turnhout, 1984).

257 B. Moreton, The Eighth-Century Gelasian Sacramentary: A Study in Tradition, (Oxford, 1976).

258 See n.260 below.

259 Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, pp.79-106. For example, the Sacramentary of Gellone has both a widow's prayer, [Sac. Gellon.,2616,p.409] and a virgin's prayer [Sac. Gellon.,2606,p.406] both of which occur in the Paduan sacramentary; R. Metz, La consécration des vierges dans l'Église romaine, (Paris, 1954), pp.157,195. Metz did not seek an explanation for this affinity; but a relationship between the Eighth-century Gelasian and the "Type II Gregorian" is demonstrated by the occurrence of the widow's prayer in the Sacramentary of Trent, n.269 below.

260 Deshusses, I, p.56-60.

in the Frankish kingdoms probably in the 780s as Charlemagne sought to impose Roman usage on the Frankish Church. But the Hadrianum was not a version of the pure original Gregorian since additions like the masses for Thursdays in Lent had been made during pontificates subsequent to that of Gregory I.²⁶¹ For the ninth century there are four categories of the Hadrianum.²⁶² First, there is the Hadrianum itself extant in MS Cambrai 164 dating probably from 811-12.²⁶³ Secondly, there are a number of "corrected Hadrianums".²⁶⁴

The third group, the "Aniane Gregorians", is probably the most important.²⁶⁵ Since the Hadrianum was basically a papal mass book, it had limited practical use for the Frankish Church lacking such necessities as prayers said for a king at the time of a synod, Frankish saints' days and benedictions for widows. A Supplement was therefore provided by Benedict of Aniane²⁶⁶ deriving material essentially from Eighth-century Gelasians although the episcopal benedictions, bar one, are Visigothic.

²⁶¹ Other elements date it to at least the pontificate of Gregory III, c.733; Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.85.

²⁶² Deshusses, I, pp.35-47.

²⁶³ The Sacramentary of Hildoard; Deshusses, Ibid, pp.36,61.

²⁶⁴ These include the Sacramentary of Constance in Donaueschungen MS 191; the Sacramentary of Mainz in Mainz MS 1; the Sacramentary of Modena in MS OII.7; the Sacramentary of St. Gall in Bod MS DI20; and the Sacramentary of Reichenau in Vienna Öst MS lat1815; Deshusses, Ibid, pp.35-47.

²⁶⁵ These include Le Mans MS77 - the St. Amand Group; the Sacramentary of Nonantola in BN 2292; the Sacramentary of Arles in BN 2812; the Sacramentary of Rheinau in MS43; and Vat. Reginensis 337 which with the Sacramentary of Arles are the two best Lyons manuscripts and point to Benedict of Aniane as the Supplement's author; Deshusses, Ibid, pp.63-70.

²⁶⁶ J. Deshusses, "Le Supplément au sacramentaire grégorien: Alcuin ou S. Benoît d'Aniane", Archiv für Liturgiewissenschaft, 9, (1965), pp.48-71. This attribution is now generally accepted, one indicator being the Supplement's Visigothic inclusions.

Although the Hadrianum represented an official desire to implement Roman usage, it was probably never intended to completely displace the Eighth-century Gelasians with which it was virtually contemporaneous. ²⁶⁷

The fourth category of Hadrianum-type texts, "corrected Aniane Gregorians", date from the mid-ninth century onwards and comprise twelve manuscripts including the Sacramentaries of Paris, Chelles and St. Vaast d'Arras. ²⁶⁸ Many of their variations are paralleled in a mid-ninth century Gregorian, the Sacramentary of Trent, which appears to be descended from the archaic "Type II Gregorian", parent also of Padua MS D47. ²⁶⁹ These texts seem to tie in with the pre-Hadrianum influences that we have already noted in the Eighth-century Gelasians suggesting that an older Gregorian text or texts was in circulation in the Frankish kingdoms prior to 800.

There are a number of other important texts. The first of these is the Leofric Missal the core of which, Leofric A, dates from the late ninth century. ²⁷⁰ This text's provenance is disputed. Warren, remarked on the manuscript's "Lotharingian" constituents arguing that the text was brought to England from Lotharingia in the eleventh century. ²⁷¹ Hohler, however, pointed to what he

²⁶⁷ It was not uncommon in the ninth century for liturgical texts to be used concurrently, with prayers for a rite in one text and instructions on performance in another; "The Earliest surviving Royal Ordo: Some Liturgical and Historical Aspects", Politics and Ritual, pp.341-60, at p.354 and note 62.

²⁶⁸ Deshusses, I, pp.72-74.

²⁶⁹ This pre-Hadrianum Gregorian copied at Salzburg c.825-30 can only be explained by a link between bishop Arno with Alcuin and Benedict of Aniane; Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, pp.97-102.

²⁷⁰ The other parts are Leofric B, a calendar at the beginning of the manuscript, and Leofric C, later eleventh-century additions when the text was in use at Exeter; F.E. Warren (ed.), The Leofric Missal, (Oxford, 1883), pp.xxx-xxxi.

²⁷¹ Warren, Ibid.

saw as the text's peculiarly English characteristics.²⁷² But the provision for women in Leofric A can be used for the Frankish context. Firstly, the Leofric Missal contains a deaconess' consecration prayer ²⁷³ which comes from the Hadrianum and which occurs neither in the Veronese nor Gelasian Sacramentaries. Secondly, the Leofric Missal's consecration of virgins has the Gallican prayer, Accipe puella sanctum pallium ²⁷⁴; it is perhaps more likely that a compiler from Lotharingia would have had access to a prayer present in the Missale Francorum, a text possibly produced at Corbie. ²⁷⁵

If Hohler is correct in suggesting that St. Boniface brought a Veronese-type text to Francia in the mid-eighth century, this would explain why the tenth-century Sacramentary of Fulda ²⁷⁶ (where Boniface is buried) sometimes displays more affinity with the Veronese than with the Gelasian Sacramentary. ²⁷⁷ But the Sacramentary of Fulda also displays affinities with Eighth-century Gelasians ²⁷⁸ and the Gallican Bobbio Missal. ²⁷⁹

²⁷² C. Hohler, "Some Service Books of the Later Saxon Church". Nelson also suggested that the Leofric Missal's royal ordo is of earlier, English origin although she noted the suggestion by Eileen Drage that the missal came from St. Vaast, Arras in the Rheims diocese c.880., "The Earliest surviving Royal Ordo", p.350, note 41.

²⁷³ Leofric, p.226.

²⁷⁴ Leofric, p.226. This occurs in the Missale Francorum, 48, p.15 and in a slightly different form in the Missale Gothicum, 263, p.68.

²⁷⁵ Mohlberg, Missale Francorum, pp.xii-xvii.

²⁷⁶ G. Richter and A. Schönfelder (ed.), Sacramentarium Fuldense saeculi X, [Quellen und Abhandlungen zur Geschichte der Abtei und der Diözese Fulda, 9], (Fulda, 1912).

²⁷⁷ For example, the Sacramentary of Fulda has the Veronese Sacramentary's version of Deus castorum corporum; see p.220 below.

²⁷⁸ For example in its provision for marriage [pp.300-03 below] and for infertile women [pp.333-34 below].

The final text which requires description is the Romano-Germanic Pontifical - the PRG. This represents "the meeting place of ancient traditions and the repository of the ritual practices worked out in the ninth and tenth centuries, it was also the point of departure for a later evolution of liturgy". ²⁸⁰ The text can be dated to the 950s from the scriptorium of St. Alban's Mainz. ²⁸¹ It is a hugely important text not least because it became the basis of much of the western medieval liturgy. ²⁸² Andrieu estimated that there were thirty-six manuscripts, all of eleventh or twelfth-century date ²⁸³ of which ten were used for a critical edition. ²⁸⁴ Its greater sophistication is manifested in a greater differentiation of rites and persons to whom these rites pertained. There is a great deal more rubric and often many more formulas for each rite.

There are also a number of late ninth-century French pontificals - those of Angers, Aurillac, Poitiers and Cahors, and a tenth-century one from Rheims. ²⁸⁵ The first

²⁷⁹ In its nuptial provision, pp.302-03 below.

²⁸⁰ Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.232. The PRG was a "pure" pontifical, even if some of its inclusions show its attachment to a didactic tradition; Ibid, p.231.

²⁸¹ M. Andrieu (ed.), Les Ordines Romani du haut moyen âge, [5 vols. Spicilegium sacrum Lovaniense 11,23,24,28,29], (Louvain, 1931-61), vol.1, pp.497ff; Vogel dates the text to somewhere between 950 and 961/3; Medieval Liturgy, p.234-5.

²⁸² Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, pp.226-247.

²⁸³ Andrieu, Les Ordines Romani, vol.1, pp.497ff.

²⁸⁴ C. Vogel and R. Elze (eds.), Le pontificale romano-germanique du dixieme siecle, [Studi e Testi 226,227,269], (Vatican City, 1963,72). The many manuscripts represent the PRG in several stages of evolution; Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.236.

²⁸⁵ v. Leroquais, Les Pontificaux Manuscrits des Bibliothèques de France, [3 vols], (Paris, 1937): Pontifical of Aurillac - vol.1, pp.8-15; Pontifical of Angers - vol.1, pp.25-32; Pontifical of Poitiers - vol.1,

four of these represent formative pontificals ²⁸⁶; but, they provide useful parallels to the PRG showing that liturgical performance became more complex in the West as well as in the East Frankish kingdoms.

Even in view of this proliferation of more elaborate texts, it is unclear to what extent liturgy was used even on the most basic level. The library catalogue of 831 for St. Riquier lists no fewer than nineteen Gelasian missals ²⁸⁷; and the existence of liturgical texts in Bavarian church inventories, paralleled by a survey of six churches in the Rheims diocese ²⁸⁸, suggests that the liturgy was getting through to priest-level. But it is impossible to know whether the texts were always correctly implemented. St. Boniface was of the opinion that re-baptism was necessary in those cases where an ignorant Bavarian priest had said the incorrect formula. ²⁸⁹

Angenendt is surely correct to stress the central importance of the baptismal rite in the liturgy. ²⁹⁰ The purification of all men and women through its exorcism prayers present in both the Hadrianum and the Gelasian texts was part of the structuring of Frankish society as worthy recipients of God's choice as his new chosen

pp.263-70; Pontifical of Cahors - vol.2, pp.109-11; Pontifical of Rheims - vol.2, pp.265-68.

²⁸⁶ "Formative" in the sense that they represent the beginnings of the combining of prayers from sacramentaries with the corresponding rubric from the Ordines - a process culminating in a "true" pontifical in the PRG; Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, pp.226-28.

²⁸⁷ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.127.

²⁸⁸ In Bavaria nine sacramentaries are evidenced amongst other types of texts; the churches in Rheims each had at least one missal, plus psalters and lectionaries; Hammer, "Country Churches, Clerical Inventories and the Carolingian Renaissance".

²⁸⁹ The priest mistakenly had said, "Baptizo te in nomine patria et filia et spiritus sancti"; A. Angenendt, "Die Liturgie und die Organisation des kirklichen Lebens auf dem Lande", Spoleto, 28, (1982), pp.169-226, at p.172, note 14.

²⁹⁰ Angenendt, Ibid.

people. But the penitentials' regulations punishing parents, and especially mothers, for failing to get their children baptised ²⁹¹ could be evidence of a lack of success in imposing the liturgy. Preeminent with baptism in the christianisation of the people, was the mass ²⁹²; but it is questionable whether repeated prescriptions instructing the laity to communicate more than the obligatory three times a year ²⁹³ is adequate evidence of frequent lay participation in the Eucharist. The contrary may in fact be true; repeated prescriptions may evidence a lack of adherence, as well as of real understanding. ²⁹⁴

More tangible evidence in assessing the successful imposition of liturgy might be provided by archaeological evidence from cemeteries. There seems to be a parallel between the movement from Merovingian cemeteries outside towns to positions nearer the church, with the appearance of consecration prayers for cemeteries which, "are not to be found in the earliest Pontificals; when they first occur in the early tenth century, form and language alike point to a Carolingian origin". ²⁹⁵ A response to social need as well as an attempt to use liturgy as an alternative to non-christian practices is evidenced in the development of death rituals in this period. ²⁹⁶ The increasing complexity of more rituals may have been in

²⁹¹ See pp.360-61 below.

²⁹² Angenendt, "Die Liturgie und die Organisation des kirklichen Lebens auf dem Lande", pp.199-209.

²⁹³ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.144.

²⁹⁴ Conciliar prescriptions stated that all Christians should know the Lord's prayer and the Creed; some episcopal statutes tell priests to explain the significance of liturgical rites to the laity; McKitterick, Ibid, pp.139, 143. But this does not indicate that understanding was more than surface-deep in some areas.

²⁹⁵ D. Bullough, "Burial, Community and Belief in the Early Medieval West", in P. Wormald (ed.), Ideal and Reality in Frankish and Anglo-Saxon Society, (Oxford, 1983), pp.177-201. Heinzelmann commented on the link between liturgical developments and the vogue for Translationes; Translationsberichte, p.29.

²⁹⁶ Paxton, Christianising Death.

response to concerns, expressed in contemporary conciliar legislation, of the attraction of traditional magical practices for healing. ²⁹⁷ Therefore the liturgy may evidence a particular concern over women's behaviour.²⁹⁸ It is possible that other aspects of liturgical provision also evidence a response to the social realities of women's lives. ²⁹⁹

It is difficult to decide how far liturgy was response to need and how much it was an attempt to create a need. However, the death ritual in the Gelasian Sacramentary is based on the burial service for nuns appended to Caesarius of Arles' Rule for his sister's community, suggesting that this libellus was created at Chelles or another community of women. ³⁰⁰ This seems to show that liturgy was sometimes a response to existing circumstances; other provision may evidence an attempt to stimulate a need, not always successfully. ³⁰¹

The introduction of newer and more developed rituals does not presuppose that earlier, less-evolved texts were put aside. ³⁰² Liturgy is difficult to use for an assessment of reality, because of its formulaic nature. This of course was its function; there would have been no point in an "original" liturgy. ³⁰³ Hence it has to be used carefully for insights into changing social

²⁹⁷ Paxton, Ibid, pp.129-30.

²⁹⁸ That liturgy was perhaps provided as an alternative for women who may have been particularly drawn to magic is not pursued by Paxton.

²⁹⁹ See pp.332-47 below.

³⁰⁰ Paxton, Christianising Death, p.106.

³⁰¹ Paxton argues that the reform rite for anointing the sick, being ecclesiastical but no less magical, had not made much headway against folk medicine by the later ninth century; Ibid, pp.163-4.

³⁰² Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.63.

³⁰³ "Liturgical prayers were always formulated according to a framework"; C.A. Boumann, Sacring and Crowning, (Gröningen, Djarkarta, 1957), p.57.

conditions; but each time a liturgical form is used it becomes "authentic". ³⁰⁴ Hence, because liturgical manuscripts were in constant use they can provide immediate evidence of what was done, when and where. ³⁰⁵

Except for Metz who has written on the virgin's consecration rite ³⁰⁶, there has been little analysis concerning women and the liturgy of the Carolingian period. Metz's work is more textual analysis and very useful as such, than interpretation of the material in its wider social sense. Clearly liturgical provision for religious women is a much smaller part of the whole than that provided for males. A provision for the male sacerdotal role is evident from the Veronese Sacramentary onwards with its rites for the ordination of bishops, deacons and presbyters. ³⁰⁷ The Gelasian Sacramentary marks an even greater provision ³⁰⁸ and the Eighth-century Gelasians, similarly reflects this greater need for more detailed differentiation. This type of provision for the male sacerdotes is different from that made for the male monastic professions; and it is with these latter that the liturgical provision for female religious can be usefully compared.

Liturgical rubric should not be always read at face-value. The PRG insists that virgins should be consecrated by the bishop. ³⁰⁹ This insistence may be qualified if

³⁰⁴ Vogel, Medieval Liturgy, p.63.

³⁰⁵ F.L. Cross, "Early Western Liturgical Manuscripts", Journal of Theological Studies, 16, (1965), pp.61-67.

³⁰⁶ René Metz, La consécration des vierges dans L'Eglise romaine, and "La consécration des vierges dans l'Eglise franque d'après la plus ancienne Vie de Sainte Pousine (VIIIe-IXe siècle)", Revue des Sciences Religieuses, 35, (1961), pp.32-48.

³⁰⁷ Sac. Veron., 942-954, pp.118-22.

³⁰⁸ Rites of consecration for sub-deacon, acolyte, exorcist, lector, ostiarius, and psalmista; Sac. Gelas., 748-778, pp.117-123.

³⁰⁹ See pp.223, 229 below.

other sources suggest that abbesses were sometimes consecrating their own nuns, or performing other sacral offices.³¹⁰ The insistence on the episcopal competence highlights that the ninth-century liturgy presents official, reform attitudes. Bishops had a vested interest in setting out in a liturgical form the message that important rites were to be performed by them alone. Therefore analysis of rites by virtue of gender alone is not always helpful. Other attitudes underpinning the reforms such as the perceived superiority of Benedictine monasticism may also colour an interpretation of the liturgy.

³¹⁰ See p.127 below.

CHAPTER TWO.

WOMEN IN THE RELIGIOUS LIFE: THE EFFECTS OF THE REFORMS.

Recent interpretations have viewed the reform legislation as successfully imposing a degree of uniformity on women religious in the early ninth century.¹ However, a closer examination of the prescriptions qualifies these interpretations: several options for female observance of a religious life existed; the construction of a rigid divide between the secular and religious spheres for women is anachronistic²; and there was a greater degree of continuity throughout the ninth century than has been envisaged by some scholars.

I. Forms of Religious Observance.

[1] Nuns and Canonesses.

One of the principal difficulties for identifying women religious is the terminology of the ninth-century sources. The legislation most commonly uses the non-specific term sanctimoniales.³ Except for a small number of instances

¹ Wemple, Women, pp.143-48,165-74; and "Female Monasticism in Italy and its Comparison with France and Germany from the Ninth through the Eleventh Century" in W. Affeldt (ed.) Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, pp.291-310 where she argued that compared to "France" and "Germany" "the Carolingian monastic reforms were also enacted in Italy but their application was limited", p.295.

² Especially the construct of "marriage and the cloister"; Wemple, Women. Nor is "cloister" a self-evident or a value-free description.

³ Throughout the ninth century and in different regions: Capit. miss. gen.(802), MGH Capit. I,c.20,40, pp.95,98; Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II ii, c.39,p.637; Council of Yützt (844), MGH Conc. III,c.5,p.34; Council of Ver (844), MGH Conc. III,c.7,p.41; Councils of Meaux/Paris (845-6), MGH Conc. III,c.70,p.118; Council of Quierzy (858), MGH Conc. III,c.8,p.417; Council of Trosly (909), Mansi 18,c.3,cols.270-72. Occasionally, sanctimonialis femina is used; Councils of Reischach, Freising, Salzburg (800), MGH Conc. II i,c.47,p.213.

it is rarely possible to identify a specific type of religious female. The legislation employs several other terms - virgines sacrae ⁴; puellae ⁵ or ancillae Dei ⁶; and monachae. ⁷ Monachae is less frequently used than sanctimoniales but it may have been used to refer to regular nuns where it is contrasted with canonicae ⁸; but this cannot be inferred from every application of the term. ⁹ The legislation uses nonnanes infrequently,

⁴ Council of Mainz (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.13, p.264.

⁵ The Council of Tours (813) is representative of how the legislation differentiates between monks and canons but not between types of female religious: "monasteria canonicorum, monachorum seu puellarum"; MGH Conc. II i, c.31, p.290.

⁶ "Monasteria puellarum vel ancillarum Dei" may imply a distinction between puellae and ancillae; MGH Capit. I, no.42, c.5, p.119. Vel can mean "and" as well as "or"; but the nature of such a distinction remains unclear judging by the flexible use of puellae elsewhere. It is also impossible to identify what differentiation, if any, is intended by an 811 capitulary which refers to sanctimoniales et ancillae Dei; MGH Capit. I, no.72, c.13, p.164.

⁷ Council of Friouli (796/7); MGH Conc. II i, c.12, p.194.

⁸ As in an 829 capitulary which refers to "canonici... et monachi... monasteriis sanctimonialium, tam monacharum quam canonicarum"; MGH Capit. II, no.196, c.19, pp.42-3. This kind of distinction is rare.

⁹ M. Parisse regards monachae as regular nuns; "Les femmes au monastère dans le Nord de L'Allemagne du IXe au XIe siècle. Conditions sociales et religieuses", in W. Affeldt (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, pp.311-324, at pp.319-20. But monachae is used alongside sanctimoniales and monasterium puellae within the same text; Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg (800), MGH Conc. II i, c.29, 28, 21, pp.210-11. Sanctimoniales and monasteria puellae were also used with reference to canonesses; IS, MGH Conc. II ii, c.11, p.446. The Council of Douzy (874) describes the renegade Duda and her two accomplices as monachae; Mansi, 17, col.288. Duda may have been a Benedictine nun because she is described as allegedly going contra regulam suae professionis and the canons of St. Benedict in her criminal bid to become abbess with the help of her lover, the priest Huntbert; Ibid, cols.289-93. The fact that this Council also refers to Duda's crimes as transgressions against the canones of Benedict but also of Ambrose, Jerome, and Augustine demonstrates the difficulty of identifying the nature of a religious life described as being lived according to the canones.

usually critically ¹⁰; mulierculae is a similarly unflattering term. ¹¹ The less precise term religiosae is rarely used in the legislation ¹² although it occurs in other sources. ¹³

The Carolingian reforms are notable for the fact they provide two monastic options for women, the regular and the canonical life. It is not certain when the first institutes of canonesses appeared. Several scholars have argued for a date around the mid-eighth century.¹⁴ However, the flexible application of a variety of terms for religious women suggest that they often denoted the

¹⁰ Admonitio Generalis, MGH Capit. I, c.17,p.53 concerning women not entering the sanctuary and MGH Capit. I, no.23,c.19, p.63 concerning religious women not living according to a Rule.

¹¹ Council of Paris (829); MGH Conc. II ii,c.42, p.638 and the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.174, pp.281-2.

¹² Abbesses are described as matres religiosarum; MGH Conc. II ii, Conc. Aquis, (836),c.13,p.713.

¹³ It is unclear whether the mulieres religiosae referred to in the Miracula s. Carilephi were nuns/canonesses or laywomen who came to the saint's shrine; ASS Iulii I,c.34-36,p.98.

¹⁴ K.H. Schäfer argued that canonesses developed out of the Early Church's female diaconate, and that they existed from at least the sixth century; Die Kanonissenstifter im deutschen Mittelalter, (Stuttgart, 1907) and "Kanonissen und Diakonissen, Ergänzungen und Erläuterungen", Römische Quartalschrift, 24, (1910), pp.49-90. Schäfer's views have been qualified by P. Schmitz, Histoire de l'ordre de St. Benoît, [7 vols], (Liège: Maredsous, 1942-56), vol.7, Les Moniales, p.12; Wemple Women, p.166. Both referred to the Council of Ver (755), "ut in monasterio sint sub ordine regulari aut sub manu episcopi sub ordine canonico" [MGH Capit. I,c.11, p.35] to argue that there was the option of a canonical life for women after this date. Petra Heidebrecht and Cordula Nolte also accept a mid-eighth century date for the first community of canonesses; Petra Heidebrecht and Cordula Nolte "Leben im Kloster: Nonnen und Kanonissen. Geschichtliche Lebensformen im frühen Mittelalter" in U.A.J. Becker and J. Rüssen (eds.), Weiblichkeit in Geschichte Perspektive, (Fallstudien und Reflexionen zu Grundproblemen der historischen Frauenforschung Herausgegeben), [Suhrkamp Taschenbuch Wissenschaft 725], (Suhrkamp, 1988), pp.79-115, at p.82.

same thing.¹⁵ Further, the references to a female canonical life need to be indentified definitely as specific to women.¹⁶

Some references to a canonical life are ambiguous. It has been argued that "beginning with the Council of Frankfurt in 794 abbesses had been routinely offered the choice between Benedictine profession or a canonical life."¹⁷ But "canonical" in this text¹⁸ could equally refer to a concern that women not observing a Rule should follow the canons of ancient and current conciliar legislation¹⁹ as it may to canonesses. While the Council of Frankfurt referred to regulariter, this term may sometimes have indicated monastic Rules other than the Benedictine.²⁰

¹⁵ Schmitz, Les Moniales, p.3.

¹⁶ R. Kottje cites references to persons vivant canonice or a vita canonica which are not gender-specific or which refer to canons: Admonitio Generalis, (789), MGH Capit. I, c.73,p.60 and Capit. miss. gen., MGH Capit. I, c.22,p.95; "Claustra sine armario? zum Unterschied von Kloster und Stift im Mittelalter" in J.F. Angener and J. Lenzenweger (eds.), Consuetudines Monasticae. Eine Festgabe für Kassius Hallinger aus Anlass seines 70. Geburtstages, (Rome, 1982), pp.125-44, at p.128.

¹⁷ Wemple, Women, p.166.

¹⁸ "De abbatissis, quae canonice aut regulariter non vivunt, episcopi requirant et regi adnuntient, ut ab honore priventur"; MGH Conc. II i,c.47,p.171.

¹⁹ "concerning abbesses who do not live according to the canons or the monastic rule...."; as translated by H.R. Loyn and J. Percival, The Reign of Charlemagne. [Documents of Medieval History 2], (London, 1975), p.62. Similarly, the Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzbouurg (800) refer to a vita canonica or a vita monachica; MGH Conc. II i,c.2,p.207. The Council of Mainz (813) refers to sanctimoniales who should live either regulariter following the Rule of St. Benedict, or canonice; MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.264.

²⁰ The Regula ad virgines drawn up by Caesarius of Arles was still used during the ninth century and it was adopted by the convent of Niedermünster in Regensburg in the tenth century; Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", p.84. While this proved the more popular and was adopted by St Croix Poitiers, other Rules for women included those drawn up by Aurelian of Arles, Donatus of Besançon and Columbanus - the latter being followed by the community at Luxeuil; other convents such as Jouarre

Although the Council of Frankfurt stated elsewhere that men and women should follow the Benedictine Rule ²¹ that regulariter always denoted the Benedictine Rule for nuns can only be inferred when the legislation directly mentions it for women. ²²

The first set of regulations for canons was drawn up by Chrodegang of Metz between 751 and 766; and subsequent references to a female canonical life have been viewed as a directly comparative female version developing out of this. ²³ But definite evidence for canonesses is first provided by the Council of Châlons (813) which refers to sanctimoniales quae se canonicas vocant. ²⁴ An examination of the regulations for canonesses in the Council of Châlons as well as the more expanded treatise in the IS²⁵ will show that canonesses should be viewed as the

and Chelles may have followed a regula mixta (of Columbanan and Benedictine elements); Schmitz, Les Moniales, pp.13-16. Under their third abbess Agnes the community at Nivelles accepted the Benedictine Rule, but this may have been combined here too with the Columbanan Rule; J.J. Hoebanx, L'Abbaye Nivelles des origines au XIVE siècle, (Brussels, 1952), pp.70,75ff.

²¹ MGH Conc. II i,c.11-18,p.168. On the significance of this council and its expressed preference for the Benedictine Rule, see Herrin, The Formation of Christendom, pp.441-2.

²² As does c.13 of the Council of Mainz (813), "quae vero professionem sanctae regulae Benedicti fecerunt..."; MGH Conc. II i,p.264. The Conc. in Franc. Hab., (816-29) refers to the Benedictine rule and male monasteries (c.9); it may therefore be reasonable to (cautiously) infer that the regular life in c.13, "de monasteriis feminarum in canonico vel regulari ordine constitutis", was also Benedictine; MGH Conc. II ii,pp.591-2.

²³ Schmitz: Les Moniales, pp.39-40. "Canonesses... presumably the feminine counterpart of the order of canons"; Wemple, Women, p.168. Also, Schulenburg, "Strict active enclosure and its effects on the female monastic experience (500-1100)", in J.A. Nichols and L.T.Shank, (eds.), Distant Echoes, pp.51-86, at p.58; Parisse, "Les femmes au monastère", p.320.

²⁴ MGH Conc. II i,c.53,p.284.

²⁵ A. Werminghoff first noted that chapters 53-65 of the Council of Châlons were a prototype of the IS; "Die Beschlüsse des Aachener Concils im Jahre 816", NA, 27, (1901), pp.605-75, at p.631, note 4.

canonical equivalents of regular nuns and not as the female equivalents of canons.

Alongside the IS the 816 Council of Aachen drew up a Rule for canons. ²⁶ This demonstrates that the important similarity between canonesses and canons (and therefore the main difference between canonesses and nuns) was the right to hold private property. The IS stated that if a canoness wished to give her property to the Church and wished to retain the usufruct, a quaestor should be appointed who would administer the property. ²⁷ However, if she did not wish to give her property to the Church, with the abbess and other sanctimoniales agreeing, the canoness should commit her property, by a document confirmed in public, to a kinsman or friend of good faith who would guard her interests outside the convent. ²⁸ Women were advised to decide who was going to administer their property before they entered the convent so that, free of external care, they could concentrate on their heavenly reward. ²⁹ But clearly, it was envisaged that excursions outside the convent ³⁰ and/or further conversations with men might be required. ³¹ A canoness could also retain private resources within the convent: private dwellings are referred to by the Council of

²⁶ MGH Conc. II i, pp.394-421.

²⁷ "Si autem ecclesiae eas tradiderit et usufructuario voluerit, quaestor ecclesiae eas utpote ecclesiae defendat". MGH Conc. II i, c.9, p.444.

²⁸ "Quodsi eas ecclesiae conferre noluerit, abbatissa et ceteris sanctimonialibus conhibentiam adhibentibus, committat eas per scriptum publice roboratum aut propinquo aut alio cuilibet bonae fidei amico, qui eas iure res defendat"; MGH Conc. II i, c.9, p.444.

²⁹ MGH Conc. II i, c.9, pp.444-5.

³⁰ Council of Châlons; MGH Conc. II i, c.57, 62, pp.284-5.

³¹ The Council of Châlons, MGH Conc. II i, c.51, 52, 55, 56, pp.284-85. The IS, MGH Conc. II i, c.19, 20, 23, pp.451-2.454. For a fuller discussion of cloistering see pp.104-114 below.

Châlons as mansiones ³² and by the IS as mansiunculae.³³ Canonesses also had servants. ³⁴

A second important difference between canons and canonesses was in the supervisory role of the bishop. Monks were regulated by their abbot, and canons by their bishop. ³⁵ The bishop had a specific supervisory role over abbesses and their convents. They oversaw the Rule observed by their abbesses ³⁶, gave abbesses permission to leave their convents ³⁷ and intervened in disputed abbatial elections ³⁸; bishops also oversaw the lifestyle of the whole convent ³⁹, and ultimately intervened in the cases of especially disruptive sanctimoniales. ⁴⁰ But on a day-to-day basis canonesses, like nuns, were ruled by abbesses. ⁴¹

The IS was therefore part of the monastic tradition⁴² with its ideals of abstinence ⁴³, renunciation ⁴⁴ and

³² MGH Conc. II i,c.51,p.285.

³³ MGH Conc. II i,c.20,23,pp.451-52,454.

³⁴ Council of Châlons; MGH Conc. II i,c.62,p.285. IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.21,p.452.

³⁵ Admonitio Generalis, MGH Capit. I,c.73,p.60.

³⁶ Council of Frankfurt (796/7), MGH Capit. I,c.47,p.77.

³⁷ See below, pp.106-07; 112.

³⁸ Hincmar upbraided Charles the Bald's second wife, Richildis, for expelling a legitimately elected abbess from the convent at Origny; Flodoard, MGH SS,13,III, c.27,p.549. Episcopal intervention in the disputed election involving Charles the Bald's daughter, Rotrude, at St. Croix, Poitiers in 861 is also described; Flodoard, MGH, Ibid, III,c.27,p.548.

³⁹ Statuta of Walter of Sens, PL132,cols.717-20.

⁴⁰ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.18,pp.450-51.

⁴¹ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.7,p.442.

⁴² Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", pp.109-111.

⁴³ In terms of their diet; MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.447.

rejection of the outside world's temptations. ⁴⁵ The IS also insisted on parity in the canonesses' lifestyle and equal observance of their obligations ⁴⁶ and also on communal living. ⁴⁷ It has been suggested that the IS should be seen in the context of a compromise between the reform ideals of Louis the Pious based on the Benedictine Rule and the vita communis (canonica) of Chrodegang of Metz. ⁴⁸ But this analysis, strictly speaking, can only be attributed to the Institutio canonicorum. ⁴⁹ There was no set of regulations for canonesses prior to 813 to form the basis of a compromise with the Benedictine Rule.

If the IS was a compromise, it should be viewed as one arising out of royal interests and those of the aristocratic kin of women religious on the one hand, and the reform ideals of the Frankish clergy on the other.⁵⁰ The canoness' retention of private property benefitted families unwilling to permanently alienate patrimony to the Church. Related to this consideration was the ability of canonesses to leave their convents. Additionally, in the case of the abbess, such egress enabled her to fulfill

⁴⁴ Although canons and canonesses were allowed to retain private property, canonesses had to delegate its administration to a third party whereas canons could hold and administer both their own and church property; MGH Conc. II i,c.115,p.397.

⁴⁵ Canonesses took a vow of virginity (c.8,10); and they underwent a degree of cloistering (c.8,11,12,19,20, 21,27); MGH Conc. II i,pp.444-52.

⁴⁶ Canonesses had to respect all inhabitants whatever their social background (c.10); their rations were also not to be distributed according to status (c.12); and all canonesses had to observe the horae canonicæ and go to the daily reading (c.15, 17); MGH Conc. II i,pp.446,449.

⁴⁷ Canonesses had to eat together, sleep in a dormitory and use the same hospital (c.10); all the community were involved in the discipline of a sinful canoness (c.18); MGH Conc. II i, pp.445-6,449-50.

⁴⁸ Schneider, Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life, p.85, note 19.

⁴⁹ Werminghoff; "Die Beschlüsse des Aachener Concils im Jahre 816", pp.623,630.

⁵⁰ Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", p.109.

her role as a royal official.⁵¹ Hence the IS was unlike a Rule such as the Regula ad virgines which, being firmly ascetic, could not have adequately accommodated ninth-century royal and aristocratic interests.⁵²

However, we need to examine the extent of the IS' influence and whether it satisfied the secular interests of aristocratic families in particular regions; and we must even ask whether the IS made the need for regulation for nuns redundant. Although it is impossible to answer these questions from the legislation alone⁵³ some comments may be ventured. Others who have utilised the legislation have arrived at some rather contradictory conclusions. Wemple has argued that in the early period of the reforms, convents were more likely to follow the Benedictine Rule because of the likelihood of receiving royal grants of immunity especially from Louis the Pious; when royal authority diminished in the later ninth century, suggests Wemple, convents such as Remiremont were more likely to become institutes of canonesses under aristocratic familial control.⁵⁴

However, the IS was issued in 816 as part of Louis the Pious' reform legislation, to accomodate royal and aristocratic familial concerns, which demonstrates that the interests of the latter were dominant in the early ninth century. Nor was the Benedictine Rule, preferred by the reformers, incompatible with aristocratic family interests. Semmler has demonstrated how Herford, established in the first decade of the ninth century, formed part of a "Klostergruppe" with Notre Dame de

⁵¹ Heidebrecht and Nolte; Ibid, p.109; and see below, pp.114-15.

⁵² Women living under this Rule were strictly cloistered; Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", p.111. Also see C. Nolte, "Klosterleben von Frauen in der frühen Merowingerzeit. Überlegungen zur Regula ad virgines des Caesarius von Arles" in W. Affeldt and A. Kuhn (eds.), Frauen in der Geschichte VII, pp.257-71.

⁵³ Further research on individual institutions is required.

⁵⁴ Wemple, Women, p.172.

Soissons and followed the Benedictine Rule; as part of this network, Herford influenced the Liudolfing convent at Gandersheim under the abbess Hathumoda ⁵⁵ also to follow the Benedictine Rule. ⁵⁶

The case of Herford also serves to contradict a second conclusion of Wemple's. After observing that the Notitia de servitio monasteriorum of 819 listed forty-eight royal abbeys ⁵⁷ but included only five convents ⁵⁸, Wemple therefore argued: "we can only conclude that the reformers did not bother to list all feminine Benedictine abbeys because they were not pressing the imposition of the Benedictine Rule on female communities". ⁵⁹ But this interpretation is questionable, and indeed doubts have been expressed over the identification of some of the small number of convents listed. ⁶⁰ Such difficulties

⁵⁵ J. Semmler, "Corvey und Herford in der benediktinischen Reformbewegung des 9. Jahrhunderts", FMS, 4, (1970), pp.289-319.

⁵⁶ Gandersheim was not the only new convent founded after the IS which followed the Benedictine Rule. Vézelay was founded by Bertha, wife of Gerard of Vienne: J. Verdon, "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord", Revue Mabillon, 59, (1976), pp.49-96, at p.50. However, Vézelay only lasted twenty years. Nelson pointed to the Monumenta Vizeliacensia which stated that this was "on account of frequent assaults of the secular world"; "Commentary", p.329, note 27 whereas Schulenburg stated that it was "destroyed by the Vikings", "Women's monastic communities", p.281, note 49.

⁵⁷ Emile Lesne, "Les Ordonnances de Louis le Pieux", Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France, 6, (1920), pp.445-88; text=pp.490-93; MGH Capit. I, no.171, pp.349-52.

⁵⁸ These are listed as Notre Dame de Soissons, Baumeles Dames in the diocese of Besançon, Swarzach at Würzburg, St. Croix de Poitiers and Notre Dame de Limoges; Wemple, Women, p.295, note 164.

⁵⁹ Wemple, Women, p.169.

⁶⁰ E. Magnou-Nortier pointed out that there is no real evidence that Notre Dame de Limoges was a convent of nuns; "Formes Féminines de Vie Consacrée dans les pays du Midi jusqu'au début du XII^e siècle", La Femme dans la vie religieuse du Languedoc XIII^e-XIV^e s., [Cahiers de Fanjeaux 23], (1988), pp.193-216, at p.194, note 3. Jane Martindale also commented that of the five foundations only St. Croix de Poitiers is definitely described as a

demonstrate how little information there is for these institutions ⁶¹ and the danger of discerning patterns even within a region from such a small amount of evidence.⁶² Further, aristocratically patronised Benedictine convents like Herford would not appear on the Notitia, which in any case affords no comprehensive list of either female or male Benedictine houses. ⁶³

Wemple stressed the contrast between the adaptation of the Benedictine Rule for canons at Aachen in 817, and the lack of any attempt "to adapt the Benedictine rule for use by nunneries". ⁶⁴ A separate set of regulations for canonesses was required because their monastic lifestyle made them quite different from canons. But it could be

monasterium puellarum; "The Nun Immena and the Foundation of the Abbey of Beaulieu: a Woman's Prospects in the Carolingian Church", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.27-42, at pp.29-30, note 8.

⁶¹ Magnou-Nortier, Ibid. Martindale comments on the unreliability of dossiers for convents supposedly founded for women in the Carolingian period in Aquitaine, and hence the even greater importance attached to what scant information there is, as for Sarrazac; Ibid.

⁶² However, Verdon has compiled very useful lists, diocese by diocese, of convents in "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord aux IXe -XIe siècle", Revue Mabillon, 59, (1976), pp.49-96; and "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du sud aux IXe -XIe siècle", Annales du Midi, 88, (1976), pp.117-38. Verdon's information sometimes alludes to the convent's professed Rule. St. Pierre de Meerbeke may have had canonesses before 870 and the convent at Auchy was probably Benedictine; "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord", pp.52,55. But Verdon's evidence includes legislation and hagiographical texts whose problems as evidence we have already noted [see ch.1 above]; even grants and foundation charters may not be totally reliable. For example, a donation of Charles the Bald to Notre Dame de Soissons is in fact only referred to in a later eleventh-century forgery; "Notes sur le rôle économique de monastères féminins", p.331, note 26.

⁶³ Lesne comments that the document has a provisional character and that it was concerned with military quotas rather than religious observance; "Les Ordonnances de Louis le Pieux", pp.465,445-88.

⁶⁴ Wemple, Women, p.169.

argued that except for their ability to retain private property, canonesses led a very similar life to that of nuns, therefore making unnecessary an adaptation of a Rule which certain convents were already observing.⁶⁵ Further, the legislation often adds a phrase to a statement concerning abbots and monks to indicate that the same prescription was intended for their female counterparts.⁶⁶

While the IS does not refer to any actual communities, no conclusions about its usage can be drawn from this fact. Nor does the manuscript tradition conclusively indicate the extent of the IS' popularity. Wemple argues that because the IS is extant only in four ninth-century copies this demonstrates that it was not widely followed, and she further suggests that abbesses may have opted for the economic advantages they could obtain under the Benedictine Rule.⁶⁷ This rather contradicts her arguments that the Benedictine Rule was less popular in the early years of the reform and that Benedictine houses tended to evolve into institutes of canonesses in the later ninth century. The IS actually exists in five ninth-century manuscripts.⁶⁸ This number of contemporaneous copies,

⁶⁵ The Capit. Monasticum [MGH Capit. I, no. 170, pp. 343-49] was issued in the same year as the Notitia de servitio monasteriorum.

⁶⁶ "Ut abbates, ubi monachi sunt, pleniter cum monachis secundum regulam vibrant (sic) adque canones diligenter discant et observent; similiter abbatissae faciant"; Capit. miss. gen. (802), MGH Capit. I, c. 12, p. 93. Or concerning the punishment for monks who break their vows: "similiter et in canonicis atque sanctimonialibus observandum esse sancimus"; Conc. Franc. (846), MGH Conc. III, c. 4, p. 136. The Capit. Monasticum may represent an attempt to publicise the reformers' preference for the Benedictine Rule rather than constituting a gender-specific statement.

⁶⁷ That is, royal grants of immunity; Wemple, Women, p. 170.

⁶⁸ Werminghoff, "Die Beschlüsse des Aachener Concils im Jahre 816", p. 634, note 7.

could be regarded as high. ⁶⁹

That no firm conclusions may be drawn concerning the proportions of nuns and canonesses is illustrated by two opposed interpretations. Schäfer argued that the terminology of donations and grants corroborated his argument that institutes of canonesses predominated in the ninth century. ⁷⁰ Levison qualified Schäfer's thesis, arguing that many of the terms Schäfer used - monasterium, coenobium, claustrum, ancillae Dei, Deo sacratae, sanctimoniales, sorores, virgines - could apply as readily to convents following the Benedictine Rule as to institutes of canonesses. ⁷¹ The legislation is also non-specific in both its terminology for women religious⁷² and for the actual institution. The most common term used is monasterium; claustrum is also used but other terms such as collegium sanctimonialium ⁷³, congregatio ⁷⁴ and societas ⁷⁵ occur. Domus is more ambiguous since its meaning as "house" overlapped in cases of communities

⁶⁹ The Council of Paris (829 exists in two tenth-century manuscripts [MGH Conc. II ii, p.606]; and the Councils of Reischach, Freising and Salzburg (800) exist only in one tenth-century manuscript [MGH Conc. II i, p.205].

⁷⁰ Including St. Croix de Poitiers, Nivelles, Herford, Gandersheim and Avenay; Die Kanonissenstifter, pp.70-4,130; and see "Kanonissen und Diakonissen". Schäfer's arguments range too widely geographically and chronologically: there is insufficient acknowledgement of regional differences, and an assumption that some of the terminology is automatically transferrable in different periods - especially diaconissa; see below, pp.120-21; 232-33.

⁷¹ W. Levison, "Rescension: K.H. Schäfer, Die Kanonissenstifter" in Westdeutsche Zeitschrift für Geschichte und Kunst, 27 (1908), pp.491-512, at pp.491,508. Hoebanx noted the difficulties of determining whether moniales, fratres et sorores denoted regulars at Nivelles; Hoebanx, L'Abbaye de Nivelles, p.72.

⁷² See above, pp.83-85.

⁷³ IS; MGH Conc. II i, c.9, p.444.

⁷⁴ IS; MGH Conc. II i, c.9, 18, 25, pp.444, 450, 454.

⁷⁵ IS; MGH Conc. II i, c.12, p.446.

founded as proprietary house monasteries. 76

Legislative statements which add that sanctimoniales should do the same as is prescribed for monachi⁷⁷ indicate that sanctimoniales were perceived as a group defined simply by gender. The Council of Mainz (847) provides for sanctimoniales in the widest interpretation of the term. Here a résumé of the lifestyle for sanctimoniales repeats chapters 57 to 59 of the Council of Châlons (813) but omits the crucial phrase quae se canonicas vocant, and the chapter concerning mansiones.⁷⁸ Therefore the IS was not necessarily successful in, nor even envisaged as, achieving "un regroupement de toutes femmes sous des principes uniformes" ⁷⁹ with canonesses evolving from regular nuns ⁸⁰ in all the Frankish kingdoms.

The argument that with the breakdown of royal authority "local families took over the exploitation of monastic revenues, with their daughters administering convents as lay abbesses..." and..."Benedictine abbeys were transformed into institutes of canonesses"⁸¹ requires modification since Benedictine houses still received royal grants in the later ninth century ⁸²; and

⁷⁶ See below, pp.103-04.

⁷⁷ See n.66 above.

⁷⁸ The procedure required for an abbess leaving her convent and her spiritual care of her nuns; liturgical duties; and the responsibility to sleep in a dormitory; MGH Conc. III,c.16.pp.169-70.

⁷⁹ M. Parisse, "Les Chanoinesses dans l'Empire germanique" in Francia, 6, (1978), pp.107-126, at p.112.

⁸⁰ As Parisse contends for ninth-century Saxony with the Benedictine Rule having a renaissance before the end of the tenth century; "Les femmes au monastère", pp.320-22.

⁸¹ Wemple, Women, p.172.

⁸² Notre Dame de Jouarre was granted the rights of a mint and a market; Jean Guerout, "La monastère a l'époque carolingienne" in Y. Chaussy et al (eds.) L'Abbaye de Notre Dame de Jouarre, (Paris, 1961), vol.1, pp.75-8, and

the benefits once reserved for Benedictine houses were also given to some institutes of canonesses. Nivelles received a royal donation, the income of which was to be reserved for the sole use of the community.⁸³ It may be unwise to generalise from the example of Nivelles as it had been, in the comparatively recent past, Benedictine⁸⁴ and was closely linked to the Carolingians.⁸⁵ But Nivelles may exemplify the point that the distinction between "Frauenkloster und Damenstift"⁸⁶ is not hard and fast for the ninth century; that in fact "les liens entre chanoinesses et benedictines pouvaient être étroits sans que les unes et les autres changent leur mode de vie".⁸⁷

Therefore, the legislation strengthens the impression that overall proportions of nuns and canonesses cannot be determined. Where conclusions can be drawn about the regular or canonical life they are often only for individual convents. Parisse's remarks concerning the role of institutes of canonesses fit an analysis of the IS as a compromise between secular practices and religious ideals. Thus the canoness "demeure en relations avec sa famille".⁸⁸ This relationship was two-way: convents were useful places for protecting unmarried daughters from the incestuous

Verdon, "Notes", p.333. Emma, abbess of San Juan de las Abadesas, was granted immunity from tolls by Charles the Simple in 899; Verdon, Ibid, p.334, note 64.

⁸³ Hoebanx, L'Abbaye de Nivelles, p.107.

⁸⁴ It was described in 877 as "fratrum seu sororum, sanctimonialium videlicet et canonicorum Nivellae coenebii"; Hoebanx, Ibid, p.72. But it is unclear when it became canonical; certainly at least up to the late eighth century it was a regular community; Hoebanx; Ibid, p.82.

⁸⁵ Prinz, Mönchtum und Gesellschaft, p.336. Royal women such as Gisla, the daughter of Lothar II, were its abbatissae; Hoebanx, Ibid, p.102.

⁸⁶ Kottje, "Claustra sine armario?"; Ennen, The Medieval Woman, p.79.

⁸⁷ Parisse, "Les femmes au monastère", p.321.

⁸⁸ Parisse, Ibid, p.322.

advances of their kin ⁸⁹ and as intercessors for their family, ⁹⁰ but equally these women might sometimes be taken from the convent to marry for the political interests of the family. ⁹¹ However, Parisse was writing about Germany ⁹² and principally Saxony ⁹³ so that his remarks concerning canonesses may not be applicable for other regions; but they indicate that the foundation of institutes of canonesses may have been determined in part as much by the different cultural needs of particular regions as the changing political and economic dynamics of the ninth century.

[2] Smaller Communities and Individual Women Religious.

If we know about the larger convents ⁹⁴ this is due to their fuller record. Therefore a distinction is to be drawn not between regular and canonical convents, but rather between large houses, whether regular or canonical, and whether royally or aristocratically patronised, on the one hand, and smaller and probably less permanent houses and individual women on the other.

⁸⁹ Leyser, Rule and Conflict, p.64. Parisse regarded Lesyer's comments about tenth-century Saxony as relevant for the ninth century; Ibid.

⁹⁰ Leyser, Ibid, p.72.

⁹¹ Parisse "Les femmes au monastère", p.322.

⁹² "Les Chanoinesses".

⁹³ "Les femmes au monastère".

⁹⁴ The question of convents' size is difficult to answer. A capitulary c.822-24 stipulates that the congregatio at St. Croix de Poitiers should not support more than one hundred; MGH Capit. I, no.149, c.6, p.302. But it is unclear whether this referred to all inhabitants and whether this was the actual figure at this time. Hincmar estimated that the mansi of Avenay could support 40 women religious and 20 clerics: Flodoard, MGH SS, 13, c.27, p.549. Some Vitae refer to numbers but their reliability is uncertain. The Vita Odiliae refers to 130 canonesses at Hohenburg [MGH SRM, 6, c.13, p.44]; the Vita Glodesindis refers to 100 women [ASS Iulii VI, c.I, 12, p.204]; the Vita Sadalbergae states there were 300 women at Laon [MGH SRM, 5, c.17, p.59]; and the Vita Herlindis et Renildis refers to twelve other women at Aldeneyk [ASS Mart. III, c.II, 11, p.388].

The legislation does not conclusively support Wemple's arguments that, "small nunneries were gradually eliminated and the status of women religious living in the world was degraded," so that "the only choice was to join either a Benedictine convent or an institute of canonesses".⁹⁵ A capitulary of 789 orders that nonnanes living in small monasteries without a Rule should be grouped together in one place as a regular congregation under the authority of the bishop.⁹⁶ The capitulary confirms that smaller groups of women religious existed. Further, the prescription's success seems to have been limited judging by a reference in 817 by Hrabanus Maurus to a coenobia or monasteriola nonnarum even if it is in the context of the Emperor's order to move them in alia loca.⁹⁷ In 829 small monasteries still required similar legislation.⁹⁸

This picture is corroborated by the Gesta of Bishop Adalric which refer to the consecration of monachae and canonicae in the Le Mans diocese between 832 and 857. Here monachae were consecrated in monasterio⁹⁹ although the first group of 65 were consecrated canonice which may indicate that these were canonesses as opposed to the second group of 38. The monachae were in convents, however, whereas the canonicae virgines were consecrated per diversa loca.¹⁰⁰ This may indicate house-convents and/or individual women religious who followed a religious life outside a coenobitic environment.

⁹⁵ Wemple, Women, p.168.

⁹⁶ Duplex Leg. Edict, MGH Capit. I, c.19, p.63.

⁹⁷ MGH Epp. Karol., 5, c.6, p.518.

⁹⁸ MGH Capit. II, no.186, c.6, p.7.

⁹⁹ "Sacrauit etiam predictus pontifex virgines inter monachas et canonicas per diversa et canonice sacrauit tempora 120. In monasterio videlicet Intramensi monachas virgines canonice sacrauit 65. Et in monasterio Sanctae Mariae iuxta urbem supra fluvium Sartae, quod ipse a novo fundavit et ornavit, monachas virgines consecrauit 38, et reliquas canonicas virgines per diversa loca Domino militantes 17"; MGH SS, 15.1, c.44, p.324.

¹⁰⁰ MGH, Ibid.

Despite the tenor of the early reforms, later legislation is ambiguous suggesting that both monastic and less institutionalised forms of religious observance continued to coexist. ¹⁰¹ Individual women following a private vow of chastity are attested to by the Council of Friouli (796/797). This refers to "either virgins or widows who, taking on the vow of virginity or continence, are emancipated for God and, as is the ancient custom in these regions as a sign of chastity, don the black as a religious dress". ¹⁰² Wemple mistranslates quasi in the sense that these women were mimicking "proper" nuns ¹⁰³; whereas they wore the black habit precisely because it made them like monastic women. ¹⁰⁴ The Council of Friouli (796/7) adds that although these women had not been veiled by a priest their vow was permanently binding ¹⁰⁵; those women who had broken their vow were to be segregated, do penance and even be excommunicated. ¹⁰⁶ The segregation may have involved separation from their sexual partners rather than being forced to enter a convent. ¹⁰⁷ This council therefore implies that those women who properly observed their vow were free to continue their form of religious life.

Such women continued to exist throughout the ninth century. The Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) stated that

¹⁰¹ The Councils of Worms (868) refers to feminae quae sacro velamine sunt consecratae and to viduae amongst other velatae feminae; Mansi, 15, c.20, 21, col.873.

¹⁰² "Item placuit de faeminis cuiuscumque conditionis, puellis scilicet vel viduis, quae, virginitatis sive continentiae propositum spontanee pollicentes, Deo emancipate fuerint et ob continentiae signum nigram vestem quasi religiosam, sicut antiquus mos in his regionibus, indutae fuerint"; MGH Conc. II i, c.11, p.193.

¹⁰³ "the black dress was now designated as only quasi-religious"; Wemple, Women, p.167.

¹⁰⁴ As in n.108 below.

¹⁰⁵ MGH Conc. II i, c.11, p.193.

¹⁰⁶ MGH, Ibid.

¹⁰⁷ But see Wemple, Women, p.167.

those women who lived like sanctimoniales having taken the veil of religion ¹⁰⁸ but who had fallen into libidinous ways should, by episcopal authority and royal enforcement, live in talibus locis where they could undergo penance; if bad reports concerning them were shown to be true they were to be coerced. ¹⁰⁹ Tales loca may denote convents, but this is not explicit and the implication remains that women who observed their vows were allowed to continue living in the world. At the turn of the ninth/tenth centuries Regino of Prüm included the Meaux/Paris statement but added the title: De secularibus viduis et sanctimonialibus. ¹¹⁰ This suggests that there was a perceived difference between widows and other women religious ¹¹¹, but also that widows were the most common type of women to lead a religious life in the world. Regino adds that when these women were segregated they were to be placed in monasteriis. ¹¹² It is clear, despite the hostile tone of these statements, that these women continued to represent an accepted manifestation of religious life alongside women in convents.

Thus all women religious had in common a permanent vow which was symbolised by the black dress and sometimes a veil. ¹¹³ Episcopal supervision was a further shared

¹⁰⁸ "Quae quasi sanctimoniales sub velamine religionis degere"; MGH Conc. III,c.70,p.118. This highlights the similarity between sanctimoniales in convents and those women who had taken a similar vow but lived in the world.

¹⁰⁹ MGH, Ibid.

¹¹⁰ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.171,pp.279-80.

¹¹¹ See below, pp.131, 228-30.

¹¹² Ecclesiastical Discipline; Ibid.

¹¹³ So that like the Council of Friouli (796/7) the IS refers to a propositum castimoniali, and the nigra vestis; it also mentions a velum worn for mass and the horae canonicae; MGH Conc. II i,c.8,10,27,pp.444-45,455. The Council of Tribur (895) refers to the virgin taking on the sacrum velamen and the sanctum habitum which rendered her permanently velata and consecrata, and also to the widow who was veiled in the sense of taking on a habitus sanctimonialium and a velamen consecratum; MGH Capit. II,

characteristic. The Council of Paris (829) condemned mulierculae who had veiled themselves ¹¹⁴; but it also stated that "such women should be examined and instructed, and if they wished to dedicate themselves to God, they should be veiled, and be diligently admonished how they should preserve that veiling under a vow of chastity and humility". ¹¹⁵ It is significant that this council is preoccupied with the regulation of the procedure of veiling ¹¹⁶ which puts the chapter concerning mulierculae into context. Although a rather "odd" saint for this period ¹¹⁷, the Vita Pusinnae, which was rewritten in the ninth century, presents the fifth-century Pusinna as secular virgin living in the world having undergone an episcopal consecration. ¹¹⁸

The same Council of Paris also refers to widows who wished to be veiled: having waited thirty days they should not remain in their own homes but go to a convent under the regimen of an abbess. ¹¹⁹ This could be interpreted as aiming to cloister all women religious. But particular

c.24,25,pp.226-28. See also pp.213-30 below.

¹¹⁴ MGH Conc. II ii,c.42,p.638. A capitulary of 829 also condemns women who had veiled themselves "unreasonably"; MGH Capit. II,no.186,c.2,p.7.

¹¹⁵ MGH Conc. II ii,c.42,p.638.

¹¹⁶ Virgins were not to be consecrated by priests; priests were not to veil widows without the knowledge of their bishops; abbesses were not to veil widows or virgins; MGH Conc. II ii, c.40,41,43,pp.637-38.

¹¹⁷ See p.150 below.

¹¹⁸ Vita Pusinnae, c.4,5,9,pp.216-7,221-22. Metz dated the Vita to the ninth-century precisely because of the description of the consecration; "La consécration des vierges dans l'Eglise franque". Pusinna seems to be first blessed [Vita Pusinnae, c.5,p.217] and then veiled some time later [Vita Pusinnae, c.9,p.221]. In this latter stage the Latin reads, "nam illam sacro velamine cooperire studuit". De Gaiffier, the Vita's editor, comments "il n'est guère vraisemblable que l'hagiographe ait voulu dire que Pusinne avait elle-même imposé le voile"; Vita Pusinnae, p.221,note 4. But in view of the individual women religious we have noted the hagiographer may have wished to say exactly this.

¹¹⁹ MGH Conc. II ii,c.43,pp.638-9.

concern is expressed about young widows who were seemingly more open to the devil's snares if they remained at home.¹²⁰ The Church was apparently attempting rather to protect younger women who were more vulnerable to abduction and forced remarriage, than to enforce monastic observance on all religious women.¹²¹ Other legislative statements do not prescribe that religious widows should go to a convent. They either express concern about over-hasty veiling stipulating the thirty-day waiting period¹²² or that "indiscreet" widows should be episcopally supervised.¹²³

The Council of Mainz (888) refers to widows who were given the choice of assuming a professio castitatis in a convent or in their home.¹²⁴ It may not be stretching an interpretation of this text to point to the dual application of the term domus: it is used in the liturgy in rites concerning canonesses¹²⁵ and may denote small communities of canonesses or a religious widow's own household¹²⁶ - in some cases the two may have been synonymous.¹²⁷ The Council of Mainz therefore does not

¹²⁰ "quoniam huiuscemodi adulescentulas, viros amittentes et in sanctimoniali habitu propriis domibus residentes, persepe in laqueum diaboli lapsas esse didicimus"; MGH, Ibid, p.639.

¹²¹ This would militate against the argument that ninth-century convents did not provide such an attractive alternative to supposedly more secure marriages; Wemple, Women, p.171.

¹²² Capit. Eccles. (818-19), MGH Capit. I, c.21, p.278.

¹²³ MGH Capit. II, no.196, (829), c.17, p.42.

¹²⁴ "Si autem propositum castitatis assumpserint, aut monasterii claustris regulariter constringantur, aut domi manentes castitatem suae professionis integerrime custodiant"; Mansi 18, c.26, col.71.

¹²⁵ See below, pp.212-13, 222.

¹²⁶ The term "individual" is misleading when noble widows would have been heads of their familiae.

¹²⁷ Walter of Sens refers to moniales receiving people in their domus; PL132, c.2, col.781. It is unclear whether domus means the convent as a whole or perhaps

demonstrate that "resistance to women religious living in the world diminished by the end of the ninth century" 128; rather it confirms that some women religious especially widows had always remained outside convents throughout the ninth century. 129

II. The Religious Life in Practice.

[1] The Cloistering of Women Religious.

To what extent strict cloistering of women religious was attempted and how successful this was are crucial questions for this study. The enclosure of religious women has been viewed as one of the most gender-specific policies of the Carolingian reforms. 130 A review of the legislation not only qualifies such an interpretation but raises wider implications for the participation of sanctimoniales in the literary and educational trends of the ninth century, and the role of abbesses.

This study has not yet looked at the question of double monasteries although these would have provided points of contact for male and female religious. However, much of the evidence for identifying double monasteries is again ambiguous. 131 Although the double monastery was

private dwellings if these are canonesses, since these statutes do not use the term monasterium anywhere.

128 Wemple, Women, p.173.

129 Rotrude, the widowed sister-in-law of Rodulf of Bourges, is described as femina Deo sacrata c.860: Magnou-Nortier, "Formes Feminines de Vie Consacrée", p.208; Martindale, "The Nun Immena", p.36, note 28. Magnou-Nortier also points to a deo sacrata, and another woman named Aulo from c.905; Ibid, pp.206-7.

130 Wemple, Women, pp.168-9. Schulenburg, also argued that "Carolingian councils from the mid-eighth to the mid-ninth century issued a proliferation of sex-specific canons stipulating rigorous, unbroken claustration for nuns", "Strict Active Enclosure", p.56.

131 Mary Bateson, "Origins and Early History of Double Monasteries" in TRHS, 13 (1899), pp.137-99 remains fundamental; but for a recent discussion of Anglo-Saxon double monasteries including a survey of the historiography see Schneider, Anglo-Saxon Women in the

apparently quite widespread in Anglo-Saxon England, the convents set up as Anglo-Saxon enclaves in the Frankish kingdoms did not become double monasteries.¹³² Rudolf of Fulda, the author of the Vita Leobae writing in the 840s, "seems to be unable to reconcile himself to the idea of a double house itself"¹³³ and they were not founded in Saxony. More research on actual foundations is required. As far as segregation of the sexes is concerned double monasteries need not imply a greater degree of access¹³⁴; and in some "double" monasteries male and female communities were geographically separated by a considerable distance.¹³⁵

Prior to the Carolingian reforms there was a tradition,

Religious Life, pp.14-37,38-80. The Translatio Balthildis describes the community at Chelles as clerum tam virorum quam feminarum; MGH SS,15.1,p.285. This surely does not imply that these women were considered part of the clergy [Wemple, Women, p.169]; the phrases cleri Dei, sacerdotes sancteque virgines et viduae pudicae and also ordo clericorum et sacrae virgines imply a clear distinction between priests/monks and women religious; MGH, Ibid. However, the Translatio may be describing a double monastery. T.A.M. Bishop interpreted the Corbie a and b scripts in the context that they were written at Corbie by a body of professed nuns there; "The Scribes of the Corbie a-b" in P. Godman and R. Collins (eds.), Charlemagne's Heir, pp.523-36, at pp.533-35. Elsewhere, phrases such as fratres et sanctimoniales [Verdon, "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord, p.78,note 122 concerning Morienval] could imply a double monastery but is more likely to mean a convent with a house of canons attached.

¹³² Schneider, Ibid, p.17. Schneider explains their decline in England thus: "with their commanding and holy abbesses..." they "had no place in a genuinely Christian and medieval world"; Ibid, pp.36-7. An analysis of the success or otherwise of the ninth-century reforms will impinge on a consideration of the extent of the phenomenon of the double monastery in the Frankish kingdoms.

¹³³ Schneider, Ibid, p.42,note 38.

¹³⁴ Strict segregation was the ideal; Schneider, Ibid, pp.41-3.

¹³⁵ Corvey and Herford were described as coenobia utriusque sexus; U. Lobbedy, "Zur archäologischen Erforschung westfälischer Frauenkloster des 9. Jahrhunderts. (Freckenhorst, Vreden, Meschede, Herford)", FMS, 4, (1970), pp.320-40, at p.335.

patristic ¹³⁶ and monastic ¹³⁷, which prescribed the benefits of cloistering women. This tradition was reflected in Merovingian legislation ¹³⁸ but there was a flurry of statements from the mid-eighth to the mid-ninth centuries concerning the segregation of women religious from the secular world. Two main concerns are expressed regarding cloistering: firstly, about sanctimoniales and their abbesses leaving the convent and secondly, about allowing outsiders inside the convent. We will look at each in turn.

The Council of Ver (755) prescribed that if abbesses were to leave their convents they could only do so in times of war, and to go to the king's court once yearly so long as they had episcopal permission. ¹³⁹ This council formed the basis of many subsequent legislative statements emphasising that abbesses must acquire episcopal or royal permission to leave their convents. ¹⁴⁰

¹³⁶ Especially the letters of St. Jerome to Eustochium, and of Pope Gregory the Great; Schulenburg, "Strict Active Enclosure", pp.52-4.

¹³⁷ Especially the Regula ad virgines of Caesarius of Arles; Schulenburg, Ibid, pp.54-6 and Nolte, "Klosterleben von Frauen".

¹³⁸ For example, the Council of Orleans (549); MGH Conc. I, c.19, p.107.

¹³⁹ MGH Capit. I, c.6, p.34.

¹⁴⁰ Duplex leg. edict. (789) only allows abbesses to leave their convents with royal permission, MGH Capit. I, c.19, p.63. The Councils of Freising, Reischach and Salzburg (800) state that an abbess should not leave her monasterium except with episcopal consent; MGH Conc. II i, c.27, p.210. The Capit. miss. gen (802) also requires the abbess to get her bishop's permission; MGH Capit. I, c.20, p.95. Cf. also the Council of Mainz (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.13, p.264. The Council of Tours (813) stipulates that episcopal permission should be sought by abbesses unless they wish to visit the emperor; MGH Conc. II i, c.30, p.290. These instructions are echoed by the Council of Châlons (813) for canonesses; this council also orders that abbesses may leave only with the permission of their bishop or that of his vicecomes, or by imperial order; MGH Conc. II i, c.57, p.284. The Châlons statement is repeated in 847 by the Council of Mainz but for sanctimoniales generally; MGH Conc. III, c.26, p.170.

Not only abbesses, who by virtue of their status were a special case, but also other sanctimoniales regularly had to leave their convents. As part of the procedure for the abbess going outside her convent, several texts refer to other sanctimoniales who accompanied her ¹⁴¹, and over whose behaviour she must be vigilant ¹⁴² or who themselves were witnesses to the abbess' own good behaviour.¹⁴³ Further, although the majority of ordinary women religious would not normally leave their convents ¹⁴⁴, it was envisaged that they too might leave on occasion. ¹⁴⁵ The legislation is not consistent on the question of whether the abbess or her bishop gave sanctimoniales permission, but more often it was the abbess who decided. ¹⁴⁶

It was not just canonesses ¹⁴⁷ but also nuns, or at least their abbesses, whom the legislation envisaged as leaving

¹⁴¹ Councils of Freising, Reisbach and Salzburg (800); MGH Conc. II i, c.27, p.210.

¹⁴² Council of Châlons (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.57, p.284; Council of Mainz (847), MGH Conc. III, c.26, p.170.

¹⁴³ The IS refers to abbess' conversations with men which could have been inside or outside the convent; MGH Conc. II i, c.19, p.451.

¹⁴⁴ "Nullatenus foris claustra ire praesumant"; Capit miss. gen. (802), MGH Capit. I, c.20, p.95. Theodulf of Orleans also states that "populus, ut praediximus, in unum ad publicam missarum celebrationem convenient exceptis deo sacratis feminis, quibus mos est ad publicum non egredi, sed claustris monasterii contineri"; MGH Capit. Episc., I, c.45, p.142.

¹⁴⁵ Walter of Sens (d.923) states that sanctimoniales should not be allowed to leave or go about at night nisi ex magna causa, et raro and that they should return without delay; PL132, c.5, col.719.

¹⁴⁶ "nec sibi subditas facere permittat... exire": Duplex leg. edict., MGH Capit. I, c.19, p.63. But the Council of Châlons (813) states that, "sanctimoniales, nisi forte abbatissa sua pro aliqua necessitate incumbente mittente, nequaquam de monasterio egrediantur"; MGH Conc. II i, c.62, p.285. Walter of Sens also envisaged that the abbess made the decision: "si aliquando abbatissa ex causa iusta alicui permittat, eidem injungat, quod sine mora revertatur"; PL132, c.5, col.719.

¹⁴⁷ Council of Châlons, MGH Conc. II i, c.57 (abbesses) and 62 (canonesses), pp.284-85.

their convents. Although the assembly at Herstal decreed that regular abbesses should not absent themselves from their convents ¹⁴⁸ later legislative statements do not repeat this prescription in the case of Benedictine abbesses. The Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg (800) include the injunction that when the abbess and the nuns accompanying her return to the convent they should not talk to the other sanctimoniales about what they have seen "quia plurima destructio est", sicut in sancta regula continentur. ¹⁴⁹ The "holy Rule" is the Benedictine¹⁵⁰ which would imply that these were nuns. The Council of Mainz' provision in 813 for abbesses to leave the convent is aimed equally at regular and canonical abbesses.¹⁵¹ Similarly, the Council of Mainz (847) non-specifically refers to sanctimoniales, repeating the Châlons provisions about abbesses leaving their convents. ¹⁵²

The legislation envisaged abbesses and sanctimoniales neither leaving their convents regularly ¹⁵³ nor for journeys of great length ¹⁵⁴ especially pilgrimages.¹⁵⁵ It has been argued that the reforms demonstrate that "all

¹⁴⁸ MGH Capit. I,c.3,p.47.

¹⁴⁹ MGH Conc. II i,c.27,p.210.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid, p.210. This quotation comes from the Benedictine Rule, which warns monks against going outside their monasteries; McCann, The Rule of St. Benedict, c.67,pp.152-54.

¹⁵¹ MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.264.

¹⁵² See above n.140.

¹⁵³ See n.144 and 145 above.

¹⁵⁴ Councils of Châlons (813): "aut prolixitas itineris id facere minime permittat"; MGH Conc. II i,c.57,p.284.

¹⁵⁵ The Council of Friouli (796/7) prescribed that abbatissae and monachae should not go to Rome or other holy places since there was the danger of forming dangerous liaisons with men on their journey; MGH Conc. II i,c.12,p.194. The physical dangers as well as the danger of falling into a life of prostitution for women going on pilgrimage preoccupied Boniface of Mainz; see Schneider, Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life pp.230-31,notes 43 and 44. But as Schneider demonstrates, Anglo-Saxon women played a significant role in pilgrimage even after the time of Boniface, and Frankish women also probably continued to go on pilgrimage; Ibid, pp.227-234,note 45.

women religious were to be cloistered".¹⁵⁶ This fact, it is alleged, gave nuns and canonesses another element in common so that it was perceived as unnecessary to impose the Benedictine Rule on women.¹⁵⁷ But this argument makes little sense in a context where although leaving the convent was not encouraged, provision was made for nuns and canonesses. This explains the references to episcopal permission: women were allowed to leave their convents so long as episcopal authority over convents was acknowledged. The tone and certainly the number of statements may be partly explained by the fact that bishops regulated women religious; moreover, the frequency of these statements is also explicable if women were ignoring the spirit of the injunctions.

Moreover, statements concerning monks leaving their monasteries are similar to those for women.¹⁵⁸ Prescriptions that a group of sanctimoniales should accompany the abbess were probably issued for reasons of moral and physical safety. But the reality of retinues of sanctimoniales contrasts to prescriptions stating that monks were not generally supposed to accompany their abbots.¹⁵⁹ These retinues of nuns/canonesses were sometimes going to court¹⁶⁰ whereas monks were banned from going to saecularia placita.¹⁶¹ While the legislation bans monks from a greater variety of secular

¹⁵⁶ Wemple, Women, p.169.

¹⁵⁷ Wemple, Ibid.

¹⁵⁸ The Council of Mainz (813) states that "in eorum clauastro permaneat, nullusque ex eis foras vadat, nisi per necessitatem abbate mittatur in oboedientiam"; MGH Conc. II i, c.12, p.264.

¹⁵⁹ Monks were also not supposed to accompany their abbots unless going to a general synod; MGH Capit. I, c.59, p.347.

¹⁶⁰ "nisi cum ad piissimum imperatorem nostrum proficisci voluerint": Council of Tours (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.30, p.290. Also "nisi forte... imperialis iussio eam cogat", Council of Châlons (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.57, p.284.

¹⁶¹ Council of Rheims (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.29, p.256.

activities, there are more general prescriptions concerning women religious going out into the world.¹⁶² Nevertheless, this aspect of cloistering was not gender-specific.

The principal concern of the legislation concerning the entry of men into convents was the danger of sexual liaisons.¹⁶³ Hence there are prescriptions that sanctimoniales may only meet with men between prime and vespers, that is, during daylight hours.¹⁶⁴ No laymen were allowed to enter the convent and a priest was only supposed to enter in order to celebrate mass and only with the bishop's permission¹⁶⁵; moreover, the priest had to leave immediately after he had completed his offices.¹⁶⁶

Other statements suggest that despite these ideals men were entering convents more frequently.¹⁶⁷ There was probably a difference between the claustrum and the

¹⁶² Schulenburg also points to a number of legislative statements which prescribe against monks going out into the world and being involved in its affairs; "Strict Active Enclosure"; pp.58-59. Her argument that these statements "in effect outline the activities of monks outside the cloister" [*Ibid*, p.59] weakens her case that cloistering prescriptions for women were successful [*Ibid*, p.70].

¹⁶³ The 836 Council of Aachen refers to convents which seemed like lupinaria (brothels), and which religious men were to go and investigate; MGH Conc. II i, c.12, p.713.

¹⁶⁴ Council of Châlons (813): c.55 concerns abbesses; c.56 concerns abbesses and canonesses; MGH Conc. II i, p.284. Walter of Sens expressed concern over sanctimoniales going out pernoctare; PL132, c.5, col.719.

¹⁶⁵ Council of Friouli (796/7), MGH Conc. II i, c.12, p.193; Capit. Eccles. (803-4), MGH Capit. I, c.5, p.119.

¹⁶⁶ Admonitio Generalis (789), MGH Capit. I, c.18, p.95; Capit. Eccles. (803-4), MGH Capit. I, c.5, p.119; MGH Capit. I, no.79, (813), c.4, p.175; IS, MGH Conc. II i, c.27, p.455.

¹⁶⁷ A cleric or layman could enter a convent if there was a reason necessitating it; MGH Capit. I, no.79, c.4, p.175. Also in 813 the Council of Châlons stated that no vassus or minister of the abbess could enter the convent unless there was an important reason; MGH Conc. II i, c.63, p.285.

convent as a whole where men had a greater degree of access. ¹⁶⁸ The IS stated that where canonesses had conversations with men they had to be supervised by three or four sanctimoniales of good character ¹⁶⁹; the same applied to abbesses. ¹⁷⁰ Further, the office of the portaria was seen as crucial: she had to be of maturity and proven good character ¹⁷¹ since all comings and goings had to go through the porta of the convent. ¹⁷²

Thus the reformers wished to cloister women religious. But there are two important caveats. First, a procedure was constructed which recognised that contact with the outside world was unavoidable, and which facilitated access for both laymen and especially clerics.¹⁷³

¹⁶⁸ While the Council of Châlons referred to the abbess leaving the monasterium [MGH Conc. II i,c.57,p.284] it also prescribes against a vassus or minister entering the claustrum ancillarum [MGH, Ibid,c.63,p.285]. The IS refers to female servants who brought back tales from the outside world being ejected extra claustra monasterii [MGH, Ibid,c.21,p.452] and the Capit. gen. (802) also sees a difference: ut in claustra vel monasterium earum vir nullus intret; MGH Capit. I,c.18,p.95. On the two different areas see Lobbedy, "Zur archäologischen Erforschung westfälischer Frauenkloster", p.334; M.M. Hildebrandt, The External School in Carolingian Society, (Leiden, New York, 1992), pp.86-90.

¹⁶⁹ MGH Conc. II i,c.20,p.451. The Council of Châlons referred to the need for witnesses; MGH Conc. II i,c.56, c.62,p.284. Canonesses were also not supposed to have these conversations with men in their own dwellings; MGH, Ibid, c.61, p.285; c.20,p.451.

¹⁷⁰ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.19,p.451. Also the Council of Châlons, MGH, Ibid,c.55,p.284.

¹⁷¹ Council of Châlons; MGH Conc. II i,c.64,p.285. IS; MGH Ibid, c.26,p.455. This echoes the senex sapiens of the Benedictine Rule; McCann, The Rule of St. Benedict, c.66,p.152.

¹⁷² The Council of Châlons refers to business being conducted at the media porta in front of witnesses which probably included the portaria; MGH Conc. II i,c.62,p.285. The IS also comments: "ut nulli intrandi aut exeundi nisi per portam aditus [sit]"; MGH Conc. II i,c.11,p.446.

¹⁷³ At the end of the ninth century Walter of Sens complained that it was scandalous how moniales were receiving all manner of persons without episcopal permission; PL132,c.2,col.718. This suggests that even the rules provided were being ignored.

Secondly, it was the abbess, and sanctimoniales she appointed, who controlled this procedure. ¹⁷⁴ Thus it would not be true to say that abbesses were therefore different from abbots in this respect. ¹⁷⁵

Moreover, monks had to avoid women's company ¹⁷⁶ and the concern to restrict female access into monasteries is attested to in other sources. ¹⁷⁷ There are also more general prescriptions forbidding laymen from going into monasteries. ¹⁷⁸

The concern behind attempts to cloister monks ¹⁷⁹ and sanctimoniales was a fear of women's sexuality. The IS declares that an abbess had to be especially vigilant since the greater weakness of the female sex required a

¹⁷⁴ The Capit. miss gen. (802) stated that the bishop decided who might go into a convent; MGH Capit. I, c.20, p.95. However, another capitulary in 813 stated that either the bishop or the abbess decided on which clergy or laymen should enter; MGH Capit. I, no.79, c.4, p.175. The IS describes how the praepositae alongside the abbess investigate if other canonesses had been entertaining men in their own quarters, or had been breaching the claustrum in other ways; MGH Conc. II i, c.24, 20, pp.454, 451. The witnesses required for conversations with men [n.169, 172 above] and for confessions [IS; MGH Conc. II i, c.27, p.455] may have been the praepositae.

¹⁷⁵ But see Schulenburg, "Strict Active Enclosure", p.59.

¹⁷⁶ Capit. Monasticum, MGH Capit., I, c.16, p.344.

¹⁷⁷ The Vita Leobae describes how the saint, who must have left her convent, was unique amongst women in being allowed to enter Fulda to pray; MGH SS, 15.1, c.19, p.129. Adrevald of Fleury recounts how the relics of St. Benedict were placed for a while outside the gate of the monastery in order to allow a crowd of women to pray since they were refused entry within the monastic precinct; PL 124, col.933. See also Nelson, "Women and the word", p.68.

¹⁷⁸ Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg: "Ut claustra monachorum laici non intrent"; MGH Conc. II i, c.18, p.210.

¹⁷⁹ Priests were also to avoid female company; see pp.375-76 below.

greater degree of vigilance. ¹⁸⁰ The fear of woman as sexually corrupting and corruptible is reflected in the Vita Leobae. This describes how a nun who had left the convent at Bischoffsheim was accused of having a child from an illicit relationship and drowning it. ¹⁸¹ The nun was cleared when the mother, a crippled girl, admitted her crime after Leoba's intercessions. ¹⁸² The hagiographer perceives "woman" as the guilty party sexually and indicates that this kind of scenario was likely to occur when nuns left their convents. Nevertheless, the story demonstrates that it was the practice for ordinary nuns to leave the convent on occasion: the abbess, Leoba, states that the nun had her "full permission" to attend to private business at her parents' house. ¹⁸³

Fear of women's sexuality partly motivated the reformers. ¹⁸⁴ But there is a danger of taking too far the argument that, in contrast to the concern for women's physical safety and spiritual autonomy which motivated Caesarius of Arles' Regimen ad virgines, the ninth-century reformers sought to cloister women only because of a fear of women's greater sexual frailty. ¹⁸⁵ This argument overestimates the "independence" of Caesarius' nuns. ¹⁸⁶ Further, ninth-

¹⁸⁰ "Quanto enim idem sexus fragilior esse dinoscitur, tanto necesse est maiorem erga cum custodiam adhiberi"; MGH Conc. II i,c.18,p.449. This propensity to sin was not implied here specifically in the context of sex and cloistering.

¹⁸¹ MGH SS,15.1,c.12,p.127. It was assumed that the father was a priest presumably since clerics had the greatest degree of access to convents.

¹⁸² MGH, Ibid.

¹⁸³ MGH, Ibid.

¹⁸⁴ Fears of female sexuality and the desire to cloister women are apparent in Irish hagiography of a similar period; L. Bitel "Women's Monastic Enclosures in Early Ireland: A Study of Female Spirituality and Male Monastic Mentalities" in J. Med. Hist., 12, (1986), pp.15-36. However, Bitel accepts some of Wemple's theses too readily.

¹⁸⁵ Wemple, Women, pp.154-55; Schulenburg "Strict Active Enclosure", pp.78-79.

¹⁸⁶ Nolte, "Klosterleben von Frauen", pp.265-8.

century prescriptions that abbesses should look to the physical fabric of convents must have been partly motivated by the concern to physically protect women religious.¹⁸⁷ In part, for similar reasons, armed men were banned from convents.¹⁸⁸

Therefore, to argue that strict cloistering was no longer required in the late ninth century because it had proved premature and ill-suited to political and social realities¹⁸⁹ misinterprets the prescriptions which represent a balance of religious ideals with political and social realities and overlooks the fact that more prescriptions survive from the earlier than for the later part of our period.

[2] The Abbess.

[i] The Abbess outside the Convent.

The nature of the abbess' role necessitated a degree of freedom of movement because abbesses like other "king's men" owed the king military quotas.¹⁹⁰ Prescriptions that abbesses leave their convents on account of a royal command suggest, at least, that abbesses went to court.¹⁹¹ Yet while the legislation refers to abbots

¹⁸⁷ "Habeat etiam abbatissa studium aut in aedificando ea, quae ad sanctimonialium necessitatem pertinent, aut in restaurando"; Council of Châlons, MGH Conc. II i,c.58,p.285. The IS added: "ut monasteriis puellarum ita undique firmissimis circumdant munitionibus"; MGH, Ibid, c.11,p.446.

¹⁸⁸ "Ut nullus ex clericali ordine, sacerdotes videlicet aut alii clerici neque laicus, brunias aut arma infra monasteria puellarum commendare praesumat, nec quisquam recipere audeat"; Capit. Eccles. ad Salz data (803/4), MGH Capit. I,c.8,p.120.

¹⁸⁹ Wemple, Women, pp.172-73.

¹⁹⁰ Capit. miss. (786-92), MGH Capit. I,c.4,p.67; MGH Capit. I,no.74,c.10,p.167. MGH Capit. II, no.218 (866), c.4,p.96 prescribed that abbesses like bishops, counts and abbots would be deprived of their honores if they did not fulfill the quota.

¹⁹¹ The Vita Leobae describes how the saint was often at the court of Charlemagne, and was a particular favourite of the queen Hildegard, MGH SS,15.1,c.18,p.129.

going to general synods ¹⁹² there are no similar statements for abbesses to conclude that abbesses "ex officio were summoned to royal assemblies or took oaths of allegiance". ¹⁹³

The status of "exceptional" abbesses such as Gisla the sister of Charlemagne had more to do with the person (and her royal connections) than the office. ¹⁹⁴ However, the obligations of the abbess' role - both inside and particularly outside the convent ¹⁹⁵ - were an acknowledgement that, to some extent, and far more so than ordinary sanctimoniales, abbesses transcended their gender because of their status. That some attempted to further enhance this status is evidenced by a canon in the Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg (800). This text states,

"Ut sanctae moniales non induantur virilia indumenta, id est rocho vel fanones, nisi tantum feminea vestimenta". ¹⁹⁶

Wemple used this text along with canon 125 of the 816 Council of Aachen to argue that "the desire to prevent sisters from leaving the convent and to guard them against temptation - prompted council after council to inveigh against nuns wearing male attire, and to caution against

¹⁹² Capit. Monasticum, MGH Capit. I, c.59, p.347.

¹⁹³ Nelson, "Women and the word", p.64. Abbess Hildegard was summoned by Walter of Sens to an episcopal court to answer a charge involving one of her retainers in an attack on a priest; Flodoard, MGH SS, 13, IV, c.6, pp.568-69. Verdon inferred from this that abbesses attended assemblies; "Notes", p.332, note 40. But see Nelson's interpretation, Ibid, p.64, note 44.

¹⁹⁴ Nelson, Ibid. Gisla hosted "a major diplomatic occasion" at the convent of Chelles in 804; Ibid, pp.63-5; and "Perceptions du pouvoir chez les historiennes du haut moyen âge" in M. Rouche (ed.), Les Femmes au Moyen Age, (Maubeuge, 1990), pp.75-85 at pp.80-81.

¹⁹⁵ Schulenburg interprets the rules about cloistering as effectively diminishing the abbess' public role and emphasising her private role within the enclosure; "Strict Active Enclosure", p.70. However, this anachronistically regards the convent as "private" compared to the world outside.

¹⁹⁶ MGH Conc. II i, c.23, p.211.

unnecessary visits by men, including bishops, canons and monks." 197

In fact canon 125 has no direct relevance for women religious. From it Wemple quotes the phrase:

"sicut enim turpe est virum vestem muliebrem et mulierem vestem virilem induere". 198

But the title of the canon, ut canonici cucullas monachorum non induant indicates the text's real concern: that "it is against ecclesiastical custom that they should wear cowls, only monks should wear (them)". 199 Thus the phrase quoted by Wemple should be read in conjunction with the next sentence: "just as it is a shameful thing that a man wear female clothing and that a woman wear male clothing, so it is exceedingly wrong that a canon should wear monastic dress unless he wishes to assume the vow along with the vestment". 200

The source for the phrase that Wemple used is Deuteronomy, xxi,5 except that canon 125 reverses the order in Deuteronomy to put the men first thus indicating that its principal concern is with men. The condemnation of the practice of gender-based cross-dresssing was the intention of Deuteronomy: but the canon included the biblical allusion to provide an analogy for the use of clothing to practice deceit upon society. Acquiring another person's clothes did not always entail crossing gender boundaries. The redactors of canon 125 used a biblical example of transvestism which did involve gender to illustrate their own instance of transvestism which did not. However, the seriousness of the second kind of disorder was enhanced by an analogy that stressed the

197 Wemple, Women, p.168,note 152.

198 MGH Conc. II i,p.405.

199 Hence: "eo quod contra morem ecclesiasticum cucullas, quibus solis monachis utendum est, induant... sicut indecens est... ita nimirum inhonestum et valde indecorum est"; MGH, Ibid.

200 MGH, Ibid.

order of gender.

This leaves the Reisbach canon as the only example of female religious apparel which may have some bearing on the issue of cloistering.²⁰¹ However, the canon was not concerned with transvestism in a sexual sense - so that women religious could dissemble as men and therefore more easily conduct illicit sexual relationships with men inside or outside the cloister.²⁰² For the Reisbach canon is not about virilia indumenta in its general sense. In later medieval usage the rochetum was the vestment of a bishop or abbot²⁰³ but it is unclear what the word meant in this period, and it probably did not refer only to an ecclesiastical garment.²⁰⁴ Roccus meant a belt or girdle²⁰⁵, and a capitulary of 808 concerning trading regulations refers to "a roccus made of martin fur and otterskin"²⁰⁶ meaning an over-garment of some sort which

²⁰¹ On a different form of transvestism see below, pp.136-41.

²⁰² In that case the men would have had to dress as women to facilitate unauthorised entry to the convent. See the story told by Gregory of Tours: this man successfully cleared himself of any involvement with Abbess Agnes of St. Radegund's, Poitiers since it was accepted that he had dressed as a woman not to hide in the convent for the abbess' sexual gratification, but because he was impotent; MGH SRM, I.i, Bk.10, c.15, p.504.

²⁰³ C. du Fresne, S. du Cange, Glossarium mediae et infimae latinitatis, [ed. and revised D.P. Carpentier] (Paris, 1766 ff.) vol.7, p.203. Secondary commentaries on liturgical vesture regard the roccus as a vestment providing the modern German "chorrock" or "surplice"; J. Braun, Die liturgische Gewandung im Occident und Orient. Nach Ursprung und Entwicklung, Verwendung und Symbolik, (Freiburg, 1907), pp.126,130; W. B. Marriott, Vestiarum Christianum, (London 1868), p.226.

²⁰⁴ An 817 capitulary sets out what the abbot should provide for each of his monks including four pairs of shoes, two pairs of socks, two cowls, etc. but also one roccus; MGH Capit. I, c.22, p.345.

²⁰⁵ "Gürtel"; Boretius, MGH Capit. I, p.345, note 25.

²⁰⁶ Capit. cum primis constituta, MGH Capit. I, c.5, p.140.

denoted high status. 207

The fanones could also be associated with priestly clothing. Fano was a variant of pannus 208, a term used either to signify the offertory napkin or an item of clerical vestment. 209 The type of fano used by the laity would have been used by sanctimoniales as they too were lay; it would be difficult to see why the reformers would object to this. Clearly, the Reisbach canon refers to a garment, however. The principal objection thus lay in the fact that fanones were sacerdotal vestments and as eucharistic insignia were perhaps more significant than the rochets. This accords with other reform prescriptions which attempt to keep everything connected with the eucharist free of female pollution. 210

The wording of the Reisbach canon suggests that some sanctimoniales had carefully chosen items of apparel, not to disguise or dissemble (the fanos in particular and even rochets would hardly have afforded that opportunity), but rather, to gain additional, publicly recognised status. 211

207 From "roccus" the old High German "roch" ("rocch") and the Anglo-Saxon "rocc" which is a coat or cloak are derived; F. Kluge, Etymologisches Wortbuch der deutschen Sprache (Strassburg, 1883-1910), p.604. Squirrel and marten fur were prized for high status symbol garments; Ennen, The Medieval Woman, pp.88-9.

208 Werminghoff; MGH Conc. II i, p.211. Fano is also in the 831 St. Riquier inventory; Braun, Liturgische Gewandung, pp.126,130.

209 Synonymous with mappa; du Cange, Glossarium, vol.5, p.255. And see Hrabanus Maurus, De Institutione clericorum, PL107,col.307.

210 See pp.375-78 below.

211 In this they were similar to Joan of Arc who "could thereby transcend her sex; she could set herself apart and usurp the privileges of the male and his claim to superiority."; Marina Warner, Joan of Arc. The image of female heroism, (London, 1981), p.152. Like Joan these women were not pretending to be men but wished to share the status that certain types of men enjoyed and so they cannot be equated with the androgynous, asexual model that

It is possible that fanones and rochets had been worn inside convents, especially if abbesses were participating in liturgical practices such as the veiling of their own nuns.²¹² However, the principal arena for the practice was, I suggest, outside the convent: this canon directly follows another concerning the procedure whereby an abbess could leave her convent taking with her ceterae sanctimoniales. It is these sanctimoniales, but principally the abbess, against whom the canon about male apparel is directed.²¹³

Queens, royal daughters or sisters, and abbesses were virtually the only women of high rank in this period. Therefore abbesses in an otherwise exclusively male ecclesiastical hierarchy were a kind of anomaly. One of the main aims of the reforms was to enhance the uniqueness of the status of the exclusively male sacerdotal order. Hence the importance of gender in defining hierarchy, and hence the anxiety expressed in the Reisbach canon. The practice may have been confined to the eastern regions²¹⁴ but seems not to have been a one-off occurrence.²¹⁵ Although important regional differences remained between

later writers imposed on Joan; Warner, Ibid, pp.146-63.

²¹² Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II ii,c.43, p.638.

²¹³ Note the injunction that bishops, abbots and abbesses should not have hunting dogs, falcons, hawks or jesters; MGH Capit.,c.31,p.62. This shows that abbesses behaved like male ecclesiastical lords in their activities both inside and outside the convent - both therefore "public" areas.

²¹⁴ Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg are in Bavaria.

²¹⁵ The canon is not unique to the Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg. In another manuscript only the last four words of the canon survive: nisi tantum feminea vestimenta. But it seems probable that this is the same injunction, especially since several other of the Reisbach canons occur in this late eighth or early ninth-century Bavarian manuscript; Clm 6333,l.1,p.374,note 2.

areas like Saxony and Bavaria ²¹⁶, Saxony was not the only area, east of the Rhine, with strong noble kindred groups and family monasteries, and therefore with powerful abbesses. ²¹⁷

Although the black dress seems to have been standard dress for all women religious - in and outside the convent - ²¹⁸ and the veil is referred to in the IS, there are no lists for the clothing of religious women compared to the 817 capitulary on an individual monk's clothing requirements. If there had been widespread concern about female monastic dress the penitential material would surely have reflected it; but there is no sign of any such concern. ²¹⁹

Abbesses' attempts to assert their status may explain the reference, again in the east, at the Council of Worms (868) to deaconesses. This restated chapter 10 of the

²¹⁶ See Nelson's comments on the danger of uncritically applying Leyser's Saxon model to earlier Frankish regions; "Women and the word", p.56, note 13.

²¹⁷ Regino of Prüm's inclusion of what is supposedly chapter 19 of the 895 Council of Nantes may be explicable in such a context: Ne sanctimoniales palatium et publicos conventus adeant: Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.175, pp.281-82. Recent American historiography has interpreted this as evidence for the Frankish Church prohibiting secular women from aspiring to participating in a public sense at assemblies: Wemple, Women, pp.105-6; S.F. Wemple and J.A. McNamara "The Power of Women Through the Family" in M. Erler and M. Kowaleski (eds.), Women and Power in the Middle Ages, pp.83-101, at p.93; J.T. Schulenburg, "Female Sanctity: Public and Private Roles ca.500-1100", Women and Power, pp.102-125, at p.116. However, Nelson has shown Regino's source was probably a Merovingian forgery; "Women and the word", p.58. If Regino did include this text because he was having "to contend with some awkward female influence at the Lotharingian court" [Nelson, Ibid, p.59, note 19], that this text referred to sanctimoniales may suggest that abbesses or high status nuns were going to court and assemblies in some eastern areas.

²¹⁸ Walter of Sens refers to moniales nigrae; PL132, c.2, col.718.

²¹⁹ Other penances which prohibit men and women from wearing the clothes of the opposite sex are in the context of non-Christian practices and tomfoolery; St. Hubert Penitential, Wassersleben, c.42, p.383.

Council of Chalcedon: Diaconissam non ordinandum ante annum quadragesium, et hoc cum summo libramine.²²⁰ Schäfer pointed to a late ninth-century gloss on this text found by Maassen: "diaconissa est abbatissa".²²¹ Because Schäfer assumed that institutes of canonesses predominated in the ninth century, he argued that the heads of these institutions were deaconesses.²²² It is more likely that the Council of Worms used the term deaconess in a non-traditional sense, simply to suggest the high status of abbesses of convents as members of powerful aristocratic kindred groups.

[ii] The Abbess inside the Convent.

The reform legislation described the office exercised by the abbess as a regimen.²²³ This office corresponded to that of an abbot as a regimen animarum.²²⁴ The term regimen embodied the care of souls in the spiritual sense, but it also conveyed the governmental aspect of the office which when applied to a woman transcended her gender.²²⁵ Abbesses were variously described in the reform legislation as ductrices animarum²²⁶, matres religiosarum²²⁷ and spiritales matres.²²⁸ As such, the abbess had to exercise the care of the souls of her subditae both by her words and example.²²⁹ The qualities that were required

²²⁰ Mansi 15,c.73,col.882; and see pp.230-34 below.

²²¹ Die Kanonissenstifter, p.51.

²²² Kanonissen und Diakonissen, pp.49-90.

²²³ Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II ii,c.44, pp.638-39.

²²⁴ Council of Paris (829), MGH, Ibid, c.39,p.638.

²²⁵ See pp.209-10 below.

²²⁶ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.7,p.442.

²²⁷ Council of Aachen (836), MGH Conc. II ii,c.13,p.713.

²²⁸ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.23,p.454. The Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II ii,c.39,p.637.

²²⁹ "Tales abbatissae regendarum animarum curam suscipere debent, quae subditis verbis et exemplis ducatum praebant"; IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.7,p.442. See also the

were therefore similar to those required for the office of abbot. 230

The election of the abbess often depended on outside, connected interests despite the Benedictine Rule's prescription for free elections. 231 Royal grants could ensure a free election for some convents 232 but perhaps "la nécessité de stipuler la liberté des elections prouve que celles-ci étaient l'occasion de pressions". 233 Where aristocratic proprietorial interests were particularly strong as in Saxony, it may be possible even to discern in the appointment of abbesses a "droit du sang" and a "droit de succession" without even the need for an election per se. 234 The automatic right of succession from within the founding family may seem to have been a particular feature of Saxon convents 235 only because they are better documented. The practice was probably quite general, and it was not confined to abbesses. 236 The IS does not describe how an abbess was to be appointed. This reticence may reflect the fact that the election of an abbess, especially in proprietorial institutes of canonesses whose

Council of Châlons (813); MGH Conc. II i, c.54, p.284.

230 vir modestus et prudens; MGH Conc. II i, Conc. Franc. Habitum (816-29), c.10, p.591.

231 McCann, The Rule of St. Benedict, c.64, p.144.

232 Verdon points to Charles the Bald's grant of the right of free election to the convent at Notre de Dame de Soissons (846), whilst reserving the right to impose his own choice with the aid of the bishops and the agreement of the community if a nun did not fulfill the necessary requirements; and also in 859 confirming the right of free election to the convent at St. Andoche d'Autun: "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord", p.63.

233 Verdon, Ibid, p.63.

234 Parisse, "Les femmes au monastère", pp.313-16.

235 Concerning Gandersheim see pp.163-65 below.

236 "Erbrecht can be found implicitly in the arrangements for Sarrazac and for Vabres, in Aquitaine, and explicitly in West Francia at the male monastery of Glanfeuil-sur-Loire"; Nelson, "Commentary", pp.229-330. And see pp.162-63 below.

members' retention of private property bound them permanently to their familial patrimony, was inevitably dependent on familial interests. It may also explain why the IS does not prescribe maturity in terms of age as one of the necessary prerequisites for an abbess. 237

Once appointed, the abbess was required to exercise care over the members of the convent so that they lived in harmony as una societas. 238 Hence the abbess should plant virtues in the minds of her subditae 239 and discourage those things which are the root of all evil. 240 To achieve this harmony it was important that the whole community had the same rations otherwise this caused avarice 241, and that everyone equally observed the horae canonicae and other liturgical offices. 242 To assist her in this supervision the abbess had a number of officials. The cellararia supervised the sanctimoniales' rations; she had to be of upright and ~~un~~impeachable character, certainly not criminal or a drunkard or prodigal, and serve the other sanctimoniales faithfully and humbly. 243 The supervision of liturgical offices was the preserve of the custodes who had to keep a note of the time and ring a bell at the appropriate hour. 244

The disciplining of delinquentes sanctimoniales was a communal task. Sanctimoniales were required to give the

237 Whereas this was a prerequisite for the praepositae and the portaria.

238 IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.12,p.446.

239 Charity, humility, patience, chastity, continence, sobriety, kindness, obedience and gentleness: IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.14,p.448.

240 MGH, Ibid.

241 IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.12,p.446.

242 "in psalmodum celebratione sive oratione et horas canonicas... pariter celebrent"; Council of Châlons, MGH Conc. II i,c.59,p.285. IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.15,17,pp.448,449.

243 IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.25,p.454.

244 IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.15,pp.448-49.

abbess help ²⁴⁵; and, if an offender would not repent, the ultimate sanction was expulsion from the convent by communal vote so that the recalcitrant member could not further contaminate the congregation. ²⁴⁶ However, in the first stages of discipline for an offence ²⁴⁷ it was the abbess who had to separate the offender from the other sanctimoniales within the convent. ²⁴⁸ As part of the punishment penance on bread and water was meted out ²⁴⁹; where a sanctimonialis was whipped the abbess undertook this task. ²⁵⁰ In some of the handbooks of penance sins that sanctimoniales might commit are mentioned. ²⁵¹ In describing how the abbess should investigate sins within the convent and how she should administer the appropriate penance, the IS imputes to the abbess a role that was normally exercised by priests. Thus the abbess' office did indeed require her to transcend her gender.

²⁴⁵ "In castigandis namque atque corrigendis delinquentibus opem ferre non desistant abbatissis ceterae sanctimoniales"; IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.18,p.451.

²⁴⁶ "quae post tot saluberrimas admonitiones et castigationes necdum se correxerit, deprecetur pro ea communi voto ab omni congregatione, ut ab illo, cui nihil est impossibile, sanetur": IS, MGH Conc. II i, c.18,p.450. The bishop after this stage could impose penance and ultimately a sentence of excommunication; MGH, Ibid.

²⁴⁷ Offences were described as neglecting the horae canonicae and opus Dei, failing to go to the daily reading, not doing good works, being indecent in the dormitory, and being dishonest in words or actions: IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.18,p.450. Sanctimoniales were not to be guilty of arrogance, avarice, envy, hatred, slander, whispering and muttering, spreading scurrilous tales, treachery, dissension and hypocrisy: IS, MGH Conc. II i, c.14,18,pp.448,450. These types of behaviour prevented the proper observance of the officium caritatis towards the other sisters: IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.18,p.450.

²⁴⁸ MGH, Ibid.

²⁴⁹ MGH, Ibid.

²⁵⁰ MGH, Ibid.

²⁵¹ For example lesbianism with mechanical masturbation: Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.251,p.312. Hence the IS prescribes against "indecent in the dormitory" [MGH Conc. II i, c.18,p.450] and insists that "omnes in dormitorio dominant, singulae scilicet in singulis lectis"; MGH Conc. II i,c.10,p.445.

To help the abbess inquire into misdemeanours sanctimoniales were appointed as praepositae. These women, like the abbess, had to lead by word and by example and helped the abbess in the correction of errors ²⁵² such as sanctimoniales entertaining men in their own dwellings. ²⁵³ The other principal officer who assisted in the guarding of the community both morally and in a practical sense was the portaria. ²⁵⁴ The abbess was required to provide the various buildings in the convent ²⁵⁵ which included the strong defences so that only the porta provided access to and egress from the refectory, cellar, dormitory and other buildings that were deemed necessary. ²⁵⁶ It is likely that the abbess appointed the officers who supervised these parts of the convent; she already appointed the sanctimoniales who accompanied other sisters when they had conversations with men. ²⁵⁷ Except for the priest these officers corresponded to those described for male monasteries ²⁵⁸, and even the priest was often attached to, if supposed to live outside, the convent. ²⁵⁹

The moral health of the community was linked to its

²⁵² IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.24,p.454.

²⁵³ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.20,p.451. The praepositae were probably the same sanctimoniales who accompanied the abbess during her dealings with men and were described as having maturity, proven morals and an innocent life to recommend them; IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.19,p.451.

²⁵⁴ See n.171,172 above.

²⁵⁵ Council of Châlons (813), MGH Conc. II i,c.53,p.285.

²⁵⁶ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.11,p.446.

²⁵⁷ "ut abbatissae tres aut quattuor sanctimoniales vitae probabilis constituent"; IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.20, p.451. These were probably the praepositae again.

²⁵⁸ "praepositi, decani, portarii, cellerarii, ceterique ministri"; Councils of Reischach, Freising and Salzburg (800), MGH Conc. II i,c.40,p.212.

²⁵⁹ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.27,p.455.

economic health; and the abbess was responsible for both.²⁶⁰ As well as being responsible for the physical fabric of the building, the abbess had to ensure that there were sufficient resources otherwise sanctimoniales might be led to sin for lack of food and drink. ²⁶¹ Convents, like monasteries, were warned against having insufficient resources and against mismanagement, since there was the danger that the divine offices might be neglected and that the community would be compelled to live an irregular life. ²⁶² Hence communities of canons, monks and puellae alike were warned against taking in too many entrants unless they had sufficient resources. ²⁶³ Verdon rightly comments, however, on the specific economic vulnerability of convents. ²⁶⁴ The Council of Rheims (813) set out how the emperor was particularly bound to protect sanctimoniales on account of the frailty of their sex if, on episcopal investigation, it was found that their convents had insufficient resources. ²⁶⁵ This statement may particularly but not specifically concern royal convents. The abbess was not only responsible for the convent's own resources, she with her officers, had to supervise the handing over of the administration of the

²⁶⁰ "Studendum summopere abbatissis est, ut tot talesque in monasteriis admittant sanctimoniales, quae et morum probitate commenduntur et ecclesiasticis possint rationabiliter sustentari stipendiis": IS; MGH Conc. II i, c.8, p.444.

²⁶¹ "et stipendia sanctimonialibus praebeat necessaria, ne forte per indigentiam cibi aut potus peccare compellantur"; Council of Châlons (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.54, p.284.

²⁶² Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II ii, c.18, p.676.

²⁶³ Council of Tours (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.31, p.290. Council of Arles (813), MGH Conc. II i, c.8, p.251.

²⁶⁴ "Notes sur le rôle économique monastères féminins".

²⁶⁵ "De monasteriis puellarum considerandum est et domni imperatoris misericordia imploranda, ut victum et necessaria a sibi praelatis consequi possint sanctaemoniales, et vita illarum et castitas secundum fragilitatis sexum diligenter provisa tueatur", MGH Conc. II i, c.32, p.256.

private property of individual canonesses. 266

The abbess was responsible for the quality of entrants. The IS states that the abbess should take in women of good character 267 but warns against the abbess incautiously and indiscreetly taking into the convent adolescentes who, causing arguments and dissension, were a great cause of potential scandal. 268 When a woman was admitted into the convent she had to have the capitula read to her²⁶⁹ probably by the abbess. However, the abbess unlike the abbot was not allowed to profess new entrants. Yet the wording of prescriptions against abbesses giving priestly benedictions and veiling sanctimoniales in 789 and veiling both widows and even virgins in 829 is evidence that such liturgical practices, though condemned, were current.²⁷⁰ That abbesses despite the prohibitions continued to issue benedictiones sacerdotali is evidenced in hagiographical material written at the very end of the ninth century.²⁷¹

266 See p.88 above.

267 See n.260 above.

268 "Sed et de adolescentibus et de his, quarum conversatione simultates et discussiones plerumque pati solent monasteria, cavendum abbatissis est, ne incaute et indiscrete eas in congregatione admittant, ne forte illarum admissio aliquod in posterum generet scandalum"; IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.9,p.445. It is possible that as this warning occurs in the canon regarding the administration of property, it concerned disputes over property.

269 MGH, Ibid, c.8,p.444. The capitula may have been ecclesiastical canons; or the Benedictine Rule [Werminghoff, MGH, Ibid, p.444]; or the IS itself [Schneider, Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life; p.92,note 67].

270 "Auditum est, aliquas abbatissae contra morem sanctae Dei ecclesiae benedictionis cum manus inpositione et signaculo sanctae crucis super capita virorum dare, necnon et velare virginis cum benedictione sacerdotali"; Admonitio Generalis (789), MGH Capit. I,c.76,p.60. Also, "cognovimus... [quod] abbatissae et ceterae sanctimoniales non solum viduas sed etiam virgines velare solite sint"; Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II i,c.43,p.638.

271 The Miracula Waldburgis describes the participation in the liturgy of the abbess or designated sanctimoniales: Bk.I, c.19,p.184; blessing people: Bk.III, c.9,p.282; touching the eyes of blind pilgrims with the

saint's holy baton which corresponds to the abbot's baculus [PRG I,1,p.62]: Bk.II,c.5,p.220 and Bk.III,c.8, pp.280-82; and also blessing offerings: Bk.II,c.1, p.208. See J.L. Nelson, "Les femmes et l'évangélisation au IXe siècle", Revue du Nord, 68 (1986), pp.471-85, at pp.479-80.

[3] Women Religious.

i) Social Composition.

The vast majority of women who pursued a religious life and for whom the reform legislation prescribed were noble. Those outside the convent, especially widows, were described as noble. ²⁷² Mulierculae are more problematic. Usually the term is used to describe lower-status women; but it is also used in a derogatory sense. Both applications could apply to those women condemned by the Council of Paris (829) for veiling themselves ²⁷³ but I suspect that the derogatory application is the strongest in this instance. ²⁷⁴

Nobility in practice was a prerequisite to entry into a convent as indicated by the reference to "stipends" or private incomes. ²⁷⁵ However, the prescription in the IS that sanctimoniales should have equal rations ²⁷⁶ may indicate that some enjoyed a higher standard of living within the convent. This would explain the injunction that food should not be prepared in sanctimoniales' private mansiunculae unless they were ill. ²⁷⁷ The daily rations that the IS stipulate for each sanctimonialis are three measures of bread and three of wine; if wine was less plentiful they could have two measures of wine and two of

²⁷² "De nobilibus feminis, quae amissis viris velantur et in propriis domibus residere delectantur"; Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II ii,c.44,p.638.

²⁷³ MGH Conc. II ii,c.42,p.638.

²⁷⁴ On the status of mulierculae referred to in Regino of Prüm's Ecclesiastical Discipline; Nelson, "Women and the word", pp.57-8,note 17.

²⁷⁵ Council of Châlons (813), MGH Conc. II i,c.54, p.284; IS, MGH Conc. II i,c.8,13,p.444,447-48; Council of Paris (829), MGH Conc. II ii,c.18,p.676.

²⁷⁶ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.12,p.446.

²⁷⁷ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.447.

ale or three of ale and one of wine. ²⁷⁸ The allowance on feast days of vegetables and pulses ²⁷⁹, and especially fish and meat, suggests that the IS was a document providing for the nobility. ²⁸⁰ Further, whilst the IS states that everyone is worthy of respect whatever their social background ²⁸¹; that nobility was held in esteem is indicated by the provision that a sanctimonialis of noble birth should not be whipped. ²⁸²

The age of women following a religious life is more difficult to ascertain. The legislation often states that a virgin should not be consecrated before the age of twenty-five. ²⁸³ But this canon was taken from the Dionysio-Hadriana and originally came from an ancient African council. It can hardly be cited as evidence that marriage in the ninth century became a more attractive alternative to monasticism so that there was a particular attempt to protect women from hasty veiling. ²⁸⁴ The Council of Tribur (895) restates the ancient canon but also states that a girl should not be coerced into consecration before the age of twelve. ²⁸⁵ The implication is clear: women much younger than twenty-five were entering convents. The IS does not mention an appropriate age, although, as we have noted, it warned against the potential dangers of admitting adolescentes. This does not

²⁷⁸ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.447. This compared to four measures of bread and five of wine for canons; MGH Conc. II i,c.122,p.401.

²⁷⁹ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.447.

²⁸⁰ Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", p.108.

²⁸¹ MGH Conc. II i,c.10,p.446. This may refer less to noble and non-noble (or servants) as to gradations within the nobility which was by no means a homogenous group within the convent; Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", pp.96-7.

²⁸² MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.450.

²⁸³ Admonitio Generalis (789), MGH Capit. I,c.46, p.57; Council of Frankfurt (796/7), MGH Capit. I,c.46,p.77.

²⁸⁴ Wemple, Women, pp.166-67.

²⁸⁵ MGH Capit. II,c.24,pp.226-27.

mean that young women were not admitted. The issue of personal choice hardly seems relevant ²⁸⁶ and is certainly not gender-specific. ²⁸⁷

Whilst the legislation acknowledges the entry into the religious life of both virgins and widows, it also shows a downgrading of the status of the widow as compared to the Merovingian period. The Council of Paris of 829 suggests that it was not suitable for widows who have experienced the carnal life to be chosen by other sanctimoniales as their spiritual mother. ²⁸⁸ Further, although priests had to get their bishop's permission, they were allowed to veil widows ²⁸⁹; but they were liable to punishment if they presumed to veil virgins. ²⁹⁰ This assertion that bishops should consecrate virgins and priests should veil widows ²⁹¹ implied a correspondence between the higher status of bishops and the higher (chaste) state of virginity as compared with the widow's mere continence. ²⁹²

[iii] Responsibilities of the Religious Life.

The legislation clearly envisaged that all sanctimoniales in convents should undertake both liturgical and practical responsibilities. The Council of Châlons refers to

²⁸⁶ But see Wemple on the attractions of the choice first of marriage then of monasticism; Women, pp.171,173.

²⁸⁷ The Capit. Monasticum refers to male child oblates; MGH Capit. I,c.37,p.346. The Concordia Episc. concerns the tonsuring of men at the correct age and with parental consent; MGH Conc. II,c.12,pp.298-99. The Capit. Eccles. (818/19) states, "Ne pueri vero sine voluntate parentum tonsorentur vel puellae velentur, modis omnibus inhibitum est"; MGH Capit. I,c.20,p.278.

²⁸⁸ MGH Conc. II ii,c.39,p.637.

²⁸⁹ MGH, Ibid, c.40,p.637.

²⁹⁰ MGH, Ibid, c.41,pp.637-38.

²⁹¹ As in the complaint that: "inlicitum et temerarium factum in usu, ut vix aut viduae a praesbyteris aut puellae virgines consecrari expetant a pontificibus"; MGH, Ibid, c.43,p.638.

²⁹² See pp.182, 229 below.

sanctimoniales who in lectione et in officio et in psalmorum modulatione strenuae sint et in omnibus operibus bonis.²⁹³ This council further required that all sanctimoniales should equally endeavour in reading and singing, through celebration of the psalms or prayer and the horae canonicae that is to say, matins, prime, terce, sext, nones, and vespers, and go to the daily reading.²⁹⁴ The observance of the horae canonicae was enhanced with sanctimoniales allowed to ring bells and light candles.²⁹⁵ The IS is less specific about liturgical obligations simply stating that all sanctimoniales should observe the horae canonicae²⁹⁶ including vespers²⁹⁷; but it also refers to the singing of psalms and listening to holy lections.²⁹⁸

Significantly, there is also a chapter in the IS concerning the importance of prayer and the cultivation of a pure mind to make it more efficacious.²⁹⁹ The role of intercessor was one of the most important responsibilities not only of the sanctimoniales but also of a woman leading a religious life in the world.³⁰⁰ The convent which

²⁹³ MGH Conc. II i,c.44,p.284.

²⁹⁴ "Sanctimoniales in monasterio constitutae habeant studium in legendo et in cantando, in psalmorum celebratione sive oratione et horas canonicas, matutinam videlicet, primam, terciam, sextam, nonam, vespertinam, completoriam pariter celebrent et omnes... ad collationem veniant"; MGH, Ibid, c.59, p.285. This description is repeated in the Council of Mainz (847), MGH Conc. III, c.16,p.170 which is the source for its slightly modified inclusion in the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.147,p.278.

²⁹⁵ Councils of Reims, Freising, Salzburg (800), MGH Conc. II i,c.22,p.210.

²⁹⁶ MGH Conc. II i,c.15,p.448.

²⁹⁷ MGH Conc. II i,c.17,p.449. Presumably this required prescription since vespers was probably the most irksome duty.

²⁹⁸ MGH Conc. II i,c.10,p.445.

²⁹⁹ MGH Conc. II i,c.16,p.449.

³⁰⁰ The example of Dhuoda shows the role of prayer "as a spiritualized equivalent of aristocratic largesse"; M. Claussen, "Dhuoda's Liber Manualis", p.46. Her case

constituted a power-house of prayer, especially for the benefit of the founding family both living and dead was special, however. ³⁰¹ If small proprietary convents were often institutes of canonesses, this could then help explain canon 66 of the Council of Châlons which instructs everyone to pray, pro salute animae et corporis domni imperatoris prolisque eius, and pro statu regni. ³⁰² This canon immediately follows the regulations for those quae se canonicas vocant. The instruction seems particularly directed at women in small houses preoccupied with their own familial memoria and who may have needed such a reminder of what the reformers perceived as their wider duties. Therefore Leyser's comments concerning the special contribution of Saxon convents to the memoria of (male) family members may be equally relevant to some ninth-century Frankish areas. ³⁰³

A high educational standard would have been required for nuns/canonesses to carry out such liturgical obligations. Certainly the expectations outlined by the reform legislation do not support the assertion concerning the developments of the Carolingian Renaissance: that "because women could neither preach nor participate in the liturgy, there was no need to introduce this new programme in female communities". ³⁰⁴ If the Carolingian Renaissance was aimed at "the creation of an élite that was literate in Latin, well versed in Christian doctrine, and familiar with the Roman liturgy..." ³⁰⁵, surely women in convents formed part of this élite? The councils' description of the female monastic round does not support the idea that

also shows that (even though she had not taken a religious vow) the line between the religious life lived in the convent and that in the secular world was transcended in this respect.

³⁰¹ See pp.170-74 below.

³⁰² MGH Conc. II i,c.66,p.285.

³⁰³ Rule and Conflict, pp.63-73.

³⁰⁴ Wemple, Women, p.188.

³⁰⁵ Wemple, Ibid.

nuns were unfamiliar with the Roman liturgy: the Gelasian Sacramentary was copied at Chelles which can be set alongside McKitterick's recent findings that a significant number of liturgical manuscripts, Gospel books and patristic works were copied in convents in all the Frankish regna.³⁰⁶

Indeed the councils expected female communities to study: the IS instructs ut erga puellas in monasteriis erudiendas magna adhibeatur diligentia.³⁰⁷ For this purpose magistrae were chosen from amongst the other sanctimoniales³⁰⁸; this suggests that all of the sanctimoniales were sufficiently educated to provide a general pool out of which teachers could be picked.³⁰⁹ Puellae could indicate sanctimoniales already inside the convent but it also probably refers to young girls educated there who may not have stayed on in the convent as nuns/canonesses. The education of women in convents was not entirely motivated towards their liturgical responsibilities; they might also participate, it seems, in the exercise of a literary genre.³¹⁰

Despite an injunction forbidding boys from being educated

³⁰⁶ R. McKitterick, "Frauen und Schriftlichkeit in frühen Mittelalter". This follows the pioneering work by Bernhard Bischoff who identified texts copied in the Chelles scriptorium; "Die kölnen Nonnenhandschriften und das Skriptorium Chelles, Mittelalterlich Studien, I, (Stuttgart), pp.16-34

³⁰⁷ MGH Conc. II i,c.22,p.452.

³⁰⁸ MGH, Ibid.

³⁰⁹ See also pp.179-82 below; the example of one of these ninth-century saints, Hathumoda, is cited by Wemple concerning the "superior" standard of learning in Merovingian nunneries; Women, p.176.

³¹⁰ The Duplex Legationibus Edictum (789) prescribes against women in convents writing or sending winileodas (cantica sodalica et vulgaria); MGH Capit. I,c.19,p.63. These could be love songs or even heroic verse which the capitulary is thereby confirming the existence of; Nelson, "Women and the word", p.62.

in convents ³¹¹, it was not universally observed: Paschasius Radbertus was taught by the nuns at the convent of Notre Dame de Soissons. ³¹² Educational standards at some convents may not have been significantly less than at some monasteries ³¹³, and cloistering was not always strictly enforced. However, if there was a significant number of house convents, then these are less likely to have left evidence not only of their actual existence but also of manuscripts produced there. Intended primarily to house the intercessors of particular families, they were less likely to have such prolific scriptoria as Chelles or Remiremont.

The observation of the liturgical offices and education within the convent were closely linked. It is likely that references to "manual work" in fact indicate work done with the hands and of the kind undertaken in, scriptoria ³¹⁴ - book copying, illumination and

³¹¹ Capit. Eccles. ad Salz. Data 803-4, MGH Capit. I, c.7, p.119.

³¹² PL120, col.1367. Also Wiborada having being taught by her brother, a monk at St. Gall, went on to teach the future Saint Udalric; ASS Mai I, c.I, 5, pp.284-5; c.II, 17, p.287.

³¹³ The Capit. Monasticum states "ut scola in monasterio non habeatur, nisi eorum qui oblatis sunt"; MGH Capit. I, c.45, p.346. Hildebrandt argues that this capitulary was widely enforced; The External School, p.86. Thus, against McKitterick [The Carolingians, p.221], she argues that the external school on the St. Gall plan was an experiment by no means widespread; Ibid, p.107. Her interpretation of the use of monasterium to infer that the laity were excluded from the monastery generally and not just the cloister bears on McKitterick's and other's interpretation of the level of ninth-century lay literacy. However, as the Capit. Monasticum provided for monks it is unclear how convents fitted into this picture. Hildebrandt unquestioningly accepts Schulenburg's arguments that women were strictly cloistered [Ibid, pp.47,78]; but there may have been less of a divide between the secular and religious spheres for women than there was for monks and laymen with the former's formal career structure.

³¹⁴ Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", p.107; but Parisse regarded the level of manual work as higher "Les Chanoinesses", p.222.

ornamentation. ³¹⁵ Sanctimoniales were given wool and flax with which to make their own clothes ³¹⁶; but it was probably the sanctimoniales' servants who did the making. ³¹⁷ The other work required of sanctimoniales was care for the poor and sick, and alms-giving. ³¹⁸ The hospital had to be located outside the convent walls ³¹⁹; but women-viduae et pauperculae - could be taken inside the convent for care. ³²⁰

The ninth century has been seen as an impoverished one for female monasticism so that "apart from ringing church bells and lighting candles, nuns and canonesses could participate in the work of the Church only by praying, singing, reciting psalms, celebrating the canonical hours, tending the sick and poor women, and educating girls".³²¹ In fact this merely demonstrates that nuns and canonesses led a very similar lifestyle to that of monks.

Indeed some sanctimoniales seem to have so identified themselves with the male monastic lifestyle that the Council of Ver (844) issued the following decree:

"if those nuns for the reason of religion, as it seems to them, but falsely so, either wear a masculine habit or cut their hair, because we think that they are in error more by ignorance than through deliberate wrong-doing, we determine that they shall be admonished and castigated; lest by any chance as deceivers of the old and new Testaments they should according to the synod of Gangra be cut off by the most severe anathema by the body of the

³¹⁵ The Vitae Herlindis et Renildis describes the nuns making copies of the gospels and psalters; ASS Mart. III,c.II,12, pp.388; and see p.181 below.

³¹⁶ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.447. And see p.189, below.

³¹⁷ Schneider, Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life, p.104; Heidebrecht and Nolte, "Leben im Kloster", p.108.

³¹⁸ IS; MGH Conc. II i,c.28,p.455.

³¹⁹ IS; MGH, Ibid.

³²⁰ IS; MGH, Ibid,c.28,p.456.

³²¹ Wemple, Women, p.169.

Church". 322

This canon is not preceded by another which might link it to the issue of abbesses and nuns leaving their convents, nor is there such a canon in the whole of this council. The phrase virilis habitus has some similarity with the phrase virilia indumenta in the canon of the Reisbach council; but there is a new dimension in 844 with the mention of the cutting of the hair which suggests a fuller imitation of the practice of religious men, even including tonsuring perhaps.

The reasons for transvestism in 844 were different from those alleged in 800. Ver is in the West, in northern Neustria ³²³ whereas Reisbach, Freising and Salsbourg are in Bavaria. The two bits of evidence, forty years apart in date, also come from two different cultural areas.

The decrees of the Council of Ver are the only set of conciliar decisions for which we know the author - Lupus of Ferrières. ³²⁴ Canon 7 may merely mean only one instance of transvestism had occurred in one place known to Lupus and his fellow synodists. However, the phrase ut eis falso videtur in the present tense suggests that the practice was current. The Ver canon bears close resemblance to two of the canons of the mid-fourth-century Council of Gangra which are present in the Dionysio-Hadriana. The first, c.13, refers to a woman who decides to live a life of continence, and thereby assumes a male habit. ³²⁵ This corresponds to the male habit taken causa

³²² MGH Conc. III,c.7,p.41.

³²³ Ver was a Merovingian palace, near to Paris. Important female houses in the immediate area were Chelles and Jouarre.

³²⁴ Levillain, Loup de Ferrières Correspondance, I, Ep. 43,p.182.

³²⁵ "Si qua mulier, propter continentiam quae putatur, habitum mutat et pro solito muliebri amictu virilem sumit: anathema sit": "If a women, on account of what she thinks is continence, changes her dress, and instead of her usual woman's clothing assumes that of a man: let her be excommunicated"; MGH Conc. III,p.41.

religionis in the Ver canon. The cutting of hair in the Ver ruling also corresponds to c.17 of Gangra. ³²⁶ The prescriptions of the Council of Gangra in 340 were issued in response to a cult, established by Eustatius of Sebaste, in which the women cut their hair and dressed as men; further, this cult, in conjunction with the "gnostic bisexual cosmogonies and the androgenous visions of the Montanist priestesses", provided the cultural background to the Syriac cycle of female-monk legends. ³²⁷

It is possible that because the Ver canon is modelled on canons from the Council of Gangra that it was simply derived from the Dionysio-Hadriana collection. However, it is hard to see why the women would do something for which the ancient council prescribed anathema. It is more likely that the model arrived via links with the Byzantine East. ³²⁸ As Patlagean has shown the hagiographical model of the transvestite nun, originating in the gnostic milieu of the fourth century was widely known in Byzantium from the fifth to the late eighth centuries. ³²⁹ The Lives of the Desert Fathers were known in Merovingian Gaul, so it is possible that the models of some of the Desert Mothers

³²⁶ "Si quae mulierum, propter divinum cultum ut aestimat, crines adtondit quas ei Deus ad subiunctiones memoriam tribuit, tamquam praeceptum dissolvens oboedientiae: anathema sit": "If any of those women, on account of divine service, as she thinks, cuts the hair which God gave her as a reminder of [her] subjection thus dissolving the command of obedience: let her be excommunicated"; MGH Conc. III, p.41.

³²⁷ John Anson, "The female transvestite in early monasticism", Viator, 5, (1974), pp.1-32, at pp.10-11. These legends included the story of Thecla who, according to the Apocryphal Acts of St. Paul, cut her hair and disguised herself as a man in order to go to hear St. Paul preach. A cycle of legends told of female-monks located in the Alexandrian desert from the mid-fifth to early sixth centuries, where no fewer than six transvestite virgins were supposed to have lived at this time; Ibid, p.12.

³²⁸ Nelson, "Les femmes et l'évangélisation", pp.472, 484-85.

³²⁹ E. Patlagean, "L'histoire de la femme déguisée en moine et l'évolution de sainteté féminine à Byzance" in Structures sociales, famille, chrétienté à Byzance, [Variorum Reprints], (London 1981), pp.597-623.

also made their way westward, especially perhaps from the reign of Charlemagne onwards when there were links with Byzantine culture both diplomatically ³³⁰ and culturally.³³¹

The transvestism in the Ver canon is very different from that of the Reisbach council. Like the androgynous eastern transvestite model ³³² the sanctimoniales of the early 840s seem to have been attempting to overcome the disadvantages of their sex to achieve a purer spirituality. They assumed a form of "internalising" transvestism to transcend their sex. ³³³ Moreover the Ver canon does not lift the Gangra canons whole; they are tailored to fit the contemporary situation. Where the original Gangra canon prescribes excommunication, the Ver canon merely decrees admonishing the women since "they are more at fault through error than deliberate wrong-doing".

While the Ver canon may be evidence of an actual practice it is odd that such a practice does not appear in other types of sources, for instance annals which often reported such strange happenings like the career of the

³³⁰ On the political links between Charlemagne and Irene and the reactions to each other's religious policies see Herrin, The Formation of Christendom, pp.445-80.

³³¹ Suzanne Lewis, "A Byzantine virgo militans at Charlemagne's court" in Viator, 11, (1980), pp.71-93. Here she discusses a representation of the Virgin shown as wearing a virilised (because it is a military) form of dress, [but now see J.L. Nelson, "Women at the court of Charlemagne: a case of monstrous regiment" (forthcoming)] but Lewis also refers to the Greek Akathistos hymn which appears in an early ninth-century manuscript from St. Gall. Also see McKitterick concerning copies of the Rule of St. Basil, Cassian's Collations, The Rules of Serapion and Augustine and the Life of Anthony variously at Corbie, St. Wandrille, and Reichenau; The Frankish Church, pp.121ff .

³³² Patlagean, "L'histoire de la femme déguisée en moine", pp.598-99.

³³³ The difference between the two cases is emphasised by the fact that the compilers of the Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg knew of the Gangra canons because they referred to certain others in a chapter which forbids clerics to wear new and unaccustomed types of pallia; MGH Conc. II i,c.9, p.209.

pseudoprophetissa Thiota. ³³⁴ Nor does the transvestite model occur in female saints' lives. The virago ³³⁵ occurs as do examples of military, and therefore essentially male, imagery being applied to female saints which puts us in mind of the virgo militans ivory. ³³⁶ But the acquiring of male attributes as extra virtues is different from the phenomenon of transvestism.

There is only one instance that I know of in ninth-century hagiography of a woman, and she is not a saint, who dresses as a man: this occurs in the miracles of St. Carileph (St. Calais), where one Gunda dressed as a man and cut her hair ³³⁷ in order to gain access to the saint's shrine, otherwise forbidden to women since it was located in the monastery. Gunda's behaviour brought its just reward, in the opinion of the presumably male monastic author. Gunda had no sooner entered the innermost sanctum when she had a vision in which a demon appeared spewing blood which gushed all over the floor; she was saved only by the appearance of the holy man. Not surprisingly impressed by this, Gunda revealed all and

³³⁴ In 847 near Mainz people had asked Thiota to pray for them [ad eam venientes munera illi offerebant seque orationibus illius commendabant]. Worse still certain priests followed her believing her to be a magistra sent from heaven [et quod gravius est, sacri ordinis viri doctrinas ecclesiasticas postponentes illam quasi magistram caelitus destinatam sequebantur]; AF, MGH SRG, 7, p. 36. Thiota was condemned precisely because she subverted the ideal of the supervised female religious as intercessor (inside or outside a convent). Further, "the role of magistra was not disapproved of per se: it was denounced in this case because the teaching was false, and done from base motives"; Nelson, "Women and the word", pp. 73-4; also "Les femmes et l'évangélisation", p. 473. But for Thiota as evidence for suspicion of women religious in the world see Wemple, Women, p. 145; Schulenburg, "Female Sanctity", p. 116.

³³⁵ See pp. 177-79, 364-66 below.

³³⁶ The scutus fidei and the lorica spei of Herlindis and Renildis; Vita Herlindis et Renildis, ASS Mart. III, c. 2, p. 388.

³³⁷ comam capitis incidit implies shortening rather than tonsuring the hair; Miracula Carilephi, ASS Iulii I, c. 33, p. 98.

left the monastery praising God after having been whipped.³³⁸ This case demonstrates that although the woman's motive was spiritual - the wish to venerate the saint - her actions were practical. The point of the story was to demonstrate the need to cloister monks from women.

The significance of the practice as described in the Ver canon was that it was done causa religionis. It therefore demonstrates that in the ninth century some women religious at least were pursuing their own particular forms of asceticism ³³⁹ and that they regarded themselves as the equivalents of monks.

Although the legislators at Ver did not prescribe anathema and acknowledged that the women had sinned through ignorance, nevertheless the practice was condemned. Significantly, the image of the female transvestite in the East lost its popularity after the ninth century; it no longer appealed to a Byzantine society which now wanted models of sanctity that bolstered the power of the aristocratic family. ³⁴⁰ The transvestite model by its very nature was potentially subversive of both familial and monastic ideals and therefore was no longer tolerated. New Byzantine models were provided: for example by the Life of the abbess Irene composed in the late ninth century. She personified the ideal of the monastic female at the same time as underlining the importance of the family. ³⁴¹ We may see parallels here with the most popular models of ninth-century female sanctity in the Frankish kingdoms; and clearly the reformers were anxious to condemn reality where it subverted carefully constructed ideals.

The argument that the Ver canon is evidence for moral

³³⁸ ASS Iulii I, c.34-36, p.98.

³³⁹ As ventured by Nelson, "Les femmes et l'évangélisation", p.472.

³⁴⁰ Patlagean, "L'histoire de la femme déguisée en moine", p.619.

³⁴¹ Patlagean, Ibid.

decay within convents ³⁴² is not convincing. Indeed it is not certain that moral standards in Frankish convents generally were laxer than in the Merovingian period. The legislation, as we have noted, outlined strict rules for disciplining convent members. Nor is it fair to argue that "the criteria for admission increasingly emphasized wealth rather than religious calling" ³⁴³: not only had Frankish monasticism been a preserve of the aristocracy for centuries, but the suitability of candidates was insisted on by ninth-century reformers, as we have seen. Further, the argument that "nunneries lost their aura of heroic sanctity during the ninth century" because they were "increasingly used as a shelter, a prison, and an old-age home" ³⁴⁴ underestimates the extent to which convents had in earlier periods been used in this way, and also how "genuinely" religious institutions could still accommodate a social function. ³⁴⁵

It is by no means certain that the morality of convents worsened as the ninth century proceeded. The case of Duda in 874 can be read not so much as evidence for depravity as for the successful supervision of convents; her crimes were ultimately discovered and harshly dealt with. ³⁴⁶ The dire state of convents described by the Council of Trosly (909) has been used to argue that, "l'état moral des abbayes des religieuses apparaît assez souvent

³⁴² "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord", pp.64-5.

³⁴³ Wemple, Women, p.172.

³⁴⁴ Wemple, Women, p.172.

³⁴⁵ The insistence in the Ecclesiastical Discipline that religious widows who had sinned [p.101 above] should go to convents suggests that convents had the moral fibre to discipline them competently.

³⁴⁶ Duda was brought before the abbess and the rest of the congregation; she was whipped and then underwent penance of three years; during a subsequent three years she was allowed to join her sisters in prayer but not in the choir - either behind the door or in a place designated by the abbess where she could be seen by everyone; in the seventh year she was allowed to join her sisters in offering the communion oblations, and to take communion: Mansi 17, cols.293-94.

déplorable". ³⁴⁷ The problem of lay encroachment and the breakdown of the religious Rule was not confined to convents - general anxiety was expressed in 909 about all monasteries. ³⁴⁸ The condemnation of the marriage of religious women ³⁴⁹ had been reiterated throughout the ninth century as the statements at Friouli (796/7) and Meaux/Paris (845/6) demonstrate ³⁵⁰; and at Trosly the episcopal call for chastity ³⁵¹ reads as a general homily, and is not gender-specific.

The legislation expressed concern over the resourcing of convents recognising that insufficient resources could lead to the demise of an institution. ³⁵² Because of a lack of evidence for actual foundations in the Merovingian period, Wemple argued that "the vitality of feminine asceticism should not be measured merely in terms of the number of nunneries". ³⁵³ The same holds true for the Carolingian period. Where convents declined or were taken over by monks, this may have been due to the particular and ever-changing interests and needs of families. The demise of Sarrzac in Aquitaine ³⁵⁴ is perhaps explicable in terms of a family's management of its resources: a community of monks was perceived as more effectively carrying out the memoria since as priests they could provide, "the most potent of all commemorative services".³⁵⁵ It would be unwise to generalise such an explanation,

³⁴⁷ Verdon, "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord", pp.65-6.

³⁴⁸ Mansi 18, cols.270-72.

³⁴⁹ Mansi 18, cols.286-88.

³⁵⁰ See above, pp.100-01.

³⁵¹ Mansi 18, col.294.

³⁵² See above p.126.

³⁵³ Wemple, Women, p.157.

³⁵⁴ Lands given to Immena and a community of women in 823 were redistributed by Immena's brother, Archbishop Rodulf of Bourges, to form a new monastic house for men; Martindale, "The Nun Immena".

³⁵⁵ Martindale, Ibid, pp.38-40.

however, for the intercessory power of women in Saxon convents or at a Lotharingian institution like Remiremont³⁵⁶ provides another quite different perception of women religious. Both ideal and reality varied not only from region to region but from convent to convent.

³⁵⁶ As evidenced by the Liber Memorialis; MGH Libri Mem. I (eds.) E. Hlawitshcka, K. Schmid and G. Tellenbach (Zurich, Dublin 1970).

CHAPTER THREE.

IMAGES OF WOMEN IN HAGIOGRAPHICAL TEXTS:

SAINTLY WOMEN, MONASTIC WOMEN.

I. Genre: Writers and Recipients.

The ninth-century Vitae of Bertila and Balthild and also the Translatio Balthildis were possibly written by nuns at Chelles c.833.¹ Some other anonymous texts such as the Virtutes of Geretrude and the Vitae Odiliae may also have been written by women.² However, eight of the texts considered here³ have known authors, and all of these were male ecclesiastics: six were monks⁴, one was a

¹ Ch.1 p.69 above; female authorship of these texts seems likely in view of the probable female authorship of the earlier Vita Balthildis written c.680; Nelson, "Brunhild and Balthild", p.17, note 83.

² The author of the Vita Odiliae demonstrates knowledge of the later ninth-century community at Hohenburg describing the building and location of a hospital (c.14), dormitory and other buildings (c.18) and also the decision of the community to be canonesses rather than follow the more rigorous Benedictine Rule (c.16); MGH SRM, 6, pp.44-47.

³ 23 texts have been studied [see Table II] for 22 saints [see Table I]. Counted as a composite work are the Vita, Miracula and Translatio of St. Glodesind [ASS Iulii VI, pp.198-225] as are the Vita and Miracula of St. Opportuna [ASS Aprilis III, pp.61-71] since they constitute revised Vitae with appended sections written at the same time or shortly after.

⁴ Hucbald is counted twice as he wrote versions of the Vita Aldegundis [PL132 cols.859-76] and the Vita Rictrudis [PL132 cols.829-48]. The other male monastic hagiographers include Agius author of the Vita Hathumodae [MGH SS, 4, pp.165-89]; Rudolf author of the Vita Leobae [MGH SS, 15.1, pp.118-31]; Hatto, abbot of Reichenau, author of the Vita Verenae [in A. Reinle, Die heilige Verena von Zürzach: Legende, Kult, Denkmäler (Basel, 1948), pp.26-31]; and Hartmann, a monk at St. Gall, author of the Vita Wiboradae [ASS Mai I, pp.284-306]. Maura is in both Table I and II but she is not counted in the statistics; see n.215, ch.1.

SAINTS	provenance	Abbess	Founder	Daughter of founder	Virgin	Widow	Left marriage for convent	Other
Aldegund	Maubeuge	XXX	XXX		XXX			
Anstrude	Laon	XXX		XXX	XXX			
Austreberta	Aoeville & Pavilly	XXX			XXX			
Balthild	Chelles		XXX			XXX		Queen
Bertila	Chelles	XXX			XXX			
Chrothildis	Paris & Tours		XXX			XX		Queen
Geretrude	Nivelles	XXX		XXX	XXX			
Glodesind	Metz	XXX		XXX	XXX			
Hathumoda	Gandersheim	XXX		XXX	XXX			
Herlindis	Aldenevk	XXX		XXX	XXX			
Leoba	Bischoffsheim	XXX			XXX			became recluse
Liutberga	Wendhausen				XXX			became recluse
Maura	Troyes				XXX			"Lay"
Odilia	Hohenburg	XXX		XXX	XXX			
Opoortuna	Almenêches	XXX			XXX			
Pusinna					XXX			"secular"
Renildis	Aldenevk	XXX		XXX	XXX			
Rictrude	Marcniennes	XXX	XXX			XXX		
Sadalberga	Laor	XXX	XXX			XXX	XXX	
Verena	Zürzach				XXX			Evangeliser & recluse
Waldestrude	Mons	XXX	XXX			XXX	XXX	land recluse
Waldburgis	Nonheim	XXX			XXX			
Wiborada	St.Gall				XXX			Recluse & Martyr

TEXTS	Revised/reworked Vita or addition to Vita	Contemporary Vita	Unknown author poss. by nuns	known author
Aldegund	XXX 2 9th C. Vitae		1) XXX	2) Hucbald, (mk.) St. Amand
Anstrude	XXX		XXX	
Austreberta	Miracula		XXX	
Balthild	Vita & Translatio		XXX	
Bertila	XXX		XXX	
Chrothildis	XXX		Rheims XXX	
Geretrude	Virtutes		XXX	
Glodesind	Composite Vita; Miracula & Translatio		XXX	
Hathumoda		XXX		Agius, (mk.) Lamspringa
Heilindis	XXX		XXX	
Leoba	XXX			Rudolf, (mk.) Fulda
Liutberga		XXX	monk/cleric ? - Halberstadt	
Maura		XXX ?		((Prudentius Bp. Troves)?)
Odilia	XXX		(cleric or canoness) Hohenburg	
Opportuna	Composite Vita/Miracula			Adalhelm Bp. Sées
Pusinna	XXX		XXX	
Renildis	XXX		XXX	
Rictrude	XXX			Hucbald (mk.) St. Amand
Sadalberga	XXX		XXX	
Verena	XXX			Hatto (abb.) Reichenau
Waldestrude	XXX		XXX	
Waldburgis	Miracula			Wulfhard mk. & presbyter Eichstätt
Wiboraga		XXX		Hartmann (mk.) St. Gall

bishop ⁵, and the last was a presbyter but also a monk. ⁶

Schulenburg argued that the presentation of "saintly credentials was perhaps believed to be strengthened by a male-authored defense of the holy dead". ⁷ This conclusion must remain tentative since the majority of the texts are anonymous. Moreover, "official" canonisation was a feature of a later period ⁸; the initiatives of the local bishop, the monastic community and those attached to it - especially the saint's family - were the deciding factors for sainthood in the ninth century. ⁹ The Vita Leobae was written by Rudolf, a monk from Fulda, using the oral testimony of four nuns. ¹⁰ But, perhaps significantly for Rudolf, it was a group of venerable men including Mago, a priest and monk, who had noted down the women's words.¹¹ Nevertheless, the women's accounts were seen as an important verification of the written-up Vita. ¹² The

⁵ Adalhelm, Bishop of Sées and author of the Vita Opportunae.

⁶ Wulfhard, author of the Miracula Waldburgis [in Bauch, Ein bayerisches Mirakelbuch] was named as a monk from Herrieden by Anonymous of Herrieden; MGH SS, 7, c.10, p.256.

⁷ J.T. Schulenburg, "Saint's Lives as a Source for the History of Women, 500-1100", in J.T. Rosenthal, (ed.), Medieval Women and the Sources of Medieval History, pp.285-320, at pp.291-92.

⁸ For the papally controlled process from the late eleventh century onwards see B. Ward, Miracles and the Medieval Mind. Theory, Record and Event. 1000-1215. (London, 1982), pp.184-191.

⁹ The Synod of Frankfurt (794), even as it attempted to control the proliferation of saints' cults, showed the role of the popular affirmation of saints' cults and the function of hagiographical texts in this process; "Ut nulli novi sancti colantur aut invocentur, nec memoria eorum per vias erigantur; sed hii soli in ecclesia venerandi sint qui ex auctoritate passionum aut vitae merito electi sint"; MGH Capit. I, c.42, p.77. This echoes the Admonitio Generalis; MGH Capit. I, c.42, p.56.

¹⁰ Vita Leobae; MGH SS, 15.1, c.1, p.122.

¹¹ MGH, Ibid.

¹² In the Miracula Waldburgis, Wulfhard refers to two nuns, Diathild the procaratrix and custrix [Bk.IV, 12b, p.330; Bk.III, 6a, p.272] and Ruathildis [Bk.III, 9, p.282]

hagiographic genre offered such firmly-established stereotypes that even female authors "themselves seem passive, working within a received tradition that has been man-made".¹³ This can mean that images presented by nuns are similar if the received tradition and writing environment were monastic.¹⁴

Whatever the image of female sanctity, the number of female saints decreased in the ninth century compared with the preceding century. Quantative analyses have been attempted. Schulenburg concluded that the numbers of female saints reached a peak in the first half of the eighth century comprising 23.5% of the total number of documented saints; this number declined to 19.1% in the latter part of the eighth century and continued to drop to 14.8% in the first half of the ninth century and to 12.6% in the second half - producing an average of 13.7% for the ninth century.¹⁵ Herlihy produced a ratio of 6.8 male saints for every female in the period 476-750 which rose to 7.85 c.751-850.¹⁶

The years 650-750 have been designated "a golden age for female saints"¹⁷ because female monasticism was "a

who assisted when pilgrims came to the shrine and told him what had happened; Bk.III,9,p.282 and Bauch, "Commentary", Ibid, pp.27-8. Also see Nelson, "Women and the word", p.67. Agius refers to the verification of one of Hathumoda's visions by her sister Christina, Vitae Hathumodae, MGH SS,4,c.15,p.172. Hathumoda's other sister, Gerberga, witnessed a second vision; MGH, Ibid,c.18,p.172.

¹³ Nelson, "Women and the word", p.59.

¹⁴ See pp.68-70 above.

¹⁵ J.T. Schulenburg, "Sexism and the Celestial Gynaecium - from 500 to 1200", J.Med.Hist., 4, (1978) pp.117-133, at pp.118,122-123. See also her "Female Sanctity: Public and Private Roles". Schulenburg's figures are based on the Bibliotheca Sanctorum and Acta Sanctorum.

¹⁶ Based on the Bibliotheca Hagiographica Latina and Acta Sanctorum; Herlihy, "Did Women have a Renaissance?", p.3.

¹⁷ Schulenburg, "Public and Private Roles", p.103; Wemple, Women, p.171.

liberating force" where women could "give expression to their own emotions, ascetic ideals and spiritual strivings".¹⁸ The subsequent decline in the number of new female saints in the ninth century has been explained as a consequence of the supposed economic and ascetic decline of female monasticism with strict cloistering and exclusion from the developments of the Carolingian Renaissance, and the apparent greater attractions of marriage.¹⁹ It is not certain that marriage became significantly more attractive for noblewomen.²⁰ Further, the legislation qualifies some of these arguments concerning female monasticism.

Certainly, the link between sanctity and monasticism is clear: all the saints except for Pusinna and Verena²¹ were connected with a monastic community either as its founder²², its abbess²³ or as an inmate²⁴, or as a relative of an inhabitant.²⁵ Although saints were, by

¹⁸ Wemple, Women, p.191.

¹⁹ Wemple, Ibid.

²⁰ See pp.288-89 below.

²¹ This "odd" saint's cult, which had its tradition in the story of the fourth-century Theban legion and St. Maurice, reemerged in the middle of the ninth century. But even Verena's Vita seems to have been written in order to propagate her reputation for the double community at Zürzach, whence the saint had supposedly evangelised amongst the Alemanians: Reinle, Die heilige Verena, pp.21-22,35.

²² Balthild and Chrothildis as queens are in any case special as founders of monastic communities.

²³ Aldegund, Anstrude, Austreberta, Bertila, Geretrude, Glodesind, Hathumoda, Herlindis, Leoba, Odilia, Opportuna, Renildis, Rictrude, Sadalberga, Waldestrude and Waldburgis.

²⁴ As a young nun Liutbirga was picked out of Wendhausen by Gisla and eventually returned there as a recluse; Vita Liutbirgae. Das Leben der Liutbirg, O. Menzel, (ed.), [MGH Deutsches Mittelalter 3], (Stuttgart 1978), c.3, pp.11-12; c.22, p.25.

²⁵ Wiborada was the sister of a monk at St. Gall (c.I,5) and was connected to the monastery both as the teacher of St. Udalric (c.II,7) and as a recluse

definition, exceptional figures, many of this chapter's remarks have a wider application regarding female monasticism in the ninth century.

Yet such numerical surveys can mislead. The actual numbers involved are relatively small which gives more weight to percentages than is sometimes warranted; this consideration also applies to the sample used in this study of twenty-two saints. Further, the number of all saints, both male and female, declined in this period compared to the previous three centuries.²⁶ Even within this declining total number, the proportion of women saints declines in the ninth century than for the eighth century. One explanation for this decline may be found in the regional distribution of new saints. Poulin noted for Aquitaine that no new female saints were created from the mid-seventh to the mid-tenth century; the predominating images were adult, noble and entirely masculine.²⁷ The area already had an influential cult in St. Radegund at St. Croix de Poitiers which may have had the effect of discouraging other female saints. But, rather than simply attributing the decline of female saints in Aquitaine and elsewhere to misogyny engendered by the Carolingian reforms, several factors should be recognised.

In Aquitaine an important consideration was familial patronage of monasticism. Female monasticism was generally

(c.III,29); Vita Wiboradae, ASS Mai I, pp.284,287,290. The facts that Maura is "lay" and, unlike Pusinna, not veiled, and also that she is so firmly linked by the hagiographer to the cathedral church at Troyes, [PL115, cols.1369-70], casts further doubt on this Life as evidence for the ninth century; she sits oddly amongst all the other monastic saints.

²⁶ Poulin estimated that only fifty new saints were created between 751 and 1000 in France and Germany, whereas the equivalent figure for the years 480 to 750 was 350; L'Idéal de sainteté, pp.2-3,5.

²⁷ Poulin, Ibid, pp.43-44. The only three female saints were earlier (Sigolina whose Vita was written c.700 and Eustadolia whose Vita was written after 683) or later (Valerie of Limoges, c.985); Poulin, Ibid.

less well represented here than in other areas ²⁸; lands assigned to convents were liable to being turned over to communities of monks in the ninth century as the case of Sarrazac demonstrates. ²⁹ Sarrazac may exemplify how a religious daughter's role as intercessor and therefore her domus was closely tied to the family and its patrimony. Once the daughter died, the foundation may have been considered at an end in that particular form. ³⁰ Such "temporary" foundations were less likely to engender saints.

For an area wider than Aquitaine Verdon argued that ninth-century convents were more economically vulnerable, either disappearing or being taken over by canons or

²⁸ Verdon's survey, up to the eleventh century, was based on a count of 30 convents in the ecclesiastical provinces of Bordeaux and Bourges but fewer than twelve in the provinces of Auch and Narbonne; "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du sud". Magnou-Nortier observed that the number of female foundations in the Midi, up to the beginning of the twelfth century, compared unfavourably to the pattern evidenced north of the Loire; "Formes Feminales de Vie Consacrée", at pp.210-211. Magnou-Nortier suggested that female monasticism was less widespread in the Midi than in the north because of an adherence to ancient legislation concerning an "âge avancé pour la consécration" [but see above p.130] and the need for "une tutelle masculine"; Ibid, p.211.

²⁹ Martindale, "The Nun Immena". However, Aquitaine may present this picture precisely because research on the area has been undertaken.

³⁰ This has parallels with early medieval Ireland where only four female Vitae survive. "This enormous discrepancy between the minute number of women's houses and the very large number of pious women [named in martyrologies] must be due to the Irish law of inheritance. For a woman could not acquire more than a life interest in the land she inherited: on her death it passed back to her kin... Only in a few cases where a substantial grant of land was obtained by gift could a perpetual monastic community have been founded... women's communities seem to have been less ambitious, less competitive than many men's houses"; K. Hughes, Early Christian Ireland, (Cornell, 1972), pp.234-35. Bar bara Yorke also pointed to women's temporary holding of "bookland"; however, in England, "it is remarkable how many royal women did become saints", "'Sisters under the Skin'? Anglo-Saxon Nuns and Nunneries in Southern England", Reading Medieval Studies, XV, (1989), pp.95-117, at pp.102,105-6.

monks. ³¹ These difficulties may explain a loss of manuscripts and/or a lack of economic and literary continuity in convents which was necessary for creating many more new female saints. Leoba was abbess at Bischoffsheim but Fulda appropriated her relics, St. Boniface having ordered her remains to be buried there.³² The author of her Vita does not record how Bischoffsheim regarded the translation of her body and subsequently her cult to a male foundation. Her case indicates the sometimes less secure position of convents vis-à-vis powerful male establishments.

Patterns of landholding varied regionally. It is therefore significant that two of only three new female saints in the ninth century come from Saxony. Schulenburg commented that the increase of female saints in tenth-century Saxony was tied to "ecclesiastical developments".³³ However, in Saxony convents were specifically and amply patronised by powerful aristocratic families within which women played a significant role as abbesses or proprietresses; noblewomen, including nuns, possessed "extensive inheritances" which, in the tenth and eleventh centuries, were used by "masterful matrons" to endow convents. ³⁴ Ultimately, in the eleventh century, "Saxon princes became less tolerant of wealthy widows disposing

³¹ For the area which is now France; Verdon, "Notes sur le rôle économique de monastères féminins", pp.334-35. J. Choux argued that in the Trier region Benedictine houses were economically vulnerable because of lay proprietorship and Viking raids and were transformed into institutes of canons; "Décadence et réforme monastique dans la province de Trèves, 855-959", Revue Bénédictine, 70, (1960), pp.204-223. That Choux's list includes convents but also monasteries [Echternach, St. Arnoul, St. Vanne de Verdun, Moyenmoutier, Salone, Bonmoutier and Étival] shows that this process was not specific to women's houses; further, other areas were equally if not more vulnerable to Viking raids.

³² MGH SS, 15.1, c.19, 21, pp.129, 130.

³³ These are not elaborated upon; Schulenburg, "Public and Private Roles", p.104.

³⁴ Leyser, Rule and Conflict, pp.49-73.

of great inheritances" to convents. ³⁵ But, prior to this, the connection between inheritance patterns and the patronage of female monasticism helps to explain why most new ninth-century female saints came from Saxony ³⁶, providing the basis from which a peculiarly Saxon female sanctity developed in the tenth century. ³⁷

Furthermore, Saxony had been recently converted to Christianity - unlike the areas from where the majority of the other saints in the sample originated. These Saxon saints were therefore "frontier" saints in a "new" area and representative of a more aggressive form of Christianity. ³⁸ This trend can also be seen in some of the contemporary male saints - St. Liudger who evangelised amongst the Frisians and the Saxons ³⁹, St. Wigbert whose ministry also took him amongst the Saxons ⁴⁰ and St. Anskar apostle of the Scandinavians. ⁴¹ By the ninth century the Frankish kingdoms had reached the limits of their expansion; thus all the new female saints represented the forceful building of Christian traditions. Wiborada, the other contemporary female saint, was associated with the St. Gall area and the monastery in

³⁵ Leyser, Ibid, p.71.

³⁶ Thus Hathumoda was put in as abbess of Gandersheim, founded for her by her parents: "in monasterio, quod in propria hereditate fundatum... est mater spiritalis et electa et constituta"; MGH SS, 4, c.4, p.168.

³⁷ Corbet, Les saints ottoniens.

³⁸ Eckentstein in the last century noted that "the story of the spread of monastic life into Saxony is closely connected with the history of the conquest of the country... the extraordinary aptitude which the Saxons showed for appropriating or remodelling to their own use institutions... into which they breathed a spirit peculiarly their own", Woman under Monasticism, (Cambridge, 1896), pp.143-5. Heinzelmann noted Widukind of Corvey's comment concerning the greater enthusiasm of the Saxons as compared with the Franks as a reason for translating St. Vitus to Corvey; Translationsberichte, p.34.

³⁹ Vita Liudgeri, MGH SS, 2, pp.403-25.

⁴⁰ Vita Wigberti, MGH SS, 15.1, pp.36-43.

⁴¹ Vita Anskari, MGH SS, 2, pp.683-725.

particular. Unlike Saxony this region had not been recently converted, yet it was a newly vulnerable area; hence Wiborada was martyred by marauding Hungarians.⁴² In a different way she also represents the spirited defence against paganism.

However, a period's spiritual strength should not be measured only by the number of saints it produces. A lack of "new" saints does not necessarily indicate that, compared to the Merovingian period, female monasticism had lost its "aura of heroic sanctity"⁴³ or that the ninth century was specifically for women "an age of waning spirituality and asceticism".⁴⁴ In a survey of hagiography, Vitae which were reworked in the ninth century, or which had Miracula or a Translatio appended to them, may therefore be included. Of the sample used here the Vitae of seventeen female saints were rewritten in the ninth century⁴⁵; for five saints Miracula or Virtutes were written or added to an earlier Vita⁴⁶; and for two saints a Translatio was written.⁴⁷ The images presented in these texts were no less valid for the ninth century than for the time when the saint lived. Those areas where Christianity had deeper roots and/or chose to identify with longer-established cults were not necessarily less spiritually vital; these areas may manifest a spirit of

⁴² Vita Wiboradae, ASS Mai I, c.II, 31, p.290.

⁴³ Wemple, Women, p.172.

⁴⁴ Wemple, Ibid, p.174. Forms of asceticism were occurring; pp.136-41 above.

⁴⁵ This constitutes sixteen texts because the sister saints Herlindis and Renildis are dealt with in one Vita; ASS Mart. III, pp.383-92.

⁴⁶ Austreberta, Geretrude, Glodesind, Opportuna and Waldburgis. This number could be expanded to six as the series of post mortem miracles following the death of Anstrude read like a separate, later addition to the Vita; Vita Anstrudis, MGH SRM, 6, c.23-38, pp.75-78.

⁴⁷ Balthild and Glodesind; although the Miracula Austrebertae followed several transfers of Austreberta's remains, these followed Viking attacks, and therefore did not constitute a Translatio in the formal, liturgical sense; ASS Feb. II, pp.423-29.

consolidation rather than a lack of initiative. ⁴⁸

The regional distribution of contemporary and reworked hagiographical texts underlines the diversity of the Frankish kingdoms. However, the production of either type of text was dependent on its intended audience(s) and recipients. These could be several and overlapping since hagiographical texts had "multiple functions". ⁴⁹ The Vita Leobae had a didactic purpose; Rudolf dedicated the work to Hathumoda, later revered as a saint herself, in order that she had "something to read and imitate with profit".⁵⁰ Thus a Vita could be intended as a model for sanctimoniales in convents other than in the saint's own community - confirming that there was an exchange of ideas and learning between monasteries and convents. But the text also could have been written to justify Leoba's interment at Fulda. ⁵¹ The Vita was written soon after the translation in 837/8 and before 842. ⁵² Rudolf seems anxious to associate Leoba with Fulda describing how she was allowed into the monastery to pray although the privilege was "never granted to any woman either before or since, because from the day that monks began to dwell

⁴⁸ Alcuin evidences some of the intentions behind the writing of versions a new Vita of St. Riquier: he was commissioned by Angilbert to write a Vita "in more literary form"; he was surprised that only a small libellus of such an important saint's works had been produced; and he wrote a "fairly short version of the relevant facts" for Charlemagne; MGH Epp. Karol., 4, no.306, pp.465-66. I am indebted to Elizabeth Lockwood for the reference to and translation of this letter.

⁴⁹ McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.243.

⁵⁰ "ut et habeas quod et libenter legere et religiose possis imitari": MGH SS,15.1, prologue, p.121.

⁵¹ See above n.32. Leoba's translation is referred to in a list of various saints' Translations to Fulda; Miracula Sanctorum in Fuldense Ecclesias Translatorum auctore Rudolfo; MGH SS,15.1,p.339.

⁵² Waitz; MGH SS,15.1,p.118.

there entrance was forbidden to women". 53

Familial interests are evident in the writing of the Vita Odiliae. 54 This Vita appears to have been reworked in the late ninth or early tenth century when a descendant branch of Odilia's family, the Etichonides, was reemerging as a powerful influence in Alsace - where Hohenburg, Odilia's convent, is situated. The Vita emphasises Odilia's connections with her family but especially her relationship with her father, duke Adalric, whom the ninth-century branch of the family would regard as its founding scion. Adalric initially wished to have Odilia killed because she was born blind 55 but her mother saved her sending her to a nurse and then to Baume-les-Dames. 56 Odilia's brother interceded with their father for a reconciliation; but the angry Adalaric killed his son. 57 As an act of penance Adalric founded Hohenburg for his daughter. 58 The Duke was rewarded when Odilia successfully interceded for him after his death. 59 There could be no stronger motif of the relationship between the saint and her family; the family in the late ninth century would hope to benefit from the reaffirmed saintly reputation of the Duke's offspring. 60

Similarly, Hathumoda's family would hope that her Vita

53 MGH SS,15.1,c.19,p.129.

54 Fabienne Cardot, "Le pouvoir aristocratique et le sacré au haut moyen âge", MA, 89 (1983), pp.171-93.

55 MGH SRM,6,c.2,p.38.

56 MGH, Ibid, c.4,5,pp.38-41.

57 MGH, Ibid, c.8,p.42.

58 MGH, Ibid, c.9,p.42.

59 MGH, Ibid, c.12,p.44.

60 Balthild and her Vitae provided a female precedent of the "dynastic prestige that came of contact with supernatural power" Nelson, "Brunhild and Balthild", p.72. Geretrude performed a similar function for the Arnulfings; ch.1 above, n.206.

would contribute to the development of "une généalogie... un culte de l'ancêtre pour les héritiers" and that the saint would represent "une étape dans le processus de sanctification de toute une famille aristocratique".⁶¹ Thus Gandersheim was founded for Hathumoda by her parents.⁶² However, unlike the Vita Odiliae, the Vita Hathumodae would have benefitted the saint's immediate family as the text was written probably soon after her death in 874.⁶³ The Vita begins by detailing Hathumoda's family - her father's and mother's ancestors, her brother Bruno and her sister Liutgard.⁶⁴ Several family members' involvement with the convent is made apparent throughout the Vita and the verse obituary: two of the saint's sisters, her mother, and at least one niece appear to have been at Gandersheim and other family members are mentioned.⁶⁵

Hathumoda's sainthood was therefore placed within the familial context. The term soror was a monastic one. Hathumoda is the good abbess over her consorores⁶⁶; and she herself is defined thus:

⁶¹ Cardot, "Le pouvoir aristocratique et le sacré", pp.192-93.

⁶² That the Vita Hathumodae describes the joint pilgrimage of Hathumoda's parents to Rome, and on their return their foundation of Gandersheim is perhaps illustrative of Saxon noblewomen's participation in the distribution of patrimony; MGH SS,4,c.4,p.168.

⁶³ Pertz, MGH SS,4,p.165. The verse obituary was composed a little later, between 888-895; Ibid.

⁶⁴ MGH SS,4,c.2,p.167.

⁶⁵ Hathumoda's sisters Christina [MGH SS,4,c.15, p.172] and Gerberga are mentioned [MGH, Ibid,c.16,17, p.172; l.668 and 677,p.188]; her mother also figures [MGH, Ibid,c.17,18,27,pp.172, 175]; as does the father in two vision-sequences [MGH, Ibid, l.543ff,602ff,pp.186-87]; there is a reference to filiolae [MGH, Ibid, l.438,p.184]; and there are various references to the saint's father, brothers and sisters [MGH, Ibid, l.493,p.185], to her father and brother [MGH, Ibid,l.537,p.186], to her brothers and a sister [MGH, Ibid, l.539,p.186] and to a married sister, Enda [MGH, Ibid, l.541,p.186].

⁶⁶ MGH, Ibid,c.8,p.169.

haec soror, haec mater, haec nutrix atque magistra
haec abbatissa haec fuerat domina.⁶⁷
However, soror here is ambiguous. In view of the familial connections in the Vita and that her sisters Gerberga and Christina succeeded Hathumda as abbess⁶⁸, the description soror and abbatissa had double resonance.

II. Dominant Images in the Texts.

[1] The Abbess.

Although familial interests show that one of the functions of hagiographical texts lay in "fostering and expressing lay piety"⁶⁹, the function of Vitae as part of a family's "Klosterpolitik" explains why the majority of our saints, sixteen, are abbesses. Further, seven of these abbess-saints were the daughters of their convent's founder.⁷⁰

The high proportion of abbess-saints has several explanations. As hagiographical texts were produced principally for a monastic audience the abbatial model was obviously appropriate. Legislation detailed the role of abbesses as ductrices animarum⁷¹, and Vitae provided an exemplary manifestation of that role. Texts produced in monasteries more readily survived since these institutions were the most likely places to conserve manuscripts. But it is doubtful that there were significant numbers of now lost Vitae of lay saints. Sanctity was more likely to be achieved where visibility could be attained: hence men outnumber women saints in this and every other period. Men

⁶⁷ MGH, Ibid, 1.49,p.177.

⁶⁸ Gerberga's election is referred to; MGH, Ibid, 1.653-699,p.188.

⁶⁹ McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.243; the laity commissioned hagiographical texts (such as the Translatio of Sts. Eusebius and Pontianus by count Girard and his wife Bertha and the Vita Sturmii by the noblewoman Angildruth) and there is evidence for lay ownership of Vitae; Ibid, pp.242-43.

⁷⁰ Anstrude, Geretrude, Glodesind, Hathumoda, Herlindis, Odilia and Renildis.

⁷¹ See above pp.121-28.

had several prominent "career options" as kings, as king's men (missi and counts) and, particularly for elevation to sainthood, as members of the Church hierarchy. For women, the monastic environment was where prominence was usually found. ⁷² Apart from queens ⁷³ and other royal women, abbesses were the only women who could exercise a leadership role. In the "foyer domestique" (noble) women were far from "les objets passifs de l'évangélisation de l'Eglise" ⁷⁴ but they rarely achieved visibility there.

The argument that ninth-century female monasticism became less heroic ⁷⁵ depends partly on an analysis of the kinds of sanctity that convents engendered. It is therefore significant that the image of the saintly abbess presiding over her spiritually sound community remained the dominant one. The terminology used in several Vitae underlines this point. Several saints possessed other characteristics such as virginity, but terms designating the saint as abbess predominate.

For example:

	<u>Bertila</u>	<u>Opportuna</u>	<u>Hathumoda</u>
<u>virgo</u>	2	15	1
<u>sponsa Christi/Dei</u>	1	1	1
Total no. of usages	<u>3</u>	<u>16</u>	<u>2</u>
<u>mater</u>	3	2	6
<u>pia mater</u>	2		
<u>dulcis mater</u>		1	
<u>spiritalis mater</u>	1		2
<u>mater abbatissa</u>	1	1	
<u>abbatissa</u>	1	1	3
<u>domna/domina</u>	3	17	2
<u>demonstratrix</u>	1		
<u>nutrix</u>	1		1
<u>magistra</u>			1
Total no. of usages	<u>13</u>	<u>22</u>	<u>15</u>

⁷² Schulenburg, "Sexism and the Celestial Gynaecium", pp.129-130.

⁷³ Since queens were so exceptional, "the lives of saintly queens may rival if not exceed those of holy kings"; Stafford, Queens, p.6.

⁷⁴ Nelson, "Les femmes et l'évangélisation", pp.474-75; and see pp.329-30,363-65,366-71 below.

⁷⁵ Wemple, Women, p.172.

However, particular abbesses became saints because of powerful interest groups. Families' interests have been noted in the cases of Odilia ⁷⁶ and Hathumoda. The cultivation of Leoba's saintly reputation can be explained by her connections to Charlemagne and to her relative Boniface. Royal interests can also be seen in the rewriting of the Vitae Bertilae and Balthildis, coinciding with Balthild's translation. The Empress Judith's mother, Heigilwich, was abbess of Chelles. This may explain not only the production of a life of the abbess Bertila alongside that of Balthild but also the emphasis in the Vita Bertilae on abbatial rather than virginal terminology.

The Vitae of Opportuna and Glodesind were rewritten in the ninth century by Bishop Adalhelm of Sées and at the instigation of Bishop Drogo of Metz, respectively.⁷⁷ Powerful patrons such as these ensured the greater visibility of these women as compared to others. As abbesses constituted the most common expression of female sanctity, the convent could not have been perceived as "private" in the sense that some scholars have interpreted it.⁷⁸ The monastic environment was the public place where the saint's life and works were witnessed and recorded. Of the three contemporary saints one, Hathumoda, was an abbess - the other two, Liutbirga and Wiborada, became recluses. Seclusion was the most "private" expression of asceticism; yet these saints are also highly visible. They therefore demonstrate that the public/private dichotomy is not always a usefully transferable concept; and that

⁷⁶ Odilia was a virgin saint and is described as virgo and sponsa Christi a total of nine times; but she is also variously described as mater, abbatissa or domna four times; Vita Odiliae, MGH SRM, 6, pp. 37-50.

⁷⁷ Both saints had links with the episcopal see. Opportuna was the sister of Chrodegang, Bishop of Sées; Vita Opportunae, ASS Aprilis III, c. I, 2, p. 62. Glodesind sought sanctuary in the cathedral church at Metz; Vita Glodesindis, ASS Iulii VI, c. I, 8, p. 204.

⁷⁸ Schulenburg, "Strict Active Enclosure", p. 70.

"visibility" depends on a saint's connections. ⁷⁹

Family interests and ties operated within monasticism to such an extent that sanctity and, if the saints were abbesses, abbatial office were perceived as hereditary. Herlindis and Renildis were both sisters and abbesses at the family convent at Aldeneyk. ⁸⁰ Sadalberga, saint and abbess at Laon, handed on both roles to her daughter Anstrude. The Vita Anstrudis describes how the saint was made abbess assensu et electione et acclamatione sororum.⁸¹ But clearly the decision of Sadalberga, realising that her death was imminent and wishing to hand on care of the community to her daughter, was crucial. ⁸² The virgin abbess-saints, who greatly outnumber widowed abbess-saints ⁸³, clearly also had family members in the convent to whom they could hand on the abbacy.

Hucbald's Vita Aldegundis refers to two nieces,

⁷⁹ Liutbirga's life as a recluse was episcopally sanctioned [Vita Liutbirgae, c.22,p.25] and her connection with the aristocratic Saxon family of Hess ensured her sainthood. Similarly, Wiborada's clausula was given the bishop's benediction [Vita Wiboradae; ASS Mai I, c.II,15, p.286] and her connection with the monastery at St. Gall and especially the fact that St. Udalric commissioned the writing of the Vita [ASS, Ibid, c.IV,40,pp.292-93] guaranteed her elevation to sainthood.

⁸⁰ "in eodem monasterio, quod relictione et paterna traditione ambe sanctae virgines possidebant... ambae secundum normam sanctae Regulae et Ecclesiasticae institutae Abbatissae ordinatae atque consecratae sunt": Vitae Herlindis et Renildis, ASS Mart. III,c.II,10,p.388.

⁸¹ MGH SRM,6,c.4,p.68. Interestingly, and perhaps a specifically ninth-century concern, is the described function of royal and episcopal involvement: "sub regali licentia benedictione episcopali sacratur in abbatissam"; MGH, Ibid.

⁸² "Preterea venerabilis abbatissa Sallaberga, sentiens resolutionem sui corporis imminere, committit pastorem sollicitudinem filiae Anstrudi, post fugam nuptiarum suarum olim Deo sacratae, commoniens eam habere curam ovilis Christi"; MGH, Ibid.

⁸³ Three widowed abbesses - Rictrude, Sadalberga and Waldestrude - are outnumbered by thirteen virgin-abbesses.

Madalberta and Aldetrudis ⁸⁴, whom Aldegund brought up in the convent; and in order that they should choose to be nuns she taught them in the relevant doctrines from childhood. ⁸⁵ Both nieces subsequently became saints and abbesses at Maubeuge. Hucbald underlines how Aldetrudis in particular was groomed as Aldegund's successor: she is described as diligently studying to imitate her aunt's life and ways ⁸⁶ and in terms similar to those applied to the young Aldegund. ⁸⁷ Odilia also educated her brother's three daughters at Hohenburg one of whom, Eugenia, succeeded her. ⁸⁸

Nieces also lived at Gandersheim; but as Hathumoda had two sisters her abbacy, if not her sainthood, was inherited by Gerberga and then Christina. But Hathumoda had demonstrated her sanctity by espousing adherence to Benedictine precepts: she prohibited her nuns from eating with relatives or guests; all the nuns had to eat in the refectory in silence; everyone had to meet for prayer, and all had to work; nuns were not allowed to have their own cells or to have female servants; and they were not to meet with men, even the priest. ⁸⁹ Nuns were also forbidden from leaving the convent to visit relatives or

⁸⁴ These were the daughters of St. Waldestrude.

⁸⁵ "ut Dominum Christum sibi sponsum eligerent, ab ipsis infantiae rudimentis diligenter edocebat": PL132,col.868.

⁸⁶ "mater terae suae mores et vitam satagebat imitari"; PL132,col.868.

⁸⁷ "puella bonae indolis... quae cum multis floreret virtutibus"; PL132,col.868. Compare: "beata virgo Aldegundis de virtute in virtutem progrediens"; PL132,col.862. Elsewhere, Hucbald describes the young Rictrude as "puella bonae indolis"; Vita Rictrudis, PL132,col.833.

⁸⁸ Vita Odiliae, MGH SRM,6,c.19,pp.47-48. All three nieces became abbesses: Atala, who also became a saint, at St. Stephen's Strasbourg; Gundlinda at Neidermunster, and Eugenia at Hohenburg; Cardot, "Le pouvoir aristocratique et le sacré", pp.181-82.

⁸⁹ Vita Hathumodae, MGH SS,4,c.5,p.168.

their own property. ⁹⁰

However, the Benedictine Rule insisted on a free election. ⁹¹ Agius, the author of the Vita Hathumodae ⁹², describes in the obituary a vision where he saw Hathumoda who told him that she wished her sister Gerberga to succeed her. ⁹³ Significantly, Agius speaks of a liber which Hathumoda says should be given to her sister: Te Gerberg istum dixit habere librum. ⁹⁴ The liber represented not just the regula ⁹⁵ under which the convent had to live but also the new abbess' regimen. ⁹⁶ However, the liber may also have represented the Vita itself which described the abbatial model and also the lifestyle for the whole convent. If it was incorporated into the convent's liturgy ⁹⁷ it constituted not only a spiritual but also a practical guide. Certainly a divine vision was not to be ignored and provided a neat justification for

⁹⁰ MGH, Ibid, c.6,p.168. However, it is clear that the women had possessiones subiectae; and the Vita does not mention that they were ordered to give them up.

⁹¹ See pp.122-23 above.

⁹² Agius, who was a monk at Lamspringa barely ten miles from Gandersheim, may have been Hathumoda's brother; Pertz, MGH SS,4,p.165. But on Agius' description of himself as amicus as an intellectual friend/counsellor see H.J. Kamphausen, Traum und Vision in der lateinischen Poesie der Karolingerzeit, (Bern, 1975), p.162. The reference to a filiolus in the verse obituary may be to Agius himself; MGH, Ibid, l.555,p.186.

⁹³ MGH, Ibid, l.655-668,p.188.

⁹⁴ MGH, Ibid, l.665,l.678,p.188.

⁹⁵ regula nostra; MGH, Ibid, l.679,p.188.

⁹⁶ coenobii regimen: MGH, Ibid, l.678,p.188. On the interpretation of the "Buch motiv" as representing the Rule and the abbess' office see Kamphausen, Traum und Vision, p.678.

⁹⁷ The verse obituary is written as a series of responses between Agius and the nuns; MGH, Ibid, pp.176-89.

the automatic succession of a family member. ⁹⁸

[2] Nobility.

If "Familienklosterpolitik" explains the predominance of the abbess model, the nature of ninth-century monasticism explains the emphasis on nobility in hagiographical texts. That it was probably very rare for a non-noble woman to enter a convent is demonstrated by an episode in the Miracula Austrebertae. Here the abbess is punished with a fever by the saint for refusing a peasant girl entry to the community. ⁹⁹ However, the girl's eventual acceptance seems an exception which probably proves the rule.

This story is used to demonstrate the magnanimity of the saint, not to prove a point about the non-egalitarian nature of Frankish monasticism. For, if Vitae were intended as didactic texts to encourage converts to monasticism, their perception is mainly that these converts were aristocratic. The Vita Leobae comments that her example inspired multi nobiles et potentes viri to give their daughters to convents to live in a permanent state of virginity; multae matronae also took vows of continence to live a monastic life. ¹⁰⁰ The Vitae Herlindis et Renildis stated that, following the saints' example, multae nobilium hominum filiae took the nigrum velamen ¹⁰¹; and the Vita Hathumodae described how crowds flocked to Hathumoda's tomb for up to thirty days and how nobiliores came not only to mourn her but to dedicate their lives to God. ¹⁰²

⁹⁸ The Vita hints that Hathumoda's own election was not originally unanimous: "primo paucoribus, deinde pluribus sororibus est mater spiritalis et electa et constituta"; MGH, Ibid, c.4,p.168.

⁹⁹ ASS Feb. II,c.I,4,p.424.

¹⁰⁰ MGH SS,15.1,c.16,p.129.

¹⁰¹ ASS Mart. III,c.II,11,p.388.

¹⁰² MGH SS,4,c.26,p.175. Similarly, the Vita Sadalabergae exclaimed: "quis enim vir potens aut femina nobilis... qui non beatam Sadalbergam ex affectu diligeret"; MGH SRM,5,c.17,p.59.

Certainly all the abbess-saints were noble. The Vita Odililiae describes the saint's father as dux illustris ¹⁰³; the Vita also details how Odilia's grandfather had been a mayor of the palace. ¹⁰⁴ Nor is the hagiographer only preoccupied with the saint's male forbears; the nobility of Odilia's mother is also stressed.¹⁰⁵ Similarly, Agius describes how all of Hathumoda's ancestors on her paternal and maternal side were clarissimi ¹⁰⁶; it is also important that Hathumoda's brother, Bruno, had a king for a nephew through marriage and that a sister, Liutgard, had brought the family honour by marrying the son of a king. ¹⁰⁷ Nobility and status were mutually dependent with sanctity; the monastic model of Hathumoda as a good daughter is the principal image in this text, but the image of her sister as a good daughter contracting an illustrious marriage was perceived as worth including.

Through the advantage of nobility a saint could seem more saintly through the rejection of the wealth that accompanied nobility. The description of Anstrude who contempnit pompas mundi ¹⁰⁸ forms part of the virginity metaphor ¹⁰⁹; thus she rejects a suitor and instead takes

¹⁰³ MGH SRM,6,c.1,p.37.

¹⁰⁴ MGH, Ibid.

¹⁰⁵ "coniux... ex nobilissimis progenitoribus orta, nomine Persinda"; MGH, Ibid, c.2,p.38. The Vita Sadalbergae also stresses the nobility of the saint's mother, Saretrude: "Saretrude eleganti forma et nobili femina"; MGH SRM,5,c.4,p.53.

¹⁰⁶ Hathumoda's father was "ex illustrissimo Saxonum genere oriundus" whereas her mother "ex nobilissima aequae Francorum prosapia descendens, in prole nobilior effulsit"; MGH SS,4,c.2,p.167.

¹⁰⁷ MGH, Ibid. Liutgard married Louis son of Louis the German.

¹⁰⁸ Vita Anstrudis, MGH SRM,6,c.3,p.67.

¹⁰⁹ Hence she is likened to the wise virgins trimming their lamps; MGH, Ibid.

the anulus fidei ¹¹⁰ which binds her to the caelestis sponsus. ¹¹¹ However, the description of Hathumoda rejecting worldly things not only fits the topos of denial/virginity but reads like the rejection of the actual material trappings of the Saxon noblewoman. ¹¹²

Nobility was not a new prerequisite for sanctity; Sulpicius Severus' representation of St. Martin provided one of the most influential models. But ninth-century hagiographers seem particularly preoccupied with it. Queens are a special case as they acquired their own special status. However, the ninth-century Vita Balthildis plays down the saint's less than noble origins. The author of the A version of the Vita Balthildis merely says that she came ex genere Saxonum. ¹¹³ The author of the B version attributes to her a more noble background. ¹¹⁴ A spiritual nobility is also accorded in the reworked Vita which further raises Balthild's status. ¹¹⁵ There was a perceived difference between nobility as status and nobility as an inborn characteristic; but the two often

¹¹⁰ On the virgin's anulus fidei in the liturgy; see pp.227,234 below.

¹¹¹ MGH, Ibid.

¹¹² Hathumoda discards "vestes auro paratas, mitras, vittas, discriminalia, inaures, lunulas, monilia, armillas, dexteraliola, strophia et olfactoriola"; Vita Hathumodae, MGH SS,4,c.2,p.167. Opportuna also rejects marriage and the material trappings that accompany it—the gold and silver, the womanly jewellery, the slaves and slave girls that she was offered by multi praepotentes viri; Vita Opportunae, ASS Aprilis III,c.I,2,p.63.

¹¹³ MGH SRM,2,c.2,p.483.

¹¹⁴ "Claro namque sanguine, licet alterius serviret obsequiis, progenita Saxonum demonstrabatur"; MGH, Ibid.

¹¹⁵ Hence Balthild is described as beata virgo in the B Vita but not in the A Vita; MGH SRM,2,c.3,p.484. Also, rather than domna which is used in the A Vita, a variety of status-enhancing terms are used in the B Vita — beata mater: MGH, Ibid,c.4,p.487; sancta and sancta mater: MGH, Ibid, c.13,p.499; felix et sancta mater: MGH, Ibid, c.14,p.500. Sancta regina is used in the B Vita instead of domna Dei in the A Vita; MGH, Ibid, c.10,p.495.

went together. 116

Other saints whose origins were unclear or insufficiently aristocratic were also accorded nobility. Even Verena, whose fourth-century origins as a member of the Theban Legion were particularly obscure, was described as honestissimis parentibus primum orta. 117 This aristocratic attribution may be partly explained if this Vita was written by abbot Hatto of Reichenau for Richardis, wife of Charles the Fat, to read. 118

Liutbirga is a particularly interesting example of the value placed on nobility. She is described as virguncula

116 Abbess Tetta of Wimborne is described as noble, after all, "soror quippe regis erat"; nevertheless she was "morum autem probitate et sanctorum spectamine virtutum multo nobilior": Vita Leobae; MGH SS,15.1,c.3,p.123. Opportuna is similarly: "nobilis erat genere; sed nobilior fide: decora et pulchra facie, sed pulchrior mente et operatione"; Vita Opportunae, ASS Aprilis III, c.I,2,p.62. Compare the latter part of this description with the description of Waldestrude: "erat pulchra facie descoraque aspectu, sed pulchrior fide, pudicitia et castitate", Vita Waldestrudis, AS Belgii Selecta,4,c.I,3,p.441. The metaphor of beauty as a mirror of sanctity is a topos, but is a gendered one in these instances.

117 Vita Verenae,c.3,p.26.

118 "Haec filia illustrissima subinde legens, ut de merito professionis et castitatis tuae pariter cum beatissima Verena coronam aeternae remunerationis reportare possis, studiosissime perage"; Vita Verenae, c.13,p.30-31. Zürzach had been given to Richardis by her husband, Charles the Fat in 881; Reinle, Die heilige Verena, pp.14,21-22. The image of Verena, the chaste wife (because her betrothed, St. Maurice, was martyred) would have been particularly relevant for Richardis. In 887 she retired to the convent at Andlau. This followed her successful defence against Charles the Fat's public accusation of adultery when he stated that he had not slept with her in ten years; Richardis defended her innocence claiming that she was still a virgin and proved this by ordeal; Regino of Prüm, Chronicon, MGH SRG,50, s.a.887,p.127. This episode may evidence Charles' "internalisation... of the essentially monastic spirituality preached by the leaders of the Carolingian Reform... [so that] though born to secular power... [he] rejected the carnality it required"; J.L. Nelson, "A Tale of Two Princes: Politics, Text and Ideal in a Carolingian Annal", SMRH, 10, (1988), pp.105-41, at pp.119,132. The accusation against Richardis may have been prompted by her barrenness; and see Stafford, Queens, pp.94-6.

which may denote inferiority because of her young age, or that she was a foundling. ¹¹⁹ Liutbirga may not have been of exceptionally lowly status but she certainly did not have the illustrious background of the matrona Gisla. Gisla is described as the daughter of Hess who was one of the primores ac nobilissimi gentis and once he had been converted to Christianity, was given a comitatus and many honores by Charlemagne. ¹²⁰ The hagiographer is anxious to attribute Gisla's nobility to Liutbirga through her relationship with the family of Hess. Liutbirga is adopted by Gisla who takes her to live with her ¹²¹; then the dying Gisla requests her son Bernhard to adopt Liutbirga, whom she calls mea filia dilecta ¹²², and treat her as one of his own sisters. ¹²³ In Bernhard's household, Liutbirga is described as a secunda mater to the children of Bernhard's first wife Reginhilda ¹²⁴; and as genetrix and nutrix to his second wife and her children. ¹²⁵ In this way Liutbirga acquires (greater) nobility through her adopted family.

Although Liutbirga had been brought up in a convent she lived a part of her life in a lay household; here she is most commonly described as venerabilis or veneranda.¹²⁶ She only becomes ancilla or famula Dei/Christi on entering her cell at Wendhausen. ¹²⁷ Thus the presentation of her as servant is a topos associated with the monastic part of her life. In no way is her service as famula associated

¹¹⁹ Vita Liutbirgae, c.3,p.12.

¹²⁰ Ibid, c.1,p.10.

¹²¹ "permansit ergo in domo dominae"; Ibid, c.4,p.13.

¹²² Ibid, c.7,p.14.

¹²³ Ibid, c.7,pp.14-15.

¹²⁴ Ibid, c.8,p.15.

¹²⁵ Ibid, c.9,p.16.

¹²⁶ Ibid, c.8,9,10,13,16,pp.15-21.

¹²⁷ As a recluse she is described as venerabilis ancilla Dei; Ibid, c.22,p.25-26. Henceforth, she is called ancilla four and famula three times.

with the domestic arena where famula perhaps carried the wrong, as in non-noble, connotations for the ninth century. In this way Liutbirga presents a quite different model of sanctity from one current in fourteenth-century Italy where there was a rise in the number of female servant-saints.¹²⁸ There women with means might enter a convent whereas poor girls sought a virtuous solution through service.¹²⁹ Liutbirga demonstrates that in the ninth century nobility had to be acquired if it was not already perceived as innate, and that service as ancilla or famula could only be monastic which by definition was an aristocratic means of service to God. Perhaps the preoccupation with nobility partly explains why ancilla Dei does not figure frequently as an epithet in several Vitae compared to descriptions of virginity. For example

	<u>virgo</u>	or <u>sponsa</u> <u>Dei/Christi</u>	<u>famula</u> or <u>ancilla</u>	
Aldegund	55	6	5	
Anstrude	36	1	9	1
Glodesind	72	2	1	1
Hathumoda	1	1		
Herlindis/ Renildis	48			
Leoba	13			
Odilia	6	3	2	1
Opportuna	15	1	2	1
Verena	11			2
Waldburgis	77	1		
Wiborada	48			

[3] The Intercessor.

The relationship between the family and the convent is crucial in an understanding of the way so many of the saints are presented as intercessors.

¹²⁸ M. Goodich, "Ancilla Dei: The Servant as Saint in the Late Middle Ages", in J. Kirshner and S.F. Wemple (eds.) Women of the Medieval World, pp.119-36. See also A. Murray, concerning the increasing questioning from the eleventh to the early fourteenth centuries of the assumption that noble birth made for better Christians and the development of the saint "as the man (which I assume Murray uses as a generic term) without social class"; Reason and Society in the Middle Ages, (Oxford, 1978), at pp.333-49, 383-404.

¹²⁹ Goodich, Ibid, pp.121-22.

Intercession was not an exclusively monastic, familial service. Dhuoda exemplifies the role of intercession in a secular environment and the function of prayer for living and dead members of her family and also for the whole Christian community.¹³⁰ Leyser highlighted the intercessory role of tenth-century Saxon noblewomen and how it transcended the monastic/secular divide.¹³¹ Liutbirga exemplifies this latter point for ninth-century Saxony. Whilst living in Bernhard's household Liutbirga administered his familia and estates¹³²; but at the same time she continued to live a religious life constantly going to church every night to pray.¹³³ Bernhard tried to prevent her from going to church late at night because of the dangers of her being attacked by armed men.¹³⁴ But Liutbirga refused to comply saying that she had to spend her life in penance for the benefit of those who needed God's mercy - for Bernhard himself and to perpetuate the venerable memory of his mother.¹³⁵ Liutbirga then expressed the wish to return to Wendhausen.¹³⁶ She illustrates the point that movement between the convent and the secular world was possible, and that the same intercessory role was exercised by women in both spheres.

¹³⁰ Riché, Manuel, c.8, pp.306-324; and see Claussen, "Dhuoda's Liber Manualis", pp.46-47.

¹³¹ "whether they became ancillae dei and lived canonically or whether they endowed and ruled houses, without taking the veil, or remained mistresses of large households in the lay world... their works and prayers were felt to secure the successes of their menfolk, fathers, uncles, brothers, husbands and sons, in this life and they were responsible for the welfare of their souls in the next", Rule and Conflict, p.72.

¹³² Vita Liutbirgae; c.10, p.16. Similarly, Waldestrude "propriae domus curam gerebat" with constant prayer; Vita Waldestrudis, AS Belgii Selecta, 4, c.I, 5, p.441.

¹³³ Vita Liutbirgae; c.11, p.17.

¹³⁴ Ibid, c.12, pp.17-18.

¹³⁵ Ibid, c.14, p.20.

¹³⁶ Ibid, c.15, p.20.

In this instance the image presented by the male hagiographer, and reality, were the same.

Although nuns could not have a career structure as men did as abbots and bishops ¹³⁷ it is not true to say that they were "offered no career at all". ¹³⁸ This is an anachronistic construction ¹³⁹; further, the function of women as intercessors was their, very valuably regarded, "career". ¹⁴⁰

All the saints, including Liutbirga ultimately, fulfilled their intercessory role in a convent; the Vitae illustrate how living nuns and dead saints, were expected to intervene with the divine for their families' benefit. The author of the Vitae Herlindis et Renildis commented that the saints' parents founded Aldeneyk, "where their favoured daughters could pour out prayers for their (parents') sins to the immortal Lord". ¹⁴¹ That seven of the sample of saints are abbesses in parental foundations is explicable in this context and bears out Verdon's findings regarding the pattern of West Frankish convents founded for daughters of the aristocracy. ¹⁴²

It was also incumbent on monks to perform intercessions; but Leyser's argument that women had a specific function,

¹³⁷ Comparing the "careers" of Immena and her brother, bishop Rodulf of Bourges; Martindale, "The Nun Immena", pp.32-5.

¹³⁸ Martindale, Ibid, p.35.

¹³⁹ As Martindale admits, Ibid.

¹⁴⁰ Hence the image presented in one of Hathumoda's visions where she sees herself as a medium - suspended over the convent between earth and heaven; Vita Hathumodae, MGH SS, 4, c.12, p.170.

¹⁴¹ "in quo electae filiae ipsorum pro peccatis suis immortalī Domino funderent preces": Vitae Herlindis et Renildis, ASS Mart. III, c.I, 6, p.387.

¹⁴² For example, St. Maurice-la-Fougereuse (founded 820) and Sarrazac (founded 844); (also St. Sauveur de Narbonne and St. Genies des Mourgues in the tenth and early eleventh centuries); "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du sud", p.129, notes 98-101.

and particularly for their male relations, may be extended beyond the tenth-century Saxon context, to judge from some of the images in these hagiographical texts. In ninth-century Saxony Hathumoda is represented as having a special intercessory relationship with her father. In the obituary there are two vision-sequences concerning Hathumoda's father. In the first he is described as standing on a high wall (which may represent the wordly cares which have accumulated as an obstacle to his salvation); he successfully jumps to safety for which a choir gives thanks.¹⁴³ In the second sequence the Duke fears falling from a tall tree (which may symbolise the Liudolfing family); but alma Hathumoda appears and helps him on to a safe branch.¹⁴⁴ These episodes would seem to have been thought by the hagiographer to symbolise how Liudolf feared for the loss of his salvation which was secured through Hathumoda's intercession. The reference to a choir singing to give thanks¹⁴⁵ may symbolise that the whole community of Gandersheim, and not just the saint, was perceived to have a collective responsibility to pray for male members of the Liudolfing family.¹⁴⁶

The image of the saint and her convent interceding for male relations is not confined to Saxony. The Vita Odiliae describes how the saint has a vision where she sees her father in Hell; as a result of her vigils and prayers she is later rewarded when a voice from heaven informs her that on account of her intercession her father has been forgiven and he now resides with the company of patriarchs

¹⁴³ Vita Hathumodae, MGH SS, 4, 1.567-80, p.186.

¹⁴⁴ MGH, Ibid, 1.609-621, p.187.

¹⁴⁵ "Hic coetum magnum, versis faciebus ad ortum: Grates inde pio mox retulisse Deo"; MGH, Ibid, 1.579-80. A choir is also mentioned in the description of Hathumoda's premonition of her death where she sees a huge hole in the ground in the convent's church (the site of her tomb); MGH, Ibid, c.12, pp.170-71; this is a telling representation of the community's duty to perform the memoria.

¹⁴⁶ The force of these images would have been all the more powerful if the verse obituary, written in the form of responses, was incorporated into the convent's liturgy.

in heaven. ¹⁴⁷ The episode symbolises how the saint and also the whole community at Hohenburg were expected to intercede for the family in the period when the Vita was produced, but particularly for the male family members.

Significantly, although Adalric wanted Odilia killed at birth, she still continued to love the father who had rejected her. ¹⁴⁸ Odilia therefore exemplifies a rather grim determination to observe a Frankish spirituality which has been described in another context as a "religion de paternité". ¹⁴⁹ Daughter-saints such as Odilia and Hathumoda may be represented as having a special relationship with their fathers partly because they were abbesses. As such their status transcended their gender and they could correspond to their fathers in a way they could not with their mothers who did not have the same title and status as their husbands. ¹⁵⁰ Yet the intercessory role of these saints, and their convents, seems particularly gendered because of the filial relationship. Both Odilia and Hathumoda had a special relationship with their mothers: Odilia's life was saved by her mother, and Hathumoda's mother entered Gandersheim and nursed her daughter when she was ill. ¹⁵¹ But both saints are described as specifically interceding for their fathers. Hence Odilia who "reste toujours fille d'Adalricus" ¹⁵² exemplifies a particular view both of female sanctity and monasticism.

¹⁴⁷ Vita Odiliae, MGH SRM,6,c.12,p.44.

¹⁴⁸ MGH, Ibid, c.7,p.41.

¹⁴⁹ Concerning Dhuoda's view of a pious life; Riché, Manuel, p.27.

¹⁵⁰ Although Odilia's father is described as dux, her mother is merely called coniunx; MGH SRM,6,c.1-2,pp.37-38. Only in a later, fifteenth-century copy of the Vita is the mother called ducissa; MGH, Ibid, p.42.

¹⁵¹ Vita Hathumodae; MGH SS,4,c.17,p.172.

¹⁵² Cardot, "Le pouvoir aristocratique et le sacré au haut moyen âge", p.185.

[4] Passive and Independent.

It has been observed that, although the role of women in convents constituted a "domaine d'action privilégié pour les femmes", nevertheless it illustrates "une certaine "soumission" de la femme, dont la vie est toute entière consacrée au salut de l'homme".¹⁵³ The attribution of concepts of oppression and liberation is suspect for this period¹⁵⁴; in any case, the role of the female religious was couched in terms of service.¹⁵⁵ Further, the "submission" of these women is relative considering that, although women were conducting the memoria for the benefit of their male relations, they had a longer lifespan in which to do it in Saxony at least¹⁵⁶, and perhaps elsewhere.

Nevertheless, it is true that female saints are often portrayed in terms of their relationship with men, especially male saints. This partly occurs because many of the saints were sanctimoniales who required consecration often performed by saintly bishops.¹⁵⁷ Many of the women are defined through their kinship with male saints.¹⁵⁸

¹⁵³ M. Lauwers "Sainteté royale et sainteté féminine dans l'Occident médiéval" in RHE, 83, (1988), pp.58-69, at p.68.

¹⁵⁴ See Introduction above, pp.20-21.

¹⁵⁵ That is as ancilla or famula Christi/Dei; but within the confines of nobility: see pp.169-70 above.

¹⁵⁶ Leyser, Rule and Conflict, pp.52-58. Hathumoda's mother, Oda, was particularly long-lived at 107 years old; Pertz, MGH SS, 4, pp.166-67.

¹⁵⁷ For example, Herlindis and Renildis were consecrated by Boniface and Willibrord: Vita Herlindis et Renildis, ASS Mart. III,c.II,10,p.388; Rictrude was veiled by St. Amand: Vita Rictrudis, PL132 col.836; Verena took the veil from St. Cyprian: Vita Verenae, c.6,p.27; Waldestrude was veiled by St. Autbertus: Vita Waldestrudis, AS Belgii Selecta, 4,c.II,8,p.444.

¹⁵⁸ For example, Odilia's mother was the niece of St. Leudegar; Vita Odiliae, MGH SRM,6,c.2,p.38; Waldburgis was described in her relationship to her brothers Willibald and Willibrord: Miracula Waldburgis, Bk.I,c.1-3,pp.148-52; Verena is presented as the betrothed of St. Maurice: Vita Verenae, c.3-5,pp.26-27; the Vita Leobae reminds the reader that Boniface is her relation; MGH SS,15.1,c.10,

Some women saints enjoyed a spiritual relationship with a male saint or priest as their advisor.¹⁵⁹ The fact that Aldegund and Rictrude are described in relation to St. Amand was surely part of the intention of Hucbald, a monk at St. Amand, in the rewriting of these Vitae. Similarly, the representation in the late ninth-century Vita Chrothildis of the pivotal role of St. Remigius¹⁶⁰ was no doubt intended by the writer of this revised Vita, who probably came from the Rheims scriptorium, to boost the reputation of the see of Rheims. Bishop Adalhelm's emphasis on Opportuna's relationship to his predecessor, Chrodegang, would benefit the episcopal seat at Sées.

However, there is an image more gendered than simply propagandist. Female saints sometimes seem to have their sanctity conferred on them by men. This process worked literally where male ecclesiastics wrote and commissioned Vitae, but also figuratively. Odilia and Sadalberga were cured of blindness by Sts. Erhard¹⁶¹ and Eustatius¹⁶², respectively. They are therefore endowed with a physical sight as a metaphor for their spiritual insight. On other occasions the actions of female saints are controlled by spiritual or material benefactors. Leoba miraculously extinguished a fire that threatened to engulf the

p.126; Opportuna was the sister of Bishop Chrodegang: Vita Opportuna, ASS Aprilis III,c.I,2,p.62.

¹⁵⁹ For example, Aldegund was helped in the building of her convent at Maubeuge by Sts. Amand and Autbertus: Vita Aldegundis, PL132 col.867-67; Sadalberga was advised on the siting of the convent at Laon by St. Waldebert: Vita Sadalbergae, MGH SRM,5,c.14,p.57; Liutbirga had a spiritual relationship with Bishops Hemmo of Halberstadt and Anskar of Bremen; Vita Litubirgae, c.35,pp.43-44; Waldestrude was advised to enter a convent by St. Gaugericus: AS Belgii Selecta,4,c.I,5,p.442; and Agius was Hathumoda's spiritual advisor: Vita Hathumodae, MGH SS,4, c.11,p.170 and see Kamphausen, Traum und Vision, p.162.

¹⁶⁰ In the conversion and baptism of Clovis and persuading him to wage war against the Arian Goths; MGH SRM,2,c.7,8,pp.344-45. The Vita Remigius was rewritten by Hincmar, c.878; Aigrain, L'Hagiographie, p.306.

¹⁶¹ Vita Odiliae; MGH SRM,6,c.4,p.40.

¹⁶² Vita Sadalabergae; MGH SRM,5,c.4,p.53.

community; but, importantly, she sprinkled salt blessed by St. Boniface on water used to dampen the fire. 163

Liutbirga is presented as very independent-minded; she wins her argument with her patron Bernhard and Bishop Theotgrim so that she should be allowed to become a recluse. 164 The image of the articulate woman is significant 165 and to a degree illustrates that here "genre has triumphed over gender" 166; but even so, Liutbirga impresses through her humility. Variouslly she is described as speaking with a submissa vox 167 or a subiecta vox 168; her tears and sighs 169 deflect any perception of over-assertiveness, as do the references to her prostrating herself at Theotgrim's feet 170 and to the constantia of such a little woman. 171 Perhaps the reality of Liutbirga's free-speaking was changed the better to fit the topos of female humility.

However, a female saint could be presented as aggressively articulate in her role as a warrior against demons. In this context it is acceptable for Liutbirga to speak against the spirit of Satan with a formidula vox. 172 The image of the saint as the scourge of demons fits the classical image of the virago 173 - a term

163 Vita Leobae; MGH SS, 15.1, c.13, pp.127-28.

164 Vita Liutbirgae, c.13-22, pp.18-25.

165 In the role of magistra; see below, pp.179-82.

166 Nelson, "Women and the word", p.66.

167 Vita Liutbirgae, c.13, p.18.

168 Ibid, c.16, p.21.

169 Ibid, c.14, p.20.

170 Ibid, c.16, p.21.

171 Ibid, c.15, p.20.

172 Ibid, c.29, p.33.

173 M.L. Portmann, Die Darstellung der Frau in der Geschichtschreibung des früheren Mittelalters, (Basel, 1958), pp.134-37.

applied to Liutbirga. 174 Wiborada can also be classed as a virago as an imperterrita bellatrix. 175 Similarly, Opportuna is a virago since she is bellatrix Christi 176 and fortis bellatrix who defeats the devil in the form of an Ethiop saying, "You will not overcome the handmaiden of Christ as you overcame the first woman Eve". 177 The description of Opportuna as bellatrix taking on the scutum fidei, the lorica iustitiae and the gladius spiritus sancti 178 is also applied to Herlindis and Renildis. 179 These military metaphors were applied as part of the virginity topos. 180

The classical virago image entailed the appropriation of manly attributes. 181 Hence Goldesind resists marriage with manly fortitude. 182 But while a saint may be seen to take on manly strength over female weakness, this does not preclude such a saint displaying "female" characteristics if they are positive ones such as the maternal role

174 Vita Liutbirgae, c.5,p.13.

175 Vita Wiboradae, ASS Mai II,c.I,11,p.286 and see Portmann, Ibid, p.136.

176 Vita Opportunae, ASS Aprilis III,c.I,3,p.63.

177 ASS, Ibid, c.III,21,p.67; and see Nelson, "Women and the word", p.73. This episode may be drawing on the description of the vision of the early Christian martyr, Perpetua, where she sees herself as a man defeating Evil, again represented as an Ethiop, in gladiatorial combat; H. Musurillo (ed. and trans.), Acts of the Christian Martyrs, (Oxford, 1972), p.118.

178 ASS, Ibid, c.I,3,p.63.

179 Vitae Herlindis et Renildis; ASS Mart. III,c.II,10,p.388. The image is Pauline, taken from I Thessalonians v,8.

180 This was part of the image of the virgin as miles Christi; Bugge, Virginitas, pp.47ff. However, the married Waldestrude is similarly described as fighting the paterfamilias Beelzebub; AS Belgii Selecta, c.I,6,p.442.

181 In classical and early Christian traditions; Portmann, Die Darstellung der Frau, pp.12-20.

182 "patris iussis animo virili obluctans"; Vita Glodesindis, ASS Iulii, VI,c.I,6,p.211. And see Portmann, Die Darstellung der Frau, p.21.

exercised by Liutbirga. 183

[5] Magistra.

A strong image throughout the texts, where women are presented as equal with men is that of the teacher/intellectual. If images of female sanctity demonstrate that women had a "career" providing for the family's memoria, they also illustrate the women's function in convents as educators for living family members. All of the contemporary saints are portrayed as possessing great learning and/or the skills of an educator. We have already noted that Wiborada, having learnt Latin from her brother and as the teacher of St. Udalric, undermines the argument that women were excluded from teaching boys. 184 Hathumoda and Liutbirga also militate against the argument that convents played little part in the Carolingian Renaissance. Agius describes how Hathumoda applied herself to study as a child. 185 Later, as abbess of Gandersheim, she is described as magistra 186 instituting a rigorous educational programme for her nuns and exercising great patience as a teacher. 187

As Liutbirga behaved like a mother in Bernhard's household it is likely that she had responsibility for the teaching of the young in this familia in the same way as did Dhuoda. 188 The descriptions of her as genetrix and nutrix are not just nurturing terms but also refer to educating skills. Further, the hagiographer attributes to

183 See, pp.188-89, 364-65 below. Rictrude is also portrayed as a good mother in addition to her manly fortitude; for further discussion of the composite image of women as viragines who also display feminine virtues see pp.365-66 below.

184 See ch.2, n.312 above.

185 Vita Hathumodae; MGH SS,4,c.2,p.167.

186 MGH, Ibid, 1.49,p.177

187 MGH, Ibid, c.9,p.169-70.

188 See pp.363-65 below.

Liutbirga thirty scriptural quotations in a lengthy oral defence of her wish to become a recluse.¹⁸⁹ Much of these should be read as topoi; it is nevertheless significant that this image of learning is attributed to a woman. Once Liutbirga was at Wendhausen, many erudite abbots and bishops, including Bishop Hemmo and Archbishop Anskar of Bremen came to converse with her.¹⁹⁰ Strict cloistering here was not a barrier to the exchange of learned discourse between women and men.

Not only the new saints but many of the revised models of sanctity, still relevant for the ninth century, stress the image of the educated woman. As we have noted, Odilia and Aldegund were entrusted with their nieces' education. These nieces exemplify how family members were trained as successors for the position of abbess; but, equally, some young women (such as the filiolae at Gandersheim) may have received an education and not remained in the convent.¹⁹¹ This function of convents in the ninth century helps to explain why "educated noblewomen of high rank were... not unusual in the Carolingian period".¹⁹²

Leoba was also portrayed as a learned magistra. She is described as knowing the Bible by heart as well as the writings of the Church fathers, the decrees of the councils and the whole of ecclesiastical law.¹⁹³ Moreover, she limited her own and her nuns' asceticism so that it would not overly affect their pursuit of knowledge - an interesting perception of the role of a late eighth-century Frankish convent.¹⁹⁴ The vision-sequence where Leoba sees a ball of purple thread coming out of her mouth

¹⁸⁹ Vita Liutbirgae, c.13-21, pp.18-25.

¹⁹⁰ Ibid, c.35, pp.43-44.

¹⁹¹ "L'éducation qu'elle reçoit la prépare autant à une vie séculière qu'à une vie religieuse"; Parisse, "Les femmes au monastère", p.322.

¹⁹² McKitterick, The Carolingians, p.226.

¹⁹³ Vita Leobae; MGH SS, 15.1, c.11, p.126.

¹⁹⁴ MGH, Ibid, c.11, p.126.

and which "signifies the mystery of divine teaching which is set in motion by the words and deeds of those who give instruction" ¹⁹⁵ may well represent "Leoba's own conception of her religious role". ¹⁹⁶ But importantly, she was so good a teacher that afterwards there was hardly a convent in that region where one of her pupils was not a magistra. ¹⁹⁷ Learning is therefore perceived as integral to female monastic life, and not just pertaining to saints as a topos. Similarly, The Vita Herlindis et Renildis describes the sisters teaching other women in the convent¹⁹⁸ and the active convent scriptorium. ¹⁹⁹

Some of this evidence has its roots in the topos of the wise figure, full of insight; hence the magistra Hathumoda is credited with sophia and likened to the biblical figures, Anna and Holda. ²⁰⁰ But, in view of the argument that convents declined as centres of education in the ninth century ²⁰¹, it is significant that images of the learned woman are stressed at the same time. The ninth-century Vita Balthildis places an emphasis on wisdom not present in the earlier version. ²⁰² Aldegund is also

¹⁹⁵ MGH, Ibid, c.8,p.125; with translation from C.H. Talbot, The Anglo-Saxon Missionaries in Germany, (London, 1954), p.212.

¹⁹⁶ Nelson, "Women and the word", p.66.

¹⁹⁷ "quae ad exemplum beatae magistrae caelestis disciplinae studiis instituebantur et in tantum doctrina eius proficiebant, ut plures ex illis postmodum magistrae fierent aliarum, ita ut nulla aut etiam rara in illis regionibus essent monasteria feminarum, quae non discipularum eius magisteria desiderarent": MGH SRM,15.1, c.11,p.126.

¹⁹⁸ "interdum vero scribentes, nonnumquam legentes, ceterasque sorores docentes"; ASS Mart. III,c.II,9,p.388.

¹⁹⁹ See pp.135-36 above.

²⁰⁰ Vita Hathumodae, MGH SS,4,1.142,299-300,pp.178,181.

²⁰¹ Wemple, Women, pp.187-88.

²⁰² Balthild herself is described as sagax puella in the B but not in the A Vita [MGH SRM,2,c.3,p.484] and her little companion described as vilissima ancillula in the A Vita becomes sagax ancillula in the B Vita [MGH, Ibid, c.11,p.496]. This latter example also demonstrates the

endowed with wisdom by Hucbald to a degree not present in the early ninth-century Vita.²⁰³

[6] The Virgin/Sponsa Dei.

Virginity was one of the oldest and most enduring topoi for both men and women from the fourth century onwards²⁰⁴ and the image predominates amongst this sample of saints.

There are seventeen virgin-saints and only five married or widowed saints, including two queens. All the new saints are virgins; all the widows or married women saints date from the seventh century, apart from the sixth-century Chrothildis, and feature in revised texts. These statistics are significant in an assessment of ninth-century female monasticism. Virginity was the most "heroic" state for a saint.²⁰⁵ That the ninth century affirmed the virgin abbess as a dominant image underlines the point that the Frankish Church regarded monasticism as heroic and an attractive alternative to marriage. The prevalence of this image also demonstrates the perception that the abbess was the equivalent of the abbot who was not likely to be a widower. That widows only constitute a small proportion of the total, and that they all date from an earlier period demonstrates the trend evidenced in other sources²⁰⁶ that widows were regarded as having a lower status in relation to virgins than they had in the Merovingian period.

move away from images of lowly origins.

²⁰³ She is described as virgo sapiens [PL132 c.20,col.869]; as virgo prudentissima [PL132 Ibid]; and as virgo prudens [PL132 c.27,col.872;c.28,col.873].

²⁰⁴ Its origins in gnostic and patristic thought, and the belief that "the cloister brought the ideal of virginal perfection", are outlined by Bugge, Virginitas, pp.16-29,30.

²⁰⁵ It was traditionally thought to be superior to marriage, according a higher level of knowledge and divine insight, Bugge, Ibid, pp.70-72,76.

²⁰⁶ See p.131 above; pp.228-30 below.

Virginity was supposedly "beyond gender" ²⁰⁷ since a man could also be wedded to Christ as a monk, following the vita angelica. ²⁰⁸ Nevertheless, the presentation of the virgin/abbess-saint is gendered. For although abbot-saints were also supposed to be chaste they are not defined as virgines to the degree that many female saints are.²⁰⁹ For example, the ninth-century Vita Wigberti refers to this abbot-saint as sanctus ²¹⁰, beatus ²¹¹ or simply sacerdos ²¹² but there is no reference to virginity. Similarly Ardo's Life of Benedict of Aniane describes the saint most frequently as vir Dei, venerabilis pater or vir but not as virgo. ²¹³ There is, in ninth-century Vitae, the concept of male religious rejecting marriage - the Vita Rictrudis describes how Rictrude's son, Maurontus, nuptias fugiens tondetur. ²¹⁴ But the application of virgo to female saints ²¹⁵ is striking and gender-specific.

The concept of choice between marriage and the cloister is anachronistic as the hagiographical images show.

²⁰⁷ Nelson, "Women and the word", p.59.

²⁰⁸ "When the monk dons his habit it denotes his assumption of the role of an angel"; Bugge, Virginitas, pp.30-35.

²⁰⁹ Bugge argued that was a greater tendency in patristic writings to attribute the term virgo to female virgins, and hence male virgins were subsequently more often described as miles christi; Ibid, pp.59-66,79. The developing cult of the Virgin Mary in the ninth century also may partly explain the attribution of terms of virginity more frequently to women; Bugge, Ibid, p.148.

²¹⁰ Vita Wigberti, MGH SS,2,c.16,19,p.42.

²¹¹ MGH, Ibid, c.10,p.41.

²¹² MGH, Ibid, c.5,p.39.

²¹³ Vir Dei (Vita Benedicti, MGH SS,15.1,c.4,35,38, 40, pp.203, 215-18); venerabilis pater (MGH, Ibid, prologue, c.17,30, pp.200,205-6,213); venerabilis vir (MGH, Ibid, c.1,13,19,24,29,30, pp.201,205,208,210-13).

²¹⁴ Vita Rictrudis, PL132,cols.841-42.

²¹⁵ See p.170 above.

Daughters ²¹⁶ were completely dependent on their parents. Odilia's life and certainly her career as a nun depended on her father: he allows her to take the veil, founds Hohenburg, and provides her with resources to the sum of the stipend for one ancilla every day. ²¹⁷ Hathumoda is presented as wishing to pursue a religious life from an early age, but when she does take the veil it is cum parentum voluntate. ²¹⁸ Leoba's converts to monasticism are dedicated by their fathers, not described as making an independent vocational choice. ²¹⁹

Even alongside the topos of chastity and rejection of marriage, parental approval is shown to be important. The Vita Glodesindis describes how the saint sought sanctuary at St. Stephen's, Metz; but her parents are ultimately reconciled to Glodesind's "decision". ²²⁰ But Glodesind is unhappy at having to deceive her parents ²²¹; the image of the dutiful daughter was therefore maintained.

[7] Maternal and Domestic Images.

If virginity was praised, there runs throughout the Vitae a strong vein of maternal imagery applied to both types of women - married and unmarried. The image of the maternal virgin was partly based on the Virgin Mary so that in this sense it is gender-specific to women. However, it is concomitantly a part of the image of abbess as mother. Mater outstrips virgo in the number of times it is applied to some virginal abbess-saints. ²²² The term sancta mater is not new to the ninth century: it describes abbess-

²¹⁶ On wives choosing monasticism see pp.270-72 below.

²¹⁷ vita Odiliae, MGH SRM,6,c.8,9,p.42.

²¹⁸ vita Hathumodae, MGH SS,4,c.3,p.167.

²¹⁹ See n.100 above.

²²⁰ vita Glodesindis, ASS Iulii VI,c.I,11,p.204.

²²¹ "noluit illuc ire iuxta conductum patris"; ASS Iulii VI,c.I,9,p.204.

²²² See p.160 above.

saints in the Merovingian period. ²²³ However, ninth-century texts have extended descriptions of this maternal characteristic.

At the beginning of the Vita Leobae there is a long passage dealing with Leoba's first abbess, Tetta, at Wimborne, concluding with a description of Leoba's relationship as a spiritual daughter to this venerable mother. ²²⁴ Leoba herself was described as a maternal figure ensuring, for example, that her nuns got sufficient sleep in the summer. ²²⁵ Hathumoda demonstrated maternal affection in the way that she cared for the sick nuns when the monastery was struck down with some kind of contagious disease. ²²⁶ The fact that the Vita Leobae was dedicated to Hathumoda may indicate that Agius read and partially imitated some of the images in Rudolf of Fulda's text.

However, this kind of care for the sick was exactly what an abbess was enjoined to do according to the reform legislation. ²²⁷ Therefore some of the nurturing imagery when applied to abbess-saints stems from their office. The description of Hathumoda as haec soror, haec mater, haec nutrix atque magistra, haec abbatissa, haec domina²²⁸ differentiates "mother" from "abbess". Further, the image of the sancta mater as the nurturing abbatial figure is not entirely gender-specific: it is a topos of male Vitae. Paschasius Radbertus used the imagery of breasts in the Vita Adalhardi, to describe how the abbot spiritually

²²³ For example, Rusticula is described as sancta mater; Vita Rusticulae, MGH SRM, 4, c. 21, p. 348.

²²⁴ "Haec de venerabili matre Tetta eiusque virtutibus dicta sufficient, nunc ad explicanda spiritalis filiae eius Leobae virginis gesta secundum propositum stilus vertatur"; Vita Leobae, MGH SS, 15.1, c. 5, p. 124.

²²⁵ MGH, Ibid, c. 11, p. 126.

²²⁶ Vita Hathumodae; MGH SS, 4, c. 10, p. 170.

²²⁷ IS; MGH Conc. II i, c. 23, p. 454.

²²⁸ Vita Hathumodae, MGH SS, 4, 1. 49-50, p. 177.

nourished his monks. ²²⁹ Ardo's description of Benedict of Aniane has close parallels with the description of Hathumoda: erat quasi nutrix forans iuvansque, atque ab omnibus amabatur ut pater, venerabatur ut dominus, reverabatur ut magister. ²³⁰ That Hathumoda is described in similar terms to Benedict suggests that regular abbesses such as she were perceived equivalent to abbots.

The terms nutrix and domina (as the equivalent of dominus) are therefore not gender-specific but they do have a monastic application. Both terms are applied to Balthild because of their association with queenly offices, and therefore of regal status. Balthild was the ultimate nutrix in her role as administrator of the palace. ²³¹ She is described as pia nutrix in the B Vita ²³²; the optima nutrix in the A Vita is not used in the B Vita suggesting that in the ninth century the image of the nutrix was more closely associated with the abbatial office.

The term domina or domna is also ambiguous. It had associations with regal office; hence Balthild is described as domna in the palace. ²³³ She is also repeatedly called domna once she has entered the convent at Chelles.²³⁴ However, Bertila is also called domna abbatissa both in

²²⁹ Vita Adalhardi, PL120, cols.1543-1544.

²³⁰ Vita Benedicti, MGH SS,15.1,c.19,p.208. The description has parallels with the Benedictine Rule which outlines the characteristics the abbot should display: "dirus magisterii, pius patris ostendat affectum"; McCann, The Rule of St. Benedict, c.2,p.20

²³¹ Vita Balthildis, MGH SRM,2,c.4,pp.485-87.

²³² MGH, Ibid, c.4,p.486.

²³³ Especially in her role as regent and peace-maker: "Et credimus, quia, Deo gubernante, iuxta domne Balthildis magnam fidem accidit, ut ipsa tria regna, que antea dissidebant discordia, tunc inter se tenerent pacis concordiam"; Vita Balthildis, MGH SRM,2,c.5,pp.487-88.

²³⁴ MGH, Ibid, c.7,10,13,14,19,pp.490-91,495,498,500,507.

the Vita Balthildis ²³⁵ and in the Vita Bertilae. ²³⁶ The term therefore has a dual meaning. ²³⁷ The Vita Chrothildis uses the terms beata or sancta regina ²³⁸ but does not use the term domna. Chrothildis did not live in a convent as did Balthild; although when she is described as building monasteries she is called famula or electa Dei. ²³⁹ Therefore both domna and regina were interchangeable ²⁴⁰ perhaps because the statuses of an abbess and a retired queen were perceived to have equal worth. But ninth-century Vitae illustrate that domna was also perceived as an essentially abbatial descriptive term, as applied, for example, to Hathumoda.

It has been argued that beginning in the ninth century a new type of female saint appeared, exemplified by Liutbirga, Maura, Herlindis and Renildis, and Wiborada who in response to the curtailing of women's public roles "glorified the private role or cult of domesticity".²⁴¹ But this "trend" is not so apparent if these saints are looked at carefully. ²⁴² The monastic environment of the

²³⁵ MGH, Ibid, c.8,p.491.

²³⁶ MGH SRM,6,c.4,pp.105-106. Here Balthild is also described as mater domna and as domna regina.

²³⁷ Radegund is the model for the close association of regina and domna. Fortunatus calls Radegund domina in the sense of both abbess and queen; Vita Radegundis, MGH SRM,2,c.36,p.375. Baudonivia also calls Radegund sancta domina; MGH, Ibid, II, Prologue, p.377.

²³⁸ A total of ten times; MGH SRM,2,pp.342-48.

²³⁹ MGH, Ibid, c.12,p.347.

²⁴⁰ As is illustrated by the early eleventh-century Vita Mathildis Posterior where Corbet estimated that regina and domina were used in 46% of cases out of the total number of descriptive terms, Les saints ottoniens, p.209.

²⁴¹ Schulenburg, "Public and Private Roles", pp.117-8.

²⁴² Maura can not now be counted as evidence for the ninth century; see ch.1 n.215 and n.25 above. Verena has also been cited as an example of domestic virtues in her role as priest's housekeeper; Wemple, Women, p.146, note 106, p.277. However, the evidence for this role comes from the Vita Posterior dated by Reinle to the late tenth century; Die heilige Verena, p.23 and text, pp.38-43. The

writers and the audiences of the Lives throws light on some of the maternal imagery applied to these saints.

Wemple argued that Liutbirga is representative of a new model of domestic sanctity since "her activities... took place within the strict confines of a woman's role".²⁴³ But Liutbirga's mobility from convent to noble household back to convent, as well as her role as an intellectual, challenges this anachronistic description of her as "domestic". If her sainthood was a reward for "socially constructive behaviour" ²⁴⁴ Liutbirga, encompasses a variety of ninth-century "womanly" roles, illustrating that the secular/religious divide was often crossed.

In Bernhard's household Liutbirga occupies a maternal role in its parenting, caring manifestation. As a second mother ²⁴⁵ she is described as dispensing love: genetrix et nutrix. ²⁴⁶ The image of Liutbirga, as mediator, healing rifts within the family may be a topos, related to the image of the queens as mediators ²⁴⁷; but this may have a particular relevance to a Saxon context if Leyser's description of rivalrous Saxon families is borne in mind.²⁴⁸ In Bernhard's absence Liutbirga cared for the household as

Bollandists, unaware of Hatto's authorship, and whose version was used by Wemple, put Hatto's late ninth-century Vita Prior and the later Vita together as one text as Capitula I and II; ASS Sep. I, pp.164-68. The Miracula are early eleventh century; Reinle, Ibid, p.23.

²⁴³ Wemple, Women, p.145.

²⁴⁴ Wemple, Ibid, p.171.

²⁴⁵ Vita Liutbirgae; c.8,p.15.

²⁴⁶ Ibid, c.9,p.16.

²⁴⁷ Compare the description of Balthild, n.233, On the motif of queens as peacemakers; Stafford, Queens, pp.29,44-45. See also the description of the noble/royal wife as "peaceweaver" and mediatrix; M.J. Enright, "Lady with a Mead-Cup. Ritual, Group Cohesion and Hierarchy in the Germanic Warband", FMS, 22, (1988), pp.170-203, at pp.189,201-03.

²⁴⁸ Rule and Conflict, p.57.

a fidelis dispensatrix ²⁴⁹ so well that both sexes in the household loved her like a mother. ²⁵⁰ Bernhard addressed her as dilecta mater nostra Liutbirga and carissima mater.²⁵¹ Her role here is similar to the way in which Bernard of Septimania entrusted his estates to his wife Dhuoda.²⁵² Thus Liutbirga indeed functions in a "domestic" setting.

It is also true that Liutbirga excelled herself in textile crafts - traditionally women's skills. Significantly, however, she pursued her skills both in Gisla's household handing on the crafts to proceres and matronae who came to her ²⁵³ and also in her cell at Wendhausen. ²⁵⁴ Textile-work can hardly be called a "domestic" skill practised in the convent. ²⁵⁵ Herlindis and Renildis are praised for their skills in the making of richly decorated clothes ²⁵⁶; but again they practised these skills in the convent. Nor does the fact that Wiborada provided her brother's clothing ²⁵⁷ designate her as a domestic model since this function also had its monastic context ²⁵⁸; further, the reference to Wiborada's

²⁴⁹ Vita Liutbirgae; c.10,p.16.

²⁵⁰ Ibid, c.8,p.15.

²⁵¹ Ibid, c.12,p.17.

²⁵² Riché, Manuel, c.X,4,pp.351-53.

²⁵³ Vita Liutbirgae, c.6,pp.13-14.

²⁵⁴ Ibid, c.36,p.44.

²⁵⁵ Particularly when the seventh-century abbess-saint Eustadolia was praised for her embroidery skills; Schulenburg, "Public and Private Roles", p.111. The exercise of such "seemingly domestic skills" by queens also had application in the public/political sphere through the production of the aula regis; Jane Hyam, "Ermentrude and Richildis", p.157; Stafford, Queens, pp.107-8.

²⁵⁶ Vitae Herlindis et Renildis, ASS Mart. III,c.II,12,p.388.

²⁵⁷ The verb used is "destinavit" which could imply either that she bought the clothes or made them; Vita Wiboradae, ASS Mai I,c.I,5,p.284.

²⁵⁸ The IS refers to sanctimoniales being given wool and flax to make their clothes; MGH Conc. II i,c.13,p.447.

particular skill in the making of book-covers hardly denotes domestic skills so much as those useful in a scriptorium.²⁵⁹ Wiborada was essentially defined by her hagiographer as a martyr.²⁶⁰ The multiple images imposed on saints makes it difficult to understand any of them in terms of a single type.²⁶¹

Liutbirga demonstrates that her role as a domestic model is in fact rooted in the monastic tradition. The running of a noble household was probably very similar to an abbess administering her familia; in house convents the differences between the two would seem even less. But significantly, Liutbirga is described as imposing a regimen on the household.²⁶² Resonances of monastic office implied here are underlined by the description of Liutbirga as dispensatrix since she is in fact called custos atque fidelis dispensatrix.²⁶³ The term custos also had a monastic application.²⁶⁴ Elsewhere maternal imagery is resonant as much of monasticism as of mothering in the domestic sphere. Hatto of Reichenau describes the virgin Verena proselytising amongst the Alemanian people: ut mater virginuum praeposita.²⁶⁵ The association with the monastic office is quite intentional since the praeposita, like the custos, was one of the monastic officers who assisted the abbess.²⁶⁶

²⁵⁹ ASS, Ibid, c.I,5,p.284.

²⁶⁰ She is called martyr seven times.

²⁶¹ As is implicitly acknowledged by Schulenburg in her use of the Vita Herlindis et Renildis to categorise its eighth-century subjects as builder saints for the eighth century but as domestic models for the ninth; "Public and Private Roles", pp.111,117-18.

²⁶² "ut domus penes eam regimen constiterit penitus"; Vita Liutbirgae, c.8,p.15.

²⁶³ Ibid, c.10,p.16.

²⁶⁴ IS; MGH Conc. II i, c.15,p.448. The custos is also referred to in the Vita Hathumodae; MGH SS 4,c.20,p.173.

²⁶⁵ Vita Verenae, c.8,p.28.

²⁶⁶ IS; MGH Conc. II i, c.24,p.454. The Vita Hathumodae also mentions this office; MGH SS,4,c.20,p.173.

A distinction between maternal imagery and the monastic model can be seen in the Vita Sadalbergae where the hagiographer distinguishes between the saint's two roles—before and after she became an abbess. When Sadalberga was a mother in the biological sense, but before she became an abbess, she is described as christianissima femina ²⁶⁷, famula Christi ²⁶⁸ or beata ²⁶⁹ which could apply to a woman in or outside the cloister. Only when she has become abbess is she described as beata et venerabilis mater, venerabilis mater and sancta mater. ²⁷⁰ Maternal imagery may have had overlapping monastic and nurturing symbolism. ²⁷¹ Yet a decoding of the images via a monastic interpretation warns us against seeing these particular saintly images simply as gender-specific in a "domestic" sense. ²⁷²

[8] Women Saints as Images for Women.

Once the saint had died, the image of her intercessory powers to enlist patrocinium for the benefit of all Christians helped to increase the popularity of her cult. This explains the intention behind many revised Vitae and additions to others. The Miracula of Waldburgis attested to the saint's wide area of influence with (especially noble) pilgrims coming to Monheim from Alemania, Thuringia and the Frankish kingdoms. ²⁷³

²⁶⁷ Vita Sadalbergae, MGH SRM, 5, c.11, p.55.

²⁶⁸ MGH, Ibid, c.11, p.56.

²⁶⁹ MGH, Ibid, c.12, p.56.

²⁷⁰ MGH, Ibid, c.19, 20, pp.61-62.

²⁷¹ Hence the description of Waldestrude in the convent at Mons casting out a demon from a young boy: "erat misericordissima, doloribus compatiens maternis". Once cured, the boy, "materna solito more suxit ubera"; Vita Waldestrudis, AS Belgii Selecta, 4, c.III, 14, pp.447-48.

²⁷² For further comments on the theme of the "good mother/nurturer"; see pp.364-67 below.

²⁷³ On the provenance of the pilgrims see Bauch, Ein bayerisches Mirakelbuch, pp.124-135. Heinzelmann also commented on the widespread influence of Waldburgis' cult;

Patrocinium in its widest sense benefitted all who prayed to a saint ²⁷⁴; but a saint's protection was often invoked specifically for the monastic community with which she was associated. Wiborada provided protection for the monks of St. Gall when she saw the invading Hungarians in a vision and warned the abbot of St. Gall so that the monks escaped to safety although she remained to be martyred.²⁷⁵ However, she is unusual amongst the saints studied here; the majority of them were associated with convents so that their protection was afforded mainly to women.

During the saint's lifetime Leoba demonstrated miraculous physical protection for the convent, first extinguishing a fire and then a thunderstorm. ²⁷⁶ Anstrude also protected her nuns first from attack by the king's man Ebroin ²⁷⁷; from an attempt to kill the abbess herself ²⁷⁸; from an attack by a local nobleman ²⁷⁹; and finally from the encroaching greed of the local bishop of Laon, Madelgar. ²⁸⁰ This ninth-century text demonstrates, therefore, an enduring concern with the physical protection of the convent ²⁸¹; and also that convents were economically vulnerable to greedy local potentates - lay

her relics were regarded by Charles the Simple in 916 as pro tutamento totius regni; Translationsberichte, p.34.

²⁷⁴ The Vita Herlindis et Renildis describes how true faith was sought and found (in the form of miracles) when the patrocinia Virginuum was invoked; ASS Mart. III, c. IV, 25, p. 391.

²⁷⁵ Vita Wiboradae, ASS Mai I, c. II, 25, p. 289.

²⁷⁶ Vita Leobae, MGH SS, 15.1, c. 13, 14, pp. 127-28.

²⁷⁷ Vita Anstrudis, MGH SRM, 6, c. 12-13, pp. 71-2.

²⁷⁸ MGH, Ibid, c. 14, p. 72.

²⁷⁹ MGH, Ibid, c. 15, pp. 72-73.

²⁸⁰ MGH, Ibid, c. 16, p. 73.

²⁸¹ See pp. 114; 125 above. The ninth-century Vita Sadalbergae also refers to the concern to make the convent physically safe from outside incursions; MGH SRM, 5, c. 14, p. 57.

and ecclesiastic. 282

Guarding the convent's resources is a recurring theme well illustrated by two cautionary tales in the Vita Glodesindis. In the first episode, an unfortunate nun allowed a mouse to get into the saint's tomb where it devoured one of the digits on the saint's right foot; the mouse was got rid of when the abbess and her nuns saw blood streaming from the holy foot. 283 In the second story, the nun Duda, who was the custodian, dared to give some of the saint's holy oil to another convent and to her brother's church; Duda was punished with insanity and only recovered when all the holy oil was returned. 284 Clearly relics, and resources generally, were to be properly managed and reserved for the saint's own familia.

If the saint protected the convent as a community, the texts also illustrate the protection of its individual members. It has been observed that the malign influence of the Frankish aristocracy on convents in the ninth century resulted in their functioning as "asylums for the handicapped, retarded and mentally disturbed". 285 Convents undoubtedly housed a number of physically and mentally ill people. The Vita Anstrudis details a number of miracles which all concern nuns several of whom seem to have been in the convent since childhood. A certain Oda had been possessed with demons; she had lived in the convent for fifteen years before the saint's voice cured her. 286 Other women suffered from blindness 287, dropsy

282 The Vita Sadalberga also describes how the dying saint confirmed charters securing conventual lands usurped by her own brother; MGH SRM, 5, c.29, p.66.

283 ASS Iulii VI, c.II, 17, p.205.

284 ASS, Ibid, c.V, 41-42, p.209.

285 Wemple, Women, p.171.

286 Vita Anstrudis, MGH SRM, 6, c.28, pp.75-76.

287 MGH, Ibid, c.26, 27, p.75.

288, paralysis 289, dumbness 290 and severe bleeding.²⁹¹ These miracles are partly based on biblical models. The fact that convents are represented in this way was not necessarily seen to detract from their aura of heroic sanctity, but was perceived by hagiographers to denote it. Sanctity and social function were not mutually exclusive; convents were required to care for the sick. ²⁹²

Often, following a translation, the first miracle would be experienced by a nun ²⁹³; this would act as confirmation of the saint's powers and as publicity for potential lay beneficiaries. Significantly, cures predominate amongst the miracles ²⁹⁴; but amongst these the distribution by gender amongst lay men and women is significant. Rouché noted that laymen predominate amongst the cures in the texts he looked at. ²⁹⁵ Part of the explanation for these figures may lie in the fact that

²⁸⁸ MGH, Ibid, c.31,p.76.

²⁸⁹ MGH, Ibid, c.24,32,pp.75-56.

²⁹⁰ MGH, Ibid, c.27,p.75.

²⁹¹ MGH, Ibid, c.29,p.76.

²⁹² See p.136 above. The Vita Odiliae describes the care the saint took in the location of Hohenburg's hospital, building it at the bottom of a hill, rather than at the top next to the convent, so that pilgrims and the sick would be able to get there easily; MGH SRM,6,c.14, p.44-45.

²⁹³ As in the Miracula Austrebertae [ASS Feb. II, c.I,5,p.424] and the Vita Glodesindis [ASS Iulii VI,c.II, 15,p.205].

²⁹⁴ For example, in the Miracula Austreberta 20 out of a total of 25 miracles are cures; and in the Vita Glodesindis 38 out of a total of 42 miracles are cures. Michel Rouché also came to this conclusion in his survey of ninth-century hagiographical texts, estimating that cures made up 73.5% of miracles and of these, cures of paralysis made up 41.6%; "Miracles, maladies et psychologie de la foi à l'époque carolingienne en Francie", in P. Riché and E. Patlagean, (eds.), Hagiographie cultures et sociétés, pp.319-35 and Tableau I and II.

²⁹⁵ Male recipients predominated with the exception of cures performed by St. Wandrille where laywomen exceeded men [20 : 14]; otherwise laymen constituted 56.9% of the recipients of cures; Rouché, Ibid.

laymen had a greater degree of access to the shrines of the saints considered by Heinzelmänn which all happened to be at monasteries. Thus Rouche explains the figures as the result of monastic misogyny which was reinforced in the Carolingian period. ²⁹⁶

It was more difficult for women to gain access to male saints' shrines, as is illustrated by the story of the lay woman who dressed as a man in order to get near to the shrine of St. Calais. ²⁹⁷ However, the figures may be explained, if laywomen more frequently patronised female saints in convents where access was more readily granted. Hence it has been noted that half of the pilgrims in the Miracula Waldburgis were women. ²⁹⁸ In other sets of Miracula concerning women saints, the figures are more striking. Of nineteen individual cures in the Miracula Austreberta three were experienced by laymen and ten by laywomen. ²⁹⁹ Of a total of 36 named recipients of cures performed by Glodesind, ten were experienced by laymen and twenty-seven by laywomen. ³⁰⁰

In view of these figures, it is perhaps odd that female maladies do not figure greatly ³⁰¹ although they are not entirely absent. ³⁰² However, whilst acknowledging the biblical metaphors underlying the description of many cures, the hagiographers were still presenting the image of women saints providing special healing for laywomen. Undoubtedly a motive behind the presentation of the female

²⁹⁶ Rouche, Ibid, pp.321-22.

²⁹⁷ Rouche, Ibid; and pp.140-41 above.

²⁹⁸ Half of a total of 78 were women; Nelson, "Les femmes et l'évangélisation", p.480.

²⁹⁹ Five were experienced by nuns and one by a monk; ASS Feb. II, pp.423-29.

³⁰⁰ Plus one by a nun; Vita Glodesindis, ASS Iulii VI, pp.203-225.

³⁰¹ Rouche noted their absence in his sample; Ibid, p.335.

³⁰² The Miracula Austreberta includes a miracle where a very rich and noble materfamilias having suffered from breast cancer for nine years was cured; ASS Feb. II, c.II, 13, p.425.

saint as the healer of women was the wish to provide an alternative to folk-medicine to which women in particular might turn. To meet this demand for healing, or to stimulate a demand, Waldburgis is presented as having the means to cure a girl by dispensing her gift of medicina through her access to the medicus medicorum.³⁰³ Glodesind is described as curing three women of fever and one of illness for whom no human medicine had worked.³⁰⁴

A most telling instance occurs in the Miracula Austreberta. Here a woman came to the shrine and was cured of an affliction affecting her feet. Once cured, she met a little woman who told her of a herb which could cure feet.³⁰⁵ Believing her the first woman was punished with a worse recurrence of the affliction; she was only cured after an eight-day penance as an acknowledgement that the saint had the cure.³⁰⁶

Therefore convents with female saints may have made particular social provision for laywomen: at least the texts wish to present such an image. Anstrude not only cures sick members of her community, but also laywomen. A paralytic girl is cured of demons when placed next to Anstrude's chair; and a girl is cured of dropsy when placed on the saint's tomb on the second anniversary of her death.³⁰⁷ Anstrude exemplifies the point that women saints performed more than one function - fulfilling needs across the secular/religious divide.

³⁰³ Miracula Waldburgis, Bk.1,c.3,pp.152-54.

³⁰⁴ Vita Glodesindis, ASS Iulii VI,c.III,22,23,p.206.

³⁰⁵ "Ego, inquit illa, novi herba tantae virtutis, ut quamdiu pedi alligata fuerit, nullo modo ad cum aliquod infirmatatis genus accedere possit"; ASS Feb. II,c.III, 21,p.426.

³⁰⁶ ASS, Ibid. On penances for women using folk-remedies, see ch.6, n.200 and pp.369-70 below.

³⁰⁷ Vita Anstrudis, MGH SRM,6,c.32,31,p.76.

CHAPTER FOUR.

LITURGICAL PROVISION FOR WOMEN RELIGIOUS.

The provision of prayers and rites may illustrate a response to social reality; but, consecration rites and benedictions were the means by which the Frankish Church instituted women into a religious life. They thus denote an official categorisation of women. This was a gendered categorisation because consecration rites and benedictions were performed by male ecclesiastics.¹ This provision reveals how women in the religious life were perceived by the Frankish Church. This allows us to see how far they were regarded as a separate category apart from laywomen, and therefore beyond the constraints of their gender by virtue of their religious vow; to what extent they were perceived as the equivalent of their male religious counterparts and how far they were gender-differentiated, nonetheless.

I. Ordination Rites for Abbesses.

Ordination rites for abbesses may be compared directly with those for abbots. The Veronense and the Gelasian Sacramentaries do not provide consecration rites for ordination to the abbatial office nor do the Gallican rites. The earliest provision occurs in the Hadrianum and some Eighth-century Gelasians. The Hadrianum provides one prayer which begins:

"Concede quesumus omnipotens deus ut famulum tuum
ille vel illam quem ad regimen animarum
elegimus...".²

This provision is non-gender-specific which is confirmed by the prayer's title: Oratio ad abbatem faciendum vel abbatissam.³ This prayer also occurs in the

¹ But see p.127 above.

² Deshusses, I, 996, p.342.

³ Deshusses, Ibid, p.342.

Sacramentaries of Autun and Gellone ⁴; but famulus alone is employed and the rubric also indicates that the prayer was intended for abbots. ⁵

The Sacramentaries of Autun and Gellone provide two other prayers, Deus cui omnis potestas et dignitas and Omnium domine fons bonorum. These occur under the rubric: Orationes pro adepta dignitate (sic). ⁶ The dignitas is the abbatial office; hence these prayers occur in later texts for abbots and abbesses. ⁷

However, the Eighth-century Gelasians make provision specifically for abbesses with three prayers entitled: Orationes quando abbas vel abbatissa ordinatur in monasterio. ⁸ Here the perception of the abbatial office is developed with the use of the term ordinare rather than facere; and the office is associated with the monastic institution. The first two benedictions Deus qui pro moysen famulum tuum... instituisti and Omnipotens sempiterne deus, affluentem illum spiritum tui benedictionis were intended for abbots and abbesses. In both prayers the Sacramentary of Gellone uses famulus and abbatissa interchangeably. ⁹ The Sacramentary of Autun demonstrates that this interchangeability indicates a non-

⁴ Sac. August., 1591, p. 193; Sac. Gellon., 2576, p. 399. The presence of these prayers suggests that a Gregorian text prior to the introduction of the Hadrianum was in circulation in the Frankish kingdoms.

⁵ Oratio ad abbatem faciendum: Sac. August., p. 193; Sac. Gellon., p. 399.

⁶ Sac. August., 1589, 1590, pp. 192-3; Sac. Gellon., 2574, 2575, p. 399.

⁷ Deus cui omnis potestas et dignitas, occurs in the abbots' rite in the Pontifical of Aurillac, [n. 16 below] and the PRG [PRG I, 14, pp. 66-67] and also for regular abbesses [PRG I, 15a, p. 68; 14, p. 81]. The second prayer, Omnium domine fons bonorum occurs in the PRG's rites for abbots and both types of abbesses - regular and canonical [PRG I, 15, p. 68; 12, p. 81; 10, p. 50].

⁸ Sac. Gellon., pp. 399-401; Sac. August., pp. 193-94.

⁹ Sac. Gellon., 2577, 2578, pp. 399-400.

gender-specific application since it uses feminine terminology alongside the masculine - famulus/famula; abbas/abbatissa; speculator idoneus/speculatrix idonea.¹⁰

The Eighth-century Gelasians provide a third prayer solely for abbesses ¹¹:

"Domine deus omnipotens qui sororem Moysen Mariam¹² pereuntem ceteris mulieribus... te supplicis (sic) deprecamur pro fidele famola (sic) ill. que hodiae materna in cathedra universis subditis sibi abbatissa esse constituetur, ut ita monastica nurma (sic) tueatur cunctas famulas quatenus aeternum ad gloriam... introeat leta".¹³

While this prayer evidences the beginnings of gender-differentiated provision, many liturgies in use from the late eighth through the ninth centuries, did not differentiate between abbots and abbesses. The Aniane Supplement did not provide Eighth-century Gelasian ordination prayers for abbesses. Benedict of Aniane, the instigator of the early ninth-century monastic reform, must have regarded the non-specific benediction in the Hadrianum as sufficient. Part of the reason for this may have been a lesser need for abbesses if convents were much fewer in number than male houses; but it also suggests that the liturgical role of abbots and abbesses may not have been perceived to be very different.

Non-gender-specific provision continued throughout the ninth century in various regions. The Sacramentary of Trent includes Deus cui omnis potestas et dignitas under the rubric, pro adepta dignitate.¹⁴ The Leofric Missal used two prayers with both male and female terminology,

¹⁰ Sac. August., 1592, 1593, pp. 193-94.

¹¹ Sac. Gellon., 2579, pp. 400-01; Sac. August., 1594, p. 194.

¹² This reference forms a logical counterpoint to Moses in: Deus qui pro moysen famulum tuum... instituisti.

¹³ Sac. Gellon., 2579, pp. 400-401.

¹⁴ Deshusses, I, 402, p. 714. This "Type II" Gregorian liturgy is also associated with Benedict of Aniane [see ch. 1, pp. 73-74 and n. 260 above].

the first from the Hadrianum and the second from the Eighth-century Gelasians.¹⁵ The only French pontifical to provide an abbatial ordination rite was the Pontifical of Aurillac. This uses the Eighth-century Gelasian's rubric: ad abbatem faciendum¹⁶, and the accompanying prayer, Concede quesumus omnipotens deus which employs famulus.¹⁷ There is also another Eighth-century Gelasian prayer, Deus cui omnis potestas et dignitas which similarly uses famulus.¹⁸

This provision of ordination rites, seemingly only for abbots, may indicate that there still was not perceived to be a need for a separate ordination rite for an abbess by the end of the ninth century. The prayers for abbots may have been used for abbesses without the need for specific rubrics, but the gendered language of the text was, in many manuscripts, unaltered.

If differentiation was rarely made between abbots and abbesses, no differentiation was made between regular and canonical abbesses prior to the tenth-century and the PRG. The Eighth-century Gelasian rubric, Orationes quando abbas vel abbatissa ordinatur in monasterium gives no indication of any perceived difference in the kinds of institutions that monasterium might have denoted.¹⁹ The Eighth-century Gelasian abbess' prayer, Domine deus omnipotens qui sororem Moysen Mariam pereuntem contains the term monastica norma. This ties the abbatial office to the monastic institution; but nothing specific concerning

¹⁵ Concede quesumus omnipotens deus ut famulum tuum ille vel illam and Deus qui pro moysen famulum tuum... instituisti; Leofric, pp.227-28.

¹⁶ Leroquais, Les Pontificaux Manuscrits I, Fol. 6v0, p.8. A fifteenth-century anonymous gloss to the text attributed an Albi provenance; Ibid, p.8.

¹⁷ Leroquais, Ibid, p.8. The Pontifical of Aurillac probably came by this Gregorian prayer from the Eighth-century Gelasians rather than the Hadrianum.

¹⁸ Leroquais, Ibid, p.8. This prayer appears in the Sacramentary of Gellone; n.7 above.

¹⁹ See p.95 above.

regular and canonical communities can be assumed from this term. This could indicate that canonesses were definitely a ninth-century categorisation. ²⁰

However, by the tenth century the term monastica was employed specifically to denote the regular office for abbesses as opposed to the canonical. The PRG provides two ordination rites for abbesses ²¹ and one for abbots which contains some appended prayers for abbesses. ²² The abbot's rite is entitled Ordinatio abbatis. ²³ But differentiation is made between the two rites for abbesses. The first of these is entitled: Ordinatio abbatissae canonicam regulam profitentis ²⁴; the second: Ordinatio abbatissae monasticam regulam profitentis.²⁵ Canonica regula and monastica regula denote a distinction between the heads of communities of canonesses and those of regular nuns. This is underlined by a small but important difference in the Eighth-century Gelasian prayer, Domine deus omnipotens qui sororem Moysen Mariam pereuntem which is included in both the abbesses' ordination rites ²⁶:

Ordinatio abbatissae canonicam regulam profitentis.
famula tua quae hodie materna in
cathedra super universas
subditas sibi abbatissa
constituitur, ut ita canonica
norma tueatur cunctas famulas
tuas...

Ordinatio abbatissae monasticam regulam profitentis.
famula tua quae hodie materna
in cathedra super universas
subditas sibi abbatissa
constituitur, ut ita monastica
norma tueatur cunctas famulas
tuas...

²⁰ See pp.85-87 above.

²¹ PRG I, pp.48-51, pp.76-82.

²² PRG I, pp.62-69; the appended prayers are pp.67-69.

²³ PRG I, p.62.

²⁴ PRG I, p.48.

²⁵ PRG I, p.76.

²⁶ PRG I, 7, p.50; 10, p.81.

Thus the PRG uses monastica to denote "regular".²⁷ Further, monasterium also seems to be used for this purpose. The prayer Domine deus omnipotens qui sororem Moysen Mariam pereuntem as it occurs in the Ordinatio abbatissae monasticam regulam profitentis also appears in a series of prayers appended to the end of the ordination rite for abbots. The rubric Item benedictio proprie ad abbatissam ²⁸ clarifies that this prayer was for abbesses. However, the rubric which entitles this whole appended section reads: Consecratio quando abbas vel abbatissa ordinatur in monasterio. ²⁹ The word consecratio has replaced orationes, but otherwise this rubric is Eighth-century Gelasian. ³⁰ Clearly then, monasterium and monastica norma/regula are used in the PRG to contrast the regular with the canonical Rule. Further, several of the prayers in this section appended to the abbot's rite have not been adapted but, as the title rubric to this section indicates, were not only applied to abbots. ³¹

The ordering of these rites in the PRG is also significant. The ordination rite for a regular abbess follows that for an abbot ³² and the mass for an abbot ³³; whereas the rite for the ordination of a canonical abbess

²⁷ This seems to be confirmed by the inclusion of an oratio in the abbot's ordination rite, Accipe monasticae conversationis regulam; PRG I,10,p.66.

²⁸ PRG I,18a,p.69.

²⁹ PRG,14a,p.67.

³⁰ Sac. Gellon.,p.399.

³¹ Famulus and abbas are used in Deus qui pro moysen famulum tuum... instituisti [PRG I,14a,p.67] and also in Omnipotens sempiterne deus, affluentem illum spiritum tui benedictionis [PRG I, Ibid]. Famulus is used in Deus omnium fidelium pastor et rector [PRG I,14b,p.68]; Omnium domine fons bonorum [PRG I,15,p.68]; Deus cui omnis potestas et dignitas [PRG I,15a,p.68] and also Deus aeterne lucis inventor [PRG I,17,p.68].

³² PRG I,pp.62-69.

³³ PRG I,pp.69-70.

precedes a consecration rite for canonesses. ³⁴ Clearly there was a liturgical perception that regular abbesses and abbots should be viewed together.

Nevertheless, significant similarities exist between the two discrete ordination rites for abbesses. In particular they share some rubrics. The rubric in the rite for a regular abbess states its source: Capitulum ex canone Theodori anglorum archiepiscopi. ³⁵ The rite for an abbot also has this phrase and a near identical version of a chapter from the penitential. ³⁶ While the canonical abbess' rite does not acknowledge Theodore there is the same rubric as in the rite for a regular abbess which follows the reference to Theodore's canon:

"In ordinatione abbatissae episcopus debet missam canere et eam benedicere hoc modo". ³⁷
In one sense this makes all abbesses like abbots since this is a change from instructions elsewhere in the Penitential of Theodore which state that priests consecrate abbesses. ³⁸ Abbesses, like abbots, now underwent an ordinatio and by a higher status cleric suggesting that they transcended their gender by virtue of the abbatial office.

Moreover, the abbess of each type is required by an almost identical rubric to prostrate herself at the altar with two or three of her sisters ³⁹; this rubric has some

³⁴ See p.223 below.

³⁵ PRG I,1,p.76.

³⁶ PRG I,1,p.62. The Penitential of Theodore reads: "In abbatis vero ordinatione episcopus missam agere debet eum benedicere inclinato capite cum duobus vel tribus testibus de fratribus suis, et dat ei baculum et pedules"; Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.III,5, p.204.

³⁷ PRG I,2,p.48; 1,p.76.

³⁸ "Presbyter potest abbatissam consecrare cum missae celebratione"; Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.III,4,p.204.

³⁹ PRG I,2,p.48; 2,p.77. These sisters may have been the praepositae which the IS refers to; see p.125 above. The IS describes the appointment of the two or three

similarities with the ordination rite for abbots. 40

Canonical Abbess.
post antiphonum
ad introitum et
datam orationem
et reliquum
officium missae
usque ad
evangelium,
prosternat se
electa ante
altare cum duabus
vel tribus de
sororibus suis,
fiantque ibi
letaniae.

Regular Abbess.
post antiphonum
ad introitum et
datam orationem
et reliquum
officium missae
usque ad
evangelium,
prosternat se
electa ante
altare retro
episcopum cum
duabus vel tribus
de sororibus
suis, fiantque
ibi letaniae.

Abbot.
et eum benedicere
inclinato capite
cum duobus vel
tribus fratribus
suis, et dat ei
baculum et
pedules
post antiphonum
ad introitum et
datam orationem
annuntiat
episcopus...
prosternat se
episcopus ante
altare et abbas
sacris vestibus
indutus, fiantque
ibi letaniae.

Prostration was an important action since it was employed in status-changing rites. 41 Hence the abbess, like the abbot, "assumed a new social personality". 42 Significant similarities also occur in the following rubric: 43

sisters of good repute: "Si quando autem tibi pro necessitate monasterii seorsum fuerit conloquendum, cum duabus vel certe tribus electis sororibus facito..."; MGH Conc. II i,c.7,p.443. If the abbess chose the praepositae, perhaps these sisters, paralleling the abbot's two or three brothers, prostrated themselves alongside their abbess in her ordination rite as a means of confirming their positions as her appointees in association with her.

40 PRG I,1,2,p.62. This comes from the Penitential of Theodore; n.36 above.

41 J.L. Nelson, "Ritual and Reality in the Early Medieval Ordines", in Politics and Ritual, pp.329-39, at p.334.

42 Nelson, Ibid.

43 PRG I,11,p.50; 15,p.82.

Ord. abbatissae canonicam regulam profitentis.

Item si alibi consecrata fuerit, regressae ad monasterium omnis chorus virginum honorifice procedat ei obviam cum crucibus, aqua benedicta, incenso et evangelio, et in ipso ecclesiae introitu imponant (sic) "Te Deum laudamus", turba acclamante "Kirieleyson" et presbitero prosequente orationem ut supra: "Omnium domine fons."

Ord. abbatissae monasticam regulam profitentis.

Item si alibi consecrata fuerit abbatissa, regressae ad monasterium omnis chorus monacharum honorifice procedat ei obviam cum crucibus, aqua benedicta, incenso et evangelio, et in ipso ecclesiae introitu imponant (sic) "Te Deum laudamus", turba acclamante "Kirieleyson" et presbitero prosequente orationem ut supra: "Deus cui omnis potestas et dignitas".

However, there are some important differences. The regular abbess is called abbatissa whereas her canonical counterpart is simply described as consecrata which may denote her perceived lesser liturgical status. It is significant that the rest of the regular community are described as monachae which denotes nuns and identifies this abbess as regular; whereas the women accompanying the canonical abbess are described simply as virgines. This indicates that, although both nuns and canonesses could be described as virgines or sanctimoniales, only by the first half of the tenth century were nuns definitely differentiated by the term monachae.⁴⁴

It is also significant that the canonical abbess has the priest saying the prayer Omnium domine fons bonorum over her. The regular abbess in this context has the Eighth-century Gelasian prayer, Deus cui omnis potestas et dignitas which only occurs in the abbot's ordination rite⁴⁵ and in that for regular abbesses.⁴⁶ The other Eighth-century Gelasian prayer, Omnium domine fons bonorum is the

⁴⁴ See p.84 above.

⁴⁵ PRG I,14,pp.66-67.

⁴⁶ In the prayers appended to the abbot's ordination rite for abbots and abbesses; PRG I,15a,p.68. It is also in the discrete regular abbess's ordination rite; PRG I,14,p.81.

only prayer shared by the ordination rite for an abbot⁴⁷ and those for a canonical abbess⁴⁸ and a regular abbess.⁴⁹ This prayer, and Domine deus omnipotens qui sororem Moysen Mariam pereuntem are the only two prayers which the two discrete ordination rites for abbesses in the PRG have in common.⁵⁰

In striking contrast, however, the ordination rite for a regular abbess shares a total of seven formulas with the ordination rite for an abbot.⁵¹

Abbot.

[1]
Sequitur: Pater noster. Et
preces:
Salvum fac servum;
Dominus conservet eum;
Dominus custodiat introitum;
Dominus custodiat te;
Mittat tibi Deus;
Nihil proficiat inimicus in eo;
Esto, illi, domine;
Exurge (sic), domine, adiuva
nos. R. Et redime nos;
Domine, exaudi.

[2]
Concede, quaesumus omnip.
Deus...

Regular Abbess.

[1]
Sequitur: Pater noster cum
precibus:
Salvam fac ancillam;
Dominus conservet eam;
Dominus custodiat introitum;
Dominus custodiat te;
Mittat tibi dominus;
Nihil proficiat inimicus in
ea;
Esto, illi, domine;
Exurge (sic), domine, adiuva
eam. R. Et libera eam;
Domine, exaudi.

[2]
Concede, quaesumus omnip.
Deus...

⁴⁷ PRG I,15,p.68. This is in the appended section of prayers for an abbot or an abbess.

⁴⁸ PRG I,10,p.50.

⁴⁹ PRG I,12,p.81.

⁵⁰ And in the section appended to the abbot's rite for regular abbesses; PRG I,18a,p.69.

⁵¹ One of these comes from the mass for an abbot; PRG I, p.69. However, the abbot's ordination rite instructs that the mass is part of the ordination: Et peragatur missa ordine suo; PRG I,18,p.69. The columns below show the prayer titles and where they differ indicating the subjects' gender.

[3]
Deus qui per Moysen famulum
tuum... instituisti... ut hunc
famulum... abbatem...
instituit... "Euge, serve bone
et fidelis..."

[4]
Tunc imponat ei manum super
caput, dicens orationem hanc in
modum praefationis:

Omnip. semp. Deus, affluentem
spiritum tuae benedictionis
famulo tuo...

[5]
Tunc det ei regulam, dicens:
Accipe regulam a sanctis
patribus nobis traditam ad
regendum custodiendumque gregem
tibi a Deo creditum...

[6]
Deus cui omnis potestas et
dignitas famulatur, da famulo
tuo...

[3]
Deus qui per Moysen famulum
tuum... instituisti... ut hanc
famulam... abbatissam...
instituit... "Euge, ancilla
bona et fidelis..."

[4]
Tunc inponat (sic) ei manum
super caput, dicens hanc
orationem in modum
praephationis:

Omnip. semp. Deus, affluentem
spiritum tuae benedictionis
famulae tuae...

[5]
Tunc det ei regulam, dicens:
Accipe regulam a sanctis
patribus nobis traditam ad
regendum custodiendumque
gregem tibi a Deo creditum...

[6]
Deus cui omnis potestas et
dignitas famulatur, da famulae
tuae...

[7] from the Missa pro
abbate:

Concede, quaesumus, omnip.
Deus, famulo abbati, ut
praedicando et exercendo que
recta sunt, exemplo bonorum
operum animos suorum
instruat subditorum...

[7]

Concede, quaesumus, omnip.
Deus, famulae abbatissae,
ut ostendendo et exercendo
que recta sunt, exemplo
bonorum operum animos
suarum instruat
subditarum...

These formulas include the Hadrianum's non-gender-
specific prayer [2]; and also three Eighth-century
Gelasian non-gender-specific prayers [3,4 and 6].

The ordination rites for abbots and regular abbesses
share a series of nine Pater noster responses [1].
Canonical abbesses have only two of these responses: the

first in response to the episcopal benediction ⁵² is shared by regular abbesses ⁵³; the second, the same response but when the bishop is at the altar. ⁵⁴ This is significant since it provides for a degree of participation for regular abbots and abbesses which is denied to a canonical abess.

Thus the ordination rites for abbots and regular abbesses were more similar than those for regular and canonical abbesses. It suggests that compilers of the PRG perceived the need to present a greater degree of difference between the two types of abbesses than between regular abbots and abbesses. This may represent an attempt to promote Benedictine monasticism for women as superior to the canonical lifestyle. Such an attempt at liturgical ranking may not reflect the real social status of Benedictine and canonical abbesses. Yet this liturgical provision may reflect a response to the fact that institutes of canonesses existed in greater numbers in the East Frankish kingdoms where the PRG originates.

Further, in the case of abbesses, women may not always have been perceived as one group by virtue of their gender. Although the PRG makes greater provision for abbatial ordination by separating out rites according to gender, the similarity between the rites for regular abbots and abbesses indicates little perceived, and therefore real?, difference between men and women's roles at the head of regular monastic communities. ⁵⁵ The PRG's provision reflects a tradition of such non-gender-specific provision in earlier liturgies which may still have been used.

⁵² "benedicat eam episcopus inclinato capite, dicens: Dominus vobiscum. R. Et cum spiritu tuo"; PRG I,3,p.48.

⁵³ This response is added to the end of the nine Pater Noster responses shared by the regular abess with the abbot; PRG I,4,p.77.

⁵⁴ PRG I,5,p.49.

⁵⁵ This is underlined by the inclusion of the appended section at the end of the abbot's ordination rite in the PRG for regular abbots and abbesses.

The distinct liturgical perception of the canonical abbess is underlined by some features and particularly omissions in her ordination rite in the PRG. Her ordination rite includes the Eighth-century Gelasian prayer, Omnium domine fons bonorum which refers to the abbatial dignitas.⁵⁶ The ordination rites for regular abbots and abbesses share this prayer⁵⁷, but they have in addition the other Eighth-century Gelasian prayer, Deus qui omnis potestas which makes a further reference to the abbatial dignitas.⁵⁸ Dignitas was the official rank or honor of the abbot or abbess. But regimen not only incorporated the spiritual and liturgical nature of the office, it also had governmental connotations. It is therefore significant that the abbess, as a woman, should have this term applied to her in earlier liturgies.⁵⁹ However, the PRG's rite for the canonical abbess does not contain the Hadrianum's prayer, Concede, quaesumus omnip. Deus with its reference to the abbot's or abbess' office as regimen animarum; although this prayer does occur in the PRG's regular abbot's and abbess' ordination rites.⁶⁰

⁵⁶ PRG I,10,p.50.

⁵⁷ In the appended section to the abbot's ordination rite [PRG I,15,p.68] and in the discrete rite for a regular abbess [PRG I,12,p.81].

⁵⁸ In the discrete rites for regular abbots and abbesses, see above, p.207, [6]; and in the appended section to the abbot's rite; PRG I,15a,p.68.

⁵⁹ The application of regimen signifying an office of government and status is illustrated by its inclusion in the coronation/marriage rite of Charles the Bald's daughter, Judith. The phrase, "ut in regimine suo gratiae supernae largitatem congaudens suscipiat" exists within the Gelasian Te invocamus prayer; MGH Capit. II ii, pp.425-427, l.28, p.426. This ordo also includes a version of the abbatial ordination prayer, Concede, quaesumus, omnip. et misericors Deus; MGH, Ibid, p.427. This also shows that the status of an abbess could be used as a model for a queen - something which we have seen with the application of domna to both queens and abbesses; see pp.186-87 above.

⁶⁰ See above p.206,[2].

Like her regular counterparts, the canonical abbess is described as being promoted ad sacrum ordinem.⁶¹ Further, she is also given a regula denoting the abbatial office; but, again, significantly she has a different prayer.⁶² The regular abbess shares with the abbot a prayer which confers greater authority on the recipient through its reference to the Rule as handed down by the holy fathers.⁶³

Moreover, the canonical abbess' ordination rite does not contain either of the two non-gender-specific prayers from the Eighth-century Gelasians - Deus qui per Moysen famulum and Omnip. semp. Deus affluentem. Both of these prayers are in the discrete rites for a regular abbot and abbess⁶⁴ and they both make reference to the hundred-fold reward that the abbot or abbess will receive in heaven.⁶⁵ This hundred-fold reward was a reference to the topos that married people received a 30-fold, widows a 60-fold, and virgins a 100-fold heavenly reward since they had lived the purest form of existence.⁶⁶ The canonical abbess has a prayer, Domine, sancte pater, omnip., eterne Deus⁶⁷ which refers to the chaste life and example that the

⁶¹ In the prayer, Omnip. tuam, domine, humiliter imploramus; PRG I,4,p.49. Similarly, the abbot is described as pater electus suum adesi (sic) ordinem ad suscipiendum; PRG I,2,p.62.

⁶² Accipe regulam sanctae conversationis; PRG I,6,p.50.

⁶³ See above, p.207,[5].

⁶⁴ See above p.207, [3]; [4]; and also in the section appended to the abbot's rite; PRG I,14a,pp.67-68.

⁶⁵ "centesimo cum fructu laetus introeat portas paradisi" in the prayer, Deus qui per Moysen famulum; and "cum centesimo fructu coronaque iusticiae et ad celestium thesaurorum donativa perveniat" in the prayer, Omnip. semp. Deus affluentem.

⁶⁶ Tertullian designated three levels of perfection in descending order: "spirituals" (virgins), "physics" (widows) and "materials" (the married); Bugge, Virginitas, pp.67-72. The source for the numerical heavenly reward for these groups is based on Matthew's gospel and the parable of the sower and his seed which "brought forth fruit, some a hundredfold, some sixtyfold, and some thirtyfold"; xiii,8.

⁶⁷ PRG I,5,pp.49-50.

abbess sets those under her:

"in moribus eius praecepta tua fulgeant, ut suae castitatis exemplo cunctis sibi subditis imitationem praebeat puram". ⁶⁸

Castitas may mean virginity since continentia is often applied to widows ⁶⁹ and reference to the wise virgins trimming their lamps is also made in this prayer ⁷⁰; but it is nevertheless significant that prayers referring to the virgin's traditional 100-fold reward are not applied to the canonical abbess. Canonesses were not regarded in the same way as regular nuns; sometimes they may not have been permanent members of the community ⁷¹ and/or their abbesses were sometimes widows.

A further difference between the regular and canonical abbess is the description of the women they ruled. The prayer, Domine, sancte pater, omnip., eterne Deus in the ordination rite for a canonical abbess refers to a chorus virginum. ⁷² The rite of ordination for a regular abbess has, in the equivalent position in her rite, a more significant Preface, Vere dignum, aequum et salutare. This refers to the abbess as custos monachorum. ⁷³ Both these prayers make reference to the good example that both types of abbess should provide for their charges ⁷⁴ which parallel instructions in the IS ⁷⁵:

⁶⁸ PRG I,5,p.50.

⁶⁹ As in the propositum sanctae continentiae; PRG I,11,p.61. Widows also professed castitatis; n.92 below.

⁷⁰ PRG I,5,p.49.

⁷¹ Parisse, "Les femmes au monastère", pp.322-23.

⁷² PRG I,5,p.49.

⁷³ PRG I,7,p.78. On the custos see p.123 above.

⁷⁴ PRG I,12,p.79; 5,p.49.

⁷⁵ See ch.2, pp.121-22 and n.229 above.

Canonical Abbess.

Domine, sancte pater,
 omnip., eterne Deus...
 mandata tua custodiat,
 dictis tuis obediat, sacris
 lectionibus insistat,
 terrena et transitoria
 despiciat, atque omni
 tempore bonis operibus
 inserviat

Regular Abbess.

Vere dignum, aequum et
 salutare...
 doceat, constituat vel
 iubeat sed magis mentes
 discipularum tam exemplis
 bonorum operum quam verbis
 instruat, et quae
 discipulabus docuerit esse
 contraria, in operibus suis
 iudicet non agenda

It is significant that the prayer for the regular abbess refers to her as a teacher over her discipulae. This parallels the image of the abbess as magistra which is such a strong model in some of the hagiography.⁷⁶ This image which marks the regular abbess as the direct equivalent of the abbot is not attributed to the canonical abbess.

In the appended section in the abbot's ordination rite, the rubric, Consecratio abbas vel abbatissa ordinatur in monasterio, monasterium indicates a regular community particularly when used in conjunction with monastica norma.⁷⁷ Chorus monacharum is similarly used to contrast with the canonical chorus virginum.⁷⁸ In this last context, it is true the rite of ordination for canonical abbesses employs the term monasterium⁷⁹, clearly showing that these descriptive terms are not fixed. Nevertheless, significantly, the rite of ordination for canonical abbesses elsewhere uses the term domus:

"Quod si ordinatio in domo sua facta fuerit,
 imponatur Te Deum laudamus, populo acclamante
Kirieleyson".⁸⁰

Thus although monasterium can be used in relation to abbots and in both types of abbess' ordination rites, domus is only used in relation to canonesses. The ambiguous application of the term domus perhaps suggests

⁷⁶ See pp.180-81 above.

⁷⁷ See pp.201-2 above.

⁷⁸ See p.205 above.

⁷⁹ See above, Ibid.

⁸⁰ PRG I,9,p.50.

that smaller house convents were likely to be inhabited by canonesses. ⁸¹

II. The Consecration of Virgins and Benediction of Widows.

The two categories of women religious in the ninth century, as earlier, were virgins and widows. But ninth-century liturgies and earlier texts show such flexibility of usage that a categorisation of women religious can only be tentatively suggested. Ninth-century legislation indicates that the one common feature between virgins and widows from the late eighth/ninth centuries was the taking of a vow, described as a propositum and represented by the nigra vestis; there was also a difference between virgins and widows with virgins episcopally consecrated and widows blessed by priests. ⁸²

The Veronese Sacramentary only provides for virgins with two prayers: Respice, domine, propitius and Deus castorum corporum under the rubric Ad virgines sacras. ⁸³ The first prayer refers to the sanctum propositum and the second to the propositum virginitatis. The propositum represented the betrothal of the virgin and was the term applied to women more frequently than professio. ⁸⁴ While the second prayer refers to the virgin's permanent holy union beginning with a benediction ⁸⁵, it is unclear whether the rite was a consecration or benediction.

The Gelasian Sacramentary is the first Roman liturgy providing for both virgins and widows. The provision for

⁸¹ See pp.103-04 above.

⁸² See ch.2, p.100 and n.113 and 116 above.

⁸³ Sac. Veron., 1103, 1104, pp.138-39.

⁸⁴ Propositum has its origins in the third century; Metz, La consécration des vierges, p.142. However, O.G. Harrison stressed that patristic thinking designated the propositum as the embracing of all forms of ascetism; O.G. Harrison, "The Formulas "Ad virgines sacras". A Study of the Sources", Ephemerides Liturgicae, LXVI, (1952), p.254.

⁸⁵ "ac super sanctum coniugium initialis benedictio permaneret"; Sac. Veron., 1104, p.138.

virgins uses the prayers from the Veronese Sacramentary ⁸⁶ except that Respice, domine, propitius now refers to a singular virgin and Deus castorum corporum exists in a lengthened version. ⁸⁷ The rubric clarifies that this rite was now a consecration and that it was to be performed at Epiphany, Easter or on Apostles' feast days. ⁸⁸ The rite also includes a Benedicchio (sic) vestimentorum virginum. ⁸⁹

The Gelasian Sacramentary also provides a separate oratio to be said over ancillae Dei "who are transformed with different clothing". ⁹⁰ In this prayer, Te invocamus domine, the women clearly are virgins since they are compared to the 144,000 qui virgines permanserunt ⁹¹; the rubric also indicates that they had taken on a vestment with the religious vow.

The Gelasian Sacramentary provides one prayer for widows which the accompanying rubric states is a benediction: Benedictio viduae quae fuerit castitate professa. ⁹² This benediction, Consolare, domine refers to the widow's "consolation" as opposed to the virgin's propositum. There is no provision for vestments, but the widow is described in the rubric as "professed". Gryson argued that the term, professae, for widows, which is also used in fifth-

⁸⁶ Sac. Gelas., 787-790, pp.124-25.

⁸⁷ A section referring to the parable of the wise virgins, beginning "In te habeat omnia, quem diligere appetat super omnia"; Sac. Gelas., 790, l.25-34, p.125. This section may be an addition although Metz is more inclined to argue that the Veronese has survived in an incomplete version; La consécration des vièrges, p.151.

⁸⁸ "Consecratio sacrae virginis quae in Epiphania vel secunda feria Paschae aut in Apostolorum Natalicio caelebratur"; Sac. Gelas., p.124.

⁸⁹ Deus... qui vestimentum salutare: Sac. Gelas., 791, p.126

⁹⁰ "Item oratio super ancillas Dei quibus conversis vestimenta mutantur"; Sac. Gelas., p.126.

⁹¹ Sac. Gelas., 792, p.126. This is a reference to Revelations, xiv, 3-4; Metz, La consécration des vièrges, p.173.

⁹² Sac. Gelas., p.213.

century Gaulish conciliar legislation, made them more similar to consecrated virgins also called professae in the first Council of Toledo (400); the similarity between the two groups was furthered when widows had to adopt a similar vestment according to the Council of Orange (441).
93

Some Gallican rites present an acknowledgement of this Gaulish tradition where virgins and widows were treated in a similar way. The Missale Gallicanum vetus provides a Benedictio virginis ⁹⁴ and a Benedictio viduae.⁹⁵ Nevertheless, uniquely, the virgin takes a magnum propositum. ⁹⁶

The Missale Francorum ⁹⁷ presents a synthesis of Gallican and Roman usages. It provides a Benedictio super virgines ⁹⁸; but the second of six prayers in this rite is headed consecratio virginum. ⁹⁹ This rite includes the Gelasian Sacramentary's version of Deus castorum corporum ¹⁰⁰ but the other five prayers are "Gallican". ¹⁰¹ The last of these invests the virgin with a vestment which is strongly influenced by the Gallican baptismal rite as presented in the Missale Gothicum ¹⁰²:

⁹³ R. Gryson, Le ministère des femmes dans l'Église ancienne, (Gembloux, 1972), pp.164-69.

⁹⁴ With the prayers, Faventes dilectissimi fratres and Omnium quidem laudum adque virtutum; Missale Gallicanum vetus, 13,14,p.6.

⁹⁵ With the prayers, Deus rerum omnium.. qui inter cithera documenta and Deus, qui Annam filiam; Missale Gallicanum vetus, 15,16,pp.7-8.

⁹⁶ Missale Gallicanum vetus, 1.29,14,p.6.

⁹⁷ This was the only Gallican source used by the PRG for virgins; Metz, La consécration des vierges, pp.176-77.

⁹⁸ Missale Francorum, p.14.

⁹⁹ Missale Francorum,46,p.14.

¹⁰⁰ Missale Francorum,47,pp.14-15.

¹⁰¹ Missale Francorum,45,46,48,49,50,pp.14-15.

¹⁰² Missale Gothicum,263,p.68.

Missale Francorum.

Accipe, puella, pallium, quod perferas sine macula ante tribunal domini nostri Iesu Christi, cui flectit omne genu caelestium et terrestrium et infernorum.

Missale Gothicum.

Accipe, vestem candidam, quam immaculatam perferas ante tribunal domini nostri Iesu Christi. Amen.

This borrowing, not previously noted, may have occurred to indicate that a religious vow, like baptism, was a form of rebirth to become a different kind of person; it also denoted purification since baptism involved an exorcism ceremony. As well as the pallium here the virgin also adopted a habitus virginalis ¹⁰³; a vestimentum ¹⁰⁴ and the spiritual propositum. ¹⁰⁵

The Missale Francorum's rite for widows provides the Gelasian's Benedictio viduae quae fuerit castitate professa with its Consolare, domine prayer ¹⁰⁶ but also the Gallican prayers, Deus, qui Annam filiam ¹⁰⁷ and Domine deus virtutum caelestium aeterne ¹⁰⁸ which alludes to Anna. This last prayer highlights a lack of clear definition between "benediction" and "consecration"; it refers to consecration ¹⁰⁹ under the rubric Benedictio. There is both a Benedictio vestimentorum viduae ¹¹⁰ and a Consecratio (sic) vestium for widows. ¹¹¹

In the Eighth-century Gelasians the benediction of vestments is a fixed feature for virgins and widows but "benediction" and "consecration" are still used

¹⁰³ Missale Francorum, 1.12-13,45,p.14.

¹⁰⁴ Missale Francorum, 1.10,50,p.16.

¹⁰⁵ Propositum mentis; Missale Francorum, 1.21,46,p.14.

¹⁰⁶ Missale Francorum,53,p.16.

¹⁰⁷ Missale Francorum,55,p.17.

¹⁰⁸ Missale Francorum,54,p.16.

¹⁰⁹ Missale Francorum, 1.30,54,p.16.

¹¹⁰ Visibilium et invisibiliter rerum creator; Missale Francorum,51,p.16.

¹¹¹ Inlumina, quaesumus, oculos; Missale Francorum,52,p.17.

interchangeably. The Sacramentary of Gellone provides a Benedictio super ancillas Dei for virgins. ¹¹². There are also six prayers ¹¹³ under another, Deus aeternorum bonorum fidelissime promissor which has the rubric, Benedictio vestimentorum virginum vel viduarum. Above this rubric is another specifically for virgins and which refers to consecration:

"Sanctimonialis virgo cum ad consecrationem sui episcopi offertur in talibus vestibus adplicetur qualibus semper usitura est professione et sanctimoniae aptis". ¹¹⁴

Like the Sacramentary of Gellone, the Sacramentary of Autun provides this last rubric under another Ad virgines benedicendum. ¹¹⁵ These are followed by the Benedictio vestimentorum virginum vel viduarum, Deus aeternorum bonorum fidelissime promissor, and the next two of the Sacramentary of Gellone's prayers. ¹¹⁶ It then provides a separate Consecratio sacrae virgines ¹¹⁷ which provides the remaining four prayers from the Sacramentary of Gellone but repeats Deus aeternorum bonorum fidelissime promissor but with the amended rubric Benedictio

¹¹² Dominis deus aeterne qui utrumque sexum refers to the holy virgins trimming their lamps; Sac. Gellon., 2090, p.296. This also occurs in the Sacramentary of Angoulême under the rubric, Item super ancillas Dei; Sac. Engol., 1850, p.276.

¹¹³ The Veronese Respice, domine, propitius; the Gelasian, Deus castorum corporum [Sac. Gellon., 2607 and 2608/9, pp.406-08]; two Gelasian prayers: Deus... qui vestimentum salutare and Te invocamus domine [Sac. Gellon., 2604 and 2610, pp.405, 410]. There is also the prayer, Domine deus, bonorum virtutum dator which refers to the benediction of a vestis [Sac. Gellon., 2605, p.406] and Exaudi omnip. deus preces nostras for widows since it refers to a 60-fold heavenly reward. [Sac. Gellon., 2606, p.406].

¹¹⁴ Sac. Gellon., 2603, p.405. This rubric comes from the Statuta ecclesiae antiqua; Andrieu, Les Ordines Romani, vol.3, pp.616-19.

¹¹⁵ Sac. August., p.197.

¹¹⁶ Sac. August., 1617-1619, pp.197-98.

¹¹⁷ Sac. August., p.198. This is the Gelasian Sacramentary's rubric; n.88 above.

vestimentorum virginum.¹¹⁸ The Sacramentary of Angoulême provides a prayer under the rubric, Cum sanctae monialis virgo benedicatur vel cum in monasterio puellarum missa caelebratur¹¹⁹ which is an episcopal benediction.¹²⁰

The Sacramentaries of Gellone and Autun provide the Gelasian Sacramentary's Benedictio viduae quae fuerit castitate professa¹²¹; but there is a second prayer, Da quaesumus omnip. deus ut hec famula tuam que pro spe which uses the verb consecrare.¹²²

The Hadrianum provides one prayer, Famulas tuas domine custodia muniat pietatis which refers to a propositum virginitatis.¹²³ It is unclear from the rubric whether a benediction or consecration was intended: Orationem ad ancillas Dei velandas.¹²⁴ Provision only for a blessing of habits and not of the persons may not be an oversight but, as Harrison suggested, "proof that this ceremony... was kept in another libellus".¹²⁵ But as there was no provision for widows, the Aniane Supplement added the Eighth-century Gelasian rubric, Benedictio vestimentorum virginum vel viduarum with two prayers from the same

¹¹⁸ Sac. August., 1620-1623, pp. 198-99. Prayer 1621 is described as a benedictio.

¹¹⁹ Effunde Domine caelestem benedictionem tuam; Sac. Engol., 1849, pp. 275-76.

¹²⁰ It occurs in the section devoted to such benedictions; Sac. Engol., pp. 262-79.

¹²¹ With the Gelasian Consolare, domine prayer; Sac. Gellon, 2615, p. 409; Sac. August., 1628, p. 200.

¹²² Sac. Gellon, 2616, p. 409; Sac. August., 1629, p. 200.

¹²³ Deshusses, I, 995, p. 341.

¹²⁴ Deshusses, Ibid, p. 341. Harrison suggested that the term oratio as opposed to benedictio or consecratio suggests that this prayer may have been performed by a priest not a bishop; "The Formulas "Ad Virgines Sacras"., p. 266.

¹²⁵ The volume of material may have resulted in this, and provision for other occasional ceremonies, being left out of papal sacramentaries; Harrison, Ibid, pp. 262-63.

source. ¹²⁶ The Supplement also provides Respice, domine, propitius but with the specific rubric, Benedictio virginis ab episcopo dicenda and also Deus castorum corporum which is described as usual as Consecratio. ¹²⁷

The Aniane Supplement was itself probably supplemented with recourse to Eighth-century Gelasians. Taken together they reflect the fundamental categorisation of women religious for much of the ninth century. An integral part of the ritual constituted the blessing, for both virgins and widows, of vestments which were an emblem of their religious life. ¹²⁸ Widows could have a benediction said over them; but virgins underwent episcopal consecration within which there could be benedictions. But only virgins took the propositum. ¹²⁹

This pattern is evidenced in later ninth-century liturgies throughout the Frankish kingdoms:

¹²⁶ Deus... qui vestimentum salutare and Domine deus, bonorum virtutum datur; Deshusses, I, p.419.

¹²⁷ Deshusses, I, 1253, 1254, pp.419-20.

¹²⁸ It is possible that the ceremony for the blessing of the vestments of virgins took place some time earlier than the consecration of the female subject, and that the Hadrianum's Oratio super ancillas Dei formed part of a simple ceremony denoting the first stage of taking on the religious vow; Harrison, "The Formulas Ad Sacras Virgines", p.266. Such a theory probably applies to a period earlier than the ninth century, since the provision in the Aniane Supplement and the Eighth-century Gelasians imply that, although the benediction of virgins' vestments took place before the consecration of the virgins themselves, the two elements formed part of the same ritual.

¹²⁹ The propositum constituted the permanent commitment to the religious life. According to a decretal of Pope Leo I (458/9) there may have been a difference between virgins who were consecrated and those who merely took a propositum; but in either case the propositum bound the virgin since women of both categories were condemned if they married; Metz, "La consécration des vièrges dans l'Église franque", pp.39-40. This categorisation was, in its fifth-century Roman sense, not valid for the ninth century since by this time liturgical provision for virgins constituted a consecration which incorporated the propositum. But if consecrated virgins continued to live outside convents, in the world, the propositum which distinguished all virgins from widows represents a significant element of the liturgical identification of women religious.

Leofric Missal.

VIRGINS

[1] Benedictio vestimentorum
virginum

Deus... qui vestimentum
salutare... [or]
Domine deus, bonorum virtutum
dator...

[2] Benedictio virginis ab
episcopo dicenda

Respice, domine, propitius...

Accipe, puella, pallium...

Consecratio

Te invocamus domine...

Deus castorum corporum...

WIDOWS

[1]

Item ad velandam viduam

Consolare, domine... [or]

Deus, castitatis amator...

Sacramentary of Fulda.

VIRGINS

[1] Orationes super virgines
quando vestem mutant

Deus... qui vestimentum
salutare... [or]
Te invocamus domine...

[2] Ad missam

[There follows three prayers
from the Sacramentary of
Gellone's mass for virgins].

[3] Consecratio

Deus castorum corporum...

[4]

[The fourth prayer from the
Sacramentary of Gellone's mass
for virgins].

WIDOWS

[1]

Oratio ad velandam viduam,
quando fuerit castitatem
professa

Consolare, domine...

Ad missam

Deus, castitatis amator...
[plus the two other mass
prayers for widows from the
Sacramentary of Gellone].

Pontifical of Aurillac.

[1] Ad ancillas Dei velandas
 Famulas tuas domine custodia
 muniat pietatis...

[2] Benedicchio vestimenti
virginum
 Deus... qui vestimentum
 salutare... [or]
 Domine deus, bonorum virtutum
 dator...

[3] Benedictio virginis ab
episcopo dicenda
 Respice, domine, propitius...

[4] Consecratio
 Deus castorum corporum...

Pontifical of St. Aubin
d'Angers.

[1] Sanctimonialis virgo cum ad
consecrationem sui episcopi
offertur in talibus vestibus
applicetur qualibus semper
usitura est professione et
sanctimoniae aptis

[2] Benedicchio vestimenti
virginum
 Deus... qui vestimentum
 salutare... [or]
 Domine deus, bonorum virtutum
 dator...

[3] Benedictio virginis ab
episcopo dicenda
 Respice, domine, propitius...

[4] Consecratio
 Deus castorum corporum...

All of these rites form the background to the PRG. This synthesises much of what has been outlined but with some significant new developments. It describes two rites for virgins and one for widows as "consecrations":

- {i} Consecratio sacrae virginis ¹³⁰;
- {ii} Consecratio virginum quae a seculo conversae in
domibus suis susceptum castitatis habitum privatum
observare voluerint ¹³¹;
- {iii} Consecratio viduae quae fuerit castitate professa.
¹³²

However, the practice that we have identified is also apparent here - there is a benediction of the vestments of

¹³⁰ PRG I,p.38.

¹³¹ PRG I,p.51.

¹³² PRG I,p.59.

virgins and widows but only virgins are consecrated, and by bishops.

[11] Virgins: Nuns and Canonesses.

The PRG's differentiation between virgins marks a significant development from earlier provision which referred generically to virgines or ancillae Dei.

Metz regarded the first group in the PRG, the sacrae virgines, on whom he almost exclusively concentrates, as cloistered nuns.¹³³ He therefore assumed that the "other" virgins were not cloistered, and were "isolated" in the world.¹³⁴ Metz therefore interpreted the phrase, a seculo conversae in domibus suis, in the sense of the women's own private homes. Domus has an ambiguous application.¹³⁵ This rite provides complementary evidence that women continued to live in the world under a religious vow either as individuals or in house convents. Indeed, this rite evidences the official acceptance of these phenomena, in the East Frankish kingdoms at least.¹³⁶

However, it is possible to broaden Metz's interpretation. It is probable that this rite is also intended for canonesses since the use of domus here corresponds to its use in the canonical abbess' ordination rite.¹³⁷ It would make sense to interpret these virgins as canonesses and

¹³³ Metz, La consécration des vierges, pp.184-217.

¹³⁴ Metz, Ibid, p.218.

¹³⁵ And see pp.98-104 above.

¹³⁶ The categorisation of avowed virgins as either living in the world or in a convent dated back to the fourth century; Metz, "La consécration des vierges dans l'Eglise franque", p.39. Indeed, the inclusion of a description of a consecration rite which includes a particular version of Deus castorum corporum (and also late eighth/ninth-century language) which was supposedly said over the fifth-century St. Pusinna, described as remaining with her sisters "dans leur milieu familial", dates the oldest version of her Vita to the late eighth/ninth century; Metz, Ibid. Further, this text illustrates that the consecrated woman religious living in her domus was still an acceptable image for the ninth century.

¹³⁷ See p.212 above.

the sacrae virgines as nuns, which would correspond with the two rites for abbesses. Further, the rite for canonesses follows directly after the canonical abbess' ordination rite.

The monastic lifestyles of nuns and canonesses were similar. But canonesses could retain property, and some may not have followed their vows permanently, but left the convent to marry. This may explain why the PRG presents liturgical differences between the canoness and the nun as it did between regular and canonical abbesses.

Although there were differences we need to look first at the broad similarities between nuns and canonesses. In particular a significant number of rubrics are shared including the following ¹³⁸:

"Secular virgin" or canoness:

Ancilla Dei virgo cum ad consecrationem sui episcopo offertur, in talibus vestibus applicetur qualibus semper usura est professioni et sanctimoniae aptis.

Sacra virgo or nun:

Sancta monialis virgo cum ad consecrationem sui episcopo offertur, in talibus vestibus applicetur qualibus semper usura est professioni et sanctimoniae aptis.

This rubric came from Eighth-century Gelasians ¹³⁹, but here where the sacra virgo is described as sancta monialis, her "secular" counterpart is called, ancilla Dei. This does not mean that this latter kind of woman religious was not monastic ¹⁴⁰; but the terminology does distinguish between the two types of virgins. This rubric also states that both types of virgin were episcopally blessed, and that a religious vestment was to be put on.

Elsewhere in the two rites there is the same rubric instructing the bishop to place the veil on the virgin's

¹³⁸ PRG I, pp. 39, 51.

¹³⁹ See p. 217 and n. 114 above. The PRG wrongly assigned this to the Council of Carthage, probably because this council prescribed the age of consecration as 25; see p. 130 above.

¹⁴⁰ See p. 84 above.

head ¹⁴¹ saying Accipe velum sacrum, puella. This comes from the Missale Francorum except that the pallium has become a veil. ¹⁴² As the velum is referred to in the IS ¹⁴³ this word is more appropriate for the early tenth century. However, alongside this prayer, only one other is held in common between the two rites: the Hadrianum's ancillae dei prayer. ¹⁴⁴

It is significant that the "secular virgins'" rite only has the Gelasian Sacramentary's Te invocamus prayer; whereas the rite for the sacra virgo has a much greater number of Veronese, Gelasian and Eighth-century Gelasian consecration prayers ¹⁴⁵ including Deus... qui vestimentum salutare ¹⁴⁶; Domine deus, bonorum virtutum dator ¹⁴⁷; Exaudi omnip. deus preces nostras ¹⁴⁸; the integral Veronese consecration prayer, Deus castorum corporum ¹⁴⁹; and Da quaesumus omnip. deus ut hec famulam tuam que pro spe. ¹⁵⁰ Further, the rite for sacrae virgines contains more sophisticated rubric even where similarities with the rite for "secular virgins" occur. Thus although both types of virgin took on a vestis and had the bishop bless the veil, the sacrae virgines' rite contains a number of

¹⁴¹ PRG I,16,p.44; 10,p.52.

¹⁴² See p.216 above.

¹⁴³ See ch.2, n.113 above.

¹⁴⁴ PRG I,18,p.44; 8,p.52.

¹⁴⁵ I am not including mass prayers in this count.

¹⁴⁶ PRG I,6,p.40.

¹⁴⁷ PRG I,7,p.40.

¹⁴⁸ PRG I,8,p.40. This is from the Sacramentary of Gellone [see above n.113] but the reference to the 60-fold reward is now followed with the phrase; "si virgo, centissimi muneris opulentia, in utraque parte perseverante continentia, ditetur" which makes the prayer appropriate for virgins.

¹⁴⁹ PRG I,15,pp.42-43.

¹⁵⁰ This is an Eighth-century Gelasian benediction for widows; but it is appropriate here since it uses the verb consecrare; see above n.122, p.218.

formulas indicating that the veil and the vestment were blessed individually by the bishop. Deus... qui vestimentum salutare is accompanied by the rubric Benedictio velaminum vel vestimentarum virginis.¹⁵¹ That vel means "and" in this instance is underlined by the fact that two more prayers follow this for the blessing of the virgin's vestimentum¹⁵² and then there follows a separate prayer for the blessing of the sacrum velum.¹⁵³

Further, when both types of virgin accept the blessed veil from the bishop when he says the prayer, Accipe velum sacrum, puella the sacra virgo is instructed to say the antiphon:

"Tunc ipsa velata incipit antiphonum: Induit me dominus ciclade auro".¹⁵⁴

Moreover, the rubric is insistent that even if there are many candidates each one has to repeat the antiphon:

"Et si plures fuerit velatae, per singulas incipiatur eadem antiphona".¹⁵⁵

The sacra virgo also has a vocal response in two other places where her canonical counterpart has not. The first of these occasions is when the sacra virgo prostrates herself before the altar. The "secular virgin" also does this but without a vocal response.¹⁵⁶ Prostration was also performed by monks which suggests that nuns, canonesses and monks all were regarded as monastic persons. But, importantly, the sacra virgo and the monk, whilst prostrate, are both instructed to say the prayer, Suscipe me, domine three times.¹⁵⁷ This suggests that at

¹⁵¹ PRG I,6,pp.39-40.

¹⁵² Domine deus, bonorum virtutum dator and Exaudi omnip. deus preces nostras; PRG I,7,8,p.40.

¹⁵³ Caput omnium fidelium Deus accompanied by the rubric, Item singularis benedictio sacri velaminis; PRG I,9,p.40.

¹⁵⁴ PRG I,17,p.44. This antiphon is from the Passio of St. Agnes; Metz, La consécration des vierges, pp.199-200.

¹⁵⁵ PRG I,17,p.44

¹⁵⁶ "Prosternatur ante altare toto corpore"; PRG I,4,p.51.

¹⁵⁷ The sacra virgo: PRG I,11,p.41; and the monk: PRG I,7,p.71.

this point, nuns and monks were regarded as similar. On the second occasion, after the sacra virgo has prostrated herself and had both her veil and vestment blessed, the bishop instructs her: Soror accipe vestem in nomine domine.¹⁵⁸ The rubric then continues: "Et illa respondeat: Suscipio in nomine patris et filii et spiritus sancti".¹⁵⁹ Therefore the nun is given a degree of vocal involvement in her rite of consecration not experienced by the "secular virgin"/canoness. This corresponds to the greater number of responses in the ordination rite for a regular abbess compared to that given to her canonical counterpart.¹⁶⁰

Both virgin's consecration rites contain prayers which emphasise the role of the Virgin Mary as chief of all virgins, both heavenly and earthly, and how the consecrated virgin should emulate her. However, the different rites employ different prayers. Two prayers occur in the rite for sacrae virgines.¹⁶¹ The first of these refers to the virgin who strives for the love of the semper virgo Maria, the genetrix beatissima¹⁶²; and the second prayer contains the phrase Deus... qui te eligere dignatur ad sanctae matris.¹⁶³ In the rite for the consecration of "secular virgins" there is a Gallican prayer, Benedicat te Deus... ut maneat sine macula sub vestimento sanctae Mariae matris.¹⁶⁴

Although both rites stress the role of the Virgin Mary,

¹⁵⁸ PRG I,13,p.41.

¹⁵⁹ PRG I,Ibid.

¹⁶⁰ See above p.206.

¹⁶¹ PRG I,9,26, pp.41,46.

¹⁶² In the prayer, Caput omnium fidelium Deus; PRG I,9,pp.40-41.

¹⁶³ PRG I,26,p.46. Benedicat te conditor caeli is from the Missale Francorum's rite of consecration for a virgin; 49,p.16.

¹⁶⁴ Missale Francorum's rite of consecration for a virgin, 50,p.16.

the rite for sacrae virgines stresses the permanence of their vow of virginity. For these virgins are invested with a ring and torques. The first of these is described as the anulus fidei which the virgin is told: ut sponsa Dei voceris, si ei fideliter servieris.¹⁶⁵ This anulus fidei is the symbolic sign of marriage and appears already in the Judith ordo¹⁶⁶; but the term is also applied to virgins as the bride of Christ in hagiography.¹⁶⁷ The torques is also a sign of marital union, ut uxor eius efficiaris et in eo permanseris, in perpetuum coroneris.¹⁶⁸

Metz argues that the liturgists regarded the ring and crown as suitable only for cloistered virgins.¹⁶⁹ But canonesses could be monastic in the cloistered sense, as well as living as individuals or groups outside. It is more likely that it was accepted that, on occasions, virgin canonesses left the community, and that there was less value in symbolically more permanently binding them to their vows, especially as they retained a link with things temporal through their ability to retain private property. Therefore, these elements may evidence liturgy

¹⁶⁵ PRG I,23,p.45.

¹⁶⁶ "Accipe anulum, fidei et dilectionis signum"; MGH Capit. II ii, 1.6-7,p.426.

¹⁶⁷ "Anulum fidei, quem misit caelestis sponsus virgini, non viderat oculus terreni mariti"; Vita Anstrudis, MGH SRM, 6, c.2, p.67. As a ninth-century Vita, this allusion may be reflecting ninth-century liturgical developments rather than seventh-century images.

¹⁶⁸ PRG I,24,p.45. Secondary commentaries have interpreted the torques as a "couronne"; Metz, "La consécration des vièrges dans l'Église franque", p.38; La consécration des vièrges, pp.210-11. Metz thought that the "crown" may have resulted from Byzantine influences; Ibid. Presumably, the verb coronare led Metz to this conclusion and also, perhaps, the image of the Virgin Mary as Queen of Heaven. But the torques is probably a peculiarly Frankish element - literally a torque or collar worn over the habit. This torque sounds similar to the type of womanly jewellery that wives would wear and which Hathumoda gives up as part of her commitment to virginity; see ch.3 n.112 above.

¹⁶⁹ La consécration des vièrges, p.220.

as a response to (East Frankish?) social reality. At the same time, the liturgists were emphasising the higher liturgical status of women who followed the Benedictine Rule.

[2] Widows

A category of women who could never be sponsae Dei in the manner of virgins whether regular or canonical were widows. Although the widow's rite in the PRG is called a Consecratio ¹⁷⁰ she is still perceived as inferior to the generic group of virgins. In the consecration rite for sacrae virgines rubric states that:

"All who are to be promoted to the holy ordines should be consecrated by the bishop before the reading of the gospel, because it is by them that the holy gospel is spread throughout all the world. But virgins and widows should be veiled after the gospel reading, because they are taught and instructed through the gospel". ¹⁷¹

This rubric shows that in one respect women religious were perceived as a group by virtue of their gender; for not even female virgins could constitute a clerical ordo.¹⁷² This distinction between women religious and monks/priests in the rubric is highlighted by the reference to the "veiling" of women as opposed to the "consecration" which men undergo. The symbolic nature of all women's subordination to men is illustrated by the fact that they

¹⁷⁰ See above p.221.

¹⁷¹ "Omnes qui ad sacros ordines debent promoveri ante pronuntiationem evangelii ab episcopo debent consecrari, quia ab eis praedicatio sancti evangelii debet per totum mundum diffundi. Virgines autem et viduae post lectum evangelium debent velari, quia decet eas et per evangelium praedicari"; PRG I,1,p.39.

¹⁷² Metz expressed a "quelque hésitation à traduire le terme ordo" ["La consécration des vierges dans l'Eglise franque", pp.42-3, note 31] which occurs in *the* Life of Pusinna; Vita Pusinnae, p.217. But Metz interprets ordo here as customary practice rather than in its strict liturgical sense; Ibid. There was a difference between monastic professions (hence the missa pro monachi die professionis suae [Deshusses,II,p.116]) and an ordo. The latter had a very specific application as a clerical rank. But most monks, in the ninth century were priests as the PRG acknowledges with the rites: Ordinatio diaconorum and ordinatio monachi; PRG I,pp.24,72. Abbesses were unique amongst women religious undergoing an ordinatio; but they were part of an ordo in the sense of a social status group.

are veiled after the gospel reading; the gospel instructs women when it is read in public by the priest.

Although women religious are perceived as a group here, this is not the case according to some rubrical directions in the consecration rite for widows. Parallel to the rubric from the rite for sacrae virgines, this rite states that widows should be veiled after the gospel which instructs them. ¹⁷³ Rubric following this states that:

"But the widow, because she is bound by the law of man, if she wishes to give herself to God, should be veiled by the priest, or even accept a veil blessed by the bishop at the altar, and should put the veil on herself, not the bishop". ¹⁷⁴

Thus the widow is considered inferior to the virgin who is personally consecrated by a higher-status cleric as was stated in legislative statements. ¹⁷⁵ Gender is not the only criterion in the categorisation of women religious. This is underlined by a third rubric in the widow's rite:

"Indeed only priests should veil widows, and only bishops virgins and before the gospel". ¹⁷⁶

Here, somewhat paradoxically, virgins, and the rubric does not define whether they are regular or canonical, are equated with their male counterparts by being veiled before the gospel. That this rule applies to all virgins is illustrated by the fact that the consecration rite for "secular virgins" states that they should be professed through the perpetual observation of the religious habit before the gospel. ¹⁷⁷

Further, although the rite for widows is called a Consecratio, rubrics within the rite refer to the

¹⁷³ PRG I,1,p.59.

¹⁷⁴ "Vidua autem quia soluta est a lege viri, se ipsam si vult Deo dare, debet et a presbitero velari, vel etiam consecratum ab episcopo velamen de altari accipere et ipsa sibi, non episcopus, illud debet imponere"; PRG I,2,p.59.

¹⁷⁵ See p.131 above.

¹⁷⁶ "Presbiteris vero licet viduas velare, solis episcopis virgines, et hoc ante evangelium"; PRG I,3,p.59.

¹⁷⁷ "Ante evangelium vero, professa illa de religiosi habitus observatione perpetua"; PRG I,4,p.51.

Benedictio vestimentorum viduae que fuerit castitatem professsa ¹⁷⁸ and the Benedictio propria viduae. ¹⁷⁹ The PRG does not indicate whether these widows were consecrated to a monastic lifestyle or whether their vow ¹⁸⁰ could be observed outside the cloister; its non-specificity suggests that both types of women were intended and that there was a specific perception of widows. Here liturgy may reflect the social reality where a widow, lacking the protection of a husband, could choose to retire to a convent or lead a religious life in her own house rather than remarrying. In either case, but especially in the first, such women placed themselves under the protection of the Church. As private religiosae or as canonesses they might usefully benefit from the protection of the local bishop if they chose to retain their private property. The difficulty of widows exercising choice over their future, and the concern of male lay society to control them, is acknowledged in the rubric, Vidua quia soluta est a lege viri ¹⁸¹; this parallels the safeguards against overhasty veiling of widows built into the legislation. ¹⁸²

III Deaconesses.

Gallican liturgies do not provide consecration for deaconesses, nor does the Gelasian or the Eighth-century Gelasian Sacramentaries. The first provision occurs in the Hadrianum ¹⁸³ and is a "feminised" version of a deacon's

¹⁷⁸ PRG I,4,p.60.

¹⁷⁹ Consolare domine; PRG I,8,p.60

¹⁸⁰ Their vow is described as a propositum sanctae continentiae; PRG I,11,p.61. This is a subtle change of the propositum sanctae virginitatis which is in the original version of this prayer, Famulas tuas domine custodia muniat pietatis from the Hadrianum. It is the first indication that widows take a propositum as part of their benediction.

¹⁸¹ See above, n.174.

¹⁸² See p.248 below.

¹⁸³ Exaudi domine preces nostras; Deshusses, I, 994, p.341.

prayer. ¹⁸⁴ Andrieu argued that "deaconesses" ceased to exist at Rome and were not accepted there again until the eighth century. ¹⁸⁵ This would explain why no such rite occurs in the Gelasian, but does appear in the Hadrianum. Furthermore, Andrieu did not regard these Roman deaconesses as the wives or widows of deacons because a papal decree in 826 referred to the abductors of velatae, uxores, or diaconae; deaconesses were therefore not wives. ¹⁸⁶ They were different from presbyterae (the wives of presbyters) alongside whom deaconesses were sometimes mentioned in eighth-century Roman sources. ¹⁸⁷

The question still remains as to why a rite for the consecration of a deaconess should appear in Francia in the late ninth and early tenth centuries. For the prayer and rubric as they occur in the Hadrianum are included the Leofric Missal ¹⁸⁸ and an elaborated rite occurs in the PRG. ¹⁸⁹

The Gaulish Church prohibited the ordination of women to the diaconate in the sixth century ¹⁹⁰ although Fortunatus described how Medard manu superposita consecrav

¹⁸⁴ Deshusses, Ibid, 31, p.97. This also occurs in the PRG's rite for deacons; PRG I, 13, p.25; 17a, p.27.

¹⁸⁵ Andrieu, Les Ordines Romani, vol.3, pp.142-143.

¹⁸⁶ Andrieu, Ibid, pp.140-142. Gryson argued that in the Early Roman Church there was a difference between the female diaconate which had a function, and widowhood which essentially was a state of life but canonically organised, Le ministère des femmes, p.175. Alternatively, Schäffer, argued that widows formed a part of the diaconate in the Early Church; Die Kanonissenstifter, pp.61ff.

¹⁸⁷ Andrieu, Ibid. It is possible that "deaconess" referred to both the wives of deacons and deaconesses in their own right.

¹⁸⁸ Leofric, p.226.

¹⁸⁹ PRG I, pp.54-58. The rubric alone, Ad diaconam faciendam, exists in the Pontifical of Aurillac; Leroquais, Les Pontificaux Manuscrits I, Fol.42 v0, p.12.

¹⁹⁰ The Councils of Epaône (571) and Orleans (533) were drawing on the prohibition as stated by the Council of Orange (441); Gryson, Le ministère des femmes, p.170.

[Radegund] diaconam.¹⁹¹ Yet conciliar legislation reveals the existence of a special order of widows who seem to have had a diaconal function in the baptism of women; they were excommunicated if they remarried.¹⁹² Their existence would help to explain the provision for the consecration of widows in both the Missale Gallicum vetus and the Missale Francorum with prayers which refer to the biblical Anna.¹⁹³

Certainly the memory of the widows as a special category in the Early Church may help to explain the provenance of some of the formulas in the PRG's rite for ordaining deaconesses. The provenance of the formulas may also help to explain the rite's function. The PRG takes two prayers from the Eighth-century Gelasian consecration rite for widows: Deus castitatis amator and Munera quesumus domine familiae.¹⁹⁴ The PRG also uses the Gallican widow's benediction prayer, Deus qui Annam filiam.¹⁹⁵

Schäfer argued that in the ninth century deaconesses headed institutes of canonesses.¹⁹⁶ Whilst I do not accept his arguments that canonesses/deaconesses were still a part of the clergy in the ninth century, there are links between the rites for the deaconess and the canoness. The consecration rites for a "secular virgin"/canoness and that for a deaconess share the

¹⁹¹ Vita Radegundis, MGH SRM, 2, c.12, p.368; and Gryson, Ibid.

¹⁹² Gryson, Ibid, p.172.

¹⁹³ See pp.215-16 above.

¹⁹⁴ PRG I, 3, 18, pp.54, 58. Moreover, the PRG's ordination rite for a widow contains the rubric, "Oratio ad missam in natalis viduae: Deus castitatis. Require ut supra consecratione diaconissae"; PRG I, 16, p.62.

¹⁹⁵ PRG I, 8, pp.55-56.

¹⁹⁶ This is based on the argument that institutes of canonesses absorbed the female diaconate in the seventh century; Schäfer, Kanonissen und Diakonissen.

prayer, Preces famulae tuae... ut assumpta castitatis.¹⁹⁷ The link with the canoness is underlined by the fact that the Hadrianum's deaconess' prayer, Exaudi, domini, preces nostras ¹⁹⁸ also occurs in the ordination rite for a canonical abbess.

Whilst Schäfer's premise concerning the prevalence of institutes of canonesses is unacceptable, it is significant that the Council of Worms (868) reiterated canon 15 of the Council of Chalcedon that women over forty could be deaconesses ¹⁹⁹ and that the deaconess' rite occurs in two rites also of East Frankish provenance—those in the Leofric Missal and the PRG. If the title of deaconess was used by abbesses ²⁰⁰, it may have conferred extra status not only through symbolic sacral connotations but also through its association, in the Council of Worms, with maturity.

Too much weight should not be placed on liturgical borrowings as these were in the nature of developing liturgical practice; nevertheless, compilers only borrowed from rites which were considered appropriate in order to enhance the importance of a new or developed rite. However, the revival of a deaconess' rite in the late ninth century, may indicate provision for conferring additional status on women of royal or especially noble birth who had entered convents where there already was an abbess; for example, Oda, the co-founder of Gandersheim

¹⁹⁷ The PRG's manuscripts C,D,T and V have this prayer for deaconesses after the acceptance of a veil [PRG I,11,p.57]; whereas manuscripts B,G,K, and L have the prayer at an earlier point after the Kyrieleison [PRG I, 7a,p.55].

¹⁹⁸ In manuscripts C,D,T and V; PRG I,7,p.55.

¹⁹⁹ See above, pp.120-21.

²⁰⁰ As indicated by a ninth-century gloss to the canon in the Council of Worms; see p.121 above. Bishop Atto of Vercelli (924-61) also referred to abbesses as "deaconesses"; Schafer, Ibid. This evidence comes from northern Italy.

and mother of Hathumoda, the abbess there. ²⁰¹ Perhaps the title of deaconess, which was conferred by a bishop ²⁰², was used to accurately reflect the status of such a widow for widows otherwise were blessed by a priest.

This application would explain why the PRG's deaconess rite confers a stola ²⁰³ which was something conferred on the deacon ²⁰⁴; but also a velum ²⁰⁵, and the ring and torques exactly as in the consecration rite for sacrae virgines. ²⁰⁶ Surely an abbess would have already taken the veil in a previous virgin's or widow's consecration rite? Alternatively, this deaconess' rite may provide for women, either virgins or widows, who entered convents and immediately became abbesses on account of familial connections. Certainly the stola, with its sacerdotal symbolism, would confer special status, although it is significant that, while the deacon is "ordained", the deaconess is simply "made". ²⁰⁷ The ring and torques suggest that deaconesses were virgins; but perhaps widows took on the virgin's ring and crown if they were older women who were unlikely to remarry and were assured of being permanently bound to Christ. The trappings of virginity symbolised a higher status. This last point confirms that in an examination of the liturgical provision for religious women, gender analysis has its use only alongside age and status, and other criteria perceived by the liturgists themselves.

²⁰¹ The Vita Hathumudae refers to a decana; MGH SS,4, c.20,p.173.

²⁰² See n.207 below.

²⁰³ PRG I,9,p.56.

²⁰⁴ PRG I,11,14a,15,16,17,17a,pp.24-27.

²⁰⁵ PRG I,10,p.56.

²⁰⁶ PRG I,12,13,p.57.

²⁰⁷ "Ad diaconam faciendam"; PRG I,p.54. The rite also refers to "Episcopus cum diaconam benedicit"; but also to the "missa ad diaconam consecrandam"; PRG I,1,2,p.54. However, according to the Council of Worms (868): "Diaconissa non ordinanda [est] ante annum quadragesimum"; Mansi,15,c.73,col.882.

CHAPTER FIVE.

WOMEN AND THE REGULATION OF MARRIAGE:
THE CHURCH'S PERCEPTION OF WOMEN AS WIVES.

In the ninth century (noble) women who did not follow a religious life otherwise married. Just as the Frankish Church sought to regulate women who followed the former route, the Church also attempted to extend its influence over the latter. This formed a part of the larger process whereby the Church attempted to bring more areas of lay life under its direction extending Christianisation from mere external behaviour to internally-held belief. ¹ This process was two-fold: firstly, there were attempts to impose the Church's standards of behaviour via regulatory texts; secondly, liturgical provision replaced pagan rituals or made Christian ritual an accepted addition to existing secular practice. ²

Marriage was the most important area of lay life the Church wished to control since it involved morals, but also the most fundamental procedures binding family groups and the wider community through the designation of heirs and property. Of the many scholarly examinations of marriage in the ninth century, some adopt an essentially legalistic approach ³ but others focus on how marriage was conceived as an institution through both prescription and liturgy ⁴ and as a sacrament. ⁵

¹ McKitterick, The Frankish Church.

² See pp.290-311 below.

³ P. Daudet, Études sur l'histoire de la juridiction matrimoniale, (Paris, 1933).

⁴ K. Ritzer, Le Mariage dans les Églises chrétiennes du Ier au XIe siècle, (Paris, 1970) is the invaluable and comprehensive examination following this dual approach; but also see J. Gaudemet, Le Mariage en Occident, (Paris, 1987), pp.109-132. On particular aspects of marriage as a legal institution see D. Owen Hughes on customary gift-

The position of women within marriage has been addressed by fewer studies but predominantly via the legal approach either through an examination of the secular leges ⁶, or through comparison of their statements with those of the Carolingian reforms. ⁷ However, an examination of women and marriage is required using both the prescriptive sources and the liturgy. Prescriptive views of wives must be complemented by theological ones; and this, in turn, throws light on the image of what Frankish ecclesiastics regarded as the "good wife".

giving requirements, "From Brideprice to Dowry in Mediterranean Europe", Journal of Family History, 3 (1978), pp.262-96; on the terminology and reasons for separation and divorce from the Council of Verberie (758) to the Council of Tribur (895) see G. Fransen, "La rupture du mariage", Spoletto, 24, (1977), pp.604-30; and on spiritual consanguinity see J.H. Lynch, Godparents and Kinship in Early Medieval Europe, (Princeton, 1986) at pp.219-81 and part IV. Devisse details Hincmar's views, and other contemporary episcopal views, particularly concerning the Lothar/Theutberga case but also wider interpretations of what was perceived to constitute a marriage, divorce and consanguinity and social aspects of marriage; Hincmar, I, pp.367-466. On the effects of marriage on family structures and the distribution of property see Goody, The Development of the Family and Marriage. Specifically concerning the ritual of marriage see C. Vogel, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage: leur signification dans la formation du lien durant le haut Moyen Age", Spoletto, 24, (1977), pp.397-465.

⁵ Toubert, "La théorie du mariage".

⁶ F.L. Ganshof, "Le statut de la femme dans la monarchie franque", Recueils Société Jean Bodin, 12 (1962), pp.5-58. This presents an overview of the constituents of marital contracts [pp.18-29] and provision for divorce [pp.31-33] in the secular leges.

⁷ J.-A. McNamara and S.F. Wemple, "Marriage and Divorce in the Frankish Kingdom", in S.M. Stuard (ed.) Women in Medieval Society, pp.95-124 and "The Power of Women Through the Family in Medieval Europe, 500-1100", in M. Erler and M. Kowaleski, (eds.), Women and Power in the Middle Ages, pp.83-101. Specifically concerning the reform legislation see Wemple, Women, at pp.75-96. Jane Bishop looked at Frankish bishops' attitudes towards women and marriage, but the majority of her evidence consisted of Hincmar's and contemporary papal responses to well-known legal wrangles, in particular the Lothar/Theutberga case, "Bishops as Marital Advisors", in J. Kirschner and S.F. Wemple, (eds.), Women of the Medieval World, pp.53-84.

I. Legitimate Marriages: Enquiry and Public Nuptials.

A legitimate marriage did not require the sanction of the Church, a fact Frankish ecclesiastics recognised. In the 860s Hincmar of Rheims set out what he regarded as the constituents of a legitimate marriage making no reference to the Church's participation: parental consent, a formal betrothal, the exchange of gifts and public nuptials.⁸ Although it is unwise to rely only on Hincmar, his comment concerning the publicity of nuptials is representative of the importance attached by the Frankish Church generally to this aspect of marriage.

The principle of public nuptials was stated in the earliest Carolingian legislation: the synod of Verneuil (755) concluded that all noble and non-noble laity should undergo public nuptials.⁹ In so doing it enshrined as ecclesiastical law the "formalités du mariage prévues par les différents droits populaires".¹⁰ Clearly, publicity afforded opportunities for the Church: only through the public nature of the event could ecclesiastics hope to avert invalid marriages and prevent the dissolution of valid ones. However, the insistence throughout ninth-century episcopal legislation on public marriages indicates that this requirement was not uniformly observed. Benedictus Levita stated that those who wished to marry should undergo public nuptials because secret marriages increased the risk of consanguinious or

⁸ "Inter aequales legitima fiunt coniugia, cum a parentibus quorum interest, petita et legaliter desponsata et dotata, et publicis nuptiis honorata femina coniugii copulae sociatur et ex duobus unum corpus unaque caro efficitur"; MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no. 136, l. 28-30, p. 92.

⁹ "Ut omnes homines laici publicas nuptias faciant, tam nobiles quam innobiles"; MGH Capit. I, c. 15, p. 36. It is unclear whether homines is used generically here; see n. 19 below where it is employed in the male sense only. It is probable that homines does indicate men because the legislation often refers to men taking wives; n. 14, 19 below.

¹⁰ Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp. 334-35. Burgundian law set out the constituents of a marriage including parental consent and the giving of a dos: "ut nuptialis donatio sollemniter celebretur": Leges Burgundionum: Lex Romana; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c. XXXVII, 1, 2, pp. 155-56.

adulterous unions. ¹¹ Herard of Tours (858) stated that secret weddings should not be conducted with consecrated virgins or widows ¹²; thus a correctly conducted marriage should culminate in a public celebration. ¹³ The Admonitio Synodalis also stated that no man should accept a wife except with public nuptials. ¹⁴

Publicity was afforded through a pre-marital enquiry. But the Church did not have, nor expected to have, a monopoly on this procedure. The Council of Bavaria (743) first prescribed this procedure ¹⁵ stating that there should be no hidden marriages, rather they should be announced to the priest who should investigate with parentes and vicini whether there was any affinity between the two parties.¹⁶ Similar cooperation was envisaged by the Council of Friouli (796/7) between the priest and vicini vel maiores natu who would know the family backgrounds of both sponsi

¹¹ "Sanctitum est, ut publicae nuptiae ab his, qui nubere cupiunt, fiant: quia saepe in nuptiis clam factis gravia peccata tam in sponsis aliorum quam in propinquis sive in adulterinis coniugiis, et quod peius est dicere consanguineis, accrescunt, vel accumulatur"; PL97, Bk. III, c. 179, col. 820A.

¹² "Ut nullus occulte nuptias faciat, nec virginem vel viduam sacratam ducat"; PL121, c. 130, col. 773.

¹³ Ut sponsus et sponsa cum precibus et oblationibus a sacerdote benedicantur, et [ea] legibus sponsetur ac dotetur, et a paranympis [attendants and relatives] custodiatur, et publice solemniterque accipiat"; PL121, c. 89, col. 770.

¹⁴ "Omnibus denuntiate ut nullus uxorem accipiat nisi publice celebratis nuptiis"; Admonitio Synodalis, c. 76, p. 63. Amiet dated this text to the first two decades of the ninth century, from around Basle; Ibid, pp. 75-77.

¹⁵ Ritzer, Le Mariage, p. 335. This council's importance lies in its representation of the efforts of Boniface of Mainz to extend the Frankish Church's influence in a (relatively) marginal area.

¹⁶ "Ut et nuptiae caveantur, ne inordinate neque inexaminae non fiant, neque quisquam audeat ante nubere, antequam presbitero suo adnuntiet et parentibus suis et vicinis, qui eorum possint examinare propinquitatem, et cum eorum fiat consilio et voluntate"; MGH Conc. II i, c. 12, p. 51.

and sponsae.¹⁷ The Capitulare Missorum (802) referred to seniores populi helping the priest assess whether a forthcoming marriage was incestuous¹⁸; and a late ninth/early tenth-century anonymous episcopal statute stated that, if a man wished to take a wife, the priest should ask the iudex to investigate amongst reliqui homines veredici et maiores natu whether there was a blood relationship.¹⁹

These statements also evidence the Church's efforts to extend its control over marriage with the addition of benedictions to the secular constituents of a valid marriage. It is significant that the earlier insistence on the pre-marital enquiries by the Councils of Bavaria (743) and Friouli (796/7)²⁰ are repeated by the Capitulare Missorum (802)²¹ and Vat. Ottob.261²² but with the

¹⁷ "ne forte per erroris ignaviam vel certe, quod peius est, diabolico instigati amore inlicita conubia celebrentur, sed interventis pactis sponsalibus, per aliquam dilationis moram, requisiti quin etiam diligenti cura vicini vel maiores natu loci illius, qui possint scire lineam generationem utrorumque, sponsi scilicet vel sponsae, in eo etiam, ut sine notitia sacerdotis plebis illius nullatenus fiat, quatenus nulla deinceps separationis tribulatio intercedat"; MGH Conc. III, c.8, p.192.

¹⁸ "Ne incestis nuptiis et se ipsos et caeteros maculare audeant; coniunctiones facere non praesumat, antequam episcopi, presbyteri cum senioribus populi consanguinitatem coniungentium diligenter enquirant; et tum cum benedictionem (sic) iungantur"; MGH Capit. I, c.35, p.98.

¹⁹ "Ceteris vero temporibus, quando aliquis deliberat uxorem accipere, convocet sacerdos iudicem eiusdem loci ac reliquos homines veridicos et maiores natu et inquirat per eos diligenter, si forte sibi aliqua carnis propinquitatem iungantur an non. Quodsi nulla carnis afinitate copulantur, tunc cum benedictione sacerdotis accipiat homo uxorem de populo Dei"; Vat. Ottob. 261, c.13, p.583. On this text's provenance see n.22 below.

²⁰ See n.16 and n.17 above.

²¹ See n.18 above.

²² See n.19 above. McKitterick has suggested that although this late ninth-century text, Vat. Ottob. 261, is from Rheims it probably has Bavarian application since "it is far more conversant with the habits of a primitive society" [The Frankish Church, p.73]; but the inclusion of

addition of a priestly benediction. Herard of Tours ²³ and Isaac of Langres (850s) ²⁴ added the new element of the priestly benediction. Regino of Prüm did the same²⁵ although the remainder of Regino's description is similar to that in the earlier ninth-century Martinian Penitential. ²⁶

However, these references to priestly benedictions read as descriptions of what was regarded as a valid marriage rather than instructions to priests to perform benedictions. As we have noted, Hincmar did not refer to a priestly benediction in his description of a valid marriage. ²⁷ Other episcopal statutes show that the degree of control the Church had over marriage by enforcing sacerdotal blessings below the ranks of the royal family and the high aristocracy was minimal. Six manuscripts of the Admonitio Synodalis state that priests should not go to weddings. ²⁸ This indicates that weddings were of a

this instruction on pre-marital enquiries and benedictions casts doubt on this argument.

²³ See n.13 above. Herard derived much material from Benedictus Levita [McKitterick, The Frankish Church, p.65] who includes a similar description with an attribution to Augustine; PL97, Bk.III, c.179, col.820B.

²⁴ PL124, cols.1094D-1095D. These statutes are also heavily reliant on Benedictus Levita; McKitterick, Ibid, p.68.

²⁵ "Sponsus et sponsa cum benedicendi sunt a sacerdote a parentibus suis vel a paranympis offerantur"; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.152, p.271. Regino quotes the Council of Carthage as his source "De benedicenda sponsa" as does the PRG which includes this rubric in its Missa ad sponsas benedicendas; PRG II,1, p.414. Andrieu demonstrated that this was a false attribution and the source was the Statuta ecclesiae antiqua; Les Ordines Romani, vol.3, p.619.

²⁶ Also quoting Augustine: "Qualis esse debeat uxor quae habenda est... si viro casta, si desponsata in virginitate, si dotata legitime et a parentibus tradita, et a sponso et paranympis eius accipienda"; Wasserschleben, c.37, p.290.

²⁷ See n.8 above.

²⁸ Admonitio Synodalis, c.75, p.62. These include the Provençal group of MSS, EFQX, and a Picard MS, A, but also the oldest versions of the text, the tenth-century MSS

secular nature and to be avoided.²⁹ Rodulf of Bourges decreed that priests should avoid weddings in the same breath as instructing his priests not to bear arms - both signs of secularity and of the male laity, and to be avoided.³⁰ That the principle of sacerdotal blessings was only making headway by the later part of the ninth century is demonstrated by the second group of manuscripts of the Admonitio Synodalis. These represent a later ninth-century manuscript tradition and state that priests may not go to weddings except to give benedictions.³¹ This indicates that benedictions were not performed in church which, coupled with the inconsistency amongst Frankish ecclesiastics on the need for priestly blessings, suggests that the Church's influence over the ritual of marriage was rather fragile below the nobility.³² This raises questions about the Church's wider control over marriage practices.

Thus, the involvement of the male laity in pre-marital enquiries requires further comment. It is significant that Vat. Ottob.261 referred to reliqui homines distinguishing them from the man taking a wife.³³ This indicates that

H1,2 and 3 which occur in three copies of the PRG; Amiet, "Une Admonitio Synodalis à l'époque carolingienne", pp.13-40. Paradoxically, The PRG provides a benediction for sponsae and an Item actio nuptialis; see pp.304-05 below.

²⁹ Herard of Tours prescribed against dancing at weddings; PL121,c.112,col.772. Hincmar classed weddings and funerals with saecularia and vanae festivitates; PL125,c.14,col.776.

³⁰ "Prohibemus autem omnimodis, ut presbyteri... non... ad nuptias vadant nec arma sumant"; MGH Capit. Episc.,c.19,p.248.

³¹ Admonitio Synodalis,c.75,p.62; MSS C,D,T,V,W,Z which comprise the Worms group.

³² Dhuoda implied that she was married in the palace chapel at Aachen where she presumably received a priestly blessing; Riché, Manuel, Praefatio, 1.1-6,p.84. But this is only one case other than royal coronation/marriage ordines; see below ch.6.

³³ See n.19 above.

the homines in this instance are male. It is therefore likely that the terminology employed in the other, similar statements concerning pre-marital enquiries also indicates males. The parentes are relatives; but they are mentioned only by the Council of Bavaria (743). It is the vicini and seniores populi or maiores natu who predominate in these statements. Vicini implies local men; but the seniores and the maiores natu indicate either men of maturity and, or men of status - that is, the local nobility, counts or missi.

The facts that the Councils of Bavaria (743) and Friouli (796/7) refer to vicini, and also that Friouli and the anonymous episcopal statute both speak of the enquiry being conducted by the priest and men "of that place" (loci), indicates that these statements are referring to practice in local communities - or as near as we are likely to get. In all the Frankish kingdoms the Church wished to impose the Christian view of marriage on all social strata. But the initiative behind these investigations also seems to have been coming from laymen in the community.

II. Women and the Control of Marriage.

Studies which have treated marriage in terms of the civil and ecclesiastical jurisdictions follow an anachronistic methodology which is not a useful approach for a study of women and how actual practice affected them. ³⁴

³⁴ Daudet's thesis was that in the ninth century an aggressive reforming Church progressively undermined the lay tribunal's traditional competence over marriage, a process initiated by the Capitulare missorum Generale (802) [MGH Capit. I,c.3,38, pp.97-98] which stated that a comes' jurisdiction over cases of adultery and incest was not exclusive - bishops also had competence in such cases; Études sur l'histoire de la juridiction matrimoniale, p.68. But Daudet was predating a process culminating in the Gregorian Reform where the Church did more fully take over jurisdiction over marriage. However, Daudet admitted that the case of Northilda demonstrated the continuing competence of the "civil authority", Ibid, pp.55-57. In this instance Northilda took her complaint, that her husband Agembertus had subjected her to unnatural acts, to the assembly at Attigny (822); here the bishops decided that the case should be dealt with by married laymen

The argument that the ninth century witnessed a reforming Church whose successes resulted in "the triumph of the Christian model of lifelong marriage" ³⁵ is undermined by these statements about pre-marital enquiries. These indicate not only that priests sought the informative help of "senior" laymen but that priests were dependent on them. This also qualifies the assertion that, "by insinuating itself into the very fabric of domestic life, of heirship and marriage, the Church gained great control over the grass roots of society itself. Not only was royalty in its thrall, but the peasants too".³⁶ Ultimately with the Gregorian Reform this process may have been successful; nor would one wish to entirely discount the degree to which the Frankish Church began to change attitudes to marriage in the ninth century. But in this

[laici coniugatorum] who were better qualified to deal with such issues [qui de talibus negotiis erant cogniti et legibus saeculi sufficientissime praediti]; Hincmar's account PL125, De divortio, col.655A-B]. Devisse saw this case as representative of a process whereby the two jurisdictions collaborated [Hincmar, I, pp.422-23] since Hincmar was aware of the spheres of civil and canonical authority [Ibid, pp.459ff]. Similarly, Gaudemet argued that although, "la justice épiscopale tend progressivement à les (juges seculiers) supplanter", the ecclesiastical competence was not exclusive and there was a degree of collaboration between secular and ecclesiastical authorities; Le Mariage, pp.112-13. While Devisse and Gaudemet present a more balanced view than Daudet, their argument for cooperation between the two powers still imposes a definitive structure not warranted by the evidence for actual practice which, other than a few well-known cases, is sparse. McNamara and Wemple also regarded the ninth century as a period of cooperation between the two authorities: "these bishops were inspired by the concept of a dual government of Church and state... in matters concerning marriage and divorce, as in other aspects of life, they sought to complete the process of welding secular and ecclesiastical practice into a uniform code"; "Marriage and Divorce in the Frankish Kingdoms", p.107. However, McNamara and Wemple's views [followed by Wemple, Women] constitute an anachronistic imposition of legal jurisdictions unrepresentative of the ad hoc responses to a variety of local cases with different solutions. Further, McNamara and Wemple do not acknowledge different regional practices.

³⁵ Wemple, Women, p.95.

³⁶ Goody, The Development of the Family and Marriage, p.45.

period the Church could hope to influence marriage practices only in so far as these "senior" laymen's interests allowed. Thus there may have been more flexibility in practice than some of the reform polemic might suggest. The process of the Church's insinuation that Goody describes had some way to go in some Frankish areas by the end of the ninth century considering that in practice "l'observation des formes déterminées par le droit populaire était considérée comme un presuppose pour la réalisation d'un acte juridique". ³⁷

Importantly there is clearly an issue of gender here. In view of the collaboration evidenced in the pre-marital enquiries between the Church and laymen, the effect of the reforms' attempt to impose the Christian model of marriage was possibly only marginal on the lives of most women if control over them was still exercised by men whether they were priests or laymen. Wemple has argued that the Church's insistence on monogamy "widened the gap between wives and concubines" and that "in the open and fluid society of the Merovingian period more women had access to wealth and status through marriage than in the ninth century". ³⁸ This picture of suddenly decreased independence and mobility for women through marriage strategies in the ninth century is highly questionable. The male members of the kin and community had always been the principal power-brokers. Even if Christian precepts on monogamy and what constituted a valid union began to be accepted, men continued to control the processes; a greater degree of continuity for most women seems likely.

However, there is more than just the criterion of gender at issue in the involvement in these investigations of parentes, vicini, and seniores or maiores natu. If the latter category refers to local lords, the issue of status cross-cuts gender. For, if the pre-marital enquiries covered non-noble persons, both men and women would be subject to such lordly control. If the sponsi and sponsae

³⁷ Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.347.

³⁸ Wemple, Women, p.95.

were noble the initiative behind the investigations may have been royal.

Royal involvement in marriage practices was acknowledged by Hincmar who stated, in the case of the adulterous Ingeltrude who refused to return to her husband Boson, that although it was the bishops' duty to protect her it was for the king to bring her to her husband's presence".³⁹ But this comment illustrates the king as law-enforcer. There is little evidence for kingly manipulation of noble marriage strategies in the ninth century. It is therefore all the more striking that two hagiographical texts rewritten in the ninth century suggest that the image of kingly interference in marriages was nevertheless relevant. The Vita Sadalbergae describes how the saint's father feared that the king's anger would descend on his daughter whose decision (not to marry) had reached the king's ears. The young widow Sadalberga was therefore married to Blandinus on the counsel of King Dagobert; although she had wanted to pursue a religious life, and against her parents wishes, she married "on the order of the king and to have children".⁴⁰ At the end of the ninth century Hucbald described how another young widow, Rictrude, was ordered to marry by Dagobert; she only escaped remarriage with the help of St. Amand and by tricking the king into his consent.⁴¹ It would be surprising if ninth-century Frankish kings were uniquely

³⁹ "restat rex, in cuius regno degit... eam ad viri sui praesentiam adduci faciat"; MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no.135, l.25-26, p.83.

⁴⁰ "Metuens autem praefatus Gundoinus, ne ob filiam iram regis saevitiamque incurreret, eam a calle quo ire sponte decreverat pedetentim retraxit... Iam enim opinio eius ad aures regias prevenerat... Vir nomine Blandinus... consiliis regiis gratus... acceperat... praedictam Sadalbergam non eius sponte... licet invitis parentibus, regio tamen iussu et ob liberorum procreandorum causam in suum adscivit coniugium"; MGH SRM, 5, c.10, p.55.

⁴¹ Vita Rictrudis, PL132, c.8, cols.836-37. Although not a direct example, kingly power is hinted at in the Vita Glodesindis; the hagiographer relates as divine intervention the actions of King Childeric who imprisoned and executed the virgin saint's impotent husband; ASS Iulii VI, c.I, 6, p.204.

disinterested in noble marriages, and the distribution of wealth that accompanied them. ⁴²

Parentes may have been mentioned only by the Council of Bavaria (743) in the context of the pre-marital enquiry but consent was vital. Parentes' consent ⁴³ to marriage was a requirement concerning women in the secular leges. ⁴⁴ It was also one of Hincmar's constituents of a legitimate marriage but one which applied to men and women. ⁴⁵ If seniores or maiores natu also signify older men this indicates that the criterion of age requires consideration alongside gender. For the marriages of sons were as liable to being controlled as daughters as some well-known cases illustrate.

In 862 Judith, Charles the Bald's daughter was "abducted" and married Baldwin, count of Flanders; by acquiring her brother's consent she subverted the correct structure of fatherly control. ⁴⁶ Although Charles was ultimately reconciled to this union he initially attempted to have the marriage declared invalid as it had not been given parental approval. ⁴⁷ But sons also required this consent. Charles' son, Louis the Stammerer, repudiated Ansgard and married Adelaide in 878 apparently on the grounds that the

⁴² That kings interfered in noble marriages at other times and places: see Leyser regarding the Ottonians, Rule and Conflict, pp.62,68-70; Nelson concerning Alfred, "Commentary", p.332,note 42; and P. Stafford on eleventh century English kings and the protection of widows and virgins from forced marriages, "The Laws of Cnut and the History of Anglo-Saxon Royal Promises", Anglo-Saxon England,10,(1982),pp.173-90 at p.177,note 27.

⁴³ Parentes could indicate relatives other than parents.

⁴⁴ Visigothic law provided sanctions against a woman who married another man against her father's will; Leges Visigothorum, MGH Legum Sectio I.1,c.III,1,2,p.122-23. On "la tutelle de la femme" in the leges see Ganshof, "Le Statut de la femme" pp.12-29.

⁴⁵ See above n.8.

⁴⁶ AB, MGH SRG,5,pp.56-57.

⁴⁷ Hence in 863 the couple went, or were sent, to Rome to seek legitimacy for their union; AB, MGH SRG,5,p.66.

former union had not been given parental consent.⁴⁸ The marriage of a second son, Charles, to a widow was also declared invalid in 863 because it was contracted without parental approval.⁴⁹ Hincmar described how Stephen, who wished to have his marriage to the daughter of Raymund of Toulouse annulled, testified that his marriage was valid because it had taken place with the consent of his parentes.⁵⁰

Pope Nicholas in 866 stated the principle of mutual consent as a prerequisite for marriage.⁵¹ But "choice" was not an element of Frankish marriages in practice. Moreover, although the consent of parentes was not required specifically in the case of women it was more of an issue for them as widows. Charles the Bald claimed that as a widow Judith was, under secular law, under his mundium and the tuitio of the Church.⁵² Widows were under special scrutiny because their remarriage particularly

⁴⁸ Hincmar's analysis of this marriage is in Flodoard: MGH SS, 13, III, c.19, pp.510-11. Having condemned Lothar's repudiation of Theutberga Hincmar remained silent on Louis' repudiation of Ansgard; but Devisse defends Hincmar against Brühl's charge of hypocrisy arguing that Hincmar recognised the validity of the first marriage by supporting the succession of the two sons of this union; Hincmar, I, pp.436-39.

⁴⁹ AB, MGH SRG, 5, p.58.

⁵⁰ "Consensu parentum et amicorum meorum... in coniugem legaliter petii, et optentam legaliter desponsavi"; MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no.136, l.11-13, p.89. By the later middle ages and the early modern period, "the Church had diminished the paternal authority by recognizing the validity of marriages contracted by 'children of the family' without their parents' consent"; J.-L. Flandrin, Families in Former Times, (Cambridge, 1979), pp.130-40, at p.131.

⁵¹ "Sufficiat secundum leges, solus eorum consensus de quarum coniunctionibus agitur. Qui consensus, si solus in nuptiis forte defuerit, cetera omnia, etiam cum ipso coitu celebrata, frustrantur"; MGH Epp. Karol., 6, no.99, l.21-23, p.570.

⁵² "Filiam nostram Iudith viduam secundam leges divines et mundanas sub tuitione ecclesiastica et regio munderburde constitutam Balduinus sibi furatus est in uxorem"; MGH Capit. II, no.243, c.5, p.160. This is included in the condemnation of abduction; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.188, p.287.

concerned relatives fearing the alienation of property to another family.⁵³ Men who fornicated with widows in the first thirty days of their widowhood were subject to a 60 solidi fine.⁵⁴ The legislation also prescribed that widows should not be over-hastily veiled: they should wait thirty days and in the bishop's absence take the advice of ecclesiastics and also of their parentes and amici.⁵⁵ Thus the Church acknowledged that it could not impose its views on the remarriage of widows without the cooperation of laymen; it may even have sometimes allowed these interests to predominate over its own - as widows brought property to the Church - when it came to the "choice" of marriage or a religious life for women.

III. Abduction

Abduction was the other single most important issue specific to women and of concern to parentes. The secular leges indicate that abduction had always been a problem concerning both married⁵⁶ and unmarried women⁵⁷;

⁵³ A widow's parentes were not the only interest-group fearing the alienation of property. The Capitula Legi Salicae Addita (819) stated that a man wishing to marry a widow now had to gain the consent of his parentes; MGH Capit. I, c.8, p.293. Concerns over the alienation of property to a widow especially if she had heirs from a previous marriage may have motivated this capitulary.

⁵⁴ Capitulare Legibus Addenda (818/9); MGH Capit. I, c.4, p.281. This canon is titled, De raptu viduarum but the widow could be volens. Regino of Prüm includes this canon without the De raptu heading; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.190, p.288.

⁵⁵ Capit. Eccles. (818/19), MGH Capit. I, c.21, p.278. Regino also includes this canon but only mentions amici; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.189, p.288. The lack of parity for widowed men and women is further illustrated by the Penitential of Theodore which stated that women had to wait a year before remarriage but men only a month; Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.XII, 9, p.214.

⁵⁶ Lex Alamannorum; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 5.1, c.L, 1, 2, pp.109-110. Lex Salica (Text S); MGH Legum Sectio, I, 4.2, c.XXIII, 10, p.209.

⁵⁷ Leges Burgundionum; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c.XII, 1-5, pp.51-52. The Lex Romana version of Burgundian law condemned the abduction of virgins, widows, and women dedicated to God; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c.IX, 1-4, pp.132-33. Similarly, Lex Baiwariorum condemned the abduction of

although they acknowledged that women sometimes cooperated with an "abductor".⁵⁸ Such cooperation was the only means by which women could exercise choice.⁵⁹ *F a m i l i a l* concerns - broken commitments, compensation for the *sponsi* of abducted women, and the difficulties of marrying an unattached woman who had been abducted "by force"⁶⁰ - were still current in the ninth century. For the Church the abduction of a married woman might additionally involve the sin of adultery; the abduction of a betrothed woman violated the *desponsatio* which the Church recognised as one of the constituents of a valid marriage; and the abduction of a nun violated her religious vow.⁶¹

It is not always clear from the prescriptions concerning abduction which women were being described since the term *viduae et virgines* often denotes women religious but can also encompass secular women. The Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) condemned men and their accomplices who presumed to abduct virgins and widows;⁶² this statement's general

virgins and widows and betrothed women; *MGH Legum Sectio*, I,5.2,c.VIII,6,7,16,pp.356-60. *Lex Alamannorum* also legislated against the abduction of betrothed and unattached women; *MGH Legum Sectio*,I,5.1,c.51,52,53, pp.110-11. *Lex Salica* (Text D) also condemned the abduction of *puellae*; *MGH Legum Sectio*,I,4.2,c.XIV,1-4,p.52. *Lex Visigothorum* condemned the abduction of virgins, widows and betrothed women; *MGH Legum Sectio*, I.1,c.III,3.1,2,3,5,pp.139-42.

⁵⁸ *Leges Burgundionum*: *Lex Romana*, *MGH Legum Sectio*, I,2.1, c.IX,1,p.132. *Lex Baiwariorum*; *MGH Legum Sectio*,I, 5.2,c.VIII,16,p.360. For further comments on the *leges'* treatment of abduction see McNamara and Wemple, "Marriage and Divorce in the Frankish Kingdom", pp.100-101.

⁵⁹ On the role of Judith as a "key-player" in her own abduction see Nelson; *Charles the Bald*, p.203.

⁶⁰ The term *vis* may imply rape in addition to abduction; *Ecclesiastical Discipline*, Bk.2,c.154,p.272.

⁶¹ Hence Halitgar of Cambrai included sanctions against abduction in his penitential in the section entitled "De fornicatione"; *Wasserschleben*, Bk.6, c.II,14,pp.364-66.

⁶² "Qui vero deinceps rapere virgines vel viduas praesumpserint... ipsi et complices eorum anathematizentur"; *MGH Conc.* III,c.66,p.116. This is included in the *Ecclesiastical Discipline*, Bk.2,c.159,

application is not diminished by another specifically condemning the abduction of religious virgins and widows.⁶³ The Council of Quierzy (857) stated that no man should dare to abduct virgins or widows ⁶⁴; and the Anonymous of Trier, condemned the abductors of virgins and widows without it being clear whether these were religious or secular women, or both. ⁶⁵ Herard of Tours even less specifically condemned the abductors of feminae ⁶⁶; and the Council of Worms (868) condemned the abduction of mulieres. ⁶⁷ The penitentials are equally unspecific where they give out penance to the abductors of "virgins and widows". ⁶⁸

p.274. Canon 54 of the Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) referred to "raptores virginum et viduarum" [MGH Conc. III,c.64,p.115] which Regino included under the title, "De raptoribus virginum et viduarum" which does not allow for a definite identification of the women; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,p.274; Bk.1,c.428,pp.195-6.

⁶³ "Qui sanctimoniales virgines vel viduas rapiunt"; MGH Conc. III,c.67,p.116. Regino included this canon with the specific title, "De his qui sanctimoniales rapiunt"; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.161,p.275. This would seem to distinguish these women from secular women. However, elsewhere, Regino includes a canon which condemns the raptores of virgins and widows but then condemns those who tempt sacrae virgines into marriage; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.160,p.275. This last repeats a canon in Halitgar of Cambrai's Penitential; PL105,Bk.4,c.16,col.883.

⁶⁴ MGH Conc. III,c.5,p.398. This canon goes on to say: "Nullus deo sacratam rapiat..."; but it is not certain whether this is to clarify the first phrase or to differentiate a woman religious from other, secular virgins and widows.

⁶⁵ MGH Capit. Episc.,c.10,p.56.

⁶⁶ PL121,c.110,col.772.

⁶⁷ "Eos qui rapiunt mulieres sub nomine simul habitandi, vel cooperantes aut conniventes raptoribus,... ut si quidem clerici sunt, decidant gradu proprio, si vero laici, anathematizentur"; Mansi 15,c.77,col.882. This statement is a version of a capitulary of 818/19 which states its source as canon 27 of the Council of Chalcedon and describes the women as puellae; Capit. Eccles., MGH Capit. I,c.23,p.278.

⁶⁸ Halitgar of Cambrai gives three years penance to guis for the abduction of a virgin or widow; Wasserschleben, Bk.6,c.II,14, p.366. This provision also occurs in the Merseburg Penitential [Wasserschleben,

These general condemnations illustrate that in the context of abduction, some Frankish ecclesiastics did not differentiate between religious and secular women since they were all vulnerable. Where prescriptions specifically refer to the abduction of women religious, the severest penalty was meted out to the abductor - permanent disqualification from marriage.⁶⁹ However, while the penitentials condemned fornication with women religious⁷⁰ they were less consistent in their view of marriage with women religious.

The early insular Penitential of Theodore gave a three-year penance to a man or woman who had taken a religious vow and then married, but ordered the marriage not to be dissolved.⁷¹ Late eighth- and ninth-century Frankish penitentials, however, condemn such marriages and, like the Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) in the case of abducted women religious where a marriage had occurred,

c.35,p.395]; the Paris Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.29,p.415]; and the St. Hubert Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.38,p.382]. It also occurs in the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore but with four years penance; Wasserschleben, c.I,15,pp.574-75.

⁶⁹ And the women were to return to their religious habit even if a marriage had taken place; Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6), MGH Conc. III,c.67,p.116. Whilst this canon refers to sanctimoniales the previous canon refers simply to virgins and widows but gives the same penalty to the abductor ("sine spe coniugii perpetuo maneat") which may indicate that the women were religious, although we may not definitely assume this; MGH Conc. III,c.66,p.116.

⁷⁰ Halitgar of Cambrai condemned as adulterous fornication with a sanctimonialis or Deo dicata (surely to distinguish between monastic and non-monastic women religious); Wasserschleben, Bk.6, c.II,4, p.365. The Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore also gave five years penance to a laicus for fornication with a sanctimonialis or Deo dicata; Wasserschleben, c.I,14, p.574. Regino of Prüm condemned fornication or marriage with sanctimoniales; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.170, p.279.

⁷¹ Wasserschleben, Bk.1, c.XIV,5, p.198.

insisted that the couple separate.⁷² The exception is the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore which followed the Penitential of Theodore.⁷³ With the development of ideas concerning consanguinity marriages with sanctimoniales were equated with such unions by some Frankish ecclesiastics.⁷⁴

However, an important distinction amongst women religious is made, beginning with the Martinian Penitential; this prescribes anathema for quis marrying a monacha, Deo sacrata or ancilla Dei.⁷⁵ The term monacha began to be applied to regular nuns in the ninth century.⁷⁶ Thus it is significant that Halitgar of Cambrai's penitential condemns a man who marries a monacha.⁷⁷ Halitgar was probably using this term to distinguish her from a canoness⁷⁸ over whom there may have been some ambiguity if they were abducted and/or married. A nun's abduction was not easily solvable with marriage (hence it attracted the severest penalty) but there may have been different expectations for canonesses in some regions. This fact alongside the situation of women religious living in the

⁷² The Merseburg Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.139, p.405]; the Excarpsus Cummeani [Wasserschleben, c.III,36, p.475]; and the St. Hubert Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.14, p.379].

⁷³ Wasserschleben, c.I,21,p.575.

⁷⁴ Theodulf of Orleans wrote: "Cum consanguinea et cum sanctimoniale peccare aequale crimen est"; MGH Capit. Episc., I, c.VII,6,p.166. Following the Council of Rome (721) Regino of Prüm also equated consanguinous marriages with those to sanctimoniales; Ecclesiastical Discipline Bk.2,c.187,pp.286-87.

⁷⁵ Wasserschleben, c.XXX,2,p.289.

⁷⁶ See pp.84, 205 above.

⁷⁷ "quae Dei ancilla appellat"; PL105,Bk.4,c.22, col.684.

⁷⁸ Halitgar's implication is clarified by the Penitential of Pseudo-Egbert, a ninth/tenth-century Anglo-Saxon adaptation of Halitgar's penitential which includes this canon but now adds that the monacha is one called sponsa Dei; Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.19,p.326. This corresponds to the emphasis in the early tenth-century liturgy on the nun as sponsa Dei; see pp.226-28 above.

world, may explain why so many of the descriptions of abducted women are applicable to either secular or religious virgins and widows.

These general condemnations also suggest that abduction was either very common or at least perceived as a serious problem. According to Hincmar abduction of women religious was a fact of ninth-century noble life.⁷⁹ Abductors often worked with accomplices which suggests that abduction was a considered marriage strategy. The Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6)⁸⁰ and of Worms (868)⁸¹ both refer to collaborators who were subject to the same penance of anathema as the abductor. Regino of Prüm, like the Council of Worms, prescribed excommunication for laymen and defrocking for clerics involved in abduction.⁸² Certain women were especially vulnerable. Hincmar condemned the abduction of widows describing organised bands of abductors with their accomplices⁸³; the thirty-day rule against the over-hasty veiling of widows may have provided ecclesiastical protection to women from forced remarriage in such circumstances.⁸⁴

That abduction was a problem for all women is illustrated by the general condemnation in the Admonitio Synodalis (789).⁸⁵ While abduction is condemned as is consanguinity and the taking of another man's sponsa, there is no reference in this text to adultery and divorce. The choice

⁷⁹ De coercendo raptu viduarum, PL125,col.1020

⁸⁰ See n.62 above.

⁸¹ See n.67 above.

⁸² Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.157,p.275; Bk.2,c.5.28, p.210 also refers to collaborators.

⁸³ "Hi sunt publici raptores et praedones, cum satellitibus et sociis impietatis"; PL125,col.1020B. Isaac of Langres devoted two chapters of his statutes to the abduction of widows; PL124, cols.1093-98.

⁸⁴ See n.55 above.

⁸⁵ "Raptum omnimodis prohibete et ut nullus ad proximam sanguinis sui accedat, et ut alterius sponsam nemo ducat"; Admonitio Synodalis,c.77,p.63.

of topics indicates that some ecclesiastics were acknowledging the main concerns of laymen rather than always pressing for monogamy and the indissolubility of marriage.

An acknowledgement of the laity's interests is apparent in the Church's treatment of the penalties for abduction. A distinction was made between betrothed and unattached women - the worse crime being the violation of the desponsatio. In following earlier canon law the Admonitio Generalis also echoed the secular leges in its insistence that no man should take another man's sponsa.⁸⁶ In the early years of the reforms, under Louis the Pious, an uncompromising stance on the abduction of sponsae was taken. Quoting from the Council of Ancyra, an 818/19 capitulary insisted that a man who had abducted a sponsa had to undergo public penance and was prohibited from marrying the girl even if she had been abducted by force - she had to be restored to her sponsus; if her sponsus did not want her back he could marry another woman and his former sponsa was allowed to marry another man but not her abductor.⁸⁷ If the girl had cooperated she was subject to the same public penance as the abductor.⁸⁸ This position was repeated in a capitulary issued 814-840 possibly under Lothar I⁸⁹; and also by the Council of Ver (844).⁹⁰

However, this uncompromising position contrasts with another capitulary (818/19) which did allow the abductor of a betrothed woman to pay the injured sponsus compensation (according to the sponsus' law) and also a fine of 60 solidi to the king; if the abductor refused to

⁸⁶ MGH Capit. I,c.51,p.57.

⁸⁷ Capit. Eccles., MGH Capit. I,c.24,p.279.

⁸⁸ MGH, Ibid.

⁸⁹ Capitula Incerta, MGH Capit. I,c.1,p.315.

⁹⁰ This also referred to the Council of Ancyra as its authority that a rapta puella should be returned to her sponsus even if she had been abducted by force and that the abductors should be excommunicated by the Church and brought into line by the king; MGH Conc. III,c.6,p.41.

pay he was exiled and prevented from keeping the woman.⁹¹ The Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) also indicate that marriage for a woman with her abductor was possible: unless the abductor gained parental consent, underwent a proper betrothal and exchanged gifts and had the union publicised to everyone - which were all the constituents of a valid marriage - the man was to separate from the woman and undergo public penance while she was to be restored to her parentes.⁹² This indicates that, at least in the case of unattached women, the Church recognised that a common situation could be rectified by applying, retrospectively, the constituents of a valid marriage.⁹³ These same councils were also more flexible in the case of betrothed women; when a sponsa was abducted maximum clemency should be exercised so that the abductor could marry the woman if her sponsus was properly compensated.⁹⁴ Regino of Prüm repeats this last statement.⁹⁵

These more lenient statements are more akin to the provision in the leges where a betrothed woman and her

⁹¹ Capit. Legibus Addenda, MGH Capit. I, c.9, p.282.

⁹² "Hi autem, qui necdum eas, quas rapuerant, cum voluntate parentum sub praefato desponsionis vel dotalicii nomine in coniugium sumptas habent, quando in omnium aures hec fuerit constitutio promulgata, ab earum coniunctione separentur et publice penitente subigantur, rapte autem parentibus legaliter restituantur"; MGH Conc. III, c.65, p.115. Canon 64 also states that "raptores virginum et viduarum" had to do public penance even after they had obtained parental approval, undergone a desponsatio and exchanged gifts; MGH, Ibid. This also indicates that, once the forms of a proper union were observed alongside penance, marriage between the two parties was a likely outcome.

⁹³ Hence Gaudemet's assertion that the Frankish Church did not intervene in the abduction of an unmarried girl is incorrect; although he is right that the abduction of married women, betrothed women and nuns caused more concern because they involved the violation of legal and religious contracts; Le Mariage, p.111.

⁹⁴ MGH Conc. III, c.68, pp.116-17.

⁹⁵ Ecclesiastical Discipline; Bk.2, c.156, pp.272-73.

abductor could marry with compensation to the sponsus.⁹⁶ They also indicate that the reformers' attempts to impose strict Christian mores proved difficult to enforce in a variety of situations where parentes, sponsi and abductors had always found compromises. These more lenient statements also show that the Frankish Church became concerned with abduction as a conciliator assessing the seriousness of each individual situation. Hence the statutes of Herard of Tours and the Admonitio Synodalis include only general statements condemning abduction without providing solutions; it was recognised that the community - the priest and the male kin of the parties involved - would work out appropriate solutions.

Despite a certain flexibility the Church meted out the severest penalty in the cases of abducted women religious, or at least nuns, and also married women ⁹⁷; in the latter case adultery was not deemed to be sufficient grounds to repudiate a wife and remarry. ⁹⁸ The Church also steadily insisted on public penance for abductors and excommunication in cases of non-compliance. ⁹⁹ This penalty implied recognition that the act of abduction was wrong, morally if a sexual transgression was involved, but also because the crime was a public one. ¹⁰⁰ The abductor had transgressed against at least one family, more if the girl was betrothed. Where abductors did not comply excommunication acted as the most public form of censure since exclusion from the populus christianus in theory involved ostracism by the whole community. The cooperative imposition of the punishment reflected how the interests of the Church and laymen could coincide.

⁹⁶ For example: Lex Baiwariorum, MGH Legum Sectio, I, 5.2, c. VIII, 16, p. 360.

⁹⁷ Albgis who had abducted the wife of Patrachus and committed adultery with her was sentenced by the king to exile in addition to penance; MGH Conc. III, c. 11, pp. 248-49.

⁹⁸ See pp. 267-70 below.

⁹⁹ See n. 92 above.

¹⁰⁰ Albgis is described: "uxorem Patrichi publice auferens"; MGH Conc. III, c. 11, pp. 248-49.

However, these lay interests were principally male. The concerns of the woman's parentes, which could include female relatives, those of her sponsus who was allowed to marry another woman, and even those of her abductor were acknowledged so long as the marriage was validated and compensation paid. Significantly the Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) stated that the bishop would decide on the punishment to be doled out to the fautores who had supported an abduction ¹⁰¹; this same canon acknowledged that these supporters could include the woman's own parentes. ¹⁰²

Abducted women were dependent on male lay interests as they were in any vulnerable situation. We have seen this with regard to the remarriage of widows. Another related example is provided by the Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) which allowed an adulterous wife to marry her lover after her husband died so long as she could prove, with probatu testes, that she had not conspired to murder her husband.¹⁰³ The burden of proof lay on the woman who was dependent on her male lay supporters. ¹⁰⁴ The fautores of an abduction in one case could be the parentes of an abducted woman in another, or the testes witnessing a widow's good character or the co-investigators in a pre-marital enquiry. It is likely, however, that these male lay interests which were

¹⁰¹ MGH Conc. III,c.68,p.117. Regino of Prüm repeats this canon but with the addition of a fine (mulcta) that the bishop could impose; Ecclesiastical Discipline; Bk.2, c.156,pp.272-73.

¹⁰² "De his, qui sponsas alienas rapiunt vel consensu parentum accipiunt..."; MGH Conc. III,c.68,p.116.

¹⁰³ MGH Conc. III,c.69,p.117. A similar concern was stated by the Council of Verberie (758) where a man could dismiss his wife and remarry if he proved that she had tried to kill him; MGH Capit. I,c.5,p.40.

¹⁰⁴ "Women were held unfit to act as witnesses in Frankish law, and were usually represented by male kin or advocates"; J.L. Nelson, "Dispute Settlement in Carolingian West Francia" in W. Davies and P.J. Fouracre, (eds.), The Settlement of Disputes in Early Medieval Europe, (Cambridge, 1986), pp.45-64 at p.58.

constantly acknowledged were noble. For a harsh view was taken in the case of a man who abducted his lord's daughter since he was to be put to death ¹⁰⁵; but this instance concerned the violation of lordship bonds not just marriage procedures. ¹⁰⁶ The fact that this situation warranted a harsher penalty than the other prescriptions concerning abduction indicates that these latter were mainly directed at cases occurring within one social group - the nobility.

IV. Desponsatio and Dotatio.

Abduction often involved violation of a desponsatio. A man who abducted a sponsa or married another man's sponsa ¹⁰⁷ was censured; but there was equal condemnation of sponsi who reneged on the contract. ¹⁰⁸ A widower was allowed to remarry but not a betrothed woman. ¹⁰⁹ Parentes were condemned for breaking the desponsatio contract through abduction ¹¹⁰; penance was meted out to either set of parentes who broke a desponsatio unless the girl or young man had committed a serious crime. ¹¹¹

Desponsatio was one of the secular constituents for a valid marriage. ¹¹² It involved the dotatio, or exchange

¹⁰⁵ Capit. de partibus Saxonicae, MGH Capit. I,c.12,p.68. Although this capitulary concerns Saxony, there is no reason to suppose that the violation of lordly bonds was a concern unique to this region.

¹⁰⁶ Hence the same capitulary prescribes the same penalty for the murder of a dominus or domina; MGH, Ibid,c.13,p.68.

¹⁰⁷ Halitgar of Cambrai's Penitential, PL105,Bk.4, c.15,col.683; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.153, pp.271-72.

¹⁰⁸ Ecclesiastical Discipline; Bk.2,c.5.26,p.210.

¹⁰⁹ Or a repudiated wife; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.106,p.255.

¹¹⁰ See n.102 above.

¹¹¹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.151,p.271.

¹¹² Hincmar of Rheims (n.8 above); Herard of Tours (n.13 above); the Martinian Penitential (n.26 above); Benedictus Levita (n.23 above); and Isaac of Langres (n.24

of gifts. The Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) demonstrated the concern to validate a union resulting from an abduction with a desponsatio and dotatio.¹¹³ The Church attempted to involve itself in this secular procedure controlled by the male laity: Benedictus Levita referred to the priest with the boni homines.¹¹⁴

Benedictus Levita's reference to the position of the woman indicates that the dos, in its form as brideprice, was settled on her (eam) rather than her family.¹¹⁵ By the ninth century this dos seems usually to have been property rather than moveable wealth¹¹⁶; although the ninth-century Vita Opportunae referred to the gold and silver, slaves and slave-girls that she was offered by potentes to marry them.¹¹⁷ This last, however, may refer to the additional dos settled on the woman - the morgengabe which also constituted property by the ninth century.¹¹⁸ The morgengabe was given to the bride the morning after the wedding as proof of consummation. The fact that Lothar II had endowed Theutberga thus was public admission of her virginity which he later disputed.¹¹⁹

above).

¹¹³ See n.92 above.

¹¹⁴ "Et si licita et honesta omnia pariter invenerit, tunc per consilium et benedictionem sacerdotis et consulta aliorum bonorum hominum eam sponsare et legitime dotare debet"; PL97, Bk.III,c.179,col.820B. Also see Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp.344-45; and p.307 below.

¹¹⁵ As Owen Hughes outlines, "From Brideprice to Dowry", pp.266-68.

¹¹⁶ McNamara and Wemple, "The Power of Women through the Family", pp.86-87.

¹¹⁷ ASS Aprilis III,c.I,2,pp.62-63.

¹¹⁸ "morgengabe with its associated portion had come to assure brides - both Roman and Germanic - of substantial rights in their husband's patrimony"; Owen Hughes, "From Brideprice to Dowry", pp.269-71.

¹¹⁹ Hence Hincmar was suspicious of Lothar's accusations of Theutberga's pre-marital incest with her brother; PL125, De divortio, cols.648-50. Also see Owen Hughes on this case and the acceptance of morgengabe as the test of a valid marriage, "From Brideprice to Dowry",

Hence the dotatio referred to in these descriptions of marriage may have indicated both the dos as given at the desponsatio and the morgengabe; the two gifts were not necessarily mutually exclusive as prerequisites for a legitimate marriage. 120

V. Wives and Concubines.

The importance of the desponsatio and dotatio for a woman lay in their acceptance by Frankish ecclesiastics as the constituents which differentiated her as uxor from concubina. Tracing churchmen's definition of wives as opposed to concubines is difficult since most of the prescriptions referred to concubines without defining them. The Council of Rome (826) prescribed against men who simultaneously took two wives or concubines. 121 A second Council of Rome (853) condemned men who simultaneously took two wives or a wife and a concubine. 122 The Roman councils were stressing monogamy rather than downgrading the status of concubines.

Frankish conciliar and capitulary material infrequently referred to concubinae. A capitulary to the Italian bishops (790-800) condemned a homo who had a wife and was adulterous or had a wife and a concubine. 123 An 829 capitulary condemned men who, having wives, took concubines or mistresses; while this seems to be condemning serial monogamy the difference between

p.274.

120 Thus Wemple, against Owen Hughes' thesis that morgengabe was the test of a valid marriage, argued that dotatio referred only to bridegift; Women, note 46, pp.244-45. But, as Owen Hughes argues, gifts need not be opposite or opposed and frequently co-existed; "From Brideprice to Dowry", p.263ff. The co-existence of several types of marriage gifts in African and South-east Asian contexts are described in J. Goody's and S.J. Tambiah's, Bridewealth and Dowry, (Cambridge, 1973), esp. pp.61-67.

121 MGH Conc. II ii,c.37,p.582.

122 MGH Conc. III,c.37,p.329.

123 MGH Capit. I,no.96,c.5,p.203.

concubines and mistresses is unclear. 124

The Frankish Church first defined a concubine at the Council of Mainz (852). This stated that if a man took a concubine who had not been legitimately betrothed and afterwards took another woman with a legitimate betrothal, having left the concubine, he was to retain the woman who had been legitimately betrothed. 125 This closely followed Hrabanus Maurus' Poenitentiale ad Otgarium 126; and may only represent the response of one region's ecclesiastics.

Other episcopal statements do not clarify the difference between concubines and wives. Herard of Tours merely stated that just as a priest should only have one church so a man should only have one uxor. 127 The Anonymous of Trier more specifically condemned noble or servile men who, having a legitimate wife, took a concubine, a woman dismissed by another man, or a nun. 128 Rodulf of Bourges evidences the view that married men who took concubines were adulterors; in a chapter dealing with adultery Rodulf imposed seven years' penance on an adulterous husband, and excommunication for taking a concubine. 129

That these statements condemn the practice of concubinage without defining a concubine was probably because the Frankish Church was still formulating what constituted a legal marriage; only when this had been consistently defined could concubinage be distinguished from it. Even

124 "uxores habentes neque pellicem neque concubinam habere debeant"; MGH Capit. II, no. 196, c. 54, p. 45. Perhaps a pellex had an even less formal union than that enjoyed by a concubina.

125 "Quodsi quislibet concubinam habuerit, que non legitime fuit desponsata, et postea desponsam rite puellam duxerit abiecta concubina, habeat illam, quam legitime deponsavit"; MGH Conc. III, c. 12, p. 249.

126 PL112, c. 8, col. 1409C/D.

127 PL121, c. 49, col. 767.

128 MGH Capit. Episc., c. 3, p. 55.

129 MGH Capit. Episc., c. 42, p. 265.

Hincmar was not consistent. In 846 he had excommunicated Fulrich on the grounds that his first union was a proper marriage. But the absence of a desponsatio in this case was admitted by Hincmar in 853 to render the union an invalid marriage, allowing Fulrich, who had appealed to the statement issued by the Council of Mainz (852), the possibility of remarriage.¹³⁰ However, in the case of Stephen in 860, Hincmar was careful to include the desponsatio in his definition of a legal marriage.¹³¹ Hincmar exemplifies that many of the episcopal statements on marriage were responses to actual cases and that definitions of what was a wife or a concubine may not always have been consistent and depended on how the parties involved interpreted each union. A lack of uniformity explains why as late as 868 a council generally prohibited the dissolution of legitimate marriages without specifying what a legitimate marriage was.¹³²

Differentiation was made between the concubines of married men and those of unmarried men. In his complaint that few laymen came to marriage as virgins because they took concubines, Jonas of Orleans implied that concubines were not held polygamously with wives, but formed unions prior to marriage¹³³ - a form of serial monogamy. Hincmar's comment that married men repudiated their wives to take concubines¹³⁴ also suggests that some serial monogamy occurred in practice. The Council of Mainz (852) condemned a man for having a wife and a concubine on pain

¹³⁰ Flodoard records Hincmar's views; MGH SS,13, III,c.10,21, pp.483-84,518. See also Devisse concerning Hincmar and this case; Hincmar, I, pp.39-40,368.

¹³¹ See n.8 above.

¹³² Council of Worms, Mansi 15,c.37,col.876.

¹³³ "Quidam laicorum amore libidinis superati, quidam vero ambiendi honoris terreni cupiditate ducti, imo praestolandi tempus, quo honores mundi nancisci valeant, interim in coeno luxuriae se voluntates, antequam ad copulam connubii accedant, diversissimis modis se corrumpunt, et virginale decus, quod usque ad tempus legitimae uxoris accipiendae conservare debuerant, amittunt"; De institutione laicali, PL106,Bk.2,c.2,col.170D.

¹³⁴ De divortio, PL125,cols.644-45,657-58.

of excommunication - the punishment for unrepentant adulterers ¹³⁵; but those men who did not have a wife, or took a concubine before they took a wife, were not to be excluded from communion but should have one woman, either a wife or a concubine. ¹³⁶ This view is also expressed by Halitgar of Cambrai's Penitential ¹³⁷, Hrabanus Maurus¹³⁸ and Regino of Prüm. ¹³⁹ These statements evidence a concern over monogamy rather than the wish to differentiate between wives and concubines. This concern was surely what prompted Hincmar to state that Fulrich's first union was a proper marriage.

If concubines, held monogamously, were acceptable, this undermines the argument that the gap in status between wives and concubines significantly widened in the ninth century ¹⁴⁰; the stark dichotomy between the two types of women may be an impression gained by the prescription's terminology. Louis the Pious may have differed from his father in that he did not even tolerate monogamous concubinage and properly married his daughters as part of a considered political strategy to secure the loyalty of various aristocratic families; but his disapproval of less formal unions was not followed up in subsequent reigns- as is illustrated by the Council of Mainz (852) and its admission of concubinage. ¹⁴¹

¹³⁵ MGH Conc. III,c.15,p.250.

¹³⁶ "Ceterum autem is, qui non habet uxorem et pro uxore concubinam habet, a communione non pellatur, tantum aut unius mulieris, aut uxoris aut concubine, ut ei placuerit"; MGH, Ibid. This is based on the Council of Toledo (400).

¹³⁷ PL105,Bk.4,c.12,col.683.

¹³⁸ Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum, PL110,c.28,cols.490-91.

¹³⁹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.5.16,p.210; Bk.2,c.99,p.254. It also occurs in the Quadripartitus, Bk.4,c.256.

¹⁴⁰ Wemple, Women, p.95.

¹⁴¹ S. Konecny, "Eherecht und Ehepolitik unter Ludwig dem Frommen", MIÖG., 85, (1977), pp.1-21, at p.2.

Although a concubine was not regarded in the same way as a wife neither was she without any standing. ¹⁴² The Council of Tribur (895) differentiated between concubines and wives. The phrase si quis filiam suam viro habenti concubinam in matrimonium dederit ¹⁴³ contrasts with a daughter whom legitime in matrimonium duxerit and who was by dotata legitime et in publicis honestata nuptiis.¹⁴⁴ Each union constituted a matrimonium but only within the second, the "legitimate" marriage, could the woman be described as "uxor legibus adquista". ¹⁴⁵

The Council of Tribur, however, was concerned less with monogamy than with the clarification of rules of heirship. The canon states that if every mulier taken by a man is not an uxor, then all his children are not his heirs ¹⁴⁶ - a concern shared by Regino of Prüm. ¹⁴⁷ The children of concubines did not have the same rights as those of wives; Regino stated that the sons of concubines could not become priests. ¹⁴⁸ Concern over legitimacy prompted Jonas of Orleans to state that priestly benedictions over marriages ensured the legitimacy of heirs. ¹⁴⁹ But this may evidence the Church's attempt to involve itself in marriage rather

¹⁴² Such women were different from prostitutes such as the meretrices condemned in an 820 capitulary; MGH Capit. I,c.1,3, p.284; also MGH Capit. I,c.8,p.334. Men were given penance for fornicating with meretrices; St. Hubert Penitential, Wassersleben,c.12,p.379.

¹⁴³ MGH Capit. II,c.38,p.235.

¹⁴⁴ MGH, Ibid.

¹⁴⁵ MGH, Ibid.

¹⁴⁶ MGH, Ibid.

¹⁴⁷ Drawing from the letters of Pope Leo I; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.181,p.284.

¹⁴⁸ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.1,c.427,p.193.

¹⁴⁹ "Unde etenim damnanda consuetudo inolevit, ut perraro sponsus et sponsa in missarum celebratione, secundum praemissum ordinem, benedicantur. Nam et filii, qui ex tali concubitu generati sunt... in haereditate tamen cum fratribus ex legitimo matrimonio natis, quod dolendum est, minime iuxta mundanae legis censuram, succedere valent"; PL106, Bk.2,c.2,col.171A; and see n.95, ch.6 below.

than reflecting the laity's conception of different kinds of unions; perhaps recognition that benedictions were rarely performed prompted the Church to distinguish between wives and concubines at Mainz in 852.

The early insular Penitential of Theodore suggested that baptism sometimes formed a constituent of a valid marriage: if a man married a woman before she was baptised her children were not regarded as heirs and could not share in the inheritance.¹⁵⁰ As these earlier penitentials continued to be copied and used in ninth-century Francia, this canon might indicate application below the ranks of the nobility; its use would correspond to the Frankish Church's efforts to enforce the liturgy of baptism.¹⁵¹ Since baptism had no secular rival the Church perhaps had more success here. By connecting baptism to marriage in this way, and also by extending the rules of consanguinity to spiritual relations¹⁵², the Church could more successfully extend its influence over marriage.

VI. Monogamy and the Dissolution of Marriage.

The issue of concubinage was closely related to definitions of invalid marriages and their dissolution, as the Council of Mainz (852) illustrates; here the concubine was held to be dismissable. But where the legitimacy of an uxor was not in doubt the Frankish Church attempted to enforce the principle of indissolubility - in contrast to the secular law codes. These provided a greater number of grounds for men to divorce their wives than were allowed to women to divorce their husbands. Provision was made for divorce based on mutual consent.¹⁵³ The codes also allowed a man to repudiate a wife as long as he gave

¹⁵⁰ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.IV,2,p.205.

¹⁵¹ Angenendt, "Die Liturgie und die Organisation des kirchlichen Lebens auf dem Lande", pp.199-209.

¹⁵² See pp.284-88 below.

¹⁵³ Lex Burgundionum: Lex Romana; MGH Legum Sectio,I, 2.1,c.XXI,1,p.143.

her compensation ¹⁵⁴; but if she was adulterous he could divorce her without compensation. ¹⁵⁵ Further, if a wife was caught in the act of adultery a husband had the right to kill both her and her partner. ¹⁵⁶ The leges only allowed a woman to divorce her husband if he was proved guilty of murder, sorcery or grave-robbing. ¹⁵⁷ But these grounds were also allowed to men. ¹⁵⁸ Not only was a woman not allowed to repudiate her adulterous husband, if she was unsuccessful in proving him guilty of homicide, witchcraft or tomb-robbing, she was exiled. ¹⁵⁹ Women could also be repudiated for sterility. ¹⁶⁰ In contrast, the tenor of the ninth-century reforms seem more egalitarian; but once again male lay interests are in fact acknowledged alongside the perception of the greater corruptibility of women.

Easy divorce was discouraged by the Admonitio Generalis (789) which stated that a woman dismissed by her husband might not remarry and a man could not remarry if his first

¹⁵⁴ Leges Burgundionum: Liber Constitutionum; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c. XXXIV, 2, p. 68. Lex Alamannorum Pactus, MGH Legum Sectio, I, 5.1, c. XXXV, 1, p. 34.

¹⁵⁵ Lex Baiwariorum MGH Legum Sectio, I, 5.2, c. VIII, 1, p. 353-54. Lex Visigothorum, MGH Legum Sectio, I.1, c. III, 6.2, pp. 167-68.

¹⁵⁶ Lex Baiwariorum: MGH Legum Sectio, I, 5.2, c. VIII, 1, p. 353. Leges Burgundionum: Liber constitutionum, MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c. XXXIV, 1, p. 68 which allowed an adulterous wife to be drowned in mire. Leges Burgundionum: Lex Romana, MGH, Ibid, c. XXI, 2, p. 143. Lex Visigothorum, MGH Legum Sectio, I.1, c. III, 4.4, p. 149.

¹⁵⁷ Leges Burgundionum: Lex Romana; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c. XXI, 3, p. 144.

¹⁵⁸ Leges Burgundionum: Liber constitutionum; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c. XXXIV, 3, p. 68. Leges Burgundionum: Lex Romana cited a wife's witchcraft and conspiracy; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c. XXI, 2, p. 143.

¹⁵⁹ Leges Burgundionum, MGH Legum Sectio, I, 2.1, c. XXI, 3, p. 144.

¹⁶⁰ Sterility was considered a "just cause"; Ganshof, "Le Statut de la Femme", p. 32, note 77.

wife was still alive. ¹⁶¹ This was repeated by subsequent legislation. ¹⁶² This appears to impose the same penalty on men and women, but clearly the assumption was that men were doing the dismissing. ¹⁶³ The Admonitio Generalis does not cite the punishment, but an 829 capitulary prescribed public penance for those men who abandoned their wives to remarry. ¹⁶⁴

However, there was a lack of consistency concerning legitimate grounds for divorce. A distinction was drawn between separation, and divorce with the possibility of remarriage. The Council of Friouli (796/7) stated that although a man might dismiss an adulterous wife he could not take another because then he himself would be an adulterer. ¹⁶⁵ The Council of Worms (868) also equated a woman's adultery with a man's divorce and remarriage prescribing seven years' penance in each case. ¹⁶⁶ That these two issues were dealt with together in this canon suggest that female adultery was one of the most difficult issues for the Church to defend its stance on monogamy. The Anonymous of Trier stated that neither an adulterous husband nor wife could be dismissed. ¹⁶⁷ Other texts make

¹⁶¹ MGH Capit. I,c.43,p.56. This is c.69 of the Council of Carthage from the Dionysio-Hadriana.

¹⁶² Capit. miss. specialia (802), MGH Capit. I,c.22, p.102.

¹⁶³ Corroborated by the Penitential of Vinnian which stated that a woman dismissed by her husband should not remarry but wait for him in chastity; Wasserschleben, c.45,pp.117-18.

¹⁶⁴ Capitulary of Worms (829), MGH Capit. II,c.3,p.18.

¹⁶⁵ MGH Conc. II i,c.10,p.192; and similarly Capit. Missorum (802); MGH Capit. I,c.22,p.103.

¹⁶⁶ Mansi 15,c.44,col.877. The Penitential of Theodore gave seven years penance to a man who repudiated his wife and remarried [Wasserchleben, Bk.I,c.XIV,8,p.198] as does the Excarpsus Cummeani [Wasserschleben,c.III,30,p.474]. This equates with the penance for adultery: the St. Hubert Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.9,p.378; the Quadripartitus, Bk.4,c.254; the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.98,p.251.

¹⁶⁷ MGH Capit. Epsic., c.9,p.56.

it apparent that the wife's adultery was perceived as the problem: the early insular Penitential of Vinnian had stated that even if a wife had committed adultery her husband was not to remarry ¹⁶⁸; if she underwent penance he was to take her back ¹⁶⁹; but there was no similar provision concerning adulterous husbands. In the ninth century Regino of Prüm stipulated that even if an adulterous wife was taken back she still had to complete her seven years of penance. ¹⁷⁰

Although men were encouraged to take back their adulterous wives it was acknowledged that they might not wish to do so. Theodulf of Orleans allowed a husband to dismiss his adulterous wife but not to remarry whilst she was alive ¹⁷¹; this is followed by Benedictus Levita¹⁷² and Regino of Prüm. ¹⁷³ The Penitential of Theodore, still used in the ninth century, was especially harsh: a man could dismiss his wife on account of fornication and remarry ¹⁷⁴; if he wished to be reconciled to her the punishment was given to him rather than to the Church ¹⁷⁵; and if an adulterous wife wished to go to a convent she was allowed to retain the fourth part of her inheritance but if she decided otherwise she received nothing.¹⁷⁶ This last canon was repeated by the Penitential of Pseudo-

¹⁶⁸ Wasserschleben, c.43,p.117.

¹⁶⁹ Wasserschleben, c.44,p.117.

¹⁷⁰ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.130,pp.264-65.

¹⁷¹ MGH Capit. Episc.,II,c.V,6,pp.162-63.

¹⁷² PL97,Bk.III,c.382,col.846B.

¹⁷³ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.130,pp.264-65.

¹⁷⁴ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,5,p.213. Although another canon allowed a husband to take back his adulterous wife if she completed a penance and they were both continent; Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.XIV,4,p.198.

¹⁷⁵ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,11,p.214. This was repeated in the later ninth-century Frankish Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore, Wasserschleben,c.IV,19,p.582.

¹⁷⁶ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,10,p.214.

Theodore which also allowed the man to remarry.¹⁷⁷ The Church and certain laymen alike stood to benefit from this arrangement which qualifies Goody's argument, at least for the ninth century, that the Church attempted to control marriage strategies to deplete the number of heirs thus increasing its own chances of gaining property.¹⁷⁸

Some Frankish ecclesiastics showed more concern to condemn adulterous wives than to uphold monogamy. Rodulf of Bourges¹⁷⁹ and Regino of Prüm¹⁸⁰ included a canon which banned a man from communion if he knowingly concealed that his wife was adulterous, and further stated that he could be readmitted after ten years if he separated from her. This did not specifically advocate remarriage but it did encourage repudiation. The Church's unequal stance on adultery¹⁸¹ was further evidenced by the fact that women were not allowed to repudiate adulterous husbands.¹⁸² Although the Council of Rome (826) allowed a man to repudiate his wife on account of fornication and to remarry¹⁸³, Frankish ecclesiastics tended not to allow this leniency instead advocating separation on account of fornication.¹⁸⁴ However, the Confessional of Egbert, of eighth-century insular origin but in circulation in ninth-century Francia, allowed a man

¹⁷⁷ *Wasserschleben*, c.IV,18,p.582.

¹⁷⁸ The Development of the Family and Marriage, p.155.

¹⁷⁹ MGH Capit. Epsic., c.42,p.265.

¹⁸⁰ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.139,pp.267-68.

¹⁸¹ Compounded by some ecclesiastics giving a lesser penance of three years to a husband but seven to a wife for adultery; Theodulf of Orleans, MGH Capit. Episc., II, c.V,5,p.162. Although others gave men and women the same seven-year penance; Quadripartitus, Bk.4,c.254; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.98,p.251.

¹⁸² Penitential of Theodore; *Wasserschleben*, Bk.2, c.XII,6, p.213.

¹⁸³ MGH Conc. II ii,c.36,p.582.

¹⁸⁴ See n.171-173 above. Also an anonymous episcopal statute, Laon MS 201,PL89.c.35,col.823 and Hincmar of Rheims, De divortio, PL125,col.645B.

to remarry after repudiating an adulterous wife if it was his first wife ¹⁸⁵; this text even allowed a man to repudiate his wife without a stated reason and remarry after five years with the counsel of the bishop. ¹⁸⁶

Thus there is insufficient consistency to argue that the Frankish Church's prescriptions on the indissolubility of marriage were enforced against the male laity's concern about wifely adultery. In theory the Church's stance on monogamy was upheld by only advocating separation rather than remarriage; however, one suspects that in such circumstances there were remarriages or concubines were taken.

One of the problems with allowing men to separate from adulterous wives was that the burden of proof lay with the woman. We have already noted this with regard to women having to prove that they were not complicit with their lover in the death of her husband. ¹⁸⁷ Hincmar commented that men accused their wives of adultery without proof or judgement and dismissed them on account of hatred, cruelty or lust to remarry or take concubines. ¹⁸⁸ There were similar problems in allowing mutual consent as a reason for divorce.

The Penitential of Theodore had allowed marriage to be dissolved on these grounds ¹⁸⁹ as did an anonymous ninth-century episcopal statute. ¹⁹⁰ This last text indicates that mutual consent was often related to dissolution on the grounds that one or both parties wished to enter a

¹⁸⁵ Wasserschleben, c.19,p.308.

¹⁸⁶ Wasserschleben, c.26,p.311.

¹⁸⁷ See n.103 above. Regino of Prüm repeated this concern adding that if the accusation was proved the insidiatrix was to remain without hope of remarriage; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.117,p.260.

¹⁸⁸ De divortio, PL125,col.658.

¹⁸⁹ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,7,p.213.

¹⁹⁰ Laon MS 201,PL89,c.35,col.825.

monastery. The Penitential of Theodore also allowed either a husband or wife to give their spouse permission to enter a monastery ¹⁹¹; in these circumstances the couple might separate with mutual consent. ¹⁹²

However, there was the potential for abuse against women. The Council of Verberie (758) had legislated against a husband remarrying "*qui uxorem dimiserit velare*".¹⁹³ Regino of Prüm stated that although a man might give his wife permission to enter a convent he was not allowed to remarry. ¹⁹⁴ This may have provided for situations where the woman's decision was not voluntary. The Judgement of Clement stated that a man might not repudiate his legitimate wife and remarry even if the first wife consented ¹⁹⁵; further, the dissolution of a legitimate marriage was only allowed with the parties' mutual consent that they would not remarry. ¹⁹⁶ Clearly, the pressuring of women into "consenting" so that men could remarry was of concern here. Thus although Regino stated that a man should not leave a legitimate marriage to enter a monastery without his wife's permission, the question of her remarriage is not discussed. ¹⁹⁷

A woman could not unilaterally decide to end her marriage by entering a convent. The Penitential of Theodore had stated that a woman might not take a vow without the consent of her husband, but if she had taken a vow she was

¹⁹¹ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,8,p.214. The Council of Rome (826) also allowed a marriage to be dissolved on account of a spouse's religious vocation; MGH Conc. II ii, c.36,p.582.

¹⁹² Or if either party were ill; Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.XII,12,p.214.

¹⁹³ MGH Capit. I,c.21,p.41.

¹⁹⁴ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.124,p.265.

¹⁹⁵ Wasserschleben, c.14,p.434.

¹⁹⁶ Wasserschleben, c.15,p.435.

¹⁹⁷ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.5.20,p.210.

to be released from it and do penance. ¹⁹⁸ Regino of Prüm allowed a man to physically remove his wife from a convent if she had gone there without his permission. ¹⁹⁹ Hence laymen's interests were upheld as they were in the case of adulterous wives. Protection was potentially proffered to women, though, when Regino stated that a man should not quit his marriage, however, wronged, without his bishop's permission ²⁰⁰; alternatively, this may indicate the Church's wish to be involved in any decision-making.

The Church more strictly adhered to the principle of indissolubility in the case of men dismissing their wives on the grounds of sterility. Regino commented that it was better that the mentally or physically ill did not marry; but if they did the parties could not use this to resort to divorce. ²⁰¹ The early insular Penitential of Vinnian had forbidden men to dismiss barren wives. ²⁰² The case of Lothar and Theutberga turned on several issues - the repudiation of a legitimately taken and accepted wife for a concubine; incest; the fact that Theutberga had not produced children unlike her rival, Waldrada. ²⁰³ But Lothar did not attempt to divorce Theutberga on the grounds of her childlessness. This may suggest that the principle that sterility as insufficient grounds for divorce was now accepted by the higher nobility and royalty. Regino of Prüm included canons dealing with the case not to illustrate that sterile women were not to be repudiated, an issue he fails to address, but to illustrate that men should not have concubines and that a

¹⁹⁸ Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.XIV,7,p.198.

¹⁹⁹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.125,p.265.

²⁰⁰ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.5.21,p.210.

²⁰¹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.129,p.264.

²⁰² Wasserschleben, c.41,p.117.

²⁰³ Hincmar stated that a man should not repudiate a sterile wife; De divortio, PL125,col.734D.

legitimate marriage was indissoluble. 204

In cases of male impotence the Frankish Church did allow dissolution. This did not necessarily empower women. The Councils of Verberie (758) 205 and Compiègne (757) 206 both allowed divorce and remarriage on the grounds of a husband's impotence. The latter council stated, however, that if the husband declared that the marriage had been consummated he was to be believed because the man was head of his wife. 207 These canons were included by Regino of Prüm 208 who also stated that a woman was to be condemned if she tried to use her husband's impotence as a reason to remarry. 209 Regino also included a canon on impotency 210 drawn from Hrabanus Maurus' Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum. This released a woman from marriage to an impotent husband in order to remarry only si potest probare per iustum iudicium. 211 Hrabanus was himself relying on the Penitential of Theodore which stated that dissolution was only possible "if anyone (quis) can prove that this is true". 212 The quis in this instance was surely male which again demonstrates that the difficulty for women was proof. 213

The Confessional of Egbert is unusual in allowing a woman to divorce an impotent husband without referring to the

204 Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.103,112,115, pp.255,258-60.

205 MGH Capit. I,c.17,p.41.

206 MGH Capit. I,c.20,p.39.

207 MGH, Ibid.

208 Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.244,245,p.309.

209 Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.5.32,p.211.

210 Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.243,pp.308-09.

211 PL110,c.29,col.491A.

212 Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,32,p.216. This canon also occurs in the Martinian Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.41,p.291.

213 Gaudemet, Le Mariage, p.121.

requirement of proof. ²¹⁴ The difficulties of women in proving impotence were no less where the ordeal was used. The Councils of Reisbach, Freising and Salzburg (800) repeated the canon from the Council of Verberie (758) ²¹⁵ by prescribing the "ordeal of the cross" in such cases. ²¹⁶ But the woman's voice was dependent on male consensus. Hincmar commented in the case of Stephen of Auvergne that the wife should be asked her opinion since husbands and wives sometimes said different things. ²¹⁷ Despite this and despite Hincmar being this woman's kinsman, her treatment by all the men concerned seems "chilling" ²¹⁸ and illustrates that the male version of events was often given priority.

This issue of proof illustrates that the "problem of impotence is not so much a moral problem of human sexuality as it is a legal problem concerning the possibility of remarriage". ²¹⁹ This may explain why none of the episcopal statutes deal with the issue of impotence; it may also indicate that the statutes were used conjointly with penitential handbooks which do refer to the issue. The failure to consummate a marriage was a legal issue since morgengabe was proof of consummation as much as of the woman's virginity; the importance of morgengabe "as a symbol of a new, medieval view of marriage" was that now "attention focused on the sexual

²¹⁴ Wasserschleben, c.20, p.309.

²¹⁵ See n.205 above.

²¹⁶ "decrevit ut si vir negaverit eam fecisse ad uxorem, ut stet cum illa ad iudicium crucis aut, si ipse noluerit, inquirat aliam feminam, quae cum illa stet; si vir eandem copulationem dicit super eam et illa negaverit, tunc ipsa femina purget se secundum legem": MGH Conc. II i, c.46, pp.212-13.

²¹⁷ "Et quoniam de altera femina audivimus, quia volens liberari a coniuge, persuasa super se aliqua quae non erant, ut fertur, iam dixerit: debita ei libertas tribuatur, et periculum indicetur, ne persuasa pro veritate mendacium fateatur"; MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no.136, l.13-15, p.91.

²¹⁸ Nelson, Charles the Bald, p.197; and p.283 below.

²¹⁹ Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.32.

act".²²⁰ Thus Hincmar insisted that consummation validated a marriage; Stephen's non-consummation of his marriage was deemed to be sufficient grounds for dissolution and remarriage.²²¹ However, Hincmar also demonstrated that impotence was not simply perceived as a legal matter but also a social one. He cited the case of a young man unable to consummate his marriage; on investigation it transpired that his former concubine had worked magic against the new, legitimate union. Once the man had undergone penance he and his wife lived happily together, producing several children.²²² It is significant, that a woman's wiles were perceived to be at the root of the problem: impotence was not the man's problem. In contrast, sterility was regarded as a woman's problem and as an area the Church could become involved in by making very public liturgical provision.²²³

The only other grounds allowed to a woman to remarry were if she or her husband were sold into captivity. The Confessional of Egbert had allowed a woman to remarry if her husband had been captured²²⁴ as had the Penitential of Theodore. However, while this last text allowed a man to remarry after a year if his first wife was captured²²⁵, a woman could only do this after five years.²²⁶ Inconsistently, this penitential also stated that, if a captured spouse should return, a man or woman should put away the second partner and reclaim the former²²⁷; but elsewhere a man was allowed to keep the second spouse and

²²⁰ Owen Hughes, "From Brideprice to Dowry", p.275.

²²¹ MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no.136, l.1-20, p.93.

²²² De divortio, PL125, col.717.

²²³ See pp.332-41 below.

²²⁴ Wasserschleben, c.26, p.311.

²²⁵ Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.XII, 20, p.215.

²²⁶ Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.XII, 21, p.215. Inconsistently, this also states that a man should wait five years.

²²⁷ Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.XII, 22, p.215.

the returning wife could remarry but only if she had been married once before. ²²⁸ Regino of Prüm stated that if a man was forced to flee and his wife, because of the love for her parentes did not wish to follow him, then she could remarry as could he. ²²⁹ Hincmar also allowed the wives of captured men to remarry. ²³⁰ But ultimately, women had less freedom in this situation: Regino prescribed excommunication for those women who would not go back to their returning first husbands. ²³¹

These statements probably applied to the nobility since the Church took a firmer line concerning the monogamy of the non-noble. Regino forbade remarriage if a serf's wife was enslaved elsewhere ²³² as this would constitute adultery. ²³³ The Council of Châlons (813) stated that the legitimate marriages of servi should not be dissolved even if they served different masters. ²³⁴ Frankish ecclesiastics could afford to take a stricter line with servi since they were most concerned with the interests of their own lay counterparts - noble laymen.

In the case of the nobility it is questionable whether the Church was successful in achieving anything other than the beginning of the acceptance of the principle of indissolubility. Women could be repudiated if they could not disprove a charge of adultery; they could not divorce if they could not prove their husband's impotence. Women's dependence on male support is exemplified by the Council of Metz (888). This excommunicated a woman, Ava, who cum

²²⁸ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,c.25,24,pp.215-16.

²²⁹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.123,p.262. This comes from c.9 of the Council of Verberie (758); MGH Capit. I,p.41.

²³⁰ De divortio, PL125,col.650C.

²³¹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.183,p.285.

²³² Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.118,pp.261-62 [the source was the 758 Council of Verberie]; Bk.2,c.121,p.261.

²³³ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.122,pp.261-62.

²³⁴ MGH Conc. II i,c.30,p.279.

sui fratris consilio et auxilio et cum aliis consanguinis suis suam maritum dimisit; to cover up their crime they attacked and castrated a priest. ²³⁵ Cases such as this qualify the argument that the Lothar/Theutberga case was a turning-point, that "although the battle was fought on the pinnacle of society, its outcome affected the fate of less exalted people. It enabled the Church to reassert the principle of indissolubility and to apply it to all cases coming to its attention". ²³⁶

VII. Incest and Consanguinity.

What the Lothar/Theutberga case does exemplify is an increasing preoccupation with incest and consanguinity. The preoccupation with this issue by Frankish ecclesiastics can be seen in episcopal statutes which deal with incest but not with other marriage matters. ²³⁷ The Church's concern over incest was not new to the ninth century; the Early Church also prohibited incestuous

²³⁵ Mansi 18,c.10,col.80.

²³⁶ Wemple, Women, p.86. Konecny's appraisal of Louis the Pious' stricter line on concubinage and the subsequent return to a variety of marital arrangements ["Eherecht und Ehepolitik unter Ludwig dem Frommen", p.21] is also applicable only to the royal family and the higher aristocracy - particularly as Louis' alliances formed part of a family strategy.

²³⁷ For example the statutes of Hatto of Basle; MGH Capit. Episc.,c.21,pp.217-218. The Admonitio Synodalis also refers to consanguinity and abduction but not to divorce or adultery; see n.85 above. Rodulf of Bourges' statutes contain a chapter each on adultery and fornication [MGH Capit. Episc.,c.42,43,p.265] but do not deal with abduction, divorce or incest. These selections of topics are explicable in the statutes' use alongside the penitentials. Also, they represent responses to actual cases. Ruotger of Trier's statutes do not deal with any aspect of marriage; they are concerned with priests' conduct except for chapters on infant baptism, the sexual mores of sponsors and the importance of communion for the laity [MGH Capit. Episc.,c.23-25,p.69]. Ruotger's preoccupation with priestly behaviour is similar to that in Hincmar's statutes; he wrote on important issues like marriage in other types of sources. Episcopal statutes are not necessarily similar in style or intention.

unions. ²³⁸ The secular leges incorporated this concern. ²³⁹ However, the Frankish Church extended its view of incest and consanguinity. The early Carolingian legislation issued general condemnations of incesta matrimonia ²⁴⁰; but the Councils of Verberie (758) and Compiègne (757) defined incest to include relationships contracted via a sexual bond which then contaminated a marriage. Hence a man who had sexual relationships with both a mother and daughter and then married was obliged to have his marriage dissolved; if the women had been aware of the incest they had to leave their husbands. ²⁴¹ Incest between a man and two sisters was also condemned. ²⁴²

The ninth-century reforms expressed similar attitudes but issued many more statements. The Capitulare Generale (802) issued a general condemnation of incest without defining it. ²⁴³ There then followed a spate of Councils defining incestuous marriages. The Council of Arles (813) prohibited marriages between a man and his brother's widow or another female relative, his step-mother, first cousin, the widow or daughter of an uncle, his father's daughter,

²³⁸ The Council of Tours (567) forbade the marrying of near relations generally; MGH Conc. I, c.22, pp.131-33. The Council of Orleans (511) prohibited the marriage of a brother's widow or wife's sister; MGH Conc. I, c.18, p.6. The Council of Epaône greatly extended the concept by forbidding these marriages and also those to a step-daughter, step-mother, an uncle's or father's widow; MGH Conc. I, c.30, p.26. On the background to incest and the Early Church see G. Fransen, "Le Rupture du mariage", p.617.

²³⁹ Lex Alamannorum forbade a man's marriage to a mother-in-law, step-daughter, niece, or brother's wife; MGH Legum Sectio, I, 5.1, c.39, pp.98-99. Lex Baiwariorum repeated these injunctions' MGH Legum Sectio, I, 5.2, c.VII, 1, p.347-48. Lex Visigothorum forbade unions to the sixth generation; MGH Legum Sectio, I.1, c.III, 5.1, p.159.

²⁴⁰ Conc. Liftinense (743), MGH Conc. II i, c.3, p.6.

²⁴¹ Council of Compiègne (757), MGH Capit. I, c.17, pp.38-9.

²⁴² MGH, Ibid, c.18, p.39.

²⁴³ MGH Capit. I, c.33, p.97.

or his own step-daughter. ²⁴⁴ The Council of Mainz (813) forbade consanguinous marriages to the fourth degree²⁴⁵ which was repeated by another Council of Mainz (847).²⁴⁶ The Council of Mainz (813) also included as consanguinous sexual relationships contracted after a marriage, condemning a man who married a widow and afterwards fornicated with his step-daughter, or if he married two sisters or if a woman married two brothers, or a father and son. ²⁴⁷

Individual bishops also condemned consanguinous marriages but were not consistent in the degrees to which they thought consanguinity should be observed. The Admonitio Synodalis non-specifically condemned consanguinous unions.²⁴⁸ Theodulf of Orleans condemned a woman who successively married two brothers or a man two sisters. ²⁴⁹ Gherbald of Liège prohibited marriages up to and including the fourth degree ²⁵⁰; whereas Herard of Tours stated that no one should marry in the fifth and sixth degrees and ideally up to the seventh. ²⁵¹ The Anonymous of Trier only took the rule up to the fifth degree. ²⁵²

This lack of consistency is paralleled in the penitentials. The Penitential of Theodore stated that there were two interpretations of consanguinity: that of the Greeks which allowed marriage in the third degree and

²⁴⁴ MGH Conc. II i,c.11,p.251.

²⁴⁵ MGH Conc. II i,c.54,p.273.

²⁴⁶ MGH Conc. III,c.30,pp.175-76.

²⁴⁷ MGH Conc. II i,c.56,p.273.

²⁴⁸ "et ut nullus ad proximam sanguinis sui accedat"; Admonitio Synodalis,c.77,p.63.

²⁴⁹ MGH Capit. Episc.,II,c.V,2,3,p.161. Rodulf of Bourges condemned a woman's fornication with two brothers; MGH Ibid, c.41,p.264.

²⁵⁰ MGH, Ibid,II,c.4,p.27.

²⁵¹ PL121,c.36,cols.766-67.

²⁵² MGH Capit. Episc.,c.4,p.55.

that of the Romans which allowed it in the fifth.²⁵³ The Confessional of Egbert prescribed separation for marriages in the third degree, but only penance for those in the fourth.²⁵⁴ The Martinian Penitential recommended that consanguinity be observed in the sixth and seventh degrees.²⁵⁵ The latter text is a later Frankish compilation reflecting stricter ninth-century views on consanguinity.

An increasingly strict interpretation also explains the harsher penalties in the ninth century. The Penitential of Theodore had recommended that the parties in a consanguinous marriage should do penance rather than separate²⁵⁶ as did the Council of Verberie (758).²⁵⁷ But the Council of Mainz (813) stated that parties contracting marriages in the fourth degree should separate.²⁵⁸ Separation and five years penance was stipulated by the St. Hubert Penitential for marriage with a cousin's or father's wife or a wife's sister.²⁵⁹ However, Hatto of Basle more leniently allowed penance for parties contracting marriages in the fourth degree.²⁶⁰ The Council of Friouli (796/7) recommended penitential flogging²⁶¹; the Council of Mainz (847) recommended that those contracting incestuous marriages should undergo public penance²⁶²; and excommunication was recommended by

²⁵³ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,25,p.216.

²⁵⁴ Wasserschleben, c.28,pp.311-12.

²⁵⁵ Wasserschleben, c.29,pp.288-89.

²⁵⁶ Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.XII,25,p.216.

²⁵⁷ In the fourth degree; MGH Capit. I,c.1,p.40.

²⁵⁸ MGH Conc. II i,c.54,p.273.

²⁵⁹ Wasserschleben, c.45,p.383.

²⁶⁰ MGH Capit. Episc.,c.21,p.217.

²⁶¹ MGH Conc. II i,c.8,p.191.

²⁶² MGH Conc. III,c.28,p.175.

Halitgar of Cambrai's penitential ²⁶³, Hrabanus Maurus ²⁶⁴, the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore ²⁶⁵, and Regino of Prüm. ²⁶⁶

These different interpretations indicate that each case was judged according to local ecclesiastics' interpretation, as is suggested by the Council of Châlons (813). ²⁶⁷ The Council of Worms (868) stated that rules on consanguinity should be observed, so far as relationship was known or remembered, so that no Christian man would take a consanguinous wife; but it does not specify what these rules were. ²⁶⁸ This also indicates the application of localised standards.

The prevention of consanguinous marriages was not entirely an ecclesiastical concern. The male laity realised that the Church regarded incest and consanguinity

²⁶³ PL105, Bk.4, c.20, 21, cols.684-85.

²⁶⁴ Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum, PL110, c.20, cols.485-87.

²⁶⁵ Wasserschleben, c.V, 21, p.586.

²⁶⁶ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.196, 198, pp.290-91. Regino includes a whole series of canons on incest from Hrabanus Maurus' Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum (c.198), the Council of Mainz, the Council of Tribur (895), the Penitential of Theodore and the Council of Verberie (758). Drawing on the latter, Regino included the more lenient stipulation that parties contracting marriages in the fourth degree might do penance rather than separate [Ibid, Bk.2, c.213, p.299] but also included the statement from the Council of Mainz (813) which ordered the separation of marriages in the fourth degree [Ibid, Bk.2, c.227, p.303]. This variety was probably provided for different cases.

²⁶⁷ "Interrogaverunt nos quidam de adfinitate propinquitatum et in quibus gradibus matrimonia iungenda sint. Quibus nos ad canones currere praecepimus et, quod in eis continentur, hoc ab eis in hoc negotio sicut et in caeteris observari debere"; MGH Conc. II i, c.27, p.279. It is apparent from quidam that this referred to an actual case and that the bishops' interpretation of the canons available to them was how cases were individually judged.

²⁶⁸ "In copulatione fidelium, generationis numerum non diffinimus, sed id statuimus, ut nulli Christiano liceat de propria consanguinitate sive cognatione uxorem accipere, usque dum generatio recordatur, cognoscitur, aut memoria retinetur"; Mansi 15, c.32, col.875.

so serious, it constituted one of few legitimate grounds for divorce. This was why Lothar attempted to use the accusation of incest against Theutberga. Hincmar admitted that, if Theutberga was proved to have had a pre-marital relationship with her brother, she would be rendered unworthy to be a wife. ²⁶⁹

The Church therefore seemed to provide an option for men wishing to repudiate legitimate wives. But, unintentionally, this could encourage adultery. A man could dismiss his wife if he had married a widow and then slept with her daughter. ²⁷⁰ While the Council of Tribur (895) forbade a man to divorce a woman because she was not subject to Frankish law ²⁷¹ or if the woman was of unfree origin ²⁷², it did allow divorce in the case of a wife who then slept with her husband's brother. ²⁷³ Interestingly, the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore stated that if a man took a legitimate wife and his brother then took his concubine, they were to separate and do penance since this was regarded as incest. ²⁷⁴ This suggests that wives and concubines were regarded as virtually the same in this context.

Abuse of the rules of consanguinity prompted Hrabanus Maurus to comment that the degrees of consanguinity were too strict, allowing for easy divorce and fornication. ²⁷⁵

²⁶⁹ De divortio, PL125,col.645. Here Hincmar stated that only incest could dissolve a marriage with the hope of remarriage; a couple could separate on account of fornication or if one party wished to enter a monastery but the other spouse could not remarry.

²⁷⁰ Council of Worms (868); Mansi 15,c.36,col.876.

²⁷¹ MGH Capit. II,c.39,pp.235-36.

²⁷² MGH Capit. II,c.38,p.235.

²⁷³ MGH Capit. II,c.41,p.237.

²⁷⁴ Wasserschleben, c.V,23,p.586.

²⁷⁵ "Si enim, ubicumque aliquid proximitatis vel consanguinitis licet longinquae inter coniugatores inveniri potest, statim matrimonium dissolvitur, vereor, quod adulterium et fornicationis scelus multiplicetur";

Stephen of Auvergne's confession of the pre-marital affair he had had with a relative of his wife, allowed him to get out of this marriage. Hincmar stated that consanguinity had not been committed but that it would be if Stephen consummated the marriage. ²⁷⁶ The Anonymous of Freising stated that men who, abominating their wives, alleged consanguinity, in order to dismiss them and remarry, should have their story verified by witnesses. ²⁷⁷

These witnesses were similar to those involved in the pre-marital enquiries. Thus it is important to note that the stated purpose of these cooperative investigations was always to uncover consanguinity. ²⁷⁸ This indicates that the male laity perceived itself to have a positive interest in this issue; the Church was not necessarily imposing its views. Bouchard has argued that the tenth and eleventh-century French nobility generally contracted marriages which observed the Church's rules on consanguinity. ²⁷⁹ Certainly it is also true to say of the ninth century that "rather than saying that the Church and the secular nobility held opposing views on the propriety of marrying relatives... nobles avoided most consanguinous marriages deliberately knowing that they would be unstable and endangered from the outset". ²⁸⁰ The same motives -

MGH Epp. Karol., 5, no. 29, pp. 446-447.

²⁷⁶ MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no. 136, l. 32-34, p. 95. Incest was possible via a sexual union prior to marriage and after. The Penitential of Theodore had prescribed against marriages contracted with a spouse's relations after the spouse's death; Wasserschleben, Bk. 2, c. XII, 27, p. 216.

²⁷⁷ "De hominibus, qui abominantur uxores suas et ob hoc sanguinitate propinquitatis eam sibi dicunt esse coniunctam, ut illam possint dimittere et alteram ducere uxorem, cum qualibus testibus causa veritatis in eo negotio probetur, necessarium est inquirendum"; Anonymous of Freising, c. 21, p. 291. Nelson comments that witnesses were routinely required; "Dispute settlement", p. 59.

²⁷⁸ See n. 16, 17, 18, 19 above.

²⁷⁹ C. B. Bouchard, "Consanguinity and Noble Marriages in the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries", Speculum, 56, (1981), pp. 268-87.

²⁸⁰ Bouchard, Ibid, p. 284.

strengthening the distinct social strata of the nobility by numerous ties of marriage and kinship ²⁸¹ - may also have been at play in the ninth century.

There was an important ninth-century addition to the principle of consanguinity - spiritual relationships. Again, this was not a new concept: the Council of Rome (721) had included as incestuous, marriages with women religious, female relatives, and also a spiritalis commater. ²⁸² But, as Lynch has shown, the Franks renewed the Early Church's concept of godparentage and kinship in the ninth century. ²⁸³ The Frankish penitentials reflect this. The Martinian Penitential follows earlier insular penitentials in condemning marriages with blood relations or relatives by marriage, but adds a new prohibition against marriage with a co-mother. ²⁸⁴ The St. Hubert Penitential condemns quis who accepts in marriage a daughter or sister ex sacro fonte vel chrismate ²⁸⁵; and the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore condemns relationships with a commater and spiritalis mater. ²⁸⁶ Halitgar of Cambrai's penitential ²⁸⁷, Hrabanus Maurus ²⁸⁸ and Regino of Prüm ²⁸⁹ included similar prohibitions.

²⁸¹ Bouchard, Ibid, p.286.

²⁸² Mansi 12,c.1-9,col.263. On the importance of this council as a "seminal" text as a definition of incest for ninth-century penitentials and legislation see Lynch, Godparents and Kinship, pp.236-38.

²⁸³ Lynch, Ibid, pp.219-81;part IV.

²⁸⁴ Wasserschleben, c.30,3,p.289.

²⁸⁵ Wasserschleben, c.51,p.384. This text is rather unusual in stressing the relationship between spiritual siblings as an impediment to marriage since this was more of a feature of the twelfth century and Gratian's Decretum; Lynch, Godparents and Kinship, p.203.

²⁸⁶ Wasserschleben, c.V,pp.584-86.

²⁸⁷ PL105,Bk.4,c.22,cols.684-85.

²⁸⁸ Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum, PL110,c.20,cols.485-87.

²⁸⁹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.197,199,200, pp.290-92.

The legislation also condemned marriages with spiritual kin in the same breath as incest with natural or married kin. Haito of Basle condemned marriage with a compater aut commater, filiulus aut filiola spiritalis de fonte aut de confirmatione.²⁹⁰ Gherbald of Liège condemned a man who sponsored his step-daughter at confirmation and then later committed adultery with her or married her²⁹¹, or who married or committed adultery with a goddaughter.²⁹² Both Gherbald²⁹³ and Herard of Tours²⁹⁴ condemned a man for having an adulterous relationship with a co-mother, as did the Council of Worms (868)²⁹⁵; but, as the Council of Mainz (888) indicates, marriage with co-mothers occurred.²⁹⁶ A recently discovered legislative text which probably arose out of the Council of Mainz (847) even condemned the man who married the widow of his godfather, or the father who married his goddaughter's co-mother.²⁹⁷ The laity seem to have wished to increase the number of spiritual relations; the Council of Metz (893) was forced to restate that there should only be one sponsor per child.²⁹⁸ The nobility's desire to observe spiritual consanguinity was motivated, as with the non-spiritual kind, by the concern to build alliances within their social group.

²⁹⁰ MGH Capit. Episc., c.21, p.217.

²⁹¹ MGH Capit. Episc., II, c.17, p.31.

²⁹² MGH Capit. Episc., II, c.16, p.31.

²⁹³ MGH, Ibid.

²⁹⁴ PL121, c.66, col.769.

²⁹⁵ Mansi 15, c.34, cols.875-76.

²⁹⁶ This council condemned one Alemannus who had married his spiritual co-mother and although they had separated continued to "impiously associate"; Mansi 18, c.18, col.69.

²⁹⁷ "Ut nullus accipiat in coniugium viduam spiritalis patris neque cummatrem (sic) pater spiritalis filioli sui" [c.4 at p.212]; W. Hartmann, "Eine kleine Sammlung von Busstexten aus dem 9. Jahrhundert", DA, 39 (1983), pp.207-13; text=pp.211-13.

²⁹⁸ Mansi 18, c.6, col.79; and Lynch, Godparents and Kinship, p.209, note 16.

The treatment of consanguinity highlights a specific perception of women. Except for the occasions where incest is condemned when it occurs between a woman and two brothers ²⁹⁹, the legislation and the penitentials nearly always refer to guis, homo, or laicus and his incest with a co-mother or a goddaughter or an uncle's wife or daughter, or a brother's wife or relative and so on. Thus the relationship is always described from the male stance; and the woman is always described as a relative of another man - a brother's wife or a father's daughter etc.³⁰⁰ This reflects the cultural perception of sexual relationships, with men usually seen as the initiators of sexual liaisons. Wulfad of Bourges whilst enjoining both husbands and wives to refrain from sexual pollution, then discussed incest as if it were a male problem: so that no one should pollute himself with a female relative or a relative of his wife. ³⁰¹

Mention of women is therefore all the more striking. The Council of Châlons (813) stated that it was known that some women had cunningly and fraudulently, and in order to separate from their husbands, sponsored their own children at confirmation; where this had happened they were not allowed to separate from their husbands but were to do penance instead. ³⁰² The Anonymous of Trier condemned men

²⁹⁹ And this tends to be contrasted with a man's incest with two sisters: for example, Council of Worms (868) Mansi 15,c.33,cols.875-76; Council of Tribur (895), MGH Capit.II,c.44,45,pp.238-39.

³⁰⁰ Except where incest is described between a man and a widow's daughter [Halitgar of Cambrai's Penitential, Wasserschleben, Bk.6,c.X,7,p.373] or a wife's sister or daughter [Merseburg Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.146,p.405].

³⁰¹ MGH Epp. Karol.,6,no.27,pp.188-92.

³⁰² "Dictum etiam nobis est quasdam feminas desidiose, quasdam vero fraudulenter, ut a viris separentur, proprios filios coram episcopis ad confirmandum tenuisse. Unde nos dignum duximus, ut, si qua mulier filium suum desidia aut fraude aliqua coram episcopo ad confirmandum tenuerit, propter fallatiam suam paenitentiam agat, a viro tamen suo non separetur"; MGH Conc. II i,c.31,p.279. Lynch regards this as an unforeseen

who took their co-mothers in marriage and women who sponsored their own sons at confirmation or their daughters at baptism or confirmation.³⁰³ The text does not say what is to be done in these circumstances, merely that such cases are to be referred to the bishop.

These statements contrast with the Council of Mainz (813) which prohibited any man (nullus) from being a godparent to his son or daughter, marrying a goddaughter or co-mother, or sponsoring his son or daughter at confirmation; the penalty for such practices was separation.³⁰⁴ Herard of Tours also allowed a man who had sponsored his children, or who married a woman who had sponsored his children, to be divorced.³⁰⁵ The infrequency with which women are specifically mentioned in the prescriptions suggest that the Châlons canon was either of particular concern because women had more to do with the spiritual upbringing of their children³⁰⁶; and/or that the Church was far less willing to accommodate marriage strategies when ingeniously exercised by women. The Châlons statement also evidences the Church's view of women as naturally deceitful; the statements concerning men do not mention that they may have manipulated the rules to their own advantage. Admittedly, the Council of Worms (868) stated that even though a man might commit fornication with his co-mother, goddaughter, or a girl he had sponsored at confirmation, he was to do penance but was not to dismiss his legitimately held wife.³⁰⁷ This seems to have been at

circumstance of the consanguinity rules but fails to note it was specifically women who were chastised for trickery; Godparents and Kinship, pp.279-80.

³⁰³ MGH Capit. Episc., c.8, p.56.

³⁰⁴ MGH Conc. II i, c.55, p.273. This repeats the Council of Compiègne (757) [MGH Capit. I, c.15, p.38] except, importantly, the Mainz directive in 813 adds the phrase similiter femina. This parallels the prescription in the Council of Châlons (813).

³⁰⁵ PL121, c.38, col.767.

³⁰⁶ See pp.360-65 below.

³⁰⁷ Mansi 15, c.34, col.875.

least one attempt to stop abuses by men but at a very much later stage than the prescription in 813 against women.

VIII. Marriage as an Attractive Alternative to Monasticism?

It has been argued that "the improved legal position of married women contributed to the waning of women's interest in an ascetic life".³⁰⁸ But if some women were attempting to use spiritual consanguinity to escape marriage this argument requires qualification. That women may have wished to escape marriages is indicated by Regino of Prüm allowing men to physically take their wives out of convents.³⁰⁹ Regino seemingly affords little protection to women by including two canons from the Theodosian Code allowing a husband to kill an adulterous wife if her crime was with a "slave" or committed in the husband's home.³¹⁰ Certainly Ingeltrude feared Boso would kill her³¹¹; and Theutberga also stated that she had been forced to admit to incest because of the threat of violence.³¹² That women were subject to violence was commented on by Hincmar who claimed that husbands had their wives butchered.³¹³

However, whilst recognising the interests of noble laymen in many marriage matters, the Church also saw its role as protecting women. An 829 capitulary stated that men who killed their wives were to be given public penance - reserved for what were perceived as the most serious crimes.³¹⁴ Further, while reserving specific condemnation for adulterous wives, Frankish ecclesiastics

³⁰⁸ Wemple, Women, p.171.

³⁰⁹ See n.199 above.

³¹⁰ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.146,147,pp.269-70.

³¹¹ De divortio, PL125,col.754B.

³¹² Letter of Pope Nicholas I; MGH Epp. Karol,6, no.11,pp.277-78.

³¹³ "ad macellum illas duci faciant laniandas et coquorum suorum gladiis more vervecum atque porcorum mactari precipient, vel ipsi etiam manu et mucrone eas trucident"; De divortio, PL125,col.657.

³¹⁴ Capitulary of Worms (829), MGH Capit. II,c.3,p.18.

also recognised that the accusation of adultery could put a woman at risk. The Council of Tribur (895) provided episcopal protection for women who, having been accused of adultery, fled their husbands who plotted to kill them.³¹⁵ The Church clearly expected to be able to protect women³¹⁶; but such cases suggest that monasticism was not necessarily a less attractive option for noblewomen in the ninth century.

³¹⁵ MGH Capit. II,c.46,pp.239-40.

³¹⁶ Thus Hincmar stated that it was for the bishop to secure fair treatment for Ingeltrude should she return to Boso; MGH Epp. Karol.,8,no.135,l.26-1.5,pp.83-84.

THE RITUAL AND SACRAMENT OF MARRIAGE:
THE IMAGE OF THE GOOD WIFE.

I. Women in Nuptial Liturgy.

The ninth century is significant for the development of nuptial liturgy. The earliest extant marriage ordo is the marriage and coronation ritual for Charles the Bald's daughter, Judith in 856.¹ This rite, which scholars have analysed², constitutes alongside Ermentrude's coronation ordo (866)³ liturgical provision of a very special nature. These rites, nevertheless, will prove to have significance for nuptial liturgy in general. Prior to the distinct Judith ordo, and indeed for some time afterwards, nuptial liturgical provision consisted of a benediction within the Mass.⁴ In the late eighth/early ninth century this kind of provision was made in the Hadrianum and the

¹ MGH Capit. II, pp.425-27.

² Ritzer identified the Roman, Gallican and Celtic provenance of the ordo's formulas; Le Mariage, pp.330-32. Vogel provided a similar analysis, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage", pp.431-32. Nelson made a more thorough comparison of the "Judith" ordo with the Leofric's Benedictiones super regem voviter electum concluding that "the content and structure of "Judith" implies not only... that Hincmar's sources in 856 included some regal benedictions like those of "Leofric", but that Hincmar had before him a series in precisely "Leofric's" order and with the anointing prayer in the same central place"; "The Earliest Surviving Royal Ordo", pp.348-49.

³ MGH Capit. II, pp.453-55.

⁴ Vogel, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage", p.430. That the Church has found the provision of separate nuptial ritual problematic is illustrated by secondary commentaries: the New Catholic Encyclopedia, for example, has sections dealing variously with "the use of marriage", "canon law", "the motives for marriage", "marital roles" and "theological explanations for marriage" but there is nothing concerning its ritual; vol.9, pp.258-94.

Eighth-century Gelasian, the Sacramentary of Gellone.⁵ The Hadrianum ⁶ displays similarities with the Veronese Sacramentary particularly in the ordering of the prayers⁷ except for the insertion of the Gelasian preface: V.D: qui foedere nuptiarum blando concordiae iugo ⁸:

⁵ There is no nuptial provision in the Sacramentary of Angoulême probably because it is descended from two recensions (manuscripts x and y) of the Frankish version of the original Gelasian (Reginensis 316) whereas the Sacramentary of Gellone is more directly descended, via manuscript x; Saint-Roch, Sac. Engol., pp.xvi,xxv.

⁶ Deshusses, I, 833-39, pp.308-11.

⁷ Sac. Veron., 1105-1110, pp.139-40.

⁸ The Hadrianum's version of this has an additional Sanctus phrase; Deshusses, I, 835, l.6-8, p.309.

Veronense.Incipit velatio nuptialis

[1]
Exaudi nos... deus ut quod
nostro ministratur officio...

[2]
Suscipe domine quaesumus pro
sacra lege coniugii...

[3]
Hanc igitur oblationem famulae
illius quam tibi offerimus pro
famula... Pro qua maiestatem
tuam supplices exoramus...

[4]
Quaesumus omnipotens deus
instituta providentiae tuae...

[5]
Adesto domine supplicationibus
nostris, et institutis tuis...

[6]
Pater mundi conditor...

Hadrianum.Oratio ad sponsas velandas

[1]
Exaudi nos... deus ut quod
nostro ministratur officio...

[2] Super oblata
Suscipe domine quaesumus pro
sacra conubii lege...

[3] Praefatio
V.D.: qui foedere nuptiarum
blando concordiae iugo...

[4]
Hanc igitur oblationem
famulorum quam tibi offerent
pro famula... pro qua
maiestatem tuam supplices
exoramus...

[5] Ante quam dicatur pax
domini dic. ort.
Propitiare domine
supplicationibus nostris et
institutis tuis...

[6a] Benedictio
Deus qui potestate virtutis...

[6b]
Respice propitius super hanc
famulam tuam quae maritali
iungenda est...

[7] Ad completa
Quaesumus omnipotens domine
instituta providentiae tuae...

The provision in the Sacramentary of Gellone ⁹, however,
is very similar to that in the original Gelasian ¹⁰:

⁹ Sac. Gellon., 2629-39, pp. 411-14.

¹⁰ Sac. Gelas., 1443-55, pp. 208-10. The provision in
the Sacramentary of Autun corresponds exactly to that in
the Gelasian Sacramentary; Sac. August., 1644-1653, pp. 203-04.

Gelasian.Incipit Accio Nupcialis

[1]

Adesto domine supplicationibus nostris, et institutis tuis...

[2]

Quaesumus omnipotens deus instituta providentiae tuae...

[3] Secreta

Adesto, domine, supplicationibus nostris et hanc oblationem famularum, quam tibi offerunt pro famula... quam ad statum maturitatis...

[4]

V.D.: qui foedera nupciarum blando concordiae iugo...

[5] Infra accionem

Hanc igitur oblationem famularum tuarum quam tibi offerunt pro famula... pro qua maiestatem tuam supplices exoramus...

[6] Infra accionem ad trecesimum vel annualem nuptiarum.

Hanc igitur oblationem, domine, famulorum tuorum... quam tibi offeret (sic) ob diem trecesimum coniunctionis suae vel annualem...

[7] et sic eam benedicis his verbis: Incipit oratio

Deus, qui mundi crescentis...

Sacramentary of Gellone.Accio Nuptialis

[1]

Adesto domine supplicationibus nostris, et institutis tuis...

[2]

Quesumus omnipotens deus instituta providentiae tue...

[3] Secreta

Adesto, domine, supplicationibus nostris et hanc oblationem famulorum, quam tibi offerunt pro famula... quam ad statum maturitatis...

[4]

V.D.: qui federa nuptiarum blando concordie iugo...

[5] Infrac.

Hanc igitur oblationem, domine, famulorum tuorum... quam tibi offerunt ob diem trigisimum coniunctionis suae vel annualem...

[6] et sic cantas benedictionis orationem his verbis:

Deus, qui mundi crescentis...

[8] Incipit benedictio
Pater, mundi conditor...

[7]
Pater, mundi conditur...

[9]
Pax vobiscum
Et sic eos comunicas.
Deinde... dicis super eos
benedictionem:

[8]
Pax vobiscum
Et sic eos comunicas.
Deinde... dicis super eos
benedictionem his verbis:

[10]
Domine... iteratis praecibus te
supplices exoramus...

[9]
Domine... iteratis precibus te
supplices exoramus...

[11] Item post communionem
Exaudi, nos... deus, ut quod
nostro ministratur officio...

[10] Item post communionem
Exaudi, nos... deus, ut quod
nostro ministratur officium...

The Veronense and the Gelasian Sacramentaries share, from their common Roman tradition, several virtually identical prayers ¹¹; except that in Hanc igitur oblationem famulae illius quam tibi offerimus pro famula... pro qua maiestatem tuam supplices exoramus ¹² the singular female subject in the Veronense Sacramentary is plural in the Gelasian. ¹³ Where famula refers to the bride in the Veronense Sacramentary, the plural subjects in the Gelasian were the bride with her attendants. ¹⁴ However, the Gelasian includes the masculine pronoun, illi, alongside illae, here. This suggests that the offering was made by the husband and his attendants also. The Hadrianum corroborates this by making the subjects plural and masculine - oblationem famulorum ¹⁵; but in all these versions the offering is made on behalf of the bride - pro famula.

The important Pater mundi conditor benediction is specifically requested for the sponsa. The version in the Veronense and Gelasian Sacramentaries which is also the

¹¹ The Gelasian prayers 1,2,5,8,11 (pp.293-94above) correspond to the Veronense prayers 5,4,3,6,1 (p.292 above).

¹² Prayer [3], p.292 above; Sac. Veron., 1107, p.139.

¹³ Prayer [5], p.293 above; Sac. Gelas., 1447, p.209.

¹⁴ Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp.243-44.

¹⁵ Prayer [4], p.292 above; Deshusses, I, 836, p.309.

formula in the Sacramentary of Gellone refers to the woman thus:

"Quapropter huius famulae tuae, pater, rudimenta sanctifica ut bono et prospero sociata consorcio legis aeternae iussa custodiat".¹⁶

The Hadrianum has a distinct version of this prayer in two parts¹⁷ which are also addressed to the woman. The first, Deus qui potestate virtutis includes the phrase,

"Deus per quem mulier iungitur viro, et societas principaliter ordinata ea benedictione donatur quae sola nec per originalis peccati poenam nec per diluvii est ablata sententia[m]".¹⁸

The second, Respice propitius super hanc famulam tuam quae maritali instituta providentiae tuae also concerns the bride. Except for this phrase¹⁹ this second prayer includes the same section of Pater mundi conditor as it occurs in the Sacramentary of Gellone.²⁰ This contains the instruction to the bride that she should take as her model several biblical women:

"[Sit in ea iugum dilectionis et pacis]²¹ fidelis et casta nubat in christo, imitatrixque sanctorum permaniat feminarum. Sit amabilis ut Rachel viro suo, sapiens ut Rebecca, longeva ut Sara".²²

A version of these prayers in the Hadrianum was included

¹⁶ "Therefore, Father, bless the youth of this your servant so that in a good and blessed marriage she observes the precepts of the eternal law"; Sac. Gellon., 2636, l.14-16, p.413.

¹⁷ Prayers [6a] and [6b] p.292 above; Deshusses, I, 838a), 838b), p.310. These formulas probably reflect a tradition older than the Veronese and Gelasian Sacramentaries; Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.246.

¹⁸ "God, through whom woman is joined to man, and [through whom] is granted the partnership chiefly ordained by that blessing, which [partnership] alone was not taken away either by the penalty of original sin or by the judgement of the flood"; Deshusses, I, 838a, l.7-8, p.310.

¹⁹ It continues: "se expetit protectione muniri. Sit in ea iugum dilectionis et pacis"; Deshusses, I, 838b, l.10-12, p.310; and n.21 below.

²⁰ Sac. Gellon., 2636, l.18-28, p.413.

²¹ "Let there be in her the yoke of love and peace..."

²² Sac. Gellon., 2636, l.18-21, p.413. For further comment on these allusions see below, pp.314-15.

in Ermentrude's coronation ordo.²³

The Veronese Sacramentary's nuptial Mass is entitled Incipit Velatio Nuptialis. The Gelasian and the Sacramentary of Gellone entitle their nuptial Mass Accio Nuptialis.²⁴ Their inclusion of Pater mundi conditor indicates the veiling of the bride. This prayer makes a number of biblical allusions.²⁵ There are allusions to I Cor., xi, 7²⁶ in the passage:

"Sic enim tibi domine placitum sic necessarium fuit, ut quia longe esse[n]t infirmius quod homini similem quam quod tibi deo feceras, additus [sit] fortiore (sic) sexus infirmior et unum efficiaris ex duobus".²⁷

The other part of this Pauline verse which is alluded to, but not cited, refers to the need for women, but not for men, to cover their heads.²⁸ Although the Hadrianum does not contain this section of Pater mundi conditor it has the rubric, Oratio ad sponsas velandas.²⁹

In addition to the Pater mundi conditor prayer the

²³ Lines 1-4 of Deus qui potestate virtutis as it occurs in the Hadrianum [Deshusses, I, 838a, p. 310] and lines 10-18 of Respice propitius super hanc famulam tuam quae maritali instituta providentiae tuae [Deshusses, I, 838b, pp. 310-11] correspond to the initial section within the central coronation oratio; MGH Capit. II, 1.39-5, pp. 454-55.

²⁴ This is also the title of a nuptial rite in the late ninth/early tenth-century French Pontifical of Poitiers although the part of the manuscript with the nuptial mass is missing; Leroquais, Les Manuscrits Pontificaux I, p. 268. There is no nuptial provision in other late ninth/early tenth-century French pontificals.

²⁵ Ritzer; Le Mariage, p. 240.

²⁶ Also to Mark, x, 8-9. Ritzer, Le Mariage, p. 240.

²⁷ "For it pleased you Lord, and therefore it happened, that because you made far weaker that which you made in the likeness of man than that which you made in your own likeness, as God, the weaker sex might be added to the stronger [and you can make one from two]"; Sac. Gellon., 2636, l. 6-10, pp. 412-13.

²⁸ I Cor., xi, 7: "vir quidem non debet velare caput suum, quoniam imago et gloria Dei est; mulier autem gloria viri est".

²⁹ Deshusses, I, p. 308.

Sacramentary of Gellone includes another Gelasian prayer said over the woman: Deus, qui mundi crescentis.³⁰ This and its accompanying rubric is probably not Roman.³¹ The rubric in the Gelasian Sacramentary includes an eam³² absent in the Sacramentary of Gellone.³³ However, the body of the prayer in both liturgies indicates that the prayer was said over the woman:

"Deus, qui mundi crescentis exordio multiplicata prole (sic) benedicis, propitiare supplicationibus nostris et super hanc famulam tuam opem tue benedictionis infunde, ut in coniugali consortio, affectu conpari mente consimili, sanctitate mut[u]a copulentur".³⁴

The Sacramentary of Gellone includes two other oblation prayers from the Gelasian Sacramentary. The first of these is Adesto, domine, supplicationibus nostris et hanc oblationem famulorum, quam tibi offerunt pro famula... quam ad statum maturitatis.³⁵ In the Gelasian Sacramentary the offering is made by plural female subjects, the bride and her attendants - oblationem famularum tuarum illarum.³⁶ However, in the Sacramentary of Gellone, the subjects performing the offering on behalf of the bride (famula) by male plural subjects.³⁷ This indicates that the offering is made by the couple with

³⁰ Prayer [6], p.293 above; Sac. Gellon.,2635,p.412.

³¹ The ternary phrase, effectu conparamento consimili, sanctitate mutua, is reminiscent of the style of Gallican episcopal benedictions; Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.244,note 95a).

³² Formula [7], p.293 above; Sac. Gelas.,1449,p.209.

³³ Formula [6], p.293 above; Sac. Gellon.,2634,p.412.

³⁴ "God, who in the beginning of the world, with abundant blessings brought forth many children, show favour to our prayers and pour out on this your servant the strength of your blessing, so that in the partnership of marriage, through the exercise of equal companionship, they should be joined together in equal affection, like mind, and mutual holiness."

³⁵ Prayer [3], p.293 above; Sac. Gellon.,2631,pp.411-12.

³⁶ Sac. Gelas.,1445,l.29,p.208.

³⁷ "oblationem famulorum tuorum illorum"; Sac. Gellon.,2631,l.2,p.411.

both sets of attendants. The second prayer also indicates the couple's offering: Hanc igitur oblationem, domine, famulorum tuorum illorum et illarum quam tibi offerunt ob diem trigesimum. The timing of this prayer will be commented upon below. ³⁸

The Hadrianum's rubric, Oratio ad sponsas velandas, should not obscure that the Mass involved the couple. Indeed the Roman liturgical tradition indicates that the benediction was of the marriage and not the persons.³⁹ The Gelasian followed by the Sacramentary of Gellone, included a third type of prayer - a benediction to be said over the couple. This is the post-communion prayer: Domine... iteratis precibus te supplices exoramus and it is accompanied by rubric indicating that the words were to be said over both parties. ⁴⁰ The fact that this prayer specifically addressed the husband and not just the wife indicates that it is not of Roman origin. ⁴¹

By the early ninth century several developments are apparent. Apart from the Judith ordo, there was no distinct nuptial rite, rather prayers were incorporated into the Mass; prayers were reserved for the bride who was veiled ⁴²; oblation prayers now included the husband; and

³⁸ Prayer [5], p.293 above; Sac. Gellon., 2633, p.412; and p.306 below.

³⁹ Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.227.

⁴⁰ Formulas [8] and [9] p.294 above; Sac. Gellon., 2637, 2638, p.413.

⁴¹ Also the prayer's structure in three requests for divine providence for the couple, for their children, and for protection from their enemies, is like Gallican episcopal benedictions; Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.245.

⁴² In the Judith ordo, a ring is given to Judith; MGH Capit. II, 1.3-5, p.426. Ritzer identified the anulus pronubus as a Gallican custom signifying betrothal which was incorporated into tenth-century English liturgies. As Judith was marrying the West Saxon king, Aethelwulf, its inclusion "était sans doute une concession a la coutume des hôtes anglo-saxons"; Le Mariage, pp.280-81, 332, notes 182, 187. The description of the ring in the Judith ordo as anulus fidei and as a sign of marriage is similar to the eventual adaptation of this custom in the PRG for nuns and

prayers for the couple were provided.⁴³ The increasing differentiation between parts of the ritual performed for the woman and those for the couple seems peculiarly Frankish which, alongside oblation prayers to include the husband, became more marked in later ninth/early tenth-century liturgies such as those of the Sacramentary of Fulda⁴⁴ and the Leofric Missal.⁴⁵

deaconesses; see pp.227, 234 above. Investing these same women religious with a torque with the phrase, in perpetuum coroneris [PRG I, 24 and 13, pp.45,57] parallels the crowning in both royal ordines, but also Byzantine marriage rites; Metz, La consécration des vierges, p.210.

⁴³ In the Judith ordo Hincmar provided a benediction for the couple by adapting Deus, qui mundi crescentis originally for the woman; MGH Capit. II,1.13-16,p.426.

⁴⁴ Sac. Fuld.,2605-2617,pp.323-27.

⁴⁵ Leofric, p.228.

Sacramentary of Fulda.
Incipit Actio Nuptialis.

[1]
 Adesto domine supplicationibus nostris, et institutis...

[2] Alia
 Quesumus omnipotens deus instituta providentiae tuae...

[3] Super oblata
 Adesto, domine, supplicationibus nostris et hanc oblationem famulorum et famularumque tuarum quam tibi offerunt pro famulo et famula... quos ad statum maturitatis...

[4] Alia
 Deus qui in conditione humani generis feminam ex masculo creans...

[5] Infra actionem
 Hanc igitur oblationem famulorum famularumque tuarum, quam tibi offerunt pro famulo et famula... pro quibus nos quoque maiestatem tuam supplices exoramus...

[6] Alia
 Quesumus deus... famulorum tuorum ill. suscipe vota, fidem robora, spem confirma...

[7] Expleta canone et oratione dominica benedices eam his verbis:
 Deus, qui mundi crescentis...

[8]
 Deus mundi conditor...

[9] Alia. Super utrumque.
 Domine... qui purum hominem immaculatumque finxisti...

[10]
 Pax vobiscum
Deinde postquam communicaverint, dicit super eos orationem hanc:

Leofric Missal.

Oratio pro coniugandis

[1a]
 Exaudi, nos... deus, et institutis, quibus propagationem humani generis ordinasti...

Item ad sponsas benedicendas

[1]
 Exaudi, nos... deus, ut quod nostro ministratur officio...

[2]
 Suscipe domine quesumus pro sacra conubii lege...

[3]
 V.D.: qui federa nuptiarum blando concordiae iugo...

[4] In fractione
 Hanc igitur oblationem famulorum tuorum, quam tibi offerunt pro famula... pro qua maiestati tuae supplices preces...

[5] Antequam dicatur pax domini, dic orationem istam.
Propitiare domine
 supplicationibus nostris et institutis tuis...

[6] Benedictio
 Deus qui potestate virtutis...
 [and]
 Respice propitius super hanc famulam tuam quae maritali iungenda consortio...

[7]
 Pax vobiscum

[8] Ad complendum
 Quesumus omnipotens deus instituta providentiae tue

[11]
Domine... iteratis praecibus te
supplices exoramus...

[12]
Exaudi, nos... deus, ut quod
nostro ministratur officio...

[13] Expleta missa... accedant
ad sacerdotem hi qui coniungendi
sunt. Et parentes puellae vel
propinqui tradent eam sacerdoti.
Ille velans eam de pallio dicit
orationem:

Deum qui ad multiplicandam
humani generis prolem
benedictionis suae dona largiri
dignatus est...

[14] Alia
Deus qui ad propagandam generis
humani progeniem...

[15] His expletis tradet
sacerdos puellam viro admon[en]s
eos, ut pro sancta communione ea
nocte se abstineant a
pollutione. Tunc absoluet
diaconus dicens:
Ite missa est.

Clearly, the Leofric Missal was influenced by that of the Hadrianum in the choice and ordering of its Mass prayers; but the nuptial provision is in two separate parts. The first constitutes a prayer to be said over the couple.⁴⁶ Apart from the initial exhortation this is the same as that said before the pax in the ad sponsas Mass.⁴⁷ The Leofric Missal entitles this Mass, Item ad sponsas benedicendas rather than velandas as in the Hadrianum. Otherwise, all the Hadrianum's prayers in the same order are provided. This differentiation between formulas said over the couple and those concerning the woman suggests Masses for two different occasions.

The provision in the Sacramentary of Fulda is also in two

⁴⁶ Prayer [1a], p.300 above; Leofric, p.228.

⁴⁷ Prayer [5], p.300 above.

quite distinct parts. In the first ⁴⁸ many of the same prayers occur in the same order as in the Gelasian Sacramentary ⁴⁹ but with an important difference: it is indicated that the oblations were made by the couple and their attendants ⁵⁰, but now the offering is also made on behalf of the man and woman - pro famulo et famula ⁵¹ - and no longer for the woman as in earlier ninth-century Masses. Therefore the husband plays an enlarged role. While there is this emphasis on the couple, underlined by the inclusion of Domine... iteratis praecibus te supplices exoramus and rubric indicating that it was a joint blessing ⁵², there are still the prayers for the woman - Deus, qui mundi crescentis and Deus mundi conditor and Domine... qui purum hominem immaculatumque finxisti. ⁵³

The Sacramentary of Fulda is a mix of Roman and Visigothic formulas. ⁵⁴ The rubric and prayers in the second section ⁵⁵ correspond to formulas in the Visigothic Liber Ordinum. ⁵⁶ Deum qui ad multiplicandam humani generis prolem benedictionis suae dona largiri dignatus

⁴⁸ Prayers [1]-[12], pp.300-01 above; Sac. Fuld., 2605-15, pp.323-26.

⁴⁹ Therefore the Sacramentary of Fulda's prayers [1],[2], [3],[5],[7],[8],[10],[11],[12], pp.300-01 above, correspond to the Gelasian Sacramentary's prayers [1],[2],[3],[5],[7],[8],[9],[10], [11], pp.293-94 above.

⁵⁰ Oblationem famulorum famularumque; prayers [3], [5], p.300 above.

⁵¹ Prayers [3],[5], p.300 above.

⁵² Formulas [10],[11], pp.300-01 above.

⁵³ Prayers [7],[8],[9], p.300 above; Sac. Fuld., 2611-13, p.325.

⁵⁴ "un exemple type du phénomène d'hybridisation et d'osmose culturelle"; Vogel, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage", p.441.

⁵⁵ Formulas [13],[14],[15], p.301 above.

⁵⁶ Originating from the monastery of Silos; Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp.257-60.

est originates in the Bobbio Missal. ⁵⁷ The rubric indicates that this section took place after the Mass had ended. ⁵⁸ It is also stated that this is the point at which the girl is veiled with a pallium, with one of two prayers. ⁵⁹ This suggests that, unlike earlier nuptial Masses, Pater/Deus mundi conditor was said in the first section as a benediction over the woman rather than being used as a veiling prayer. Although the Sacramentary of Fulda provides these prayers specifically for the bride, nevertheless, they also read as invocations for both parties:

"Deum... deprecemur, ut hos famulos suos ill., quos ad coniugalem copulam ipse preelegit, ipse custodiat; det eis sensus pacificos, pares animos, mores mutua caritate devinctos" ⁶⁰;

and:

"aspice propitius ab aetheris sedibus et precibus nostris as[s]iste placatus, ut hos famulos tuos ill., quos coniugalii copula benedicendo coniungimus, benignitate propitia benedicas et propitiatione benigna sustollas". ⁶¹

This distinction between prayers for the couple and separate ritual for the bride reaches its most sophisticated manifestation in the PRG. Here there are two rites:

⁵⁷ E.A. Lowe (ed.), The Bobbio Missal. A Gallican Mass Book. MS. Paris Lat. 13246 [Henry Bradshaw Society, 53; 58; 61], (London, 1917-1923), vol.58, 550, pp.167-68. This Benedictio thalami super nubentes was to be said over the marriage-bed. Also see Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp.274-76.

⁵⁸ Formula [13], p.301 above.

⁵⁹ Formulas [13],[14], p.301 above.

⁶⁰ "We beseech God to watch over these his servants whom he has chosen to the conjugal bond; may he give them peaceable understanding, like minds, behaviour firmly bonded with mutual love"; Sac. Fuld., 2616, p.326.

⁶¹ "Look down favourably from the heavenly thrones and, placated, incline to our prayers so that you may bless with favourable generosity and sustain with generous favour, these your servants, whom we, in blessing, join together in the conjugal bond"; Sac. Fuld., 2617, p.326.

PRG Rite 1.Ad sponsas benedicendas

[1] Sponsus vel sponsa cum benedicendi sunt a sacerdote a parentibus suis vel a paranimphis offerantur. Qui cum benedictionem acceperint eadem nocte pro reverentia ipsius benedictionis in virginitate permaneant.

[2] Missa ad sponsas benedicendas

Ant. Domine refugium...

[3] Graduale

Dirigatur oratio...

[4] Offertorium

In te speravi, domine...

[5] Oratio

Exaudi, nos... deus, ut quod nostro ministratur offitio...

[6] Lectio Epistolae

[I Cor.,vi,15-20]

[7] Sequentia sancti evangelii

[Matth.,xix,1-6]

[8] Secreta

Suscipe, domine, quaesumus pro sacra conubii lege...

[9] Prefatio

V.D.: qui foedera nuptiarum blando concordie iugo...

[10] Infra canonem

Hanc igitur oblationem famulorum famularumque tuarum, quam tibi offerunt pro famula... pro qua maiestati tuae supplices fundimus...

[11] Antequam dicat Pax domini, inseratur hec (sic) oratio:

Propitiare domine supplicationibus nostris et institutis tuis...

PRG Rite 2.Item actio nuptialis ad annualem diem nuptiarum

[1]

Quaesumus omnipotens Deus instituta providentiae tuae...

[2] Secreta

Adesto, domine, supplicationibus nostris et hanc oblationem famulorum tuorum tuarum quam tibi offerunt pro famula... quam ad statum maturitatis...

[3] Prefatio

V.D.: qui foedera nuptiarum blando concordiae iugo...

[4] Infra canonem

Hanc igitur oblationem famulorum tuorum ill., quam tibi offerunt ob diem coniunctionis...

[5] Post completum canonem plenarium, dicta oratione dominica eam benedices sed prius hanc orationem:

Deus, qui mundi crescentis...

[6] Incipit benedictio

Pater mundi conditor...

[7] Post haec dicis: Pax domini. Et sic eos comunicas.

[8] Posteaquam (sic) communicaverint, dicis super eos benedictionem his verbis:

Domine... iteratis praecibus te supplices exoramus...

[9] Item ad complendum

Exaudi, nos... deus, ut quod nostro ministratur offitio...

[12] Benedictio
 Deus qui potestate virtutis...
 [and]
 Respice propitius super hanc
 famulam tuam quae maritali
 iungenda consortio...

[13] Pax vobiscum
Ad complendum
 Quaesumus omnipotens deus
 instituta providentiae...

In the first rite the PRG followed that of the Leofric Missal by referring to the benediction rather than the veiling of the sponsa. There is the addition of an antiphon ⁶², a gradual prayer ⁶³, an offertory prayer ⁶⁴, reference to Epistle and Gospel readings ⁶⁵; but these additions pertain to the Mass which otherwise occurs as in the Hadrianum. The oblation prayer ⁶⁶ is made by the couple and their attendants but, unlike the Sacramentary of Fulda, on behalf of the sponsa; this is logical in a Mass focusing on her. The second Mass in the PRG follows the provision in the Sacramentary of Gellone, apart from Adesto domine supplicationibus nostris, et institutis ⁶⁷; and the first oblation ⁶⁸ is made by the couple for the woman.

The Penitential of Theodore which is the first text to indicate that a sacerdotal benediction was a requirement ⁶⁹ refers to two rituals stating:

⁶² Formula [2], p.304 above; PRG II,2,p.415.

⁶³ Formula [3], p.304 above; PRG II,3,p.415.

⁶⁴ Formula [4], p.304 above; PRG II,4,p.415.

⁶⁵ Formulas [6],[7], p.304 above; PRG II,6,7,p.415.

⁶⁶ Formula [10], p.304 above; PRG II,10,p.416.

⁶⁷ Which was already used, in the Hadrianum's version, in the PRG's Ad sponsas rite; [11], p.304 above.

⁶⁸ Formula [2], p.304 above.

⁶⁹ Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.335.

"In a first marriage the priest should perform the Mass and bless both of them, and afterwards they should abstain from coming to church for thirty days, having done this they should do penance for forty days and absent themselves from the prayer, and after this they should take communion with the oblation". ⁷⁰

This instruction is repeated by the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore but with direct reference to the liturgy stating that the benediction of both parties should be performed sicut in Libro sacramentorum continetur. ⁷¹

That there were two Masses is confirmed by the inclusion in the Sacramentary of Gellone of a Gelasian oblation prayer which was to be used in a Mass on either the thirtieth day of marriage or the anniversary day.

"Thus, Lord, this offering of your servants which is offered to you on the thirtieth day of marriage and/or its anniversary....". ⁷²

The Sacramentary of Gellone does not include the Gelasian rubric which accompanies this prayer; but this does occur in the Sacramentary of Autun. ⁷³ This indicated that the prayer could be performed either on the thirtieth day or on the wedding's anni versary. This rubric influenced the title of the PRG's second nuptial rite:

<u>Gelasian</u>	<u>PRG</u>
Infra accionem ad trecesimum vel annualet nuptiarum.	Item actio nuptialis ad annualet diem nuptiarum

The PRG dropped the thirty-day reference from the rubric and from its version of the oblation. ⁷⁴ This indicates that the PRG's second nuptial Mass was an anniversary Mass - performed a full year after the ad sponsas rite.

Italian evidence suggests that brides received a

⁷⁰ Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.XIV,1,p.197. A thirty-day period of abstinence was also referred to by the Council of Orleans (541) [MGH Conc. I,c.24,p.92]; Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp.282-83,note 234.

⁷¹ Wasserschleben, c.II,9,p.577.

⁷² Prayer [5],p.293 above; Sac. Gellon.,2633,p.412.

⁷³ Sac. August.,1649,p.203.

⁷⁴ Prayer [4],p.304 above; PRG II,4,pp.417-18.

blessing. The Council of Pavia (850) condemned the abductors of those women, quae cum sponso pariter benedictione sacerdotali initiate sunt.⁷⁵ The ad sponsas Masses seem to incorporate this stage of the nuptial proceedings - the desponsatio. The rubric in the Sacramentary of Fulda which directly refers to the woman's parentes or propinqui who hand her over to the priest for veiling⁷⁶ is strongly suggestive of the incorporation of the civil desponsatio and dotatio procedure into nuptial Mass. This corresponds to those descriptions of a valid marriage which instructed,

"tunc per consilium et benedictionem sacerdotis et consulta aliorum bonorum hominum eam sponsare et legitime dotare debet".⁷⁷

Thus if the prescriptive statements show Frankish ecclesiastics acknowledging the secular components of marriage, the liturgy mirrors this by beginning to incorporate secular constituents.⁷⁸ An eventual result of this process was the inclusion *in* an eleventh-century Rheims pontifical of an ordo ad bendicendam sponsam where the benediction of the sponsa was preceded by the handing over of the dos.⁷⁹ The dos in secular custom was settled on the woman⁸⁰, and the liturgy provided specific prayers for the woman; thus a merging of the two procedures is not difficult to envisage. The distinct section in the Sacramentary of Fulda where the woman is veiled and her

⁷⁵ MGH Conc. III,c.10,p.224. This council also legislates against the corruption of girls in their fathers' homes since these girls "non possunt tamen cum sponso pariter sollemne benedictionis a sacerdote munus percipere"; MGH, Ibid,c.9,p.224.

⁷⁶ Formula [13],p.301 above.

⁷⁷ See ch.5 above n.114.

⁷⁸ See Ritzer on this feature of post-Hincmar liturgy; Le Mariage, p.332. On the secular constituents of marriage see ch.5 above.

⁷⁹ "Postquam fuerit mulier viro desponsata et legaliter dotata, introeat cum marito ecclesiam et prostratis (eis dicat)"; Ritzer Le Mariage, pp.329,note 399,332-33,347; Vogel, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage", p.433.

⁸⁰ As both bridegift and morgengabe; pp.258-60 above.

parentes/propinqui are involved may represent the beginnings of this process. 81

However, the ad sponsas Mass is not just a betrothal rite: the rubric instructing sexual continence that night clearly indicates that it was a wedding-day ceremony. The Sacramentary of Fulda concludes the section in which the woman is veiled with the instruction:

"Having finished, the priest hands the woman back to her husband admonishing them, that for the sake of [this] holy communion they should abstain that night from pollution". 82

The PRG includes a similar instruction:

"The sponsus and sponsa when they are to be blessed by the priest should be offered by their parentes and attendants. When they have received the blessing, they should, from reverence for that blessing, remain in virginity that night". 83

The source for this last rubric is cited as the Council of Carthage but it is in fact canon 101 of the Statuta ecclesiae antiqua. 84 As we have noted, the first part of this description occurs in several ninth-century episcopal statutes and penitentials. 85

Even without specific rubric, initial sexual continence is a theme in earlier liturgies. The Pater mundi conditor prayer includes the passage:

81 At least in Italy, "on concevait la cérémonie de la velatio, telle que la présentait le rituel romain de la messe de mariage, comme un symbole de la traditio puellae"; Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.261.

82 Formula [15], p.301 above; Sac. Fuld., 2617, p.327.

83 Formula [1], p.304 above; PRG II,1, p.414.

84 See ch.5 above n.25. The importance of this canon is highlighted by Ritzer since it was the only synodal canon (albeit apocryphal) to deal with the liturgy of marriage in the early Gaulish and Merovingian Church; Le Mariage, pp.278-79.

85 Benedictus Levita [ch.5, above, n.23] and statutes based on his canons - Herard of Tours [ch.5, n.13] and Isaac of Langres [ch.5, n.24] include versions of this canon. Regino of Prüm's Ecclesiastical Discipline cites it directly under the rubric, De Benedicenda sponsa [ch.5 n.25] The Quadripartitus includes it under the rubric, De benedicendo sponso et sponsa Bk.4, c.352; Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.336, note 422.

"meminere[t]que domine non tantum ad licentiam coniugalem, sed ad observantiam fidei sanctorum pignorum diligatam".⁸⁶

This call to diligently guard conjugal fidelity, is an allusion to the passage in the apocryphal Book of Tobit where the angel Raphael enjoins Tobit to abstain from his bride Sarah for three nights.⁸⁷

While allusion is made to the Book of Tobit in the Pater mundi conditor prayer the custom is directly referred to in the 866 coronation ordo for Charles the Bald's queen Ermentrude:

"Deus omnipotens, qui benedixit Adam et Evam dicens, Crescite et multiplicamini et patriarcharum benedixit coniugia quique cum Tobia misit Raphael angelum suum, cuius ministerio daemonium effugavit a Sara uxore ipsius, benedicat te et illam futuram uxorem tuam...".⁸⁸

The scriptural reference in this, admittedly special, rite can probably be linked to with the custom of "the nights of Tobit" which is mentioned by Jonas of Orleans.⁸⁹ Jonas wrote as if it were an existing practice:

"Audiant igitur qui uxores ducere cupiunt, qualiter angelus Raphael Tobiam de uxore sibi coniungenda instruxerint".⁹⁰

Canon 101 of the Statuta ecclesiae antiqua only refers to

⁸⁶ Sac. Gellon., 2636, l.16-18, p.413; Sac. Fuld., 2612, p.325.

⁸⁷ Tob., vi, 17-viii, 9. And see Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp.240-41.

⁸⁸ "May Almighty God, who blessed Adam and Eve, saying "Go forth and multiply", and who blessed the marriages of the patriarchs, and who sent with Tobit his angel Raphael by whose ministry, he expelled the demon from his wife Sarah, bless you and this your future wife..."; MGH Capit. II, l.20-24, p.455, citing from Gen., i, 28. As Ermentrude was already married to Charles, the use here of futura uxor implies a derivation from a current but otherwise unattested nuptial benediction.

⁸⁹ Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.282.

⁹⁰ Jonas then quotes Tob., vi, 17-22; De institutione laicali, PL106, Bk.2, col.171B/C. Benedictus Levita also refers to initial conjugal continence: "Et biduo vel triduo orationibus vacent et castitatem custodiant, ut bonae soboles generentur"; PL97, Bk.III, c.463, col.859D. This is repeated by Herard of Tours; PL121, c.89, col.770.

one night of continence but clearly knowledge of the "nights of Tobit" ⁹¹ influenced the inclusion of rubric instructing initial conjugal continence in the Sacramentary of Fulda ⁹² and the ad sponsas Mass in the PRG.

The fact that the ad sponsas Mass in the PRG and Leofric Missal include the Hadrianum's distinct version of the Pater mundi conditor prayer which does not allude to the Book of Tobit may indicate that these Masses were associated with betrothal rather marriage. The ad sponsas Mass may have taken place at the time of the desponsatio and the Mass for the couple, as in the Leofric Missal, on the wedding day itself. ⁹³

Only a proportion of marriage candidates could aspire to a sacerdotal benediction; it was a privilege reserved for chaste parties in a first marriage. The concept of the parties needing to be incorrupti was not new to the ninth century; the principle had been expounded by Caesarius of Arles. ⁹⁴ In the ninth century Jonas of Orleans stated this requirement ⁹⁵; Benedictus Levita also instructed

⁹¹ The Vita Caesarii referred to a benediction performed three days before the coniunctio: "Statuit etiam regulariter, ut nubentes ob reverentiam benedictionis ante triduum coniunctionis eorum eis benedictio in basilica daretur"; MGH SRM, 3, c.59, l.15-16, p.481. And see Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp.227, 241, 276, 280-82, 338-39.

⁹² This rubric instructs that there should be continence prior to communion (formula [15], p.301 above) and this may have entailed three nights: many of the penitentials instruct a three day period of continence prior to communion; see below pp.319-20.

⁹³ Possibly over the conjugal bed; Vogel, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage", p.440.

⁹⁴ Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.276-77; Vogel, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage", pp.434-35.

⁹⁵ "nec non et benedictione, qua Deus copulae primorum hominum benedixit, et ea quae nunc in Ecclesia per sacerdotum ministeria secundum canonicam auctoritatem et sanctae Romanae Ecclesiae morem nupturis exhibetur, se privant. Unde etenim damnanda consuetudo inolevit, ut perraro sponsus et sponsa in missarum celebratione, secundum praemisum ordinem benedicantur"; De institutione

that men who wished to take wives with a sacerdotal blessing should be casti and incorrupti.⁹⁶ This practice⁹⁷ contrasts with provision in the Bobbio Missal, which alone of the Gallican liturgies provides nuptial benedictions: Oratio super eos qui secundo nubunt.⁹⁸ In the ninth century the Franks looked to Roman liturgical practices; Pope Nicolas I stated that in the case of second marriages the woman could not be veiled.⁹⁹ Further, the fact that Jonas was addressing a noble audience when he set out the procedure for a blessing, indicates that few of lower ranks sought benedictions.

II. Women and the Sacrament of Marriage.

Toubert was right to voice caution concerning the general application of nuptial benedictions.¹⁰⁰ However, the evolution in specula coniugatorum, which Toubert traced, of a theology which regarded marriage as constituting a sacramentum is closely modelled on attitudes expressed in the liturgy. The ideas expressed in the specula concerning marriage as a sacramentum for the purpose of generating fides and proles were not new to the ninth century; they drew heavily on patristic theories, particularly

laicali; PL106, Bk.2, c.2, col.170-71. See Vogel, "Les rites de la célébration du mariage", pp.428,434. The reference to the Mass highlights the nature of nuptial liturgical provision.

⁹⁶ "Sciendum est ab omnibus et firmiter tenendum, quod hi, qui uxores ducere voluerint, sicut eas castas et incorruptas cupiunt invenire, sic ad eas casti et incorrupti debent accedere easque cum benedictione sacerdotis, sicut in sacramentario continentur, accipere"; PL97, BK.III, c.389, col.847A.

⁹⁷ As is also stated by the Penitential of Theodore; n.70 above.

⁹⁸ Deus qui multimoda subsidorum remedia; Lowe, Bobbio Missal, vol.58, 552, p.168. Ritzer, Le Mariage, p.275 and notes 201 and 202.

⁹⁹ "Verum tamen velamen illud non suscipit qui ad secundas nuptias migrat"; MGH Epp. Karol., 6, no.99, l.13, p.572.

¹⁰⁰ "La théorie du mariage", pp.272-75.

Augustinian thought. 101

Within marriage the woman was regarded as the inferior, passive partner. Jonas of Orleans quoted Paul: wives should submit to their husbands ¹⁰²; since, recalling the apostle Peter, and the biblical models used in the liturgy: Sarah called Abraham dominus. ¹⁰³ The liturgy parallels these attitudes: Pater mundi conditor refers to the bride as the weaker sex who is joined to the stronger. ¹⁰⁴

However, importantly, this same prayer, expresses the idea that men and women were incomplete without each other: et unum efficiaris ex duobus. ¹⁰⁵ This completeness is expressed in the terms societas ¹⁰⁶ and consortio.¹⁰⁷ The first of these terms implied more than a legal union; it was used to indicate the harmonious fellowship that

¹⁰¹ Noonan provides a concise summary of Augustine's definition, in De bono coniugali, of the institution of marriage and the correct exercise of conjugal relations within it in order to provide sacramentum, fides and proles; Contraception, pp.107-39. Other important patristic influences on ninth-century thought were St. Jerome and Fulgentius of Ruspe; also in the early Gaulish Church Caesarius of Arles expressed views on the purpose of sex for procreation and periods of sexual abstinence; P.J. Payer, "Early medieval regulations concerning marital sexual relations", J.Med.Hist, 6, (1980), pp.353-376, at pp.353-55,363. See also Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, pp.23-25, notes 26,28,30. On Caesarius' views and their influence on ninth-century thought, although often wrongly attributed to Augustine, see also, A. Demyttenaere, "The Cleric, Women and the Stain" in Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, pp.141-65, at pp.154,161,note 96.

¹⁰² PL106,Bk.2,c.5,col.178A; citing Coloss., iii,18.

¹⁰³ PL106,Bk.2,c.5,col.178A; citing I Peter,iii,6.

¹⁰⁴ See n.27 above.

¹⁰⁵ See n.27 above.

¹⁰⁶ See n.18 above.

¹⁰⁷ See n.34 above. Both these terms occur in Gelasian prayers which also occurs in the Sacramentaries of Gellone, Autun, Fulda, and the PRG.

husbands and wives were supposed to cultivate.¹⁰⁸ Consortio also implies mutuality in its sense of partnership. This aspect of fides is expressed in the Sacramentary of Fulda which refers to the husband and wife having "peacable understanding, like minds and mutual love".¹⁰⁹

Thus although women were not regarded in the same way as men, neither were they to be dismissed either metaphorically or literally. Jonas uses the example of the marriage of Abraham and Sarah saying,

"Foris maritus invitat, intus Sara adornat convivium; nec solum ipse festinat Abraham, sed etiam festinandum dicit uxori, sociam devotionis ostendens, nec fide disparem".¹¹⁰

Describing the wife as socia echoes the liturgy's use of societas. As a full partner in the marriage, a wife was to be respected; it was therefore the theory that she could not be treated unfairly. Hincmar drew on the story of Vashti, the wife of Xerxes, who was repudiated for disobedience. Vashti was tried in a public court which, Hincmar stated, showed that even the pagans used natural law and that arbitrary actions were wrong.¹¹¹ Hincmar's allusion signifies that women were regarded as full consortes.¹¹²

Elsewhere, Hincmar stated that Ingeltrude could not separate from Boso because she was "the inferior part of

¹⁰⁸ Hence it was used to describe sound monastic communities; see p.123 above.

¹⁰⁹ See n.60 above.

¹¹⁰ "Outside the husband does the inviting, inside Sarah prepares the feast; nor does Abraham hasten alone, but he tells his wife to hasten also, showing that she is the female-partner of his devotion, and not unequal in her faith"; PL106, Bk.2, c.5, col.178D.

¹¹¹ De coercendo raptu; PL125, col.1024C. The Book of Esther, from where this story comes, provides two models - the truculent wife (Vashti) and the good wife (Esther) who uses her influence on her husband wisely; and see n.118 and 120 below.

¹¹² Toubert, "La théorie du mariage", pp.257-58.

the body of this man". 113 However, while Ingeltrude was the guilty party in this case, and Hincmar clearly regarded women as subject to men; nevertheless, he went on to make the point that, (under permitted circumstances), men and women had equal obligations to secure each other's consent to separation for:

"Mulier enim non habet potestatem corporis sui, sed vir; et vir non habet potestatem corporis sui, sed mulier". 114

However, whatever the polemic, the practice may have been rather different.

This theory of mutuality, (to call it equality would be to misconstrue the intended meanings), did not just concern divorce, it encompassed the expected reciprocal obligations of husbands and wives. While it was assumed that husbands were the head of their wives, this in fact was perceived to entail certain responsibilities. Jonas of Orleans stated that "husbands must love their wives in chastity and show them honour as to the weaker vessel". 115 Herard of Tours stated that a husband should care for his wife and make sure that she had protection and all things necessary. 116 It is, however, significant, that it is these types of sources which refer to husband's responsibilities. While the liturgy refers to the reciprocal, loving nature of the marriage bond, it outlines the expected duties only of one partner - the wife.

As we have noted, in Pater mundi conditor, the woman was enjoined to model herself on several biblical models.

"Faithful and chaste may she marry in Christ, and remain a female imitator of holy women: may she be

113 "Quomodo poteris inferiorem partem corporis hominis illius qui sub alterius providentia degit, separare"; MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no. 135, l. 33-36, p. 82.

114 MGH, Ibid. Hincmar repeated this theory of mutuality elsewhere; MGH Epp. Karol., no. 136, l. 32-34, p. 94.

115 PL106, Bk. 2, c. 5, cols. 177-79.

116 "Quod debeant viri uxores suas diligere, eisque ut vasi inferiori custodiam et omnia necessaria providere"; PL121, c. 67, col. 769.

loving as Rachel was to her husband, wise like Rebecca, long-lived and loyal like Sarah". ¹¹⁷
 A similar expectation was included in the Judith ordo:

"I betrothe you chaste and modest virgin, a future wife, to one man, as these holy women were to their husbands Sarah, Rebecca, Rachel, Hester, Judith, Anna, Naomi, by the blessing of that divine author and sanctifier of nuptials, our Lord Jesus Christ". ¹¹⁸

Judith and Hester were appropriate models for a queen ¹¹⁹; hence they were alluded to in greater detail in the PRG's Benedictio for a queen. ¹²⁰ However, the royal subject of this benediction is also enjoined to be,

"una cum Sara atque Rebecca, Lia et Rachel, beatis reverendisq[ue] feminis, fructu uteri sui fecundari seu gratulari mereatur". ¹²¹

Queens, like other women, were expected to behave like these biblical models. In Pater mundi conditor, wifely attributes were underlined:

"Sit verecundia gravis, pudore venerabilis, doctrinis caelestibus erudita; sit faecunda in subole, sit probata et innocens; et ad beatorum requiem atque ad caelestia regna perveniat". ¹²²

These sentiments were echoed by Jonas who stated that husbands should not seek wealth or beauty in their wives

¹¹⁷ See n.22 and p.295 above. A similar invocation was expressed in the Bobbio Missal's nuptial benediction: "consorcio caritatis induant caritatem Sarre, penitenciam Rebecce, amorem Racel et caritatem Susanne discendat super hos famulos"; Lowe, The Bobbio Missal, vol.58,551,p.168.

¹¹⁸ MGH Capit. II,1.11-13,p.426.

¹¹⁹ As was Naomi, who, like the Carolingian Judith, left her country to marry.

¹²⁰ Deus qui solus habes immortalitatem [PRG I,2, 1.12-14, p.268] and Deus, fons et origo totius bonitatis [PRG I,1,1.14-15,p.267] are expansions of references to Judith and Esther in the Judith ordo; MGH Capit. II,1.37-41,p.426.

¹²¹ "together with Sarah, and Rebecca, Leah and Rachel, venerable and holy women, she should be worthy to be fertile and joyful in the fruit of her womb"; PRG I,1.20-22,p.267.

¹²² "May she be serious in chastity, respectable in modesty, knowledgable in heavenly doctrines: may she be fertile in progeny, may she be approved honest and innocent; and she arrives at the resting place of the saints and the celestial kingdoms"; Sac. Gellon.,2636, 1.25-28,p.413.

so much as modesty and virtue. ¹²³ But there is no parallel provision for husbands' behaviour.

While such attributes are praised, clearly fertility is a principal concern in nuptial prayers, as it is in the PRG's Benedictio for a queen. ¹²⁴ It is significant that the biblical models in these prayers were women who were barren for a long time. Sarah and Rachel, the wives of Abraham and Jacob respectively, are mentioned in Pater mundi conditor and also in the Judith ordo. Here Anna, the mother of Samuel, is included. ¹²⁵ Sarah is again mentioned in the PRG's Benedictio for a queen alongside Rachel who is paired with her sister Leah. ¹²⁶ She is also a suitable model - her fertility contrasts with Rachel's initial sterility. ¹²⁷

There are many invocations to God as the creator of

¹²³ "Non sunt igitur in uxoribus divitiae tantum et pulchritudo, sed potius pudicitiae, et morum probitas quaerenda"; PL106, Bk.2, c.5, col.179.

¹²⁴ See n.121. Hence also, the Hadrianum's version of Respice propitius super hanc famulam, (see p.295 above), is included in the Ermentrude coronation ordo; MGH Capit., II, 1.43-5, pp.454-55. Alongside the comparison of Ermentrude to Sarah giving birth to Isaac when she was ninety [MGH Capit. II, 1.7-21, p.454] this indicates that this was as much a fertility as a coronation rite; further, "the emphasis on offspring may also be an emphasis on their throne-worthiness": P. Stafford, "Charles the Bald, Judith and England", in Nelson and Gibson (eds.), Charles the Bald. Court and Kingdom, pp.137-51 at pp.141-42. See also Hyam, "Ermentrude and Richildis", p.156. Anointing and the invocations to fertility in the Judith ordo were for similar reasons; as Stafford comments "the age gap between a girl of 12 and a husband of 50 made fertility a real issue"; Ibid.

¹²⁵ MGH Capit. II, 1.10, p.426.

¹²⁶ PRG, I, 1, 1.20-21, p.267.

¹²⁷ The pairing of Rachel and Leah occurs in the Bobbio Missal's benediction for a second marriage: "ut faciat dominus hanc mulierem ill. que ingreditur in domum tuam sicut Rachel et Lia"; Lowe, The Bobbio Missal, vol.58, 552, p.168.

progeny ¹²⁸ and requests that the couple will be blessed by children. ¹²⁹ In this last category, Domine... iteratis praecibus te supplices exoramus which is addressed to the couple includes the following invocation:

"coniunctiones famulorum tuorum fovere digneris, benedictiones tuas excipere mereantur ut filiorum sucessibus fecundentur". ¹³⁰

But clearly the issue of fertility was principally directed at the woman. ¹³¹

The two functions of a societas to produce children and as the fellowship of the marital relationship were closely linked. For Jonas of Orleans, marriage brought about amicitia: marriage was a good thing propter ipsam etiam naturalem in diverso sexu societatem. ¹³² But Jonas also quoted Augustine:

"Bonum ergo, inquit, sunt nuptiae, in quibus tanto meliores sunt coniugati, quanto castiores ac fideiiores, si Deum timent, maxime si filios, quos carnaliter desiderant, etiam spiritualiter nutriant". ¹³³

¹²⁸ This is in Pater mundi conditor but is particularly prominent in the Sacramentary of Fulda's Visigothic formulas; Sac. Fuld., 2610 ["ut habeant te propitio faecunditatem prolis"; 2613 ["ut a domino nubendi gratiam subeuntes sic congregatione carnali fructicent ut deo vacent"]; 2616 ["habeant quoque optatas eius munere suboles"; and 2617, pp. 324-27.

¹²⁹ For example, "ut adoptionem filiorum, sanctorum coniubiorum faecunditas pudica servaretur" in the Hadrianum [Deshusses, I, 835, p. 309]; the Sacramentary of Gellone [Sac. Gellon., 2632, p. 412]; the Leofric Missal [Leofric, p. 228]; the PRG [PRG II, 9, p. 416 and 3, p. 417]. In the Sacramentary of Fulda, "ut... foedus coniugale non violent, fructificent caritate, sicque eos in tuo timore conserves, ut nos quoque in tua dilectione multiplices"; Sac. Fuld., 2608, p. 324.

¹³⁰ Sac. Gellon., 2638, l. 3-5, p. 413.

¹³¹ Underlined by liturgical provision for sterile women; see pp. 332-41 below.

¹³² "On account of the natural sociability between members of the opposite sex"; PL106, Bk. 2, c. 1, col. 168B.

¹³³ "Marriage is a good thing. And married persons are the better, the more chaste and faithful they are, and if they fear God, and especially if they spiritually nourish the children they desire carnally"; PL106, Bk. 2, c. 1, col. 167C.

The connection between the two facets of marriage is clarified by Hucbald of St. Amand. In the Vita Rictrudis, Adalbald married Rictrude, not out of lust, but for children.¹³⁴ The reciprocal nature of their marriage is described in which with one voice and working in concord they served God¹³⁵; because of this model marriage, the couple were rewarded with children.¹³⁶

Marriage was therefore a remedium luxuria¹³⁷ in which there should be ardor castitatis.¹³⁸ This could be achieved in two main ways. First through continence¹³⁹; and secondly, having sex only for children¹⁴⁰ and not to satisfy sexual urges/practices.¹⁴¹ This dual approach is paralleled in the prescriptive material in which Payer recognised that a fundamental distinction was drawn between the frequency and the form of the behaviour.¹⁴² While this ardor castitatis was described as inter masculum et feminam¹⁴³ the exercise of the conjugal relationship is treated in a gender-specific manner. As far as the frequency of sex was concerned, abstinence was

¹³⁴ "Causa vero uxoris ducendae non fuit incontinentiae, sed carae sobolis habendae"; PL132, c.5, col.834A.

¹³⁵ "unanimes uno ore et concordi operatione honorificabant Deum"; PL132, c.5, col.834C. On the inclusion of this text amongst specula coniugatorum see Toubert, "La théorie du mariage", p.263-64, note 86.

¹³⁶ PL132, c.6, cols.834-35.

¹³⁷ Halitgar of Cambrai's penitential expounded on this principle, that marriage was not an excuse to indulge carnal desire; PL105, Bk.1, cols.669-70.

¹³⁸ PL105, Ibid. The importance of this form of castitas was also stressed by Hincmar; De cavendis vitiis, PL125, c.7, cols.908-12.

¹³⁹ "Sunt plerique coniugalem ducentes vitam, qui tempora coeundi et non coeundi cum uxoribus pudicissime discernere student"; De institutione laicali, PL106, Bk.2, c.3, cols.172-74.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid, PL106, Bk.2, c.6, cols.179-82.

¹⁴¹ Ibid, PL106, Bk.2, c.9, cols.184-85.

¹⁴² "Early medieval regulations", p.355.

¹⁴³ As in n.137 and 138.

nearly always described from the male perspective. Further, it is possible to differentiate between those periods of abstinence connected with the liturgical calendar and those specifically to do with women.¹⁴⁴ Similarly, sexual practices are always described from the male perspective.

The Penitential of Vinnian had provided a short treatise on the value of continence for the married since those who practised it would get their thirty-fold heavenly reward; the principle times of abstinence were three periods of forty days, before and on the Sabbath.¹⁴⁵ These principles were repeated in their basic form¹⁴⁶ and with certain additions. The Penitential of Bede clarified the three forty-day periods for an uxoratus as those prior to Christmas and Easter; Wednesdays and Fridays were also added as days on which to practise continence.¹⁴⁷ This was repeated in the Penitential of Egbert which extended the period of abstinence prior to communion to three days.¹⁴⁸

¹⁴⁴ The former had precedent in the Old and New Testaments where Moses exhorted sexual continence before the revelation of God [Exodus, xix,15] and Paul advised abstinence to make time for prayer [I Corinth.,vii,5]; the latter has its roots in Leviticus xii,xv,xviii, which prohibits sex during the menstrual period and after childbirth. See also Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, pp.23-24.

¹⁴⁵ Wasserschleben, c.46,p.118.

¹⁴⁶ St. Hubert Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.49,p.384.

¹⁴⁷ Wasserschleben, c.III,37,p.224. A number of Frankish penitentials included the Wednesdays and Fridays rule - the Excarpus Cummeani [Wasserschleben, c.III,19, 20,pp.473]; the Fleury Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.49,p.425]; the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede [Wasserschleben, c.V,1,pp.261-62]; the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore [Wasserschleben, c.II,1,7,p.577].

¹⁴⁸ Wasserschleben, c.VII,3,p.238. Again this was repeated in Frankish handbooks. The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede added Pentecost as one of the forty-day periods; Wasserschleben, c.V,1 pp.261-2. Similar prohibitions occur in the Fleury Penitential [Wasserschleben,c.49,p.425], the Bigotian Penitential [Wasserschleben,c.IX,1,2,p.451], the Excarpus Cummeani [Wasserschleben,c.III,17,18,p.427], the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore [Wasserschleben, c.I,1,3,4,6, pp.577-78], and the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.1,c.339, pp.159-60.

The Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore was unusual in prescribing abstinence after communion. ¹⁴⁹ Halitgar of Cambrai also stipulated a three-day abstinence period before communion and stated that the forty days prior to Easter should last up to the eighth day after Easter Sunday. ¹⁵⁰

The episcopal statutes make similar prescriptions. While the Admonitio Synodalis only gave a general instruction that men should abstain from their wives at certain times ¹⁵¹, Theodulf of Orleans recommended abstinence on holy days, before Easter, and before communion. ¹⁵² Rodulf of Bourges recommended abstinence before communion, on holy days, and during Lent. ¹⁵³ Herard of Tours prescribed against marital sex prior to communion and on feast days "because a man did not take a wife for lust but to have children". ¹⁵⁴

The injunctions to abstain from sex at these times were intended to include women but it is always uxoratus or guis who is described as abstaining. Further, where these periods of abstinence were not observed, penance was meted out to this guis. ¹⁵⁵ In the liturgy by contrast, rubric,

¹⁴⁹ Wasserschleben, c.II,1,p.577. "This regulation does not seem to have been widespread"; Payer "Early medieval regulations", p.367.

¹⁵⁰ PL105,Bk.4,c.24,col.685. Abstinence up to the eighth day was also included by the Bigotian Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.IX,2,p.451] and the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore [Wasserschleben, c.II,1,p.577].

¹⁵¹ Admonitio Synodalis, c.65,p.59.

¹⁵² MGH Capit. Episc.,I,c.43,44,pp.139-40.

¹⁵³ MGH, Ibid, c.28,29,pp.255-57.

¹⁵⁴ PL121, c.53,62,col.768.

¹⁵⁵ For sex during Lent, the Penitential of Egbert gave forty days penance [Wasserschleben, c.VII,4,pp.238-39]; the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede gave one year [Wasserschleben, c.V,2, p.262]. The Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore distinguished between sex during Lent which is given one year's penance and such intercourse occurring

instructing initial conjugal continence was addressed to the couple. 156

The one exception to the prescriptions' general rule was when women were pregnant - in some texts, at least. Insular penitentials such as the Penitential of Vinnian 157 and the Penitential of Bede 158 had stated that a man should refrain from having intercourse with his wife when she was pregnant. Frankish penitentials like the Excarpsus Cummeani 159 and the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede 160 referred to husbands abstaining from their pregnant wives for three months. 161 Jonas of Orleans also regarded it as the men's responsibility to abstain from their pregnant wives. 162 Jonas stated that if a man has sex with his pregnant wife this is because he is sleeping with her out of lust rather than to procreate children. 163 Jonas' prohibition of men's not sleeping with their pregnant wives probably accounts for the inclusion of the matter in the Council of Paris (829) 164; this was incorporated by Benedictus Levita 165 and the statutes of Herard of Tours. 166 However, a large proportion of penitentials including that

through drunkenness is given forty days; the same penance of forty days is given for sex during the forty days before Christmas and Pentecost; *Wasserschleben*, c.II,3,4,p.577.

156 As in the PRG ([1] p.304 above) and the *Sacramentary of Fulda* ([15], p.301 above).

157 *Wasserschleben*, c.46,p.118.

158 *Wasserschleben*, c.III,37,p.224.

159 *Wasserschleben*, c.III,18,p.472.

160 *Wasserschleben*, c.V,1,p.261.

161 *Wasserschleben*, c.37, p.224.

162 PL106,Bk.2,c.7,cols.182-83.

163 PL106,Bk.2,c.7,col.182C.

164 MGH Conc. II ii,c.69,p.671.

165 PL97,Bk.II,c.235,col.775C.

166 PL121,c.124,col.773B. See Payer, "Early medieval regulations", p.369.

of Halitgar of Cambrai ¹⁶⁷ evidence that some ecclesiastics regarded women as having some responsibility in this situation since they prescribe that the wife should abstain from her husband, usually for three months during pregnancy. ¹⁶⁸

The other forbidden times of intercourse relating to women's biology - the menstrual period and the period after pregnancy - were dealt with from the male perspective. Herard of Tours referred in the same breath to men abstaining from pregnant and menstruating wives. ¹⁶⁹ Jonas of Orleans devoted a separate chapter to each issue; but he expressed the same attitude towards menstruating as to pregnant wives although for a different reason: men should abstain from their wives since children thus conceived were tainted, born as lepers or monsters, either horribly small or large. ¹⁷⁰ Benedictus Levita warned of similar consequences in the case of consanguinous marriages. ¹⁷¹ This demonstrates a perceived danger in mixing pure and impure things - the sacrament of marriage with impure substances and impure relationships. ¹⁷² Such beliefs may also have been propagated as a deterrent; and the penitentials usually

¹⁶⁷ PL105, Bk. 4, c. 24, col. 685.

¹⁶⁸ As in the Penitential of Egbert; *Wasserschleben*, c. VII, 1, p. 238. Frankish penitentials which follow this line are the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede [*Wasserschleben*, c. V, 2, p. 262]; the Fleury Penitential [*Wasserschleben*, c. 49, p. 425]; the Bigotian Penitential [*Wasserschleben*, c. IX, 3, p. 451] and the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore [*Wasserschleben*, c. II, 2, p. 577]. The insular Confessional of Egbert is unusually severe, prescribing seven months abstinence for pregnant wives; *Wasserschleben*, c. XVI, 28, p. 312.

¹⁶⁹ PL121, c. 124, col. 773.

¹⁷⁰ PL106, Bk. 2, c. 10, col. 186B/C. In the same vein Jonas prescribed against sex during feastdays and on Sundays since such babies were born with demons, as hunchbacks or epileptic; *Ibid*, col. 186D. These beliefs were first expressed by Caesarius of Arles; Demyttenaere, "The Cleric, Women and the Stain", p. 154.

¹⁷¹ PL97, Bk. III, c. 179, col. 820A.

¹⁷² Demyttenaere, "The Cleric, Women and the Stain", p. 151.

gave out a forty-day penance to a man who had sex with his menstruating wife. ¹⁷³ The link between progeny and continence was made by Benedictus Levita: initial marital continence was good ut bonae soboles generentur. ¹⁷⁴ Bonae could mean blessed as well as healthy. Sex at the right time produced better progeny.

Hence the penitentials also stated that men should abstain from their wives during the post partum period. ¹⁷⁵ The penitentials which gave penance to the woman in this situation were the same as those which prescribed that pregnant women should abstain from their husbands. ¹⁷⁶ Jonas seldom writes other than from the male perspective, but he did refer to women abstaining from their husbands in the post partum period. ¹⁷⁷ In some texts the misogyny concerning the post partum period is compounded by the inclusion of the injunction based on Leviticus for a longer abstention period after the birth of a girl. ¹⁷⁸ The penitentials which accorded

¹⁷³ The Penitential of Bede [Wasserschleben, c.37,p.224] is followed by the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede, [Wasserschleben, c.VI,p.262]; the Excarpsus Cummeani, [Wasserschleben, c.III,13, p.472]; and the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.250,p.312. The Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore gives a thirty-day penance; Wasserschleben, c.II,5,p.577.

¹⁷⁴ See n.90 above.

¹⁷⁵ The Penitential of Bede [Wasserschleben, c.37,p.224] was followed by the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede [Wasserschleben, c.V, pp.261-62], and the Merseburg Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.134, p.404] giving twenty-days penance to quis who has sex with his wife in this period. The Excarpsus Cummeani gives forty days, as it did for sex with a menstruating wife; Wasserschleben, c.III,15,p.472. The Martinian Penitential includes a general direction that men should abstain from their wives during this period; Wasserschleben, c.68,p.298.

¹⁷⁶ See n.167,168 above.

¹⁷⁷ PL106,Bk.2,c.11,col.187C/D.

¹⁷⁸ Jonas recommended 33 days for a boy and 66 for a girl; PL106,Bk.2,c.11,col.188A. The same periods were recommended by the Martinian Penitential; Wasserschleben, c.66.3,pp.297-98. The Penitential of Bede had given a 30 day period after the birth of a boy and 40 for a girl; Wasserschleben, c.37, p.224. Regino of Prüm provided two options - either 33 and 56 day periods or 30 and 40

responsibility for sex to pregnant woman are again those which, like Halitgar of Cambrai, stated that the period of post partum abstinence was forty days for both a boy or girl-child. 179

Payer includes sex during menstruation, during pregnancy and during the period after pregnancy, within the category of the "frequency of sex". 180 Yet these are different from the other periods of prescribed abstinence, which while affecting men also affected women, and concerned ecclesiastics because of their "fundamental ability to reconcile sex and the sacred". 181 However, the other instances pertain to the perceived physical nature of women in addition to a distaste concerning the act of sex as unholy and unclean.

Nevertheless, while carefully differentiating between these two categories, the threat to the sacred from sex was expressed as a distaste by male clerics in the sense that laymen had slept with their wives. Men were enjoined to wash if they had slept with their wives before going to church by both insular 182, and Frankish penitentials. 183 This desire for men's purification before the spiritual was taken to new lengths in the early tenth century by Ruotger of Trier who stipulated that those who brought children to confirmation should purify themselves if they

days, although in each case the longer period was for a girl-child; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.1,c.338,339, pp.159-60. In the first of these canons Regino referred to quis refraining from his uxor; in the second an uxoratus is instructed to refrain but Regino also stated that a mulier should refrain from her husband for three months prior to the birth and for forty days afterwards.

179 PL105, Bk.4,c.24, cl.685; and n.168 above.

180 "Early medieval regulations", pp.368-69.

181 Payer, Ibid, p.370.

182 Penitential of Theodore, Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.XII,29,p.216; the Confessional of Egbert, Wasserschleben, c.26,p.311.

183 The Martinian Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.66.2, pp.296-97; the St. Hubert Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.57,p.385.

previously had slept with their wives. ¹⁸⁴

Sexual practices are also discussed from the male perspective. This aspect of sex is not dealt with in the penitentials in as great detail as the frequency of sexual behaviour, and it is not discussed in the earliest, Irish Penitential of Vinnian. The ninth-century episcopal statutes also do not deal with the subject, which indicates that these texts were used conjointly with the penitentials. The two forms of marital sex uniformly condemned are in retro and in tergo sex. These two practices are first condemned in the Penitential of Theodore ¹⁸⁵; and these canons are repeated in several later penitentials. ¹⁸⁶ In tergo can be identified as anal sex since the phrase is used in reference to male homosexual sex. ¹⁸⁷ In retro is more difficult to identify. Noonan regarded this practice as the woman being on top of the man. ¹⁸⁸ Payer, however, regarded this as dorsal sex, with the man behind. ¹⁸⁹ Payer's view is preferable as the insular Penitential of Egbert ¹⁹⁰ and

¹⁸⁴ "Monemus etiam atque hortamur, ut hi, qui ad confirmandum coram episcopo infantes tenere debent, mundos se et purificatos exhibeant. Si propriis uxoribus in proximis mixti sunt, lavent corpus suum et vestimentum aqua et sic ad tenendum accedant"; MGH Capit. Episc., c.24,p.69. Brommer comments that this canon is without parallel; MGH, Ibid, note 44,p.69.

¹⁸⁵ Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.XIV,21,22,p.199.

¹⁸⁶ The insular Penitentials of Bede [Wasserschleben, c.III,38,39,p.224] and Egbert [Wasserschleben, c.VII,10, p.239]. Frankish penitentials which condemn these practices were the Excarpsus Cummeani [Wasserschleben, c.III,11,12,p.472]; the Merseburg Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.156,p.406]; the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore, [Wasserschleben, c.I,16.19, p.575] and the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.250,p.312.

¹⁸⁷ For example, the Penitential of Egbert [Wasserschleben, c.V,19,p.237] and the Paris Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.58, p.417].

¹⁸⁸ Contraception, pp.162-63.

¹⁸⁹ "Early medieval regulations"; pp.357-58.

¹⁹⁰ Wasserschleben, c.VII,10,p.239.

the Frankish Penitential of Pseudo-Bede ¹⁹¹ refer to the practice as "animal-like". Interestingly, the first of these penitentials includes this prescription under the heading De machina mulierum ¹⁹²; why is unclear as the practice is still discussed from the male perspective with a longer penance given where the practice is a habit. Whatever its form, clearly in retro sex could not have been condemned for being non-procreative; rather it did not constitute honesta coniugalis copulatio. ¹⁹³

Non-procreative sex was condemned. Theodulf of Orleans condemned coitus interruptus ¹⁹⁴ as did the Merseburg [B] ¹⁹⁵ and St. Hubert Penitentials. ¹⁹⁶ The references to oral sex are ambiguous. ¹⁹⁷ Noonan interpreted them as heterosexual practices ¹⁹⁸; but Payer argued that they probably referred to homosexuality because of the context of the chapters amongst others dealing with homosexuality, bestiality, masturbation and incest rather than in a section dealing with marital sex. Hence he concluded "the infrequency of explicit mention suggests that oral heterosexual practices were not current in this period". ¹⁹⁹ This may be correct ²⁰⁰; but the penitentials

¹⁹¹ Wasserschleben, c.VIII,3,p.262.

¹⁹² Wasserschleben, p.238.

¹⁹³ De institutione laicali; PL106,Bk.2,c.6, col.182A.

¹⁹⁴ MGH Capit. Episc., II,c.VII,11,p.168.

¹⁹⁵ Wasserschleben, c.13,p.430.

¹⁹⁶ Wasserschleben, c.56,p.385.

¹⁹⁷ "Qui semen in os miserit" does not clarify the sex of the other participant; Penitential of Theodore, Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.II,15,p.186; Merseburg Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.153, p.406.

¹⁹⁸ Noonan, Contraception, p.164.

¹⁹⁹ Payer, "Early medieval regulations", p.358.

may reflect the context of their male monastic authors whose knowledge of homosexual practices would primarily have come from the male environment of the monastery.²⁰¹ Further, oral sex, in the same way as sex with the woman on top, presupposed a perception of women as initiators or at least equal participants in the sexual act unfamiliar to the majority of the writers of these texts.

The sexual aspect of the conjugal relationship was not just perceived in terms of correct forms of intercourse, but also in terms of the relationship between man and wife. The specula referred to men treating their wives chastely; but insular penitentials such as the Penitential of Theodore ²⁰² and the Confessional of Egbert²⁰³ condemned a man for seeing his wife naked. Frankish texts such as the St. Hubert Penitential ²⁰⁴ and Laon MS 201²⁰⁵ both prescribed against men bathing with women.

In one area women were perceived to take the initiative in sexual matters - the procurement of aphrodisiacs. The Confessional of Egbert ²⁰⁶ follows the Penitential of Theodore ²⁰⁷ in condemning a woman who mixed semen in her husband's food as an aphrodisiac. A similar penance of three years for the same practice occurs in the Merseburg

²⁰⁰ The references to women drinking the blood or semen of a man is probably in the context of a remedy as these references occur alongside penances for such "remedies": the Confessional of Egbert; Wasserschleben, c.XVI, p.307; the Excarpusus Cummeani; Wasserschleben, I, 16, p.466.

²⁰¹ Concerning penances for fornication amongst the unmarried, Payer comments on the preoccupation of penitential writers with the clerical and monastic classes; Sex and the Penitentials, p.36.

²⁰² Wasserschleben, Bk.2, c.XII, 29, p.216.

²⁰³ Wasserschleben, c.XX, p.309.

²⁰⁴ Wasserschleben, c.47, p.383.

²⁰⁵ Laon MS 201, PL89, c.22, col.822.

²⁰⁶ Wasserschleben, c.29, p.312.

²⁰⁷ Wasserschleben, Bk.1, c.XIV, 15, p.199.

Penitential ²⁰⁸ and the Excarpsus Cummeani ²⁰⁹; the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore gives a seven year penance.²¹⁰ Hrabanus Maurus condemned women who mixed either menstrual blood or semen in their husband's food and drink as an aphrodisiac ²¹¹; Regino of Prüm repeated this canon.²¹² The concern over aphrodisiacs had less to do with the regulation of sexual matters than with their connection with magic and folk-superstition and women's involvement in such practices ²¹³; a connection elucidated by Hrabanus Maurus. ²¹⁴

Nevertheless, the issue of women procuring aphrodisiacs went to the heart of Frankish cleric's perception of women as wives. Magic could subvert the natural order where men were consciously in control over their wives. Nevertheless it was accepted that wives had the means to influence their husbands. Thus women were not supposed to use this influence, including the sexual relationship, for illicit purposes; rather they were to use their influence for the greater good of the marriage bond. Women such as Judith, thought by some critics to have a malign influence on her

²⁰⁸ Wasserschleben, c.103,p.402.

²⁰⁹ Wasserschleben, c.I,36,p.468.

²¹⁰ Wasserschleben, c.I,30,p.576.

²¹¹ Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum, PL110,c.30,col.491B.

²¹² Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.369,p.354.

²¹³ Payer, Sex and the Penitentials, p.118. Fear of aphrodisiacs was closely connected with that of contraceptives; see pp.348-51 below.

²¹⁴ In condemning such practices Hrabanus writes: "Ut nobis videtur, talia sententia feriendi sunt, sicut magi et arioli, qui magicam artem exercuisse noscuntur"; Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum; PL110, c.30, cl.491B. The one instance concerning a man is recounted by Hincmar who described a man making a pact with a demon to secure the love of a girl; De divortio, PL125, col.721-25. But this is a rather different instance from women using aphrodisiacs to generate sexual passion.

husband, were castigated. 215

The image of the good wife was portrayed in the hagiography where wifely influence was used to Christianise the marriage. This could be literally so, as in the case of Chrothildis. She was described as attempting to convert Clovis in the bedroom. 216 Further, the value of Chrothildis' influence on her husband's behaviour is emphasised: on her advice Clovis destroyed pagan shrines, built and endowed churches, gave alms to paupers, and supported orphans and widows. 217 It is significant that the ninth-century Vita Chrothildis follows the Liber Historiae Francorum which credits Chrothildis as much as St. Remigius for Clovis' conversion, and glosses over her complicity in her grandsons' murder by her son Lothar, as recounted by Gregory of Tours. 218 The image of a wily queen was reworked to present instead the good wife and mother of

215 Agobard described Judith as a modern-day Deliah or Jezebel as the seductive, malign influence over her husband Louis as Samson or Ahab. Paschasius Radbertus for different reasons also portrayed Judith as a Frankish "Jezebel", "a second queen Brunhild"; Ward, "Agobard of Lyons and Paschasius Radbertus as critics of the Empress Judith", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.15-26.

216 "Cumque carnali more eam rex secretius cubiculum introduxisset, beata Chrothildis dixit ei: "Domine rex, ancillam tuam audi et quod peto concede mihi"; Vita Chrothildis; MGH SRM, 2,c.5,p.343.

217 "consilio beatae Chrothildis"; MGH, Ibid, c.7,pp.344-45. See also Lifshitz, "Les femmes missionnaires", pp.13-15. This perception of Chrothildis is similar to Sharon Farmer's findings concerning twelfth and early thirteenth-century clerics' views: "That the natural, enticing and alluring qualities of the woman and her speech could be spiritually beneficial... that wives could and should tame their husbands"; "Persuasive Voices: Clerical Images of Medieval Wives", Speculum, 61 (1986), pp.517-43, at p.543. Toubert pointed to the depiction of the alluring woman becoming an influential, good mediator in Hrabanus Maurus', De vita beatae Mariae Magdalenae [PL112, c.1431-1508, esp. at c.3, cl.1434]; "La théorie du mariage, p.260. However, this text may be a twelfth-century forgery; Nelson, "Women and the word", note 90.

218 Lifshitz, Ibid, pp.13-15. The Vita describes how Chrothildis thought the boys were being taken away to be crowned not to be murdered and also her great grief on learning of their fate; MGH SRM,2,c.10,p.346.

emperors and of a Frankish king. 219

Sadalberga converted her family to monasticism. However, she is the "good wife" first and foremost. Although she had a religious vocation she married on the king's orders "in order to have children"; she was rewarded with five after a long period of sterility. 220 Further, she is described as wishing to make her whole household, not for herself alone, but for her husband and her children, into a Church of Christ. 221

The ninth-century Vita Waldestrudis also describes the saint as exercising good wifely influence by successfully persuading her husband to enter a monastery. 222 Such "conversion" images were only intended metaphorically in the sense of influencing husbands' behaviour; they were not intended literally hence the prohibitions against marriages with Jews. 223 However, while Waldestrude is a good wife and takes the anulus fidei as subject to her husband 224, nevertheless she is described as disliking sex so much that she persuaded her husband that they should both be chaste. 225 This provides an interesting ninth-century example of the rejection of marriage despite

219 "Romanorum imperatorum mater et regum Francorum genitrix"; MGH, Ibid, c.14, p.348. On this image of queens wisely using their wifely influence see Stafford, Queens, pp.27-31.

220 Vita Sadalabergae, MGH SRM, 5, c.10, 11, pp.55-56.

221 "Egit hoc denique famula Christi omnique nisu adgressa est, ut omnem domum suam non sibi soli, sed marito simul et liberis Christi faceret ecclesiam"; MGH, Ibid, c.11, p.56.

222 AS Belgii Selecta, 4, c.4, p.441.

223 Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6); MGH Conc. III, c.73, 74, pp.123-24. Regino of Prüm included a canon from the Theodosian code which stated that a Christian taking a Jewish wife and a Jew a Christian wife was akin to adultery; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.142, p.268.

224 AS Belgii Selecta, 4, c.I, 3, p.441.

225 "Coepit ipsam carnis copulam valde perhorrescere... carnale coniugium pertimescebat"; AS Belgii Selecta, 4, c.I, 4, p.441.

the valorisation of the wife's role elsewhere, in the liturgy and the treatises on marriage.

CHILD-BEARERS AND CHILD-CARERS:
PERCEPTIONS OF "MATERNITAS".

[I] Infertility and Childbirth.

Both the liturgies and the specula coniugatorum expounded the view that a marriage was blessed when there were children. the prayers of nuptial Masses make it apparent that fertility was regarded as an issue for women, rather than for the couple. This is underlined by liturgical provision for barren women which has parallels with some of the nuptial Mass prayers. The most extended provision occurs in the Sacramentary of Gellone ¹ where prayers are incorporated into the body of the Mass. This provision corresponds exactly to provision in the Gelasian Sacramentary ² except for an additional Preface, Qui ex invisibli mirabiliter concedens. ³ A considerably shortened Missa pro sterilitate mulierum in Alcuin's Masses appended to some versions of the Hadrianum has some of the Sacramentary of Gellone's prayers. ⁴ The rite in the Sacramentary of Gellone influenced later liturgies notably that in the Sacramentary of Fulda. ⁵

¹ Sac. Gellon., 2646-2656, pp.415-17. The same provision occurs in the Sacramentary of Autun; Sac. August., 1660-1670, pp.206-07.

² Sac. Gelas., 1461-1470, pp.212-13. There is no provision for female infertility in the Veronense Sacramentary.

³ Sac. Gellon., 2654, pp.416-17.

⁴ Deshusses, II, 2760-2763, p.190. These prayers correspond to prayers [1],[2],[8],[11] in the Sacramentary of Gellone, see pp.333-34 below.

⁵ Sac. Fuld., 2618-2624, pp.327-28.

Sacramentary of Gellone.Or. ad mis. pro stereli. (sic)
mulierum

[1]

Deus qui emortuam vulvam Sarre
ita per Habraae semen fecundare
dignatus es...

[2]

Deus, qui famulum tuum Isahac
pro sterilitate coniuge sue et
deprecante[m] exaudire et
conceptum Rebecce donare
dignatus es...

[3]

Deus, qui obprobrium
sterilitatis Rachel auferens dum
anxietate[m] prole[m] quereret
meruit fecundare...

[4]

Omnipotens sempiterne deus, qui
continuum etiam post fusam ad te
precem gemitum Anne dum eam
fecundaris in gaudium
convertisti...

[5]

Deus, cuius occulto ideo
Helisabeth sterelis (sic) uterum
extetit...

[6]

Deus, qui anxietate (sic)
sterilium pie respicie[n]s in
eis fecunditatem etiam in sua
disperatione mirabiliter
operaris...

[7]

Omnipotens sempiterne Deus, qui
maternum affectum nec in ipsa
sacra semper virgine Maria...[8] SecretaSuscipe domine preces nostras
cum muneribus hostiarum quas
pro famula...Sacramentary of Fulda.Missa pro sterelitate (sic)
mulierum

[1]

Deus qui emortuam vulvam Sarae
ita per Abrahae semen
faecundare dignatus es...[2] AliaDeus, qui anxietatem sterilium
pie respiciens in eis
faecunditatem etiam in sua
disperatione mirabiliter
operaris...[3] AliaOmnipotens sempiterne Deus, qui
maternum affectum nec in ipsa
sacra virgine Maria...[4] Super oblataSuscipe domine preces nostras
cum muneribus hostiarum quas
pro famula...

[9]

V.D. Qui ex invisibili potentia
omnia invisibiliter mirabiliter
con[ce]dans...

[10] Infrac.

Hanc igitur oblationem
servitutis nostre sed et cuncte
familie tue quam tibi offerimus
pro famula...

[11] Post comm.

Celesti[s] vite munus
accipientes...

[5] Praefatio

V.D. Qui ex invisibili potentia
omnia invisibiliter et
mirabiliter condens...

[6] Infra actionem

Hanc igitur oblationem
servitutis nostrae sed et
cunctae familiae tuae, quam
tibi offerimus pro famula...

[7] Ad complendum

Celestis vitae munus
accipientes...

The first five prayers in the Sacramentary of Gellone⁶ constitute invocations on behalf of the subject who is compared to biblical models of female infertility. Most of these were cited in nuptial prayers⁷ - Sarah the mother of Isaac, Rebecca the mother of Esau and Jacob, Rachel the mother of Joseph, Anna the mother of Samuel, and Elizabeth the mother of John the Baptist.⁸ The Sacramentary of Fulda only uses the first of these prayers which also occurs in Alcuin's Masses.⁹ This refers to Sarah and Abraham.¹⁰ These were important models in the Franks' perception of themselves as the new people of Israel, hence the exegesis on this theme in the Ermentrude coronation ordo¹¹; and also a benediction for Judith's fertility on similar lines in her marriage ordo.¹² The wording of this latter is similar to the prayer in the

⁶ Sac. Gellon., 2646-2650, pp. 415-16.

⁷ See pp. 314-16 above.

⁸ Elizabeth is not cited in nuptial prayers; but she was a model in the Penitential of Vinnian which instructed a man not to put away his barren wife: "credo enim, si tales fuerint quales fuerunt Abraham et Sarra, seu Isaac et Rebecca, et Anna mater Samuhelis vel Elisabet mater Johannis, bene illis in novissimo diregetur", ["if they shall be as Abraham and Sarah were, and Isaac and Rebecca, and Anna the mother of Samuel, and Elizabeth the mother of John, it will come out well for them in these current times"]; Wasserschleben, c. 41, p. 117. With the omission of Rachel, the choice and ordering of these role-models is the same as in the liturgy; perhaps this short treatise influenced the liturgy or vice versa - the earliest manuscript of the Penitential of Vinnian is Frankish and late eighth-century; see ch. 1 above n. 129.

⁹ See n. 4 above.

¹⁰ Prayer [1], p. 333 above.

¹¹ See ch. 6 above, n. 124.

¹² "Fill her... with benedictions on her breasts and womb... Bring the blessings of the ancient fathers over her and his seed, just as you promised to your servant Abraham and his seed for eternity"; MGH Capit. II, 1.10-12, p. 427. This benediction is one of six probably chanted by the other bishops present with Hincmar; Ritzer, Le Mariage, pp. 330-31, note 405.

Sacramentary of Gellone 13:

Sacramentary of Gellone.

Deus qui et mortuam vulvam Sarre ita per Habraae semen fecundare dignatus es, ut ei etiam contra spem subolis nasceretur, preces famule tuae ill. pro sua sterilitate deprecantes propitius respice, et ea iuxta tenorem precedentium patrum et fecunditatem tribuas et filium quem donaveris benedicas. Per.

Judith "Ordo".

Reple eam "benedictionibus uberum et vulvae" [Gen. xlix,25]. Benedictiones patrum antiquorum confortatae sint super eam et super semen eius, sicut promisi servo tuo Abrahae et semini suis in saecula.

A significant difference between the prayer in the ordo and the sacramentary is that the former is a benediction of both the woman's uberes et vulva and the man's semen, whereas the latter refers to sua sterilitas. Semen is used here in the sense of a man's progeny rather than as a reference to his fertility - that was regarded as an entirely female province.¹⁴ All the prayers in the Sacramentary of Gellone are offered for tua famula illa. Barrenness is variously described in these prayers as the woman's obprobrium¹⁵ or vinculus sterilitatis.¹⁶ A connection is also drawn in the Preface, Qui ex invisibili potentia omnia invisibiliter [et] mirabiliter concedens between woman's infertility and woman committing the first sin.

"Cuius benedictionis gratiam, dum mulier per peccatum prime prevaricationis amitterit, ne sterilitate humanum genus funditus interiret, ei etiam post peccatum licet in doloribus tamen generare filios precepisti".¹⁷

¹³ "God, who deigned to make fertile the barren womb of Sarah through Abraham's seed, so that a child was born to her against all hope, look kindly on the prayers of this your servant N. entreating favour in respect of her barrenness, and grant her fertility according to the manner of the fathers of old and bless her child whom you give [to her]".

¹⁴ However, the penitentials referred to semen in its physical sense; n.97,137 below.

¹⁵ Sac. Gellon.,2648,2649,2654,pp.415-17.

¹⁶ Sac. Gellon.,2655,p.417.

¹⁷ "When woman lost the grace of benediction through the sin of the first lie, lest the human race completely perish through sterility, you commanded her even after [that] sin nevertheless to bring forth children, though in

An exception to these attitudes is evidenced by the Pontifical of Poitiers which provides a Missa pro coniugibus sterilitate infecundis in procreatione prolis.¹⁸ Leroquais does not cite the actual prayers noting only that they comprise several collects, secreta, and post-communion prayers and a selection of Scriptural texts.¹⁹ However, unlike the other liturgies, the rubric provides for the couple's lack of children and not for specifically female infertility.

The second prayer in the Sacramentary of Gellone pairs Isaac and Rebecca; but the other three prayers cite only female models. The Preface, which occurs for the first time in the Sacramentary of Gellone, is shortened in the Sacramentary of Fulda.²⁰ This latter omits the last lines of the former's version which includes an invocation to "your servant Gregory".²¹ Similarly, in the Sacramentary of Gellone, Deus, qui anxietatem sterilium pie respiciens in eis faecunditatem includes an invocation of "the prayers of your servant Gregory" to intercede for the woman²²; this has been changed to, "the prayers of your holy martyr Boniface" in the Sacramentary of Fulda.²³

This indicates that women went, or were encouraged to go, to shrines such as Boniface's at Fulda to invoke the aid of the saint. The Vita Sadalbergae describes how she went to the shrine of St. Remigius and devoted herself with prayers and vigils; on her return home she was rewarded

pain"; Sac. Gellon., 2654, l.7-11, p.416.

¹⁸ Leroquais, Les Manuscrits Pontificaux, I, fol.269-273v, p.268.

¹⁹ Leroquais, Ibid.

²⁰ Sac. Gellon., 2654, pp.416-17; Sac. Fuld., 2622, pp.327-28.

²¹ Sac. Gellon., 2654, l.32-36, p.417.

²² Sac. Gellon., 2651, l.4-5, p.416.

²³ Sac. Fuld., 2619, p.327.

with the conception of her first daughter, Saretrude.²⁴ Significantly, the hagiographer describes how Sadalberga went to the shrine because she identified herself with the sanctae mulieres, Anna and Elizabeth:

"christianissima femina anxia, tot privata privilegiis sanctarum mulierum Annae et Helisabeth in se adhibens fidem, quae in Domini templo vigiliis et orationibus excubantes post diuturnam sterilitatem partus sanctos meruerunt procreari".²⁵

The saint's emulation of Anna and Elizabeth may be an allusion in this ninth-century Vita to contemporary liturgical provision.

Deus, qui anxietatem sterilium pie respiciens in eis faecunditatem with its original reference to Gregory is only one of two which occurs in the Leofric Missal.²⁶ These are entitled Oratio in sterilitate mulierum; so it is unclear whether these were part of a Mass. The other prayer, also in the Sacramentary of Gellone, includes an invocation to the Virgin as mother -

"Omnipotens sempiterne Deus, qui maternum effectum nec in ipsa sacra semper virgine Maria quae redemptorem nostrum genuit denegasti: Concede propitius, ut eiusdem dei genetricis precibus famula tua illa esse genetrix mereatur".²⁷

Mary as virgin and mother was a role-model for both religious²⁸ and secular women.

The PRG provides two rites²⁹, which include all the prayers from the Sacramentary of Gellone except for the

²⁴ MGH SRM, 5, c.11, p.55.

²⁵ "that most Christian woman, denied so many privileges, showing in herself the faith of those holy women Anna and Elizabeth, who being vigilant with prayers and vigils in the temple of the Lord became worthy to give birth to holy children after a long period of barrenness"; MGH, Ibid, c.11, l.20-23, p.55.

²⁶ Leofric, p.229.

²⁷ "Ever allpowerful God, you who did not deny the maternal accomplishment in that ever holy virgin Mary who bore our Redeemer: kindly grant that, with the prayers of the mother of God, this your servant may be worthy to become a mother"; Leofric, p.229.

²⁸ See p.226 above.

²⁹ PRG II, pp.420-21.

Preface 30:

PRG Rite 1.Oratio ad missam pro sterilitate mulierum

[1]

Deus qui emortuam vulvam Sarae
ita per Abrahae semen faecundari
dignatus es...

[2] Alia

Omnipotens sempiterne Deus, qui
maternum affectum nec in ipsa
sacra semper virgine Mariae...

[3] Secreta

Suscipe domine preces nostras
cum muneribus hostiarum quas
pro famula...

[4] Infra canonem

Hanc igitur oblationem
servitutis nostre, sed et
cunctae familiae tuae quam tibi
offerimus pro famula...

[5] Ad complendum

Celestis vitae munus
accipientes...

PRG Rite 2.Item pro sterilitate mulierum

[1]

Deus, qui famulum tuum Isaac
pro sterilitate coniuge suae et
te deprecantem exaudire et
conceptum Rebeckae donare
dignatus es...

[2] Alia

Deus, qui obprobrium
sterilitatis a Rachel
abstulisti, quae dum anxia a te
prolem quereret meruit
fecundari...

[3] Alia

Omnipotens sempiterne Deus, qui
continuum etiam post fusas ad
te preces gemitum Annae dum eam
fecundares in gaudium
convertisti...

[4] Alia

Deus, cuius occulto consilio
ideo Elisabeth[ae] sterilis
uterus exstitit...

[5] Alia

Deus, qui anxietatem sterili-
um pie respiciens in eis
faecunditatem etiam in sua
desperatione mirabiliter
operaris...

30 That is, all the Gelasian Sacramentary's prayers.

The first Mass includes the two important prayers - the Sarah/Abraham prayer ³¹ and that invoking the intercession of the Virgin Mary. ³² The second rite is a Mass, hence Item, but it may also have provided a series of alternative benedictions more akin to the provision in the Leofric Missal.

Male impotence was dealt with as a legal issue with women requiring proof, sometimes via ordeal. ³³ It was thought that impotence could be brought about by magic - of spurned concubines according to Hincmar. ³⁴ Therefore, infertility rites may partly represent the Church's fight against (women's) magic - obviously an impotent man could not impregnate his wife. Frankish ecclesiastics regarded women as more likely to turn to alternative, non-Christian solutions; according to the penitentials and episcopal statements, it was women who procured aphrodisiacs which were mixed into husbands' food or drink. ³⁵ Hrabanus Maurus criticised the femina who having done this dedit viro suo, ut comederet. ³⁶ This chapter in Hrabanus' penitential directly follows another concerning impotence. Clearly there was a link between the procurement of such potions and women's wish to conceive. Perhaps women's folk-remedies acknowledged the possibility of male impotence/infertility ³⁷ when the liturgy would not. Liturgy was therefore an acceptable alternative form as a "fertility charm". ³⁸

³¹ Prayer [1], p.339 above.

³² Prayer [2], p.339 above.

³³ See pp.273-74 above.

³⁴ See p.275 above.

³⁵ See pp.327-28 above.

³⁶ Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum; PL110, c.30, col.491.

³⁷ That men could be made infertile was recognised; n.120 below.

³⁸ Nelson, "On the Limits of the Carolingian Renaissance", p.65, note 87; and see ch.6 above n.124.

However, female infertility rites may also evidence the Church attempting to provide protection for women. Childless women, as Theutberga discovered, were vulnerable to repudiation; but Frankish ecclesiastics were agreed that childlessness did not constitute sufficient grounds for divorce.³⁹ These rites may represent the Church's solution. The fact that some of the prayers, as in the Leofric Missal and the second rite in the PRG, were perhaps performed over the conjugal bed like some of the nuptial provision.⁴⁰

The Frankish Church's attempt to extend its control over areas of lay life hitherto outside its influence, often areas of female experience, also explains the provision of rites for performance before, during, and after childbirth. The PRG provides an Oratio pro parturiente⁴¹:

"Deus qui ab initio fecisti hominem et dedisti ei adiutorium simile sibi, ut crescerent et multiplicarentur super terram, da misericordiam tuam huic famulae N., ut prospere et sine gravi dolore parturiat".⁴²

Paxton outlined the ninth-century evolution of rituals for the different moments of sickness, dying, death, burial and commemoration.⁴³ These included prayers super infirmum in domo and deathbed reconciliation rites including a commendatio animae, or rite of agony.⁴⁴ In

³⁹ See pp.272-73 above.

⁴⁰ See ch.6 above, p.310,n.93.

⁴¹ PRG II,p.419.

⁴² "God, you who from the beginning made man and gave him a helper like unto him so that they could go forth and multiply on the earth, grant mercy to this your servant N., so that she may give birth successfully and without great pain"; PRG II, p.419. Women's real fears over childbirth are illustrated in the Miracula Waldburgis. Here a woman in terrible labour prayed to the saint. Having received her aid she took gifts to the shrine to give thanks for a successful labour and the happy survival of her son; Miracula Waldburgis; Bk.III,2,pp.260-62.

⁴³ These developed particularly from the Frankish version of the original Gelasian and the Eighth-century Gelasians; Christianising Death, pp.92-127.

⁴⁴ This was new to the Sacramentary of Gellone; Paxton, Ibid, pp.116-19.

the ninth-century there was "a concerted effort to involve the laity in the new artes moriendi" ⁴⁵ so that some of these rites would be performed in the laity's homes; thus prayers for women in childbirth, where death was a real possibility, may have formed part of these developments.

The insular Confessional of Egbert and the Frankish Martinian Penitential both drew from Gregory the Great's responses to Augustine: the former allowed pregnant women to communicate before giving birth if it was necessary⁴⁶ and the latter stated that pregnant women, women in labour, or women after childbirth could be baptized if they were in danger of death. ⁴⁷ Thus women's impurity was acknowledged to be unintentional. ⁴⁸ These prescriptions acknowledged the dangers of childbirth; even so, Halitgar of Cambrai insisted that pregnant women should be allowed to fast. ⁴⁹ The dangers of childbirth may have influenced Theodulf of Orleans' statement that not only clerics but also the laity, even the female laity, were allowed to administer unction in dire need. ⁵⁰ Women would be most likely to need to administer unction in their role as midwives to women or their babies. ⁵¹

An attempt to provide for female experiences may partly explain why funeral prayers for women appeared in liturgies from the late eighth century. In the Gelasian

⁴⁵ Paxton, Ibid, p.127.

⁴⁶ Wasserschleben, c.31,p.313.

⁴⁷ Wasserschleben, c.67,p.298.

⁴⁸ On Gregory's distinction here between intentional and unintentional impurity; Demyttenaere, "The Cleric, Women and the Stain", pp.160,162.

⁴⁹ Wasserschleben, Bk.6,c.XI,22,p.375.

⁵⁰ MGH Capit. Episc., II,c.28,p.181. On the synthesis of Benedict of Aniane's anointing ritual for use with the dying see Paxton, Christianising Death, at pp.151,165-68,180-83.

⁵¹ The right to anoint in extreme circumstances was also preferable to mothers using non-Christian methods to heal their children; see pp.369-70 below.

Sacramentary, Orationes post obitum hominis, homo, is not gender-specific ⁵², neither is the provision specifically for the laity - Orationes pro defunctis laicis.⁵³ Masculine terminology is used generically in the liturgy ⁵⁴; and since the Gelasian Sacramentary provided separate funeral prayers for priests ⁵⁵ and abbots ⁵⁶ the provision for homo seems to have been intended for both the male and female laity. Non gender-specific death rituals also occur in the Hadrianum ⁵⁷, the Aniane Supplement ⁵⁸, and the Sacramentary of Gellone. ⁵⁹

However, in Alcuin's Masses there is a separate Missa pro defuncta femina. ⁶⁰ This provision is repeated in the Leofric Missal ⁶¹ and the PRG. ⁶² These prayers may have

⁵² Sac. Gelas., 1607-1625, pp. 234-37. Particularly if this was put together by nuns at Chelles; see above, p. 80.

⁵³ Plus an Item unius defuncti; Sac. Gelas., 1662-1665, pp. 242-43.

⁵⁴ See pp. 198-200 above.

⁵⁵ Sac. Gelas., 1628-1637, pp. 238-39.

⁵⁶ Sac. Gelas., 1638-1642, pp. 239-40. This is for priests and abbots.

⁵⁷ In Item alia oratione ad agendam mortuorum, illius and illa are referred to; Deshusses, I, 1015-1017, pp. 347-48.

⁵⁸ Missa unius defuncti; Deshusses, I, 1416-1419, pp. 463-64.

⁵⁹ This Sacramentary provides extensive rituals for dying, for death, and for commemoration all of which are non gender-specific; Orationes super defunctum [2892-98], Orationes pro obitu super defunctum [2899], Missa unius defuncti laici [2968-72] all refer to illius or famulus; Item alia missa pro defunctis [2984-87] refers to both famuli and famulae as does a ninth-century addition to the text Missa pro salute hominum [3061-63]; Sac. Gellon., pp. 460-63, 475, 477, 519-20.

⁶⁰ This consists of three prayers: Quaesumus domine pro tua pietate miserere animae famulae tuae; an oblation, His sacrificiis domine anima famula tuae ill. a peccatis omnibus exuatur and a post-communion prayer, Inveniat quaesumus domine anima famulae ill. lucis aeternae consortium; Deshusses, II, 3015-3017, p. 226.

⁶¹ Leofric, p. 196.

been intended for religious women although, if so, one might expect the terms sacra virgo or vidua to be used; and commemoration prayers for female religious occur discretely in the Sacramentary of Gellone ⁶³, Alcuin's Masses ⁶⁴, the Sacramentary of Fulda ⁶⁵ and the PRG.⁶⁶ The Missa pro defuncta femina follows another titled, In Unius Defuncti in Alcuin's Masses ⁶⁷, and a Missa unius defuncti laici in the Leofric Missal. ⁶⁸ This suggests that the dead femina is being distinguished from the layman. ⁶⁹ In view of the inclusion of the laity in the new death rituals ⁷⁰ this provision in later ninth-century and early tenth-century liturgies for feminae may indicate secular women and should be viewed alongside the increased provision for other areas of women's lives. ⁷¹

⁶² PRG II, p.320.

⁶³ Missa in natali ancillarum Dei, Sac. Gellon., 2620-2623, p.410; and in the Sacramentary of Autun, Sac. August., 1633-1636, p.201.

⁶⁴ Missa in natale Ancillarum Dei; Deshusses, II, 2289-2292, pp.119-20.

⁶⁵ Sac. Fuld., 2760-2763, pp.363-64. This is the same as the rite in Alcuin's Masses.

⁶⁶ Item missa in natali virginum; PRG I, pp.47-48.

⁶⁷ Deshusses, II, 3012-3014, p.226.

⁶⁸ Leofric, p.196.

⁶⁹ The PRG also provides a prayer pro una femina; PRG II, p.231. This follows Pro salute unius vivi [PRG II, p.230] in which two of the prayers refer to famulus but the first to servus vel ancilla. This last probably refers to religious women suggesting that where the liturgy uses femina it is in the secular sense, although, technically, all women were lay.

⁷⁰ In particular the Lorsch and St. Amand scriptoria produced materials for the use of the laity and the secular clergy; Paxton, Christianising Death, pp.162-200, at pp.196-200.

⁷¹ While death through childbirth was one such experience, another explanation for funeral prayers for women may lie in the Church's appreciation of the role of noblewomen, especially widows, as patrons - a particular expression of female religiosity that the Church sought to reward and encourage.

After childbirth women were regarded as impure for a period.⁷² This post partum period, during which sexual continence was enjoined, varied from forty days for a child of either sex to 66 days for a girl as compared to 33 for a boy.⁷³ Women were punished for not observing the period of purification. The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede stated that an uxor should not go to church for thirty days after the birth of a boy and forty after a girl.⁷⁴ The Excarpsus Cummeani gave a woman a forty-day penance for communicating if she was still unpurified in the post partum period.⁷⁵ The Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore⁷⁶ followed that of Theodore⁷⁷ in giving a forty-day penance for a woman going to church before she had been purified. While the penitentials refer to a period of purification, they do not indicate whether there was a liturgical ritual at the end of it.⁷⁸ Observance of the period of time may have been regarded as sufficient. However, Herard of Tours stated that if the woman wished she could go to church immediately (statim) after the birth, unless she was an adulteress, to give thanks to God.⁷⁹

For this situation, when the woman had endured the ordeal of childbirth and completed the post partum period, there was liturgical provision to celebrate the survival of a child. Such Masses occur in the Sacramentaries of Gellone

⁷² This was based on Mosaic definitions of purity; see ch.6 above, n.144.

⁷³ See pp.323-24 above.

⁷⁴ *Wasserschleben*, c.V,1,p.262.

⁷⁵ *Wasserschleben*, c.III,15,p.472.

⁷⁶ *Wasserschleben*, c.II,8,p.577.

⁷⁷ *Wasserschleben*, Bk.1,c.XIV,18,p.199.

⁷⁸ This differs from the Mass after the thirty-day period of absence from church after a marriage; see p.306 above. On the later development of churching rituals, see William Coster, "Purity, Profanity and Puritanism: The Churching of Women, 1500-1700", *SCH*, 27, (1990), pp.377-401.

⁷⁹ *PL*132,c.60,col.768. This caveat also formed part of Pope Gergory's response to Augustine.

80, Angoulême 81 and Autun 82 following the provision in the Gelasian Sacramentary 83 except for an additional Preface. The Mass is entitled Orationes in natale genuinum⁸⁴ or Missa in natale genuinum 85:

[1]

Omnipotens sempiterne Deus, totius conditur creaturae

[2]

Deus, qui saeculorum omnium cursam ac momenta temporum regis

[3] Secreta

Adesto Domine supplicationibus nostris, et hanc oblationem famuli tui illius, quam tibi offert ob diem natalis sui genuini

[4]

V.D. Per Christum Dominum nostrum ad cuius imaginem hominem formare dignatus es

[5] Infra Actionem

Hanc igitur oblationem Domine famuli tui illius, quam tibi offert ob diem natalis sui genuini,

[6] Post communion

Deus, vita fidelium, timentium te salvator et custos

This Mass occurs in a shortened form in the Sacramentary of Fulda. 86 But only the first prayer, Omnipotens sempiterne Deus, totius conditor creaturae, is included in the PRG; it is entitled, Oratio in natali genuino which need not imply that it was incorporated into the Mass. 87

The rite is clearly a celebration of the survival of a

80 Sac. Gellon., 2640-2645, pp. 414-15.

81 Sac. Engol., 2319-2324, pp. 361-62. However, this liturgy does not include a rite for infertile women.

82 Sac. August., 1654-1659, p. 205.

83 Sac. Gelas., 1456-1460, p. 211.

84 In the Sacramentaries of Gellone and Autun.

85 In the Sacramentary of Angoulême.

86 Sac. Fuld., 2625-2629, pp. 328-29. All the prayers occur as in the Sacramentaries of Gellone and Angoulême except for Deus, qui saeculorum omnium cursam ac momenta temporum regis, prayer [2] p. 15 above which is omitted.

87 PRG II, p. 419.

child who is described as coming forth de maternis visceribus.⁸⁸ Several of the prayers include invocations for the child to enjoy a long life:

"et annos famuli tui illius quem de maternis visceribus in hac vita prodire iussisti prosperos plurimosque largire, ut omnem tibi exigat placiturus aetatem"⁸⁹;

"Exaudi nos propitius et concede, ut famuli tui illius, cuius hodie natalem genuinum caelebramus consecratione mysterii, longevam largiaris aetatem"⁹⁰;

"ob hoc igitur reddat tibi vota sua Deo vivo et vero, pro quo maestati tuae supplices fundimus preces, ut adicias ei annos et tempora vitae, ut per multa curricula annorum laetus tibi haec sua vota persoluat atque ad optatam perveniat senectutem et te benedicat omnibus diebus vitae suae"⁹¹;

"dignatus es gratiam in eo vitae protector augmenta et dies eius annorum numerositate multiplica, ut te annuente per felicem provectus aetatem ad principatum caelestium gaudiorum pervenire mereatur".⁹²

Natalis could mean the actual day of birth or birthday, a year's hence.⁹³ The provision in the Sacramentaries of Gellone, Angoulême and Fulda imply the latter; whereas the prayer in the PRG seems to indicate that the prayer was said on the actual day of birth because it has added hodie to the phrase quem maternis visceribus in hanc vitam prodire iussisti.⁹⁴ A rite celebrating the survival of a child, either on the day of birth or a year later, which requested the child's long life indicates concern over infant mortality and provision for women, if not specifically.

⁸⁸ In prayers [1], [3], and [5], p.346 above.

⁸⁹ Prayer [1], p.346 above; Sac. Engol., 2319, 1.4-5, p.361.

⁹⁰ Prayer [2], p.346 above; Sac. Engol., 2320, 1.2-4, pp.361-62.

⁹¹ Prayer [5], p.346 above; Sac. Engol., 1.5-9, 2323, p.362.

⁹² Prayer [6], p.346 above; Sac. Engol., 3-6, 2324, p.362.

⁹³ It can also refer to commemorations of the dead on anniversaries, see n.63-66 above.

⁹⁴ "whom today you have brought forth into the world from his mother's innards"; PRG II, p.419.

[III] Contraception, Abortion and Infanticide.

Treatises on marriage expressed the view that marital sex should be practised chastely and for procreation.⁹⁵ Non-procreative practices such as anal sex and coitus interruptus were condemned in several penitentials and episcopal statutes⁹⁶; but the reason, namely that they could be contraceptive, was usually not given. The St. Hubert Penitential is unusual in prescribing in the same canon against a man practising coitus interruptus and a women taking contraceptive potions.⁹⁷ Contraceptive methods other than sexual practices were universally condemned as a female sin. One of the differences between contraceptive sexual practices and other methods was that the former were controlled by men while the second represented women's methods of self-help based on magic or folk-remedies.

Procuring contraceptives was associated with the female province of aphrodisiacs.⁹⁸ The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede in the same breath condemned women who drank herbs or did other things so as not to have a child, or gave potions to men to kill them, or mixed menstrual blood or semen into their husband's food as an aphrodisiac.⁹⁹ The Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore simultaneously prescribed against a woman who prepared these kinds of aphrodisiac and one who placed semen in a withered tree for contraceptive purposes.¹⁰⁰

Apart from these direct references to contraceptives it is otherwise difficult to distinguish between

⁹⁵ See pp.317-18 above.

⁹⁶ See pp.326-27 above.

⁹⁷ "Si quis potiones acceperit, ut mulier non concipiat aut conceptos occiderit, aut vir semen effuderit..."; Wasserschleben, c.56,p.385. This also occurs in the Merseburg [B] Penitenital; Wasserschleben, c.13,p.430.

⁹⁸ See pp.327-28; 340 above.

⁹⁹ Wasserschleben, c.30,p.255.

¹⁰⁰ Wasserschleben, c.I,30,p.576.

contraceptives and abortifacients. ¹⁰¹ The St. Hubert Penitential, under the title De potionibus mulierum, condemned guis, perhaps female in this instance, who accepted a potion as a contraceptive or abortifacient.¹⁰² Rodulf of Bourges referred to the two practices in the same canon. ¹⁰³ There was also a certain blurring of definition between the methods - imbibing potions and maleficium. ¹⁰⁴ The Penitential of Vinnian had condemned a woman who destroyed another woman's baby through maleficium. ¹⁰⁵ In ninth-century Frankish penitentials this use of maleficus was also used. The St. Hubert Penitential assigned three years penance for guis who, on account of love used maleficus to bring about the death of a woman's baby. ¹⁰⁶ Ultimately, maleficium became used in the special sense of a "sterilizing magical act".¹⁰⁷ Hence the Merseburg Penitential ¹⁰⁸ and the Excarpsus Cummeani ¹⁰⁹ substituted veneficus for maleficus confirming that the magic was supposed to work by a poisonous potion. ¹¹⁰

The penitentials usually assume that it was women who were involved with magic; there are numerous condemnations

¹⁰¹ Noonan, Contraception, p.158.

¹⁰² See n.97.

¹⁰³ "quae studuerit aborsum facere et, quod est conceptum, necare aut certe, ut non concipiat, elaborat sive ex adulterio sive ex legitimo matrimonio..."; MGH Capit. Episc., c.41, p.264.

¹⁰⁴ Noonan, Contraception, pp.156-58.

¹⁰⁵ Wasserschleben, c.20, p.112.

¹⁰⁶ Wasserschleben, c.11, p.379.

¹⁰⁷ Noonan, Contraception, p.156.

¹⁰⁸ Wasserschleben, c.10, p.392.

¹⁰⁹ Wasserschleben, c.VII, 2, pp.480-81.

¹¹⁰ Noonan, Contraception, p.158.

of women's incantations and divinations. ¹¹¹ Legislative references to magic were often not gender-specific ¹¹², although, in a general condemnation of chanting, incantations, divinations, sorcery, interpreting dreams and the weather, Herard of Tours mentioned mulieres veneficiae. ¹¹³ Magic arts, incantations and divinations were often grouped with potions. The Penitential of Egbert gave seven years penance to women who used artes malefica, id est per poculum to kill people; a lesser penance of four years was given to a paupercula which indicates that this prescription did not only apply to the nobility.¹¹⁴ The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede similarly condemned women who used artes malefica and pocula. ¹¹⁵ A direct

¹¹¹ Both in insular penitentials - the Penitential of Egbert [Wasserschleben, c.VII,6,p.239] and the Confessional of Egbert [Wasserschleben, c.29,p.312]; and in Frankish texts - the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede [Wasserschleben, c.XXX,2,p.272]; the Excarpsus Cummeani [Wasserschleben,c.VII,12,p.481]; the Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.364,371,pp.352,354-56.

¹¹² The Concilium Neuchingense (772) condemned carmina, machinae diabolicae and magicae artes [MGH Conc. II i,c.4,p.100]; the Councils of Reischach, Salzburg and Freising (800) condemned incantations, auguries, divining and alia maleficia [MGH Conc. II i,c.15,p.209]; and the Council of Tours (813) also in general terms condemned magic arts, incantations and using bones and herbs for healing [MGH Conc. II i,c.42,p.292]. For a survey of magical practices but without analysis of the role of women, with particular recourse to Hrabanus Maurus' De Magicis Artibus and Hincmar's De Divortio, see V.I.J. Flint, The Rise of Magic in Early Medieval Europe, (Princeton, 1991).

¹¹³ PL121,c.3,col.764.

¹¹⁴ Wasserschleben, c.VII,7,8,p.239. As this canon refers to the killing of aliqui it may not specifically imply contraceptives/abortifacients but it illustrates that potions and magic arts were regarded as synonymous.

¹¹⁵ Wasserschleben, c.XV,3,p.266. This also distinguished between a woman and a paupercula and while it also does not specifically mention contraceptives/abortifacients the prescription follows another giving a one-year penance to a woman procuring an abortion; Wasserschleben, c.XV,2,p.266. The Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore refers to the use of malitia id est poculus by a mulier or paupercula also after prescribing against a woman procuring an abortion; Wasserschleben, c.VI,6,7, p.587.

correlation between magic arts, and potions for abortion purposes is made by Gherbald of Liège:

"et veneficas id est mulieres, quae potiones aliquas donant, ut partus excutiant, et aliquas divinationes faciunt per hoc, ut a maritis suis maiorem amorem habeant". ¹¹⁶

A similar correlation alongside the involvement of women is made by the Anonymous of Trier. ¹¹⁷

Gherbald of Liège indicates that women procured these potions for women. ¹¹⁸ When the Martinian Penitential referred to a woman and her accomplices procuring an abortion ¹¹⁹ it is reasonable to assume that these accomplices were female. Only Regino of Prüm referred to the use of contraceptives by and for both men and women; he condemns guis who on account of lust or hatred gave a homo or a mulier a potion so that they would not be able to conceive since this was akin to homicide. ¹²⁰

The penitentials express different views on the seriousness of abortion. The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede gave a one-year penance; this compares with a year for sex during Lent and seven years for in retro sex. ¹²¹ The Excarpsus Cummeani gave three years ¹²² while the

¹¹⁶ MGH Capit. Episc., II, c.10, p.29. Again there is the link between the procuring of abortions and aphrodisiacs although, for the latter, methods other than mixing menstrual blood or semen in food are indicated.

¹¹⁷ "mulieres, que potiones tribuunt, ut partus excutiant, et que divinationes faciant aut veneficia donent hominem interficiendum"; MGH Capit. Episc., c.5, p.55.

¹¹⁸ See n.116 above; also the Penitential of Vinnian, n.105.

¹¹⁹ Wasserschleben, c.45, p.291.

¹²⁰ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2, c.88, p.248; and Bk.2, c.5.9, p.209: "Est aliquis vel aliqua, qui hoc fecerit, vel alium facere docuerit, ut vir non possit generare aut femina concipere".

¹²¹ Wasserschleben, c.XV, 2; c.V, 2; c.VIII, 3, pp.262, 266.

¹²² Wasserschleben, c.VII, 2, pp.480-81.

Martinian and St. Hubert Penitentials gave ten years ¹²³; Theodulf of Orleans most harshly gave a woman a fourteen-year penance. ¹²⁴ The variation of treatment partly depended on the perception of women's motivation and circumstance, and the time the abortion took place.

As far as motivation was concerned many of the penitentials and episcopal prescriptions drew on the statements of the ancient Councils of Ancyra, Elvira and Lérida. These condemned women who procured abortions on account of fornication or adultery and thus assumed that abortions concealed another crime. The statutes of Theodulf of Orleans ¹²⁵, the Penitential of Halitgar of Cambrai ¹²⁶ and the Quadripartitus ¹²⁷ all drew on the Council of Ancyra. Hrabanus Maurus also referred to all three councils in his penitentials. ¹²⁸ The inclusion of these canons in the Council of Mainz (847) ¹²⁹ was probably due to Hrabanus Maurus ¹³⁰; and Hrabanus was also the likely source for Regino of Prüm who included these

¹²³ Martinian Penitential; Wasserschleben, c.44,p.291. The St. Hubert Penitential; Wasserschleben, c.37,p.382.

¹²⁴ MGH Capit. Episc., II, c.X, 17, p.177.

¹²⁵ MGH Capit. Episc., II, c.V, 1, pp.160-61.

¹²⁶ "De mulieribus quae partus suos necant, vel quae agunt ut utero conceptus excutiant"; PL105, Bk.4, c.3, col.681. Halitgar states that according to the ancient legislation such women were permanently excommunicated but now, more leniently (humanius), a ten-year penance is given.

¹²⁷ Quadripartitus, Bk.4, c.93.

¹²⁸ The Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum cites the Council of Ancyra which condemned abortion on account of fornication and the Council of Elvira which condemned abortion on account of adultery with the more lenient ten-year penance; PL110, c.8, col.474. The Council of Lérida which condemned abortion on account of adultery and through the administering of potions is also cited with a return to communion allowed after seven years; PL110, c.9, col.474. This repeats the Poenitentiale ad Otgarium; PL112, c.11, cols.1410-11.

¹²⁹ MGH Conc. III, c.21, pp.171-72.

¹³⁰ G. Schmitz, "Schuld und Strafe. Eine unbekannte Stellungnahme des Rathramnus von Corbie zur Kindestötung", DA, 38, (1982), pp.363-87, at p.373.

councils' canons. ¹³¹ However, Regino's reference to the Council of Lérida condemned either the father or mother who killed the offspring in a mother's womb whereas the other references to this council only refer to women.

A link between abortion and women's fornication was also made in the Excarpsus Cummeani ¹³², the Martinian Penitential ¹³³, in Book Six (the penitential proper) of Halitgar's Penitential ¹³⁴, and the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore. ¹³⁵ Rodulf of Bourges also gave the more lenient penance of ten years for women who committed abortion sive ex adulterio sive ex legitimo matrimonio. ¹³⁶ This is a rare acknowledgement that abortion was practised to limit families and not only to conceal illicit liaisons.

The timing of an abortion was also perceived to result in a greater or lesser degree of culpability. The Penitential of Theodore had drawn a distinction between an abortion committed before the foetus had life; this carried a one-year penance as opposed to an abortion after the fortieth day of conception which carried a ten-year penance since they were murderesses. ¹³⁷ This definition of when a child quickened and the designation of later abortions as homicide was repeated in Frankish penitentials - in the Excarpsus Cummeani ¹³⁸, the Penitential of Pseudo-

¹³¹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.62 [Ancyra], 63 [Lérida], 64 [Elvira], pp.239-40.

¹³² Wasserschleben, c.VI,3,p.478.

¹³³ Wasserschleben, c.44,p.291.

¹³⁴ Wasserschleben, Bk.6,c.II,16,p.366.

¹³⁵ Wasserschleben, c.VI,3,p.586.

¹³⁶ MGH Capit. Episc.,c.41,p.264.

¹³⁷ "Mulieres quae abortivum faciunt antequam animam habeat... et si postea, i.e. post XL dies accepti seminis, ut homicidiae poeniteant"; Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.XIV,24, 27,pp.199-200. The Confessional of Egbert repeated this stricture describing conception as semen recepit, Wasserschleben, c.XVI,30,p.312.

¹³⁸ Wasserschleben, c.VI,11,p.478.

Theodore ¹³⁹ and by Regino of Prüm. ¹⁴⁰ Theodulf of Orleans distinguished between after the fortieth day of conception with a seven-year penance, and infanticide, with a fifteen-year penance. ¹⁴¹ Similarly, the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede distinguished between killing the child in the womb (carrying a one-year penance before quickening and three-year penance after this point) and after the birth (carrying a ten- or twelve-year penance). ¹⁴²

Where infanticide had occurred ecclesiastics took into account women's economic circumstances. The Penitential of Theodore had given a seven-year penance, rather than fifteen, to a paupercula who killed her child ¹⁴³. Similarly, the Excarpsus Cummeani differentiated between a mulier and a pauperina ¹⁴⁴ and the Merseburg Penitential between a mater and a pauperina. ¹⁴⁵ The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede stated that if a woman killed her child after it was born as opposed to when it was in the womb the crime should be treated like homicide; but for a paupercula who had committed the crime pro difficultate nutriendi or even on account of fornication her penance was less. ¹⁴⁶ These extenuating circumstances were also accepted by the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore ¹⁴⁷ and

¹³⁹ Wasserschleben, c.VI,4,pp.586-87.

¹⁴⁰ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.65,p.240.

¹⁴¹ MGH Capit. Episc.,II,c.X,17,p.177; although in the same canon Theodulf gave a fourteen-year penance for a woman quae partum necat suum, see n.124 above.

¹⁴² Wasserschleben, c.31,p.255.

¹⁴³ Unless this was homicide which merited a ten-year penance; Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.XIV,25-26,p.200. This is repeated in the insular Confessional of Egbert [Wasserschleben, c.31,p.313] and the Frankish Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore [Wasserschleben, c.VI,7,8,p.587].

¹⁴⁴ Wasserschleben, c.VI,9,10,p.479.

¹⁴⁵ Wasserschleben, c.162,163,p.407.

¹⁴⁶ Wasserschleben, c.XIV,1,pp.265-66.

¹⁴⁷ Wasserschleben, c.VI,4,p.587.

Regino of Prüm. ¹⁴⁸ These graded penances indicate non-noble behaviour. ¹⁴⁹ The fact that women were always referred to in the penitentials may not indicate real practice ¹⁵⁰ but rather clerical expectation of women's more likely culpability.

The Merseburg Penitential recognised another extenuating circumstance. It stated that a woman who had been abducted by an enemy and unwillingly exposed the child or was unable to bring it up was not culpanda but she was to do penance. ¹⁵¹ These acknowledgements of a woman's circumstance reflects the development of a new definition of the crime of child-destruction which took account of intention. The Council of Mainz (852) stated that

"If anyone carelessly suffocates their child or smothers it with too much swaddling after it has been baptised, they should do forty days penance on bread and water,

¹⁴⁸ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.65,p.240.

¹⁴⁹ The extent of infanticide is difficult to ascertain. The disproportionate ratios of men and women in the St. Germain polyptych [135 males to 100 females] has been explained as evidencing a high degree of female infanticide; Emily Coleman, "L'infanticide dans le Haut Moyen Age", Annales [E.S.C.], 29, (1974), pp.315-335. Jean Verdon, came to similar conclusions concerning the Saint-Rémi polyptych stating that "l'infanticide en tout cas doit être admis par la mentalité mérovingienne"; "Les Femmes Laïques en Gaule au Temps des Mérovingiens: Les Réalités de la Vie Quotidienne", in W. Affeldt, (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalte, pp.240-61, at pp.240-41, However, Herlihy discounted this explanation for the St. Germain evidence, arguing that such an assumption is not paralleled in other records, a more likely explanation being that some men were listed twice and that some solitary females had "hidden" families; Medieval Households, pp.64-68.

¹⁵⁰ The Vita Balthildis describes how the saint forbade the "custom" of infanticide, apparently common in all ranks and committed by (non-gender-specific) homines: "Ordinavit etiam... ut et alia pessima et impia consuetudo cessaret, pro qua multo plures homines filios suos magis mori quam nutrire obtabant"; MGH SRM,2,c.6,p.488.

¹⁵¹ Wasserschleben, c.115,p.403. This canon, which also occurs in Italian penitentials, seems to be influenced by the writings of St. Basil; R. Manselli, "Vie familiale et éthique sexuelle dans les penitentiels" in G. Duby and J. Le Goff (eds.) Famille et Parenté dans l'Occident Médiéval [Collection de l'école française de Rome, 30] (Rome, 1977), pp.363-78, at pp.369-70.

pulses and vegetables and abstain from sex; afterwards for three years they should do penance on all the proper feastdays and during the three Lents. And if they suffocated the child before it had been baptised, they should do penance for forty days as above and afterwards the same but for five years".¹⁵²

This canon resulted from Hrabanus Maurus' response in 842 to Bishop Reginbald who had asked what action should be taken when a father or mother had killed a child and it was unclear whether it had been done deliberately.¹⁵³ Hrabanus replied that if the act was not the result of voluntas then the parents were to perform a consideratio pietatis, since although they were blameless they should realise it was a grave occurrence¹⁵⁴; he compared this to the more serious crime whereby women who had fornicated committed abortion as outlined by the Council of Ancyra. The reception of the Council of Mainz's canon was wide¹⁵⁵ including the Ecclesiastical Discipline.¹⁵⁶ The canon also occurs in the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede but where the other texts refer to quis which is not gender-specific, this text refers to quis vel qua but states that she should abstain from her husband.¹⁵⁷

The assumption that the parent in these circumstances was the mother was also made by Ratramnus of Corbie who wrote an exegesis on the Mainz canon.¹⁵⁸ Having repeated the

¹⁵² "Si quis infantem suum incaute oppresserit aut vestimentorum pondere suffocaverit post baptisma, proximos XL dies peniteat in pane et aqua et oleribus atque leguminibus et a coniugio se absteineat; postea III annos in penitentia exigat per legitimas ferias et III quadragesimas. Et si ante baptismum oppresserit infantem, proximos dies XL ut supra; postea vero quinquennium expleat"; MGH Conc. III,c.9,p.247.

¹⁵³ Schmitz, "Schuld und Strafe", pp.367-69.

¹⁵⁴ MGH Epp. Karol.,5,no.30,1.30-1.4,pp.449-50.

¹⁵⁵ Schmitz traced its dissemination into the writings of Burchard of Worms, Gratian, Alan of Lille, and Tancred of Bologna; "Schuld und Strafe", pp.370-72.

¹⁵⁶ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.60,pp.237-38.

¹⁵⁷ Wasserschleben, c.XV,1,p.266.

¹⁵⁸ Schmitz, "Schuld und Strafe"; text = pp.384-87.

canon which referred to guis Ratramnus referred to those women who involuntarily suffocated their children while sleeping with them. ¹⁵⁹ Ratramnus acknowledged that the crime was one of neglect but that did not mean penance could be evaded ¹⁶⁰; however, he indicated that the punishment should be light because the grief of a mother over the death of a child was not light. ¹⁶¹

The definition of specifically female intention was taken further in the Council of Worms (868) which linked abortion and infanticide. This stated that those women who deliberately killed their children in the womb should undoubtedly be judged as murderesses; but those women who slept with their children and suffocated them should be judged more leniently because it was not done willingly or knowingly. ¹⁶² This alongside the Mainz statement constitutes an important development since intention now defined the greater and lesser crime in child-destruction rather than a differentiation between before birth (which was also differentiated by before and after quickening) and after birth. ¹⁶³ This definition indicates that each individual case was assessed. Nevertheless it was women who were perceived as the main culprits whether the infanticide was involuntary or voluntary.

The development of the idea of intention can be seen in the penitentials. The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede gave a

¹⁵⁹ Schmitz, Ibid, 1.11-14, p.385.

¹⁶⁰ "ita quoque remissa neglegentia peccati culpam non effugit"; Schmitz, Ibid, 1.17-18, p.386.

¹⁶¹ "Verum illud peccatum, quod matres in mortibus infantum incurrisse potius quam patrasse deprehenduntur, levi debet iudicatione puniri, quoniam maternorum affectus viscerum non levi super interitu filii dolore quatiuntur"; Schmitz, Ibid, 1.53-56, p.387.

¹⁶² "Mulieres igitur, quae ante temporis plenitudinem conceptos utero infantes voluntate excutiunt, ut homicidae procul dubio iudicandae sunt. Illae vero, quae dormiendo filios suffocare videntur, leviter de his iudicare oportet, quia nolentes, et non sentiendo, ad hunc devolutae sunt casum"; Mansi 15, c.35, col.876.

¹⁶³ Schmitz, "Schuld und Strafe", p.377.

ten-year penance to a woman who killed her child ¹⁶⁴; whereas Regino of Prüm adds the term voluntarie for the same crime presumably to differentiate this from accidental deaths. ¹⁶⁵ The St. Hubert Penitential gave three years to quis for suffocating a child, which was reduced to two years if it was unwillingly done.¹⁶⁶ However, paradoxically, the same penitential gave three years to quis cum uxore who suffocated a child, and five if it was done while drunk or through negligence. ¹⁶⁷

Regino indicates how women committed intentional infanticide - by drowning or burying the child.¹⁶⁸ Despite the invective against fornicating women who aborted their children, Regino demonstrates that the Church not only prescribed against such women but attempted to provide solutions for them: he stated that if a femina had been secretly corrupted but did not wish to kill the child she should leave the child at the church doors so that the priest could give it to be brought up by one of the fideles and in this way the woman would avoid the crime of homicide. ¹⁶⁹

As far as involuntary infanticide was concerned

¹⁶⁴ Wasserschleben, c.XIV,2,p.266.

¹⁶⁵ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.66,p.240. Voluntarie is also used in later ninth-century penitentials in relation to abortion; Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore, Wasserschleben, c.VI,5, p.587.

¹⁶⁶ Wasserschleben, c.50,p.384.

¹⁶⁷ Wasserschleben, c.19,p.380. Wasserschleben queried the figure five; but as it stands this canon seems to punish involuntary infanticide more heavily.

¹⁶⁸ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.67,pp.240-41. A ten-year penance is again given. Drowning as a method of infanticide was referred to in the Vita Leobae; see p.113 above. See also P. Riché, Daily Life in the World of Charlemagne [trans. J.-A. McNamara], (Liverpool, 1978), pp.49-52.

¹⁶⁹ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.68,p.241.

suffocation was the usual cause. ¹⁷⁰ In the circumstance of a child's suffocation, some penitentials non-specifically refer to guis ¹⁷¹ or laicus ¹⁷², or sometimes to both guis and/or uxor. ¹⁷³ Other texts, as we have noted, specifically refer to women. ¹⁷⁴ That women were perceived in a particular way is confirmed by the differing penances given to men and women. Theodulf of Orleans stated that a woman who slept with her child and suffocated it had six years penance; a man, if it occurred in his house, should do four years but if it occurred in the same bed he should do the same penance - two years on bread and water and the remaining four as the priest saw fit. ¹⁷⁵ This was repeated by Benedictus Levita ¹⁷⁶, Isaac of Langres ¹⁷⁷ and Herard of Tours. ¹⁷⁸

This different treatment of men and women suggests that clerics regarded women as the more likely parent to suffocate a child. That children did sleep with their mothers, thereby running this risk, is illustrated by a late ninth-century episcopal statute from Rheims which prescribed against women sleeping with their children lest

¹⁷⁰ As in the Council of Mainz (852) [n.152 above]; the Penitential of Pseudo-Bede [Wasserschleben, c.I,29, p.255]; the St. Hubert Penitential [Wasserschleben, c.19, 50, pp.380,384.]; the Excarpsus Cummeani [Wasserschleben, c.VI,20,p.479]; Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.60, pp.237-38.

¹⁷¹ The St. Hubert Penitential, Wasserschleben c.50,p.384. Gamer and McNeill translate this as "she" [Medieval Handbooks of Penance, p.293] when guis is, technically, gender-free.

¹⁷² Excarpsus Cummeani, Wasserschleben, c.VI,20,p.479.

¹⁷³ guis aut uxor; Merseburg Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.18,p.393. In the Paris Penitential this is clericus vel uxor; Wasserschleben, c.11,p.413.

¹⁷⁴ Ratramnus of Corbie, n.159,161 above; the Council of Worms (868), n.162 above.

¹⁷⁵ MGH Capit. Episc., II,c.X,4,p.162.

¹⁷⁶ PL97,Bk.III,c.381,col.846A.

¹⁷⁷ PL124,c.II,14,col.1087D.

¹⁷⁸ PL121,c.88,col.770.

accidentally, as it often happens, they should be suffocated through the devil's craftiness.¹⁷⁹ It has been argued that this is evidence for a greater conversance with the habits of a primitive society.¹⁸⁰ It also demonstrates an attempt at prevention possibly in view of the difficulties of deciding on intention in such cases. The assumption that women were more likely to suffocate their children may indicate misogyny, women being deemed more culpable and a greater degree of care being expected of them; but it probably reflects actual sleeping practices amongst all social ranks.

[III] Perceptions of "Maternitas".

The Council of Mainz (852) not only clarified a definition of intention in infanticide but also differentiated greater and lesser degrees of culpability depending on whether or not the child was baptised.¹⁸¹ The insular Penitential of Vinnian had given a one-year penance to guis in this instance.¹⁸² the Frankish Merseburg¹⁸³ and Paris Penitentials¹⁸⁴ similarly gave guis a three-year penance. The insular Penitential of Bede referred to a parens whose child had died unbaptised¹⁸⁵; and Theodulf of Orleans prescribed a years' penance to parentes if their child died unbaptised.¹⁸⁶ The Bigotian Penitential specifically referred to the mother or the

¹⁷⁹ "Ut mulieres infantes suos secum dormire non permittant, ne forte - quod frequenter contigit - insidiante diabolo suffocentur"; Vat. Ottob. 261., c.25, p.585.

¹⁸⁰ McKitterick, The Frankish Church, pp.73-74.

¹⁸¹ See n.152 above.

¹⁸² Wasserschleben, c.47, p.118. The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede was similarly non-gender-specific; Wasserschleben, c.32, p.255.

¹⁸³ Wasserschleben, c.61, p.397.

¹⁸⁴ Wasserschleben, c.47, p.416.

¹⁸⁵ Wasserschleben, c.III, 40, p.224.

¹⁸⁶ MGH Capit. Episc., II, c.X, 17, p.177.

father. ¹⁸⁷ Neither parentes nor guis in these instances are gender-specific. However, Regino of Prüm, quoting from Hrabanus' reply to Reginbald, referred to a child who died because of the mother or father but who was unbaptised because of the mother's neglect. ¹⁸⁸ The Penitential of Pseudo-Bede also gave a year's penance to a femina whose child died unbaptised. ¹⁸⁹ Clearly it was assumed that mothers had a particular responsibility for a child's baptism. ¹⁹⁰

A spiritual duty of care was not only the responsibility of natural mothers; women also sponsored children at baptism and confirmation. ¹⁹¹ Evidence for godmothers and co-mothers comes mainly from the prescriptions concerning incest. ¹⁹² Legislative references to godparents in the context of baptism or confirmation usually refer to male sponsors. Haito of Basle uses the non-gender-specific sponsores to describe the sponsors of girls and boys. ¹⁹³ The Councils of Arles ¹⁹⁴ and Mainz (813) ¹⁹⁵ stated that parentes, patrini and compadres should instruct their

¹⁸⁷ Wasserschleben, c.XI,1,p.451.

¹⁸⁸ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.61,p.238. The prescription specifically against mothers not having their children baptised is repeated in Bk.1,c.130,p.82.

¹⁸⁹ Wasserschleben, c.XVII,p.266.

¹⁹⁰ That mothers took on this role may partly explain the injunction against mothers sponsoring their own children at baptism and at confirmation; pp.286-87 above.

¹⁹¹ These two separate events had different sponsors. This was part of the strategy to increase the number of spiritual kinsmen, as was the development of sponsors at the rite of catechismus; Lynch, Godparents and Kinship, pp.210-14.

¹⁹² See pp.284-88 above.

¹⁹³ MGH Capit. Episc.,c.25,p.219.

¹⁹⁴ "Ut parentes filios et patrini eos quos de fonte lavacri suscipiunt erudire summo opere studeant..."; MGH Conc. II i,c.19, p.252.

¹⁹⁵ "Deinde praecipimus ut unusquisque compater vel proximi spiritalis filiolos suos catholice instruant"; MGH Conc. II i, c.47,p.272.

spiritual children in the Christian faith. Herard of Tours enjoined patres and patrini to educate and nurture their charges, the first because they were fathers and the second because they were fideles.¹⁹⁶ Rodulf of Bourges also only referred to patrini¹⁹⁷ as did the Admonitio Synodalis which instructed patrini to teach their spiritual charges or have them taught.¹⁹⁸ This last may demonstrate that references to godparents and spiritual kin usually concern the nobility.

While Frankish ecclesiastics usually wrote from the male perspective Gherbald of Liège referred to patrini et matrinae who had the responsibility of instructing their charges in the faith.¹⁹⁹ Also, an anonymous episcopal statute stated that neither men nor women who who could not remember the Creed and the Lord's prayer could sponsor children at the font.²⁰⁰ Matrinae are also referred to in liturgical rubric²⁰¹ and they had a role specifically for the girls they were sponsoring.²⁰² In the Sacramentary of

¹⁹⁶ PL121,c.27,col.766.

¹⁹⁷ MGH Capit. Episc.,c.23,pp.250-51.

¹⁹⁸ Admonitio Synodalis, c.79,p.64.

¹⁹⁹ "ut si patrini et matrinae qui infantes de fonte suscipiunt sive masculos sive feminas... filios et filias suas spiritalis quos et quas de fonte susceperunt pleniter instructos habeant de fide de qua pro eis fideiussores exstiterunt"; MGH Capit. Episc.,II,c.3,p.26.

²⁰⁰ "Annuntient presbyteri ut neque viri neque feminae de sacro fonte filiolos vel filiolas suscipiant, si non memoriter symbolum et Orationem Dominicam tenuerit"; Laon MS 201,PL89,c.26,col.822.

²⁰¹ The Sacramentary of Gellone refers to the godfathers and godmothers' duties: "Et signant ipsius infantes in frontibus eorum patrini vel matrinae de pollicibus suis dicentes; Sac. Gellon.,2226,p.314. Matrinae are also mentioned in the PRG; PRG II,94,102,pp.26-27.

²⁰² Men sponsoring boys and women girls at baptism may not have been copied at confirmation; the Anonymous of Trier, in relation to the question of spiritual incest [see ch.5 above n.303], referred to women sponsoring their own sons at confirmation and their daughters at baptism; "eas quarum filios tenuerunt ad manum episcopi ad confirmationem vel illarum filias, quas ad baptismum seu

Gellone the baptismal prayers were gender-specific with different prayers said first over the masculi and then over the feminae.²⁰³ In each instance before the boys' benediction the rubric states et signant patrini ut prius²⁰⁴; the rubric then states Item super feminas similiter.²⁰⁵ Thus although matrinae are not specifically referred to on each occasion their role is implied. Godmothers and mothers were also involved in offering the oblation²⁰⁶, and in reciting the names of those being baptised.²⁰⁷ The women also had to answer for their faith on behalf of their spiritual charges.²⁰⁸ Thus while Lynch described the spiritual parent as exercising paternitas²⁰⁹ there clearly was a specific role for women as mothers and godmothers in the exercise of spiritual maternitas.²¹⁰

Evidence for women carrying out the spiritual care of their children is sparse and limited to royal and noblewomen like Dhuoda.²¹¹ However, it has been argued

ad manum habuerunt episcopi"; MGH Capit. Episc., c.8, p.56.

²⁰³ In the baptismal rite [Sac. Gellon., 2215-2348, pp.312-40] a series of benedictions over the masculi [2217, 2218, 2219, 2228, 2229, 2233, 2234, 2238, 2242, 2281, 2282] is paralleled by a set said over the feminae [2220, 2231, 2236, 2240, 2243, 2283].

²⁰⁴ Sac. Gellon., 2232, 2237, pp.315-16.

²⁰⁵ Sac. Gellon., 2235, 2239, pp.315, 316.

²⁰⁶ "Et offeruntur oblationis a parentibus vel ab his qui eos sucepturi sunt"; Sac. Gellon., 2248, p.318.

²⁰⁷ "Et recitantur nomina virorum hac mulierum qui ipsius infantes sucepturi sunt, ab eo a quibus scripti sunt"; Sac. Gellon., 2251, p.318.

²⁰⁸ Sac. Gellon., 2283, p.327.

²⁰⁹ Lynch, Godparents and Kinship, pp.169-92.

²¹⁰ The development of this role in the ninth century can be seen in the Vitae Balthildis. While the A Vita refers to Balthild's filiola, the B Vita expands this description: "Quam ex fonte sacri baptismatis susceperat"; MGH SRM, 2, c.14, p.500.

²¹¹ But on the hidden value of this female role in the "foyer domestique" see Nelson, "Les femmes et l'évangélisation au IXe siècle", pp.475-78; and on the

that the specula coniugatorum in outlining the reciprocal duties of husbands and wives as a sacramentum contributed to in a more positive view of women. ²¹² Both men and women had the responsibility of spiritually nourishing their children according to Jonas of Orleans. ²¹³ The Council of Meaux/Paris (845/6) enjoined both viri potentes and especially (maxime) potentes femine to root out adultery, the sin of concubinage and incestuous adultery in their households, and to make sure that everyone in their care led a virtuous life, frequently repeating the Creed and the Lord's Prayer. ²¹⁴ Jonas of Orleans similarly, specifically referred to nobiles matronae who were responsible for the pastoral welfare of their households. ²¹⁵

Toubert argued that this valorisation of women within marriage provided an alternative model to the hagiographical virginal virago. ²¹⁶ But the two images were not mutually exclusive. As we have noted the hagiographer of the Vita Liutbirgae takes care to root the saint within a monastic context even in her secular setting. ²¹⁷ However, saints had multiple images imposed upon them so that no contradiction was involved when Liutbirga was also described as the ultimate materfamilias. She took care of the physical and moral needs of Bernhard's household including the education of

education of noblewomen who "may well have customarily played a part in the instruction of their children"; McKitterick, The Carolingians, pp.223-27

²¹² Toubert, "La théorie du mariage", p.259.

²¹³ PL106, Bk.2, c.14, cols.192-195; and see ch.6 above, n.133.

²¹⁴ MGH Conc. III, c.77, p.124.

²¹⁵ "Qualem autem sollicitudinem et curam erga subiectam sibi domum huiusmodi exhibere debeant, sequentia docent"; PL106, Bk.2, c.16, col.197.

²¹⁶ Toubert, "La théorie du mariage", p.259.

²¹⁷ See p.190 above.

his children. ²¹⁸ Thus the virgin Liutbirga, described as virago, could exhibit the value of maternitas.

Corbet argued that "l'ideal féminin saxon [was] mater et non virago"; that the tenth-century Ottonian women saints he looked at were completely feminine, valorised as the mothers of future kings, while the virago image was not projected onto them. ²¹⁹ Earlier non-Saxon examples of this image can be found in the ninth century in the hagiographer's depiction of Chrothildis. ²²⁰ However, Corbet's analysis is perhaps more accurately applied to later saints from the dynasty itself ²²¹ since Liutbirga, who is an earlier Saxon example of female sanctity, demonstrates that the images of virago and mother need not preclude each other. The Saxon virgin Hathumoda, an early antecedent of the Ottonians, also displayed maternal affection. ²²² Corbet is slightly misleading in so far as he implies that an image of total femininity must exclude the virago image: his use of the term femininity seems to be synonymous with biological maternity - a somewhat limited use of gender analysis. For the virago image, suggesting the overcoming of what male ecclesiastics regarded as female weakness, need not exclude maternitas in a wider sense.

This is highlighted by Huchald's description of St. Rictrude:

"surgit et non trepide sed constanter, non tepide sed ferventer, non segniter sed sagaciter, non muliebriter sed viriliter, quod conceperat mente, perficit opere". ²²³

However, her feminine qualities as a wife have already

²¹⁸ Vita Liutbirgae, c.8,9,pp.15-16; pp.188-89 above.

²¹⁹ Les saints ottoniens, pp.262-63.

²²⁰ See pp.329-30 above.

²²¹ But Portmann noted that Gisela, wife of Conrad II, was described as a virago in the Vita Chuonradis [MGH SS,11,c.4, p.261]; Die Darstellung der Frau, p.21-22.

²²² See p.185 above.

²²³ Vita Rictrudis, PL132,c.8,col.836C/D.

been described by Hucbald ²²⁴, as has the fact that her marriage was blessed with children. ²²⁵ Although she is a virago Rictrude is also described as a caring mother in two instances; when her son is miraculously unharmed after a horse reared ²²⁶ and also when her daughter Adalsinda died. In this last instance Hucbald described Rictrude as delaying the demonstration of her grief for three days when her daughter died on Christmas Day:

"virilis tamen quod ei inerat animi robur superavit affectum, nec passa est sibi dominari luctum mortis filiae, vel esse ibi locum tristiae, ubi natalis celebratur vitae". ²²⁷

Rictrude is portrayed with the qualities of a good nun. ²²⁸ However, it is significant that prudens Rictrude delayed the expression of her grief until Holy Innocents' Day, because then, as she is made to say, she could more readily identify with those holy mothers. ²²⁹ Her monastic duties did not push her maternitas to one side; rather the story shows how the liturgy could also provide properly for her needs as a mother.

Hagiography also demonstrated the rewards for maternitas. Sadalberga is likened to Helena, the mother of the Emperor Constantine. ²³⁰ Sadalberga became an abbess, but the comparison to Helena is made not because

²²⁴ PL132, c.5, cols.833-34.

²²⁵ PL132, c.6, cols.834-36.

²²⁶ Hucbald described the mother's relief: "at mater tandem recepto spiritu filium quoque recepit sanum, et in ulnis levavit ridentum"; PL132, c.14, col.841B.

²²⁷ "However, the firmness of a masculine mind which existed within her conquered her feelings, nor did she allow grief for her daughter's death to dominate her nor there to be a place of sadness where the birthday of life was being celebrated"; PL132, c.13, cols.839-40.

²²⁸ Henri Platelle, "Le thème de la conversion à travers les oeuvres hagiographiques d'Hucbald de Saint-Amand", Revue du Nord, 68, (1986), pp.511-31, at p.521.

²²⁹ "me autem exemplo dominarum mearum, matrum scilicet sanctissimorum puerorum innocentium, quarum hodierna die ploratus et ululatus auditus est multus"; PL132, c.13, col.840B.

²³⁰ Vita Sadalbergae; MGH SRM, 5, c.25, p.64.

Sadalberga was a sancta mater only in the monastic sense, but because like Helena who converted her son to Christianity, Sadalberga converted her family to monasticism before she herself decided to enter a convent.²³¹ This dual theme of biological and spiritual maternitas is also to be found in the Vita Odiliae. The good mother is represented in the saint's own mother who saved her daughter from death.²³² She is described as good wife because she carried out Christian works although bound by the conjugal law.²³³ However, she did not physically nurture her daughter herself; she entrusted this task to a female servant.²³⁴ This sagax nutrix was later seen to be rewarded for her diligent care of the saint. For, after a period of eighty years after she had died, her tomb was opened up and it was discovered that the body had rotted away except for the right breast which was entirely uncorrupted; this taken as was proof that this nutrix was in heaven on account of Odilia's piety.²³⁵ There could be no stronger demonstration of the rewards for maternitas.

This story implies that noblewomen used wetnurses. Wulfad of Bourges stated that noblewomen should not hand their children over to ancillae but feed them themselves.²³⁶ This injunction on breastfeeding immediately follows a prescription on the importance of each Christian taking

²³¹ See p.330 above.

²³² See p.157 above.

²³³ "Quae quamquam lege coniugali ligata foret, tamen elemosinis et ceteris iustitiae operibus dedita"; MGH SRM, 6,c.2,p.38.

²³⁴ MGH, Ibid, c.4,p.39.

²³⁵ MGH, Ibid, c.10,pp.42-43.

²³⁶ "Consulimus itaque precamur quoque feminas nobiliores et alias quascumque, ut filios suos proprio lacte nutrant et nullatenus eos ancillis aliis ad educandum tradant"; MGH Epp. Karol., 6,1.32-34,p.191.

communion ²³⁷; physical nurturing was, so Wulfad implies, part of a spiritual relationship between mother and child just as the Christian had a spiritual relationship with God when he/she took communion. This was only an analogy however; rubric in the Sacramentary of Gellone's baptismal liturgy stated that children should not be breastfed before the eucharist. ²³⁸ However, the PRG did allow it if necessary. ²³⁹

In other aspects of child-care women were regarded as having particular responsibilities. It is significant that in the penitentials, while the many variant incestuous relationships are mentioned, the parental/child type is usually described as a mother with her little son. The Penitential of Theodore had given a three-year penance to a mother who committed incest with her parvulus. ²⁴⁰ This is repeated in the Penitentials of Bede ²⁴¹, and Pseudo-Bede. ²⁴² Father/daughter incest is more rarely referred to. It only occurs in the Penitential of Egbert which gives a seven-year penance. ²⁴³ This is noteworthy, in view of clerics' tendency to write about sexual relations

²³⁷ "Vidat ergo unusquisque, ut digne et munde et devote communionem Christi percipiat; quoniam qui corpus Domini et sanguinem indigne sumit, iudicium sibi manducat et bibit"; MGH Epp. Karol., 6, 1.30-32, p.191.

²³⁸ All communicants were supposed to fast before communion: "Post hoc ingrediuntur ad missas et communicant omnes, illut autem previdentes ut postquam baptizati fuerint, nullum cibum accipiant nec ablactentur antea quam communicent sacramenta corpus christi"; Sac. Gellon., 2328, p.337.

²³⁹ "Qui etiam non prohibentur lactari ante sanctam communionem, si necesse fuerit"; PRG II, 37, p.163.

²⁴⁰ Wasserschleben, Bk.1, c.II, 20, p.186.

²⁴¹ Wasserschleben, c.III, 29, p.223. This gives two years penance plus the three Lents of sexual abstinence.

²⁴² Wasserschleben, c.II, 2, p.260.

²⁴³ Wasserschleben, c.IV, 4, p.234. Incest with a step-daughter is not included as this concerned the issue of prohibited consanguinous unions; see ch.5 above, pp. Payer failed to comment on the specific slant of these references to incest within the nuclear family; Sex and the Penitentials, pp.30-32.

from the male perspective.²⁴⁴ In view of the fact that father/daughter incest is the most prevalent type of incest in most societies, that it is mentioned comparatively rarely in our sources does not necessarily indicate that it occurred less often than mother/son incest.²⁴⁵ Dhuoda's definition of a religion based on the father-figure²⁴⁶ was probably not unique to her. There may have been an unwillingness to acknowledge the father/daughter type of incest, while misogyny allowed more frequent condemnation of the mother/son variety.

While mothers were perceived as having a special duty of care for their children it was not deemed acceptable to cure sick children by resorting to non-Christian practices. The penitentials never refer to fathers procuring cures for their children since it was women who were perceived to have greater access to such methods. The insular Penitentials of Theodore²⁴⁷ and Egbert²⁴⁸, and the Confessional of Egbert²⁴⁹ condemned a woman who put her daughter on the roof or in an oven to cure a fever. These methods are condemned in Frankish texts for both sons and daughters in the Merseburg Penitential²⁵⁰, the

²⁴⁴ See pp.318-27 above.

²⁴⁵ Manselli argued that the longer penance for father-daughter also showed that it was a rare occurrence; "Vie famille et éthique sexuelle dans les pénitentiels", p.370.

²⁴⁶ "deinde ama, time, et dilige patrem tuum; scitoque, ex illo tuus in saeculo processit status. Scias enim quia ab antiquiis temporibus qui dilexerunt patres et illis veraciter obedientes fuerunt, benedictionem a Deo ab illis accipere meruerunt"; Riché, Manuel, c.III,2,1.17-21, pp.140-42. Manselli also comments on the legal dominance of the father in family-life but does not link this to the paradoxical near-silence on father/daughter incest; "Vie famille et éthique sexuelle dans les pénitentiels", p.366.

²⁴⁷ Wasserschleben, Bk.1, c.XV, 2, p.200.

²⁴⁸ Wasserschleben, c.VIII, 2, p.239.

²⁴⁹ Wasserschleben, c.33, p.313.

²⁵⁰ Wasserschleben, c.99, p.401.

Excarpsus Cummeani ²⁵¹, by Hrabanus Maurus ²⁵² and Regino of Prüm. ²⁵³ The Vindobonense Penitential referred to a woman putting a child over her breastbone or a well.²⁵⁴ These methods were condemned because they were associated with magic, a "competing system of practice, a rival to Christian ways of coping with adversity". ²⁵⁵ Hence the Penitential of Pseudo-Egbert condemned a woman who cured a child with veneficium since id magnus est paganismus.²⁵⁶ The liturgy, in the form of the new rites of anointing the sick were an acceptable alternative. The other alternative was to appeal to a saint; the Miracula Waldburgis, for instance, describes mothers bringing sick children to Monheim. ²⁵⁷

The expected reciprocal duties of husbands and wives were paralleled by those of children and parents. ²⁵⁸ Jonas includes a short treatise on the fifth commandment that children should honour their parents. ²⁵⁹ Theodulf of Orleans also required children to honour their parents; but he imposed a penance on parents who beat their

²⁵¹ Wasserschleben, c.VII,14,p.482.

²⁵² Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum; PL110,c.30,col.491.

²⁵³ Ecclesiastical Discipline, Bk.2,c.368,p.353.

²⁵⁴ Wasserschleben, c.79,p.421.

²⁵⁵ R. Kieckhefer, Magic in the Middle Ages, (Cambridge, 1989), p.39.

²⁵⁶ Wasserschleben, Bk.4,c.20,p.335.

²⁵⁷ Miracula Waldburgis: Bk.I,9,p.164; Bk.I,13, pp.170-71; Bk.IV,5,p.314; Bk.II,4,pp.214-20. This last describes how a mother having lost a son gave full vent to her grief: "heu me, tantum quia partitutam dolorem sinus matris exposuit! Heu me, quia nivei pudoris honestatem mihi thorus cubitalis ademit. Heu me, qua dum dolorem matris parientes prodiens dempsi et ipsa mater effecta in memet eundem dolorem pariendi retorsi"; she then lost two more sons and when the fourth became ill she prayed to Waldburgis who effected his recovery. Only one miracle in this collection involved a father bringing his daughter; Miracula Waldburgis, Bk.IV,8,p.320.

²⁵⁸ On this theme in the specula see Toubert, "La théorie du mariage", pp.262-64.

²⁵⁹ PL106,Bk.2,c.15,cols.195-96.

children in anger. ²⁶⁰ Rodulf of Bourges included a similar injunction. ²⁶¹ The good parent, like the good spouse, was in a reciprocal relationship. The Christian parent's duty lay in rejecting practices which threatened the sacramentum of marriage such as contraception/abortion or infanticide ²⁶²; thus marriage was for proles who became a part of the societas, in its meaning both as the marriage and the wider Christian community, by being given a Christian upbringing. Yet clearly, with regard to these duties women were perceived to carry a greater burden of responsibility.

²⁶⁰ MGH Capit. Episc., I, c.33, p.131. This is based on Ephesians, vi,4.

²⁶¹ MGH Capit. Episc., c.23, p.251.

²⁶² Toubert, "La théorie du mariage", pp.262-64.

RELIGIOUS AND SECULAR: WOMEN AS A GENDER.

For organisational purposes this study, up to this point, has been split into two parts - the first examining women who followed a religious life and the second, secular women. However, this has only been a provisional strategy. While this construction has proved useful and has been used by previous studies ¹, it is necessary to go beyond it.

It has been demonstrated that the religious/secular dichotomy was not hard and fast for the ninth century at least for women in higher social strata. As matresfamilias, the abbess and the noble matron shared the practical and spiritual duty of care over their charges. Married noblewomen, as widows, often took up a religious life. Their religious households may have been quite similar to house convents. Young canonesses, having been educated in a convent, might leave to marry, or were abducted. Religious women in convents, especially some abbesses, were drawn into the outside world; and secular women entered convents especially as pilgrims to shrines. Yet, apart perhaps from this last category, much of this study has principally concerned noblewomen - again, a focus resulting from the nature of the sources.

There is another important reason for not applying too rigorous a dividing line between secular and religious women, and this is a consideration which transcends status: namely, that all women were, and in Roman Catholicism are, lay. Whilst other criteria crosscut it, gender has proved useful as a means of analysing social and power relationships, and highlighting contradictions in the ways in which women were perceived - particularly in the case of roles which, in part, transcended perceptions of gender: those of abbess and female saint for instance. Another kind of ambiguity is

¹ As in the subtitle, Marriage and the Cloister; Wemple, Women.

evident when the idea of maternity is cut loose from its biological anchorage, as when applied to women other than natural mothers. Gender as "a social category imposed on a sexed body" ² explains the way Frankish clerics categorised all women as such, whatever their age, status, marital position, or whether they were religious or secular. Women were perceived as a "sexed body", and consequently regarded as one single social group. This was fundamentally defined in terms of women's physical nature and its impurity which threatened all men but especially priests.

Married women were not threatening simply in the sense that they were participants in the sexual act. Men, including clerics, could be contaminated in this way, hence the concern about nocturnal emissions. ³ But men were advised on the means of purification ⁴ and, more important, were not obliged by their bodies to be "impure" in this way. Women, by contrast, were uniquely and specifically contaminated and contaminating as a result of their physical nature. This did not just include women who had sexual relationships and had children - although the impurity of pregnancy and childbirth was emphasised for such women through sexual abstinence and their post partum

² Scott, "Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis", pp.1056-57.

³ Most of the penitentials have greater and lesser comparative penances for voluntary and involuntary emissions; for example, the Penitential of Egbert, *Wasserschleben*, c.IX,9,10,p.241. This text's inclusion of a longer penance for such emissions in the dormitory [*Wasserschleben*, c.IX,11,p.241] indicates that these "offences" had their monastic context. They are a preoccupation in such widely-read literature as the Collationes of Cassian; they recur in the ninth-century ascetic practice of Gerald of Aurillac; and in tenth-century Cluniac spirituality.

⁴ Ruotger of Trier's admonition that men should wash their clothes as well as their bodies after sex and prior to going to church indicates a ritual of purification rather than just a practical instruction; see ch.6,n.184.

exclusion from church.⁵ This fear of impurity also extended to women religious. In patristic thought, women's natural bodily state was perceived to be representative of things temporal: this was one major reason why women could never be part of the sacerdotal order.⁶ Hence the force of gender, in this respect, necessitates a consideration of women beyond the somewhat constraining categorisation of religious and secular.

In the ninth century these attitudes were expressed in two main prohibitions: first, those forbidding women to enter a church when they were menstruating; and second, forbidding all women from physical contact with the priest and the sanctuary.

As far as the first prohibition was concerned there was some inconsistency amongst the prescriptive sources. The early insular Penitential of Theodore which gave a three-week fast to women, both a sanctimonialis and a laica, who entered a church or communicated during menstruation⁷ was followed by one group of Frankish penitentials.⁸ However,

⁵ See p.345 above. The post partum period ultimately became a churching ceremony. Links with ninth-century clerics' attitudes can be seen in the development of the rite in the early modern period which "focused more directly on the woman and perhaps her uncleanness and ultimate purification"; William Coster, "Purity, Profanity and Puritanism", p.383. The Puritan shift away from the rite's "penitential trappings", especially the wearing of a veil, signifying that the woman required purification, indicated a line of thought that childbirth was perfectly natural, and within marriage, a positive good; whereas Lutheranism had tolerated it as a necessary evil; Coster, Ibid, pp.384-87.

⁶ Demyttenaere, "The Cleric, Women and the Stain", pp.144-46.

⁷ Wasserschleben, Bk.1, c.XIV, 17, p.199. The Confessional of Egbert gave a twenty-day penance; Wasserschleben, c.XX, 28, p.312.

⁸ The Bigotian Penitential, Wasserschleben, c.VIII, 1, p.450; the Excarpsus Cummeani; Wasserschleben, c.III, 14, p.472; and the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore, Wasserschleben, c.II, 8, p.577.

the Martinian ⁹ and Merseburg ¹⁰ Penitentials followed the responses of Pope Gregory to Augustine in allowing menstruating women in church. While Gregory allowed women in church in such circumstances, the spirit of his answer was that women, who were not intentionally impure, were to be commended for recognising their residual impurity and abstaining. ¹¹ In the ninth century Jonas of Orleans decided that women's impurity should be more formally recognised:

"in many provinces (menstruating women) keep themselves from entering the church on account of the uncleanness of the flesh. It is true that Pope Gregory taught that these prohibitions were to be understood in a spiritual way; however, there is nothing wrong, or impure or contrary to the spiritual understanding in observing the custom literally as the first Christians did". ¹²

Thus, while Gregory allowed women to decide their course of action, Jonas and the majority of the Frankish penitentials did not give women this choice.

The second prohibition barring all women from going near the priest and the sanctuary was linked to the prohibition concerning menstruation since although "it was originally the pollution of blood that was the danger, the difficulty of knowing when women were seasonally affected in this way rendered them perennially suspect". ¹³ Prescriptions stated that priests should not have women, either lay or religious, in their homes ¹⁴; priests were even prohibited

⁹ Wasserschleben, c.66.1, pp.296-97.

¹⁰ Wasserschleben, c.89, p.400.

¹¹ Bede, Historia, I, c.27, p.92-4; and see Demyttenaere, "The Cleric, Women and the Stain", pp.159-60.

¹² De institutione laicali; PL106, Bk.2, c.11, cols.187-88.

¹³ Margaret Aston, "Segregation in Church", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.237-94, at p.244.

¹⁴ The Council of Friouli (796/7) [MGH Conc. II i, c.4, p.191]; the Councils of Rheims and Mainz (813) [MGH Conc. II i, c.22 and 49, pp.256,272]; the Councils of Meaux/Paris (845/6) [MGH Conc. III, c.26, p.102]; the Council of Mainz (852) [MGH Conc. III, c.7, p.245]; the Councils of Mainz and Metz (888) [Mansi 18, c.10 and 5, cols.67,79]. This prescription also occurs in the episcopal statutes of Theodulf of Orleans [MGH Capit.

against entertaining seniores (lords) since they were accompanied by women. ¹⁵ However, these statements formed part of the wider attempt to create a celibate priesthood. But female impurity was perceived to relate specifically to the sacred while the priest was exercising his primary sacerdotal function - singing the Mass. The laity in general were prohibited from encroaching on the unique nature of the sacerdotal order. Herard of Tours forbade laici from standing inside the cancellaria, the people's offerings were to be accepted outside. ¹⁶

But Herard specifically distinguishes women as a group within the laity: mulieres and laici were forbidden to touch the altar and the sacraments. ¹⁷ That women were regarded as a discrete, impure group is evidenced by the statutes of Theodulf of Orleans ¹⁸ and the Admonitio Synodalis ¹⁹ which followed the general prohibition of the Admonitio Generalis (789) against women going near the altar. ²⁰ Haito of Basle stated that neither mulieres nor Deo dicatae were to go near the altar or help with the ministry. ²¹ The Council of Paris (829) condemned women for impudently touching the altar or holy vessels and assisting the priest; the synodists exclaimed it was beyond belief that what was customarily forbidden by the Christian religion to laymen, women, whose sex by no means made them competent, could take it upon themselves to go

Episc., I, c.12, p.111]; Gherbald of Liège [MGH Capit. Episc., III, c.1, p.37]; Rodulf of Bourges [MGH Capit. Episc., c.16, p.245]; and Ruotger of Trier [MGH Capit. Episc., c.17, p.67].

¹⁵ Rodulf of Bourges; MGH Capit. Episc., c.9, pp.239-40. Ruotger of Trier; MGH Capit. Episc., c.8, p.64.

¹⁶ PL121, c.82, col.769.

¹⁷ PL121, c.24, col.766.

¹⁸ MGH Capit. Episc., I, c.6, p.107.

¹⁹ Admonitio Synodalis, c.20, p.45.

²⁰ MGH Capit. I, c.17, p.53.

²¹ MGH Capit. Episc., c.16, p.215.

against the law. ²²

Even within the role allowed to women, their participation was marginalised. While the liturgy made provision for women to make offerings, which we have noted in both the nuptial and baptismal liturgy, these oblations had to be handed over at the altar steps. The Penitential of Theodore had stated that mulieres were not allowed to touch the altar cloth, nor place the offerings or the chalice on the altar. ²³ Frankish penitentials such as the Merseburg Penitential ²⁴, the Judgement of Clement ²⁵, and the Penitential of Pseudo-Theodore ²⁶ repeated these stipulations. Similarly, Hauto of Basle stated that priests were to accept women's offerings outside the sanctuary. ²⁷

Some clerics allowed women to service the eucharistic paraphernalia but this role was also carefully prescribed: Hauto stated that priestly vestments to be washed by women were first to be removed from the sanctuary and only then handed over. ²⁸ But even this level of female participation proved too much for others: the anonymous Capitula Presbyterorum found the idea of women washing the

²² "Miranda sane res est, unde hisdem inlicitus in Christiana religione inrepserit usus, ut quod viris saecularibus inlicitum est, feminae, quarum sexui nullatenus competit, aliquando contra fas sibi licitum facere potuerint"; MGH Conc. II ii,c.45,p.639.

²³ Nor sit amongst the ordained men; Wasserschleben, Bk.1,c.VII,1,p.199. Theodore also stated that while the Greeks allowed women to make offerings the Romans did not; Wasserschleben, Bk.2,c.VII,4,p.209.

²⁴ Wasserschleben, c.123,p.403.

²⁵ Wasserschleben, c.13,p.434.

²⁶ Wasserschleben, c.XXXI,pp.616-17.

²⁷ MGH Capit. Episc.,c.16,p.215.

²⁸ MGH, Ibid.

altar cloth especially dreadful. ²⁹

Clearly, the threat posed by women to the Mass, the core of the sacred, was most feared. The Carolingian reforms sought to strengthen the special nature of the sacerdotal ordo which also excluded laymen. But laymen, unless physically handicapped (a significant proviso), had the opportunity, in theory, of acceding to the priesthood. Women by their gender never could; and their pollution could contaminate all men. Thus women were not only barred from the sanctuary, they were also segregated from the male laity. This is hinted at by Rodulf of Bourges who stated that women should stand "in their place". ³⁰ An incident in the Annals of St. Bertin in 858 also suggests that women were seated in a separate part of the church. ³¹ Thus even laymen were separated in church from female impurity.

Indicative of this perception of women as forever handicapped and always lay in the later medieval period, when there is more concrete evidence for women being segregated in church, are late fourteenth/early fifteenth century Italian pictorial representations of the women and the laity on the Virgin's left and the men and clergy on her right. ³² Ninth-century baptismal rubric also suggests that women stood on the left and men on the right. ³³ The baptismal liturgy follows this rubric with

²⁹ "Ut palla altaris non per feminam, quod maxime horret, sed per diaconum abluatur"; Capitula Presbyterorum, c.10, p.118.

³⁰ "Feminae autem missam sacerdote celebrante nequaquam ad altare accedant nec vasa sacra contingant, sed in locis suis stent"; MGH Capit. Episc., c.10, p.240.

³¹ "In pago Senonico in ecclesia sanctae Porcariae dei dominico celebrante missas presbytero, lupus subito introiens plebemque adsistentem discurrendo perturbans, tandem inter feminas indentidem faciens, disparuit": AB; MGH SRG, 5, p.49.

³² Aston, "Segregation in Church", p.271.

³³ "procedant ad ecclesiam et ordinantur per ordinem sicut scripti sunt, masculi ad dexteram, feminae ad sinistram; Sac. Gellon., 2303, p.231.

another stating that everyone, and this included parents and godparents who subsequently had to make responses, should gather around the font.³⁴ This is explicable if the font, as it is today, was at the furthest end of the church away from the altar near the church door. Women were allowed to participate in this ritual because it did not focus on the sanctuary as the Mass did.

This fundamental perception of women as forever separated, and threatening to the sacred, designated all women as a category apart. Already excluded from the ministry, women were not recognised as full members of the laity. This is reflected in modern scholarship. It is significant that the Studies in Church History volume devoted to "Women in the Church", and full of articles detailing women's informal grassroots contributions to Church ministry³⁵, follows another, "The Ministry: Clerical and Lay"³⁶ which contains not a single article on women's contribution. While this present study has attempted to look at women across the religious/secular divide, it is also principally source-based. Hence we are ultimately reliant on the views of Frankish clerics; and for them, whether women were virgins, widows or married, none was allowed to escape the disadvantage imposed on her by the perceived impurity of her physical nature.

³⁴ Sac. Gellon, 2312, p.332.

³⁵ SCH, 27, (1990).

³⁶ SCH, 26, (1989).

I. LEGISLATION.1. Royal Capitularies.

Capitularia regum Francorum, MGH Leges, sec. 2. Vol.1, A. Boretius (ed.); Vol 2, A. Boretius and V. Krause, (Hanover, 1883, 1897).

"Les Ordonnances de Louis le Pieux", Emile Lesne, (ed.), Revue d'Histoire de l'Eglise de France, 6, (1920), pp.445-93; text = pp.490-93.

2. Councils.

Concilia aevi Merovingici, MGH Leges, sec. 3, Concilia I, F. Maasen, (ed.), (Hanover, 1893).

Concilia aevi Karolini, MGH Leges, sec. 3, Concilia II, Vols 1-2, A Werminghoff (ed.); (Hanover, 1906, 1908).

Concilia aevi Karolini, MGH Leges, sec. 3, Concilia II, vol.3, [Die Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiches, (843-859)], W. Hartmann (ed.), (Hannover, 1984).

Sacrorum Conciliorum Nova et Amplissima Collectio [31 vols], J.-D. Mansi, (ed.), (Florence, 1757-98).

"Eine kleine Sammlung von Busstexten aus dem 9. Jahrhundert", W. Hartmann, (ed.), DA, 39 (1983), pp.207-13; text = pp.211-13.

3. Episcopal Statutes.

MGH Capitula Episcoporum, P. Brommer, (ed.), (Hanover, 1984)

[i] Known Authorship.

GHERBALD of Liège: Statuta I,II,III; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.3-42.

HAITO of Basle: Statuta; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.203-19.

HERARD of Tours: Capitula; PL121, cols.763-74.

HILDEGARD of Meaux: Statuta; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.194-99.

HINCMAR of Rheims: Capitula presbyteriis data anno 852; PL125, cols.773-778.

-----: Capitula; PL125, cols.777-92.

-----: Capitula in synodo Rhemis data anno 874; PL125, cols.795-800.

-----: Capitula archidiaconibus presbyteris

data; PL125, cols.799-804.

ISAAC of Langres: Canones; PL124, cols.1075-1110.

RICULF of Soissons: Statuta; PL131, cols.15-24.

RODULF of Bourges: Statuta; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.227-68.

RUOTGER of Trier: Statuta; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.57-70

THEODULF of Orleans: Capitula I,II; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.73-184.

WALTCAUDL of Liège: Statuta; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.43-49.

WALTER of Orleans: Statuta; MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.185-93.

WALTER of Sens: Statuta; PL132, cols.717-20.

WULFAD of Bourges: MGH Epp. Karol., 6, Epistolae variorum, no.27, E. Dümmler, (ed.), pp.188-92.

[ii] Anonymous Episcopal Statutes.

ADMONITIO SYNODALIS: "Une Admonitio Synodalis de l'époque carolingienne. Étude critique et édition", R. Amiet, (ed.), printed in Medieval Studies, 26, (1964), pp.12-82; text = 41-69.

ANONYMOUS of Freising: MS Clm.6241 printed in "Studien zu Benedictus Levita, II, Capitula episcopi cuiusdam Frisingensia, E. Seckel, (ed.), NA, 29, (1904), pp.287-94

ANONYMOUS of Trier: MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.53-56.

BENEDICTUS LEVITA: Capitularium collectio; PL97, cols.699-912.

CAPITULA FLORENTINA: MGH Capitula Episcoporum, pp.220-24.

CAPITULA PRESBYTERORUM: MS Clm.3851 printed in "Die Münchener Hs 3851, 3852, mit einer compilation von 181 Wormser Schlüssen", V. Krause, (ed.), NA, 19, (1894), pp.88-139; text = pp.117-18.

CLM 6333: MS Clm 6333 printed in "Die Texte der bayerischen Synodalstatuten von Reisbach und Freising", P.A. Dold, (ed.), DA, 8, (1950), pp.364-383; text = pp.368-76.

CODEx VAT. REGINAE CHRISTINAE 425 fol.103: Codex Vat. reginae Christinae 425 fol.103, printed in "Reise nach Italien im Jahre 1901", A. Werminghoff, (ed.), NA, 27, (1902), pp.588-89.

LAON MS 201: PL89, cols.821-24.

VAT. OTTOBONIANUS MS 261 fol.130-135: MS Vat. Ottobonianus 261 saeculi IX. X. fol. 130-135 printed in, "Reise nach Italien im Jahre 1901", A. Werminghoff, (ed.), NA, 27, (1902), pp.580-7.

II. PENITENTIALS.

Die Bussordnungen der abendländischen Kirchen, F.W.H. Wasserschleben, (ed.), (Halle, 1851).

PENITENTIAL OF BEDE: Poenitentiale Bedae, Wasserschleben, pp.220-30.

BIGOTIAN PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Bigotianum, Wasserschleben, pp.441-60.

BOBBIO PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Bobbiense, Wasserschleben, pp.407-12.

JUDGEMENT OF CLEMENT: Iudicium Clementis, Wasserschleben, pp.433-35.

PENITENTIAL OF COLUMBANUS: Poenitentiale Columbani, Wasserschleben, pp.353-60.

CONFESSIONAL OF EGBERT: Confessionale (Pseudo) Egberti: Wasserschleben, pp.300-18.

PENITENTIAL OF EGBERT: Poenitentiale Egberti, Wasserschleben, pp.231-47.

FLEURY PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Floriacense: Wasserschleben, pp.422-25.

HALITGAR OF CAMBRAI: Poenitentiale Pseudo-Romanum;
Book 6: Wasserschleben, pp.360-77; Books 1-5: PL105, cols.649-710.

HRABANUS MAURUS: Poenitentiale ad Otgarium, PL112, cols.1397-1424.

- - - - - : Poenitentiale ad Heribaldum, PL110, cols.467-94

ST. HUBERT PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Hubertense, Wasserschleben, pp.377-86.

MARTINIAN PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Martenianum, Wasserschleben, pp.282-300.

MERSEBURG PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Merseburgense [A], Wasserschleben, pp.387-407.

MERSEBURG [B] PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Merseburgense [B], Wasserschleben, pp.429-33.

PARIS PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Parisiense, Wasserschleben, pp.412-18.

PENITENTIAL OF PSEUDO-BEDE: Poenitentiale Pseudo-Bedae,
Wasserschleben, pp.248-82.

PSEUDO-CUMMEAN PENITENTIAL: Excarpsus Cummeani,
Wasserschleben, pp.460-93.

PENITENTIAL OF PSEUDO-EGBERT: Poenitentiale Pseudo-
Egberti, Wasserschleben, pp.318-48.

PENITENTIAL OF PSEUDO-THEODORE; Poenitentiale Pseudo-
Theodori, Wasserschleben, pp.566-622.

QUADRIPARTITUS: Book 4: E.L. Richter, Antiqua canonum
collectio qua in Libri de synodalibus causis compilandis
usus est Regino Prumensis, (Marburg 1848).

REGINO OF PRÜM: Reginonis abbatis Prumiensis libri duo de
synodalibus causis et disciplinis ecclesiasticis, F.G.A.
Wasserschleben, (ed.), (Leipzig, 1840).

RHEIMS PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Remense, Wasserschleben,
pp.497-504.

ST. GALL "SIMPLEX" PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Sangallense,
Wasserschleben, pp.425-29.

PENITENTIAL OF THEODORE: Poenitentiale Theodori,
Wasserschleben, pp.182-219.

VINDOBONENSE PENITENTIAL: Poenitentiale Vindobonense;
Wasserschleben, pp.418-22.

PENITENTIAL OF VINNIAN: Poenitentiale Vinniani,
Wasserschleben, pp.108-19.

III. HAGIOGRAPHY.

ADALHARD:

Vita s. Adalhardi Corbeinensis abbatis auctore Paschasio
Radberto: PL120, cols.1507-56.

ADALRIC:

Gesta Aldrici episcopi Cenomannensis: MGH SS, 15.1, G.
Waitz, (ed.), pp.304-327.

ALDEGUND:

Vita Aldegundis abbatissae Malbodiensis: MGH SRM, 6, W.
Levison, (ed.), pp.79-90.

Vita sanctae Aldegundis virginis auctore Huchbaldo: PL132,
cols.859-76.

ANSKAR:

Vita Anskari a Rimberto et alio discipulo Anskarii
conscripta: MGH SS, 2, D.C.F. Dahlmann, (ed.), pp.683-
725.

ANSTRUDE:

Vita Anstrudis abbatissae Laudunensis: MGH SRM, 6, W. Levison, (ed.), pp.64-78.

AUSTREBERTA:

Miracula s. Austrebertae virginis; ASS 10 Feb., II, pp.423-29.

BALTHILD:

Vitae Balthildis reginae A and B: MGH SRM, 2, B. Krusch, (ed.) pp.482-508.

Translatio s. Balthildis: MGH SS, 15.1, O. Holder-Egger, (ed.), pp.284-85.

BENEDICT of Aniane:

Vita Benedicti abbatis Anianensis et Indensis auctore Ardone: MGH SS, 15.1, G. Waitz, (ed.), pp.198-220.

BENEDICT of Nursia:

Miracula S. Benedicti; PL124, cols.909-48.

BERTILA:

Vita Bertilae Abbatissae Calensis: MGH SRM, 6, W. Levison, (ed.), pp.95-109.

CAESARIUS of Arles:

Vitae Caesarii episcopi Arelatensis Libri duo: MGH SRM, 3, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.433-501.

CARILEPH [CALAIS]:

Vita et Miracula s. Carilephi: ASS 1 Iulii I, pp.85-102.

CHROTHILDIS:

Vita s. Chrothildis reginae Francorum: MGH SRM, 2, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.341-48.

LIVES OF THE FATHERS:

Liber vitae patrum: MGH SRM, I.2, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.661-744.

GERETRUDE:

Vita s. Geretrudis Nivialensis: MGH SRM, 2, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.447-64.

De virtutibus s. Geretrudis: MGH SRM, 2, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.464-74.

GLODESIND:

Vita antiquior s. Glodesindis: ASS 25 Iulii VI, pp.198-225.

HATHUMODA:

Aqii Vita et Obitus Hathumodae: MGH SS, 4, G.H. Pertz, (ed.), pp.165-89.

HERLINDIS and RENILDIS:

Vita ss. Herlindis sive Herlindae et Reinulae sive Renildis abbatissarum Masaci in Belgio: ASS 22 Mart. III, pp.383-92.

LEOBA:

Vita Leobae abbatissae Bischofesheimensis auctore Rudolfo Fuldensis: MGH, SS 15.1, G. Waitz, (ed.), pp.118-31.

LIUDGER:

Altfridi Vita s. Liudgeri, MGH SS, 2, G.H. Pertz, (ed.), pp.403-25.

LIUTBIRGA:

Vita s. Liutbirgae: MGH SS, 4, G.H. Pertz, (ed.), pp.158-64.

Vita Liutbirgae: Das Leben der Liutbirg, [MGH Deutsches Mittelalter 3], O. Menzel, (ed.), (Stuttgart, 1978).

MAURA:

Vita s. Maurae virginis: PL115, cols.1367-76.

ODILIA:

Vita Odiliae abbatissae Hohenburgensis: MGH SRM, 6, W. Levison, (ed.), pp.24-50.

OPPORTUNA:

Vita Opportunae abbatissae: ASS 22 Aprilis III, pp.61-71.

PERPETUA:

Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis, H. Musurillo (ed. and trans.), Acts of the Christian Martyrs, (Oxford, 1972), pp.106-31.

PUSINNA:

Vita s. Pusinnae virginis: "La plus ancienne Vie de sainte Pusinne de Binson, honorée en Westphalie", B. de Gaiffier, (ed.), in Analecta Bollandiana, 76, (1958), pp.188-223; text = 214-23.

RADEGUND:

De Vita sanctae Radegundis, MGH SRM, 2, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.358-77.

De vita sanctae Radegundis Liber II: MGH SRM, 2, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.377-95.

REMIGIUS [RÉMI]:

Vita Remigii episcopi Remensis auctore Hincmaro: MGH SRM, 3, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.239-341.

RICTRUDE:

Vita sanctae Rictrudis abbatissae Marcianensis auctore Hucbaldo: PL132, cols.829-848.

RUSTICULA:

Vita Rusticulae sive Marciae abbatissae Arelatensis: MGH SRM, 4, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.337-51.

SADALBERGA:

Vita Sadalbergae Abbatissae Laudunensis: MGH SRM, 5, B. Krusch, (ed.), pp.40-66.

VERENA:

Vita s. Verenae virginis: ASS 1 Sep. I, pp.164-68.

Vita Prior: in Die heilige Verena von Zürzach: Legende, Kult, Denkmäler, A. Reinle, (ed. and trans.), [Ars Docta, 6], (Basel, 1948), pp.26-31.

Vita Posterior: in Die heilige Verena von Zürzach: Legende, Kult, Denkmäler, A. Reinle, (ed. and trans.), [Ars Docta, 6], (Basel, 1948), pp.38-43.

WALDBURGIS:

Miracula Waldburgis Monheimensia, A. Bauch (ed. and trans.), Ein bayerisches Mirakelbuch aus der Karolingerzeit. Die Monheimer Walpurgiswunder des Priesters Wolfhard, [Eichstätter Studien, Neue Folge Band XII], (Regensburg, 1979).

WALDESTRUDE:

Vita s. Waldestrudis: Acta Sanctorum Belgii Selecta, 4, J. Ghesquière (ed.), pp.439-48, (Brussels, 1609).

WIBORADA:

Vita s. Wiboradae: ASS 2 Mai I, pp.284-306.

WIGBERT:

Vita Wigberti abbatis Friteslariensis auctore Lupo, MGH SS, 15.1, O. Holder-Egger, (ed.), pp.36-43.

IV. LITURGIES.

ALCUIN'S MASSES:

Le sacramentaire grégorien; ses principales formes d'après les plus anciens manuscrits, J. Deshusses, (ed.), II, Textes complémentaires pour la messe, [Spicilegium Friburgense, 24], (Fribourg, 1979).

SACRAMENTARY OF ANGOULEME:

Liber sacramentorum Engolismensis, P. Saint-Roch (ed.), [CCSL CLIX], (Turnhout, 1987).

ANIANE SUPPLEMENT:

Le sacramentaire grégorien: ses principales formes d'après les plus anciens manuscrits, J. Deshusses (ed.), I, Le sacramentaire, le supplément d'Aniane, [Spicilegium Friburgense, 16], (Fribourg, 1971).

PONTIFICAL OF ST. AUBIN D'ANGERS [MS80(72) Bibliothèque municipale d'Angers]:

Les Pontificaux Manuscrits des Bibliothèques de France, V. Leroquais, (ed.), (Paris, 1937), I, pp.25-32.

PONTIFICAL OF AURILLAC [Albi MS34]:

Les Pontificaux Manuscrits des Bibliothèques de France, V. Leroquais, (ed.), (Paris, 1937), I, pp.8-15.

SACRAMENTARY OF AUTUN:

Liber sacramentorum Augustudonensis, O. Heiming (ed.), [CCSL CLIXB], (Turnhout, 1984).

THE BOBBIO MISSAL:

The Bobbio Missal: A Gallican Mass-book, [Henry Bradshaw Society vols.53 (facsimile), 58, (text), 61 (notes)], E.A. Lowe (ed.), (London, 1917, 1920, 1924).

PONTIFICAL OF CAHORS [Paris BN MS lat.1217]:
Les Pontificaux Manuscrits des Bibliothèques de France, V. Leroquais, (ed.), (Paris, 1937), II, pp.109-11.

MISSALE FRANCORUM:

Missale Francorum, L.C. Mohlberg, (ed.), [RED series maior, fontes 2], (Rome, 1957).

SACRAMENTARY OF FULDA:

Sacramentarium Fuldense saeculi X, [Quellen und Abhandlungen zur Geschichte der Abtei und der Diözese Fulda, 9], G. Richter and A. Schönfelder (eds.), (Fulda, 1912), [reprinted Henry Bradshaw Society, 101, 1972-77].

MISSALE GALLICANUM VETUS:

Missale Gallicanum vetus, L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED series maior, fontes 3], (Rome, 1958).

GELASIAN SACRAMENTARY:

Liber sacramentorum Romanae aeclesiae ordinis anni circuli [Cod. Vat. Regin. lat. 316], L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes 4], (Rome, 1960).

SACRAMENTARY OF GELLONE:

Liber sacramentorum Gellonensis, J. Deshusses [Introductio, Tabulae et Indices; CCSL CLIX A], (Turnhout, 1981).

Liber sacramentorum Gellonensis, A. Dumas (ed.), [Textus; CCSL CLIX], (Turnhout, 1981).

MISSALE GOTHICUM:

Missale Gothicum, L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes 5], (Rome, 1961).

HADRIANUM:

Le sacramentaire grégorien: ses principales formes d'après les plus anciens manuscrits, J. Deshusses (ed.), I, Le sacramentaire, le supplément d'Aniane, [Spicilegium Friburgense, 16], (Fribourg, 1971) .

LEOFRIC MISSAL:

The Leofric Missal, F.E. Warren, (ed.), (Oxford, 1883).

ROMAN "ORDINES":

Les "Ordines Romani" du haut moyen âge, Michel Andrieu, (ed.), [5 vols. Spicilegium sacrum Lovaniense 11,23,24,28,29], (Louvain, 1931-61).

PONTIFICAL OF POITIERS (ST. PIERRE DE VIERZON), [MS227, Paris bibliothèque l'Arsenal]:

Les Pontificaux Manuscrits des Bibliothèques de France, V. Leroquais, (ed.), (Paris, 1937), I, pp.263-70.

PONTIFICAL OF RHEIMS [Reims BN MS340]:

Les Pontificaux Manuscrits des Bibliothèques de France, V. Leroquais, (ed.), (Paris, 1937), II, pp.265-68.

ROMANO-GERMANIC PONTIFICAL [PRG]:

Le pontificale romano-germanique du dixième siècle, C. Vogel and R. Elze (eds.), [Studi e Testi 226,227,269], (Vatican City, 1963, 1972).

VERONENSE SACRAMENTARY:

Sacramentarium Veronense, L.C. Mohlberg (ed.), [RED, series maior, fontes I], (Rome, 1956).

V. OTHER SOURCES.

ALCUIN: De virtutibus et vitiis, liber ad Widonem comitem, PL101, cols.613-38.

-----: Letter addressed to Charlemagne: MGH Epp. Karol., 4, no.306, E. Dümmler, (ed.), pp.465-66.

AMALARIUS of Metz: J. M. Hanssens, Amalarii Episcopi Opera Liturgica Omnia, [Studi e Testi 138-40], (Vatican City 1948).

ANNALS OF ST. BERTIN: Annales Bertiniani, G. Waitz, (ed.), MGH SRG, 5, (Hannover, 1883).

ANNALS OF FULDA: Annales Fuldenses, F. Kurze, (ed.), MGH SRG, 7, (Hannover, 1891).

ANONYMOUS of Herrieden: Anonymous Haserensis de episcopis Eichstetensibus a.741-1058: MGH SS, 7, L.C. Bethmann, (ed.), pp.253-66.

BEDE: Historia ecclesiastica gentis Anglorum: Bede's History of the English People, Bertram Colgrave and R.A.B. Mynors (eds. and trans.), (Oxford, 1969).

BENEDICT of Nursia: Regula s. Benedicti: The Benedictine Rule, J. McCann (ed. and trans.), (London, 1952).

EMPEROR CONRAD: Vita Chuonradis Imperatoris: MGH SS, 11, G.H. Pertz, (ed.), pp.254-75.

DHUODA: Liber Manualis Dhuodane: Manuel pour mon fils, Pierre Riché, (ed. and trans.), [Sources Chrétiennes 225], (Paris, 1975).

FLODOARD: Historia Remensis Ecclesiae: MGH, SS 13, J. Heller and G. Waitz, (eds.), pp.409-599.

GREGORY of Tours: Historia francorum: MGH SRM I.1, B. Krusch and W. Levison (ed.), pp.1-537.

HINCMAR of Rheims: Letter addressed to Archbishop Gunthar of Cologne, (860): MGH Epp. Karol., 8, no.135, E. Perels (ed.), (Berlin, 1939), pp.81-87.

-----: Letter addressed to Archbishop Rodulf of Bourges and Frotar of Bordeaux, (860); MGH Epp.

Karol., 8, no.136, E. Perels, (ed.), (Berlin, 1939), pp.87-107.

-----: De divortio Lotharii regis et Tetbergae reginae; PL125, cols.619-772.

-----: De cavendis vitiis et virtutibus exercendis; PL125, cols.857-930.

-----: De coercendo raptu viduarum; PL125, cols.1017-36.

HRABANUS MAURUS: Letter to Bishop Humbert of Würzburg (842), MGH Epp. Karol., 5, no.29, E. Dümmler, (ed.), pp.444-48.

-----: Letter to Bishop Reginbald (842): MGH Epp. Karol., 5, no.30, E. Dümmler, (ed.), pp.448-54.

-----: Epistolarum Fuldensium fragmenta, MGH Epp. Karol., 5, E. Dümmler, (ed.), pp.517-33.

-----: De clericorum Institutione libri tres; PL107, cols.293-420.

-----: De vita beatae Mariae Magdalenae; PL112, cols.1431-1508.

JONAS of Orleans: De institutione laicali libri tres, PL106, cols.121-278.

LUPUS of Ferrières: Loup de Ferrieres, Correspondance, Léon Levillain, (ed. and trans.), [2 vols.], (Paris, 1927-35).

POPE NICHOLAS I: Letter to the Frankish legates concerning Lothar II: MGH Epp. Karol., 6, no.11, E. Perels, (ed.), pp.276-78.

-----: Letter to the Bulgars (866): MGH Epp. Karol., 6, no.99, E. Perels, (ed.), (Berlin, 1925), pp.569-600.

ODO of Cluny: S. Odo abbas Cluniacensis. Collationum libri tres; PL133, cols.517-638.

PASCHASIUS RADBERTUS:

Oposculum De partu Virginis; PL120, cols.1367-86.

PAULINUS: Liber exhortationis ad Henricum comitem seu ducem Foro juliensem, PL99, cols.197-282.

RATRAMNUS of Corbie: De infantibus incaute oppressis: printed in Gerhard Schmitz, "Schuld und Strafe. Eine unbekannte Stellungnahme des Rathramnus von Corbie zur Kindestötung", DA, 38, (1982), pp.363-87, text = pp.384-87.

REGINO of Prüm:

Chronicon, MGH SRG, 50, F. Kurze, (ed.), (Hannover, 1890).

REMIREMONT:

Liber Memorialis; MGH Libri Mem. I (eds.) E. Hlawitschka, K. Schmid and G. Tellenbach (Zurich, Dublin 1970).

RUDOLF of Fulda:

Miracula Sanctorum in Fuldense Ecclesias Translatorum auctore Rudolfo: MGH, SS, 15.1, G. Waitz, (ed.), pp.328-41.

SECULR LAW CODES:

Lex Alamannorum, MGH Legum Sectio I, 5.1, K.A. Eckhardt, (ed.), (Hannover, 1966).

Lex Baiwariorum: MGH Legum Sectio I, 5.2, E. de Schwind, (ed.), (Hannover, 1926).

Leges Burgundionum: MGH Legum Sectio I, 2.1, L.R. de Salis, (ed.), (Hannover, 1902).

Pactum Leges Salica: MGH Legum Sectio I, 4.1, K.A. Eckhardt, (ed.), (Hannover, 1962).

Lex Salica [Texts D, E, S]: MGH Legum Sectio I, 4.2, K.A. Eckhardt, (ed.), (Hannover, 1969).

Leges Visigothorum: MGH Legum Sectio I.1, K. Zeumer, (ed.), (Hannover, Leipzig, 1902).

AFFELDT, Werner and KUHN, Annette (eds.), Frauen in der Geschichte VII, [Interdisziplinäre Studien zur Geschichte der Frauen im Frühmittelalter], (Düsseldorf, 1986).

AFFELDT, Werner, (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter. Lebensbedingungen - Lebensnormen-Lebensformen, (Sigmaringen, 1990).

AFFELDT, Werner, Cordula NOLTE, Sabine REITER, Ursula VORWERK, (eds.), Frauen im Frühmittelalter. Eine ausgewählte, Kommentierte Bibliographie, (Frankfurt, 1990).

AIGRAIN. René, L'Hagiographie, ses sources, ses méthodes, son histoire, (Poitiers 1953).

AMIET R., "Une Admonitio Synodalis de l'époque carolingienne. Étude critique et édition", Medieval Studies, 26, (1964), pp.12-82.

ANGENENDT, Arnold, "Die Liturgie und die Organisation des kirklichen Lebens auf dem Lande", Christianizzazione ed organizzazione ecclesiastica delle campagne nell'alto medioevo: Espansione e Resistenze, Spoletto, 28, (1982), pp.169-226.

ANSON, John, "The female transvestite in early monasticism", Viator, 5, (1974), pp.1-32.

ASTON, Margaret, "Segregation in Church", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.237-94.

BAKER, Derek, (ed.), Medieval Women, [SCH Subsidia I], (Oxford, 1978).

BAUCH, Andreas, Ein bayerisches Mirakelbuch aus der Karolingerzeit. Die Monheimer Walpurgiswunder des Priesters Wolfhard, [Eichstätter Studien, Neue Folgen Band XII] (Regensburg, 1979).

BELL, Rudolph M., Holy Anorexia, (Chicago, 1985).

BISCHOFF, Bernhard, "Wer ist die Nonne von Heidenheim?" in Studien und Mitteilungen zur Geschichte des Benediktinerordens, 49 (1931), pp.312-327.

-----: "Die kölnen Nonnenhandschriften und das Skriptorium Chelles", in Mittelalterlich Studien, I, [Ausgewählte Aufsätze zur Schriftkunde und Literaturgeschichte], (Stuttgart, 1966), pp.16-34.

BISHOP, Jane, "Bishops as Marital Advisors", in J. Kirschner and S.F. Wemple, (eds.), Women of the Medieval World, (Oxford, 1985), pp.53-84.

BISHOP, Edmund, "The Liturgical Reform of Charlemagne", Downside Review, 38, (1919), pp.1-16.

- BISHOP, T.A.M., "The Scribes of the Corbie a-b" in P. Godman and R. Collins (eds.), Charlemagne's Heir: New Perspectives on the Reign of Louis the Pious (814-40), (Oxford, 1990), pp.523-36.
- BITEL, Lisa, "Women's Monastic Enclosures in Early Ireland: A Study of Female Spirituality and Male Monastic Mentalities" in J. Med. Hist., 12, (1986), pp.15-36.
- BLOCH, Maurice and PARRY, Jonathon, (eds.), Death and the regeneration of life, (Cambridge, 1982).
- BOLTON, Brenda, "Mulieres Sanctae", SCH, 10, (1973), pp.77-95.
- : "Vitae Matrum: a further aspect of the Frauenfrage", in D. Baker, (ed.), Medieval Women, (Oxford, 1978), pp.253-73.
- BOSWELL, John, Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality, (Chicago 1980).
- BOUCHARD, Constance B., "Consanguinity and Noble Marriages in the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries", Speculum, 56, (1981), pp.268-87.
- BOUMANN, C.A., Sacring and Crowning, (Gröningen, Djarkarta, 1957).
- BRAUN, J., Die liturgische Gewandung im Occident und Orient. Nach Ursprung und Entwicklung, Verwendung und Symbolik, (Freiburg, 1907).
- BRIDENTHAL, Renate, Claudia KOONZ, Susan STUARD, (eds.), Becoming Visible. Women in European History. [Second Edition], (Boston, 1987).
- BROMMER, Peter, "Die Quellen der Capitula Radulfs von Bourges", Francia, 5, (1977), pp.27-43.
- : "Capitula Epicoporum". Die Bischöflichen Kapitularien des 9. und 10. Jahrhunderts, [Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Occidental Fasc.43], (Turnhout, 1985).
- BRUNDAGE, J.A., Law, Sex and Christian Society in Medieval Europe, (Chicago, 1987).
- BUGGE, John, Virginitas. An Essay in the History of a Medieval Idea, (Hague 1975).
- BULLOUGH, Donald, "Burial, Community and Belief in the Early Medieval West", in Patrick Wormald (ed.), Ideal and Reality in Frankish and Anglo-Saxon Society: Studies Presented to J.M. Wallace-Hadrill, (Oxford, 1983), pp.177-201.
- BYNUM, Caroline Walker, Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the high Middle Ages, (Berkeley, London, 1982).

- : Holy Feast and Holy Fast. The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women, (Berkeley, 1987).
- CABROL, Ferdinand, and LECLERQ, Henri, (eds.), Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie, [15 vols], (Paris, 1907-53).
- CARDOT, Fabienne, "Le pouvoir aristocratique et le sacré au haut moyen âge", MA, 89 (1983), pp.171-93.
- CHOUX, Jacques, "Décadence et réforme monastique dans la province de Trèves, 855-959", Revue Bénédictine 70, (1960), pp.204-223.
- CLAUSSEN, Martin A., "God and Man in Dhuoda's Liber Manualis", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.43-52.
- COLEMAN, Emily, "Medieval Marriage Characteristics: A Neglected Factor in the History of Medieval Serfdom", Journal of Interdisciplinary History, 2, (1971), pp.205-219.
- : "L'infanticide dans le Haut Moyen Age", Annales [E.S.C.], 29, (1974), pp.315-335.
- CORBET, Patrick, Les saints ottoniens. Sainteté dynastique, sainteté royale et sainteté féminine autour de l'an Mil, (Sigmaringen, 1986).
- COSTER, William, "Purity, Profanity and Puritanism: The Churcing of Women, 1500-1700", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.377-401.
- CROSS, F.L., "Early Western Liturgical Manuscripts", Journal of Theological Studies, 16, (1965), pp.61-67.
- DAUDET, Pierre, Études sur l'histoire de la juridiction matrimoniale, (Paris, 1933).
- DAVIES, Wendy, Small Worlds. The Village Community in Early Medieval Brittany, (London, 1988).
- DE GAIFFIER, B., "La plus ancienne Vie de sainte Pusinne de Binson, honorée en Westphalie", (ed.), Analecta Bollandiana, 76, (1958), pp.188-223.
- DE ROMESTIN, H. (trans), Some of the Principal Works of Ambrose, (Oxford, 1951).
- DEMYTTENAERE, Albert, "The Cleric, Women and the Stain" in Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, W. Affeldt (ed.), (Sigmaringen, 1990), pp.141-65.
- DESHUSSES, Jean, "Le Supplément au sacramentaire grégorien: Alcuin ou S. Benoît d'Aniane", Archiv für Liturgiewissenschaft, 9, (1965), pp.48-71.
- : Le sacramentaire grégorien; ses principales formes d'après les plus anciens manuscrits,

- I; Textes complémentaires pour la messe, II, [Spicilegium Friburgense, 16, 24], (Fribourg, 1971, 1979).
- : Liber sacramentorum Gellonensis, [Introductio, Tabulae et Indices; CCSL CLIX A], (Turnhout, 1981).
- DEVISSE, Jean, Hincmar, Archevêque de Reims 845-882, [3 vols.] (Geneva, 1975).
- DIETRICH, Sheila C., "An Introduction to Women in Anglo-Saxon Society (c.600-1066)", in Barabara Kanner, (ed.), The Women of England from Anglo-Saxon Times to the Present, (London, 1980), pp.32-56.
- DINZELBACHER, Peter, "La littérature des révélations au Moyen Age: un document historique", RH, 275, (1986), pp.289-305.
- DRONKE, Peter, Women Writers of the Middle Ages, (Cambridge and London, 1984), pp.36-54.
- DU CANGE, C. du Fresne, Glossarium mediae et infimae latinitatis, [ed. and revised D.P. Carpentier] (Paris, 1766 ff.).
- ECKENSTEIN, Lina, Woman under Monasticism: Chapters on Saint-lore and Convent Life between A.D.500 and A.D.1500, (Cambridge, 1896).
- ENNEN, Edith, The Medieval Woman [trans. E. Jephcott] (Oxford, 1989).
- ENRIGHT, Michael, J., "Lady with a Mead-Cup. Ritual, Group Cohesion and Hierarchy in the Germanic Warband", FMS, 22, (1988), pp.170-203.
- ERLER M. and KOWALESKI M. (eds.), Women and Power in the Middle Ages (Athens, Georgia, 1988).
- FARMER, Sharon, "Persuasive Voices: Clerical Images of Medieval Wives", Speculum, 61 (1986), pp.517-43.
- FELL, Christine, Cecily CLARK and Elizabeth WILLIAMS, Women in Anglo-Saxon England and the Impact of 1066, (London, 1984).
- FLANDRIN, J.-L., Families in Former Times, (Cambridge, 1979).
- FLINT, Valerie I.J. The Rise of Magic in Early Medieval Europe, (Princeton, 1991).
- FOURACRE, Paul, The Career of Ebroin, Mayor of the Palace c.657-680, [unpublished Ph.D. thesis], (London, 1981).
- FRANSEN, Gerard, Les Collections Canoniques, [Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Occidental Fasc.10], (Turnhout, 1973).
- : "La rupture du mariage", Il matrimonio

nella società altomedievale, Spoleto, 24, (1977), pp.604-30.

FRANTZEN, Allen J., "The Significance of the Frankish Penitentials", J. Eccles. Hist., 30, (1979), pp.409-421.

-----: "The tradition of penitentials in Anglo-Saxon England", Anglo-Saxon England, 11, (1983), pp.23-56.

-----: Les "Libri Poenitentiales", [Typologie des sources du moyen âge occidental, Fasc.27, supplement], (Turnhout, 1985).

GANSHOF, F.L., "L'usage de l'écrit en matière administrative", MA, 57, (1951), pp.1-25.

-----: "The use of the written word in Charlemagne's administration", [trans, by J. Sondheimer], The Carolingians and the Frankish Monarchy (Aberdeen, 1971), pp.125-42.

-----: "Le statut de la femme dans la monarchie franque", Recueils Société Jean Bodin, 12 (1962), pp.5-58.

GAUDEMET, Jean, Le Mariage en Occident, (Paris, 1987).

GODMAN, Peter, Poetry of the Carolingian Renaissance, (London, 1985).

GOODICH, Michael, "Ancilla Dei: The Servant as Saint in the Late Middle Ages", in J. Kirshner and S.F. Wemple (eds.), Women of the Medieval World, (Oxford, 1985), pp.119-36.

GOODY, Jack and TAMBIAH, S.J., Bridewealth and Dowry, [Cambridge Papers in Social Anthropology, 7], (Cambridge, 1973).

GOODY, Jack, The Development of the Family and Marriage in Europe, (Cambridge, 1983).

GRAUS, Frantisek, Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger im Reich der Merowinger, (Prague, 1965).

GRYSON, Roger, Le Ministère des Femmes dans l'Église ancienne, (Gembloux, 1972).

GUEROUT, Jean, "La monastère à l'époque carolingienne" in Y. Chaussy et al (ed.) L'Abbaye de Notre Dame de Jouarre, (Paris, 1961), vol. 1, pp.75-8.

HAMMER, Carl H., "Country Churches, Clerical Inventories and the Carolingian Renaissance in Bavaria", Church History, 49, (1980), pp.5-17.

HARRISON, Odilia G., "The Formulas "Ad virgines sacras". A Study of the Sources", Ephemerides Liturgicae, LXVI, (1952).

HARTMANN, Wilfrid, "Der Rechtliche Zustand der Kirchen auf dem Lande: Die Eigenkirche in der Fränkischen Gesetzgebung des 7. bis 9. Jahrhundert", Christianizzazione ed organizzazione ecclesiastica delle campagne nell'alto medioevo: Espansione e Resistenze, Spoleto, 28, (1982), pp.397-441.

-----: "Eine kleine Sammlung von Busstexten aus dem 9. Jahrhundert", DA, 39 (1983), pp.207-13.

HEIDEBRECHT, Petra and NOLTE, Cordula, "Leben im Kloster: Nonnen und Kanonissen. Geschichtliche Lebensformen im frühen Mittelalter" in Ursula A.J. Becker and Jörn Rüsen (eds.), Weiblichkeit in Geschichte Perspektive, (Fallstudien und Reflexionen zu Grundproblemen der historischen Frauenforschung Herausgegeben), [Suhrkamp Taschenbuch Wissenschaft 725], (Suhrkamp, 1988), pp.79-115.

HEINZELMANN, Martin, Translationsberichte und andere quellen des Reliquienkultes, [Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Fasc.33], (Turnhout, 1979).

-----: "Une source de base de la littérature hagiographique latine: le recueil de miracles", in E. Patlagean and P. Riché, (eds.), Hagiographie cultures et sociétés IVe-XIIe siècles, [CNRS], (Paris 1981), pp.235-57.

HERLIHY, David, "Land, Family, and Women in Continental Europe, 701-1200", reprinted in S.M. Stuard (ed.), Women in Medieval Society, (Philadelphia 1976), pp.13-43.

-----: Medieval Households, (Harvard, 1985).

-----: "Did Women have a Renaissance?: A Reconsideration", Medievalia et Humanistica, 13, (1985), pp.1-22.

HERRIN, Judith, "Women and the Church in Byzantium", Bulletin of the British Association of Orientalists, [New Series], 11, (1979-80), pp.8-14.

-----: The Formation of Christendom, (Princeton, 1987).

HILDEBRANDT, M.M., The External School in Carolingian Society, [Education and Society in the Middle Ages and Renaissance, I], (Leiden, New York, 1992).

HLAWITSCHKA, Eduard, Studien zur Äbtissinnenreihe von Remiremont (7.-13 Jh.), [Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für Landeskunde des Saarlandes, 9,] (Saarbrücken, 1963).

HOEBANX, J.J., L'Abbaye de Nivelles des origines au XIVE siècle, [Memoires de L'Academie Royale de Belgique, Classes des Lettres et des Sciences Morales et Politiques, 46], (Brussels, 1952).

HOFFMAN, H., "Untersuchungen zur karolingischen Annalistik", Bonner Historische Forschungen, 10, (Bonn,

- 1959), pp.53-61.
- HOHLER, Christopher, "Some Service Books of the Later Saxon Church" in D. Parsons (ed.), Tenth-Century Studies, (London, 1975), pp.60-83, 217-27.
- HUGHES, Kathleen, Early Christian Ireland, (Cornell, 1972).
- HYAM, Jane, "Ermentrude and Richildis", in M. Gibson and J.L. Nelson (eds.), Charles the Bald: Court and Kingdom, [BAR International Series, 101], (Oxford, 1981), pp.153-168.
- JAMES, Edward (trans.), Life of the Fathers, [Translated Texts for Historians, I], (Liverpool, 1985).
- KAMPHAUSEN, H.J., Traum und Vision in der lateinischen Poesie der Karolingerzeit, (Bern 1975).
- KELLY-GADOL, Joan, "Did Women Have a Renaissance?", in R. Bridenthall, C. Koonz and S.M. Stuard, (eds.), Becoming Visible, (Boston, 1987), pp.176-201.
- KERFF, F., Der Quadripartitus: Ein handbuch der karolingischen Kirchenreform. Überlieferung, Quellen und Rezeption, (Sigmaringen 1982).
- KIECKHEFER, Richard, Magic in the Middle Ages, (Cambridge, 1989).
- KIRSCHNER, Julius and WEMPLE, Suzanne Fonay, (eds.), Women of the Medieval World, (Oxford, 1985).
- KLUGE, F., Etymologisches Wortbuch der deutschen Sprache, (Strassburg, 1883-1910).
- KONECNY, Silvia, Die Frauen des karolingischen Königshauses: die politische Bedeutung der Ehe und die Stellung der Frau in der fränkischen Herrscherfamilie vom 7. bis zum 10. Jahrhundert, [Dissertationen der Universität Wien. 132], (Wien 1976).
- : "Eherecht und Ehepolitik unter Ludwig dem Frommen", MIÖG, 85, (1977), pp.1-21.
- KOTTJE, Raymund, Die Bussbücher Halitgars von Cambrai und des Hrabanus Maurus (ihre Überlieferung und ihre Quellen), (Berlin, 1980).
- : "Claustra sine armario? zum Unterschied von Kloster und Stift im Mittelalter" in J.F. Angener and J. Lenzenweger (eds.), Consuetudines Monasticae. Eine Festgabe für Kassius Hallinger aus Anlass seines 70. Geburtstages, (Rome, 1982), pp.125-44.
- : "Überlieferung und Rezeption der irischen Bussbücher auf dem Kontinent", in H. Löwe, (ed.), Die Iren und Europa im Frühmittelalter, [1], (Stuttgart 1982), pp.511-24.

- KUCHENBUCH, Ludolf, Bäuerliche Gesellschaft und Klosterherrschaft im 9. Jahrhundert. Studien zur Sozialstruktur der Familia der Abtei Prüm, [Vierteljahrsschrift für Sozial- und Wirtschaftsgeschichte, 66], (Wiesbaden, 1978).
- LAUWERS, Michel, "Sainteté royale et sainteté féminine dans l'Occident médiéval", RHE, 83, (1988), pp.58-69.
- LECLERCQ, Dom Jean, Monks on Marriage. A Twelfth-Century View, (New York, 1982).
- LEFKOWITZ, Mary, R., Heroines and Hysterics, (London, 1981).
- LEROQUAIS, V. (ed.), Les Pontificaux Manuscrits des Bibliothèques de France, [3 vols], (Paris, 1937).
- LESNE, Emile, "Les Ordonnances de Louis le Pieux", Revue d'Histoire de l'Eglise de France, 6, (1920), pp.445-93.
- LEVISON, Wilhelm, "Rescension: K.H. Schäfer, Die Kanonissenstifter", Westdeutsche Zeitschrift für Geschichte und Kunst, 27, (1908), pp.491-512.
- LEWIS, Suzanne, "A Byzantine virgo militans at Charlemagne's court", Viator, 11, (1980), pp.71-93.
- LEYSER, Henrietta, Hermits and the New Monasticism; a study of religious communities in Western Europe 1100-1150, (London, 1984).
- LEYSER, Karl, Rule and Conflict in an Early Medieval Society: Ottonian Saxony, (London, 1979).
- LIFSHITZ, Felice, "Les femmes missionnaires: L'exemple de la Gaule franque", RHE, 83, (1988), pp.5-33.
- LOBBEDY, U., "Zur archäologischen Erforschung westfälischer Frauenkloster des 9. Jahrhunderts. (Freckenhorst, Vreden, Meschede, Herford)", FMS, 4, (1970), pp.320-40.
- LOYN, H.R., and PERCIVAL, John, The Reign of Charlemagne. [Documents of Medieval History 2], (London, 1975).
- LYMAN, Richard B. Jr., "Barbarism and Religion: Late Roman and Early Medieval Childhood", in Lloyd de Mause, (ed.), The History of Childhood, (New York, 1974), pp.75-100.
- LYNCH, J. H., Godparents and Kinship in Early Medieval Europe, (Princeton, 1986).
- MAGNOU-NORTIER, E. "Formes Feminales de Vie Consacréé dans les pays du Midi jusqu'au debut du XIIe siècle", La Femme dans la vie religieuse du Languedoc XIIIe-XIVe s., [Cahiers de Fanjeaux 23], (1988), pp.193-216.
- MANSELLI, Raoul, "Vie familiale et éthique sexuelle dans les penitentiels" in G. Duby and J. Le Goff (eds.) Famille et Parenté dans l'Occident Médiéval [Collection

de l'école française de Rome, 30] (Rome, 1977), pp.363-78.

-----: "Il Matrimoni nei Penitenziali", Il matrimonio nella società altomedievale, Spoleto, 24, (1977), pp.287-315.

MARCHAND, James, "The Frankish Mother: Dhuoda", in K.M. Wilson, (ed.), Medieval Women Writers, (Manchester, 1984), pp.2-29.

MARRIOTT, W.B., Vestiarum Christianum, (London 1868).

MARTINDALE, Jane, "The Nun Immena and the Foundation of the Abbey of Beaulieu: a Woman's Prospects in the Carolingian Church", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.27-42.

MAYR-HARTING, Henry, The Coming of Christianity to Anglo Saxon England, (London, 1972).

McCLURE, Judith, "Review of Distant Echoes", EHR, 102, (1987), p.1005.

McDONALD, W.J., J.A. MAGNER, M.R.P. MCGUIRE, J.P.WHALEN, New Catholic Encyclopedia, [Catholic University of America], (Washington, D.C., 1967).

MCKITTERICK, Rosamond, (formerly, PIERCE), "The "Frankish" Penitentials", SCH, 11, (1975), pp.31-9.

-----: The Frankish Church and the Carolingian Reforms 789-895, (London, 1977).

-----: The Frankish Kingdoms under the Carolingians 751-987, (London, 1983).

-----: The Carolingians and the Written Word, (Cambridge, 1989).

-----: (ed.), The Uses of Literacy in Early Medieval Europe, (Cambridge, 1990).

-----: "Frauen und Schriftlichkeit im frühen Mittelalter", in H.-W. Goetz (ed.), Weibliche Lebensgestaltung im frühen Mittelalter, (Cologne, 1991), pp.65-118.

MCLAUGHLIN, Mary Martin, "Survivors and Surrogates: Children and Parents from the Ninth to the Thirteenth Centuries", in Lloyd de Mause, (ed.), The History of Childhood, (New York, 1974), pp.101-81.

MCNAMARA, Jo-Ann, "A Legacy of Miracles: Hagiography and Nunneries in Merovingian Gaul" in J. Kirschner and S.F. Wemple, (eds.), Women of the Medieval World, (Oxford, 1985), pp.36-52.

MCNAMARA Jo-Ann and WEMPLE, S.F., "Marriage and Divorce in the Frankish Kingdom", S.M. Stuard, (ed.), Women in Medieval Society, (Philadelphia 1976), pp.95-124.

-----: "The Power of Women Through the Family in Medieval Europe, 500-1100" in M. Erler and M. Kowaleski, (eds.), Women and Power in the Middle Ages, (Athens, Georgia, 1988), pp.83-101.

MCNEILL John T. and GAMER, Helena M., Medieval Handbooks of Penance. A translation of the principal "libri poenitentiales" and selections from related documents, (Columbia, 1938).

METZ, René, La consécration des vierges dans L'Eglise romaine, (Paris, 1954).

-----: "La consécration des vierges dans l'Eglise franque d'après la plus ancienne Vie de Sainte Pusinne (VIIIe-IXe siècle), Revue des Sciences Religieuses, 35, (1961), pp.32-48.

MEYER, Marc Antony, "Women and the Tenth Century English Monastic Reform", Revue Bénédictine, 87, (1977), pp.34-61.

-----: "Land Charters and the Legal Position of Anglo-Saxon Women", in Barabara Kanner, (ed.), The Women of England from Anglo-Saxon Times to the Present, (London, 1980), pp.57-82.

MORDEK, Hubert, "Karolingische Kapitularien", in Hubert Mordek, (ed.), Überlieferung und Geltung normativer Texte des frühen und hohen Mittelalters, [Quellen und Forschungen zum Recht im Mittelalter; ed. R. Kottje and H. Mordek], (Sigmaringen, 1986), pp.25-50.

MORETON, Bernard, The Eighth-Century Gelasian Sacramentary: A Study in Tradition, (Oxford, 1976).

MURRAY, Alexander, Reason and Society in the Middles Ages, (Oxford, 1978).

NELSON, Janet L., "Review of S.F. Wemple, Women in Frankish Society", History, 69, (1984), pp.449-50.

-----: "Dispute Settlement in Carolingian West Francia", in W. Davies and P.J. Fouracre, (eds.), The Settlement of Disputes in Early Medieval Europe, (Cambridge, 1986), pp.45-64.

-----: "Les femmes et l'évangélisation au IXe siècle", Revue du Nord, 68 (1986), pp.471-85.

-----: "Review of F. Kerff, Der Quadripartitus", The Legal History Review, 54, (1986), pp.410-413.

-----: Politics and Ritual in Early Medieval Europe, (London, 1986).

-----: "Queens as Jezebels: Brunhild and Balthild in Merovingian History", Politics and Ritual, pp.1-48.

- : "On the Limits of the Carolingian Renaissance", Politics and Ritual, pp.49-67.
- : "Royal Saints and Early Medieval Kingship", Politics and Ritual, pp.69-74.
- : "Legislation and Consensus under Charles the Bald", Politics and Ritual, pp.91-116.
- : "The Annals of St. Bertin", Politics and Ritual, pp.173-94.
- : "Public Histories and Private History in the work of Nithard", Politics and Ritual, pp.195-237.
- : "Ritual and Reality in the Early Medieval Ordines", Politics and Ritual, pp.329-39.
- ; "The Earliest Surviving Royal Ordo", Politics and Ritual, pp.341-60.
- : "Making Ends Meet: Wealth and Poverty in the Carolingian Church", SCH, 24, (1987), pp.25-35.
- : "A Tale of Two Princes: Politics, Text and Ideal in a Carolingian Annal", SMRH, 10, (1988), pp.105-41.
- : "Review of Small Worlds", in The Times Literary Supplement, April 28th, 1989.
- : "Commentary on the papers of J. Verdon, S.F. Wemple and M. Parisse", in W. Affeldt (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, (Sigmaringen, 1990), pp.325-332.
- : "Literacy in Carolingian Government" in R. McKitterick, (ed.), The Uses of Literacy in Early Medieval Europe, (Cambridge, 1990), pp.258-296.
- : "Perceptions du pouvoir chez les historiennes du haut moyen âge" in M. Rouche (ed.), Les Femmes au Moyen Age, (Maubeuge, 1990), pp.75-85.
- : "Women and the word", SCH, 27, (1990), pp.53-78.
- : (trans. and ed.), The Annals of St. Bertin, [Ninth-century Histories, vol. I], (Manchester, 1991).
- : Charles the Bald, (London, New York, 1992).
- : "Women at the court of Charlemagne: a case of monstrous regiment". [forthcoming].
- NICHOLS, John A., and SHANK, Lillian Thomas (eds.), Medieval Religious Women I. Distant Echoes, (Kalamazoo, 1984).

NICHOLSON, Joan, "Feminae Gloriosae: women in the age of Bede", in D. Baker, (ed.), Medieval Women, (Oxford, 1978), pp.15-29.

NOLTE, Cordula, "Klosterleben von Frauen in der frühen Merowingerzeit. Überlegungen zur Regula ad virgines des Caesarius von Arles" in W. Affeldt and A. Kuhn (eds.), Frauen in der Geschichte VII, (Düsseldorf, 1986), pp.257-71.

NOONAN, J.T., Contraception. A History of its Treatment by the Catholic Theologians and Canonists, (Cambridge, Mass., 1965).

OAKLEY, T.P., "The Penitentials as Sources for Medieval History", Speculum, 15, (1940), pp.210-23.

OWEN HUGHES, Diana, "From Brideprice to Dowry in Mediterranean Europe", Journal of Family History, 3 (1978), pp.262-96.

PARISSE, Michel, "Les Chanoinesses dans l'Empire germanique", Francia, 6, (1978), pp.107-126.

-----: "Les femmes au monastère dans le Nord de L'Allemagne du IXe au XIe siècle. Conditions sociales et religieuses" in W. Affeldt, (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, (Sigmaringen, 1990), pp.311-324.

PATLAGEAN, E., "L'histoire de la femme déguisée en moine et l'évolution de sainteté féminine à Byzance" in Structures sociales, famille, chrétienté à Byzance, [Variorum Reprints], (London 1981), pp.597-623.

PAXTON, Frederick S., Christianising Death. The Creation of a Ritual Process in Early Medieval Europe, (Cornell, 1990).

PAYER Pierre J., "Early medieval regulations concerning marital sexual relations", J.Med.Hist., 6, (1980), pp.353-376.

-----: "The Humanism of the Penitentials and the Continuity of the Penitential Tradition", Medieval Studies, 48, (1984), pp.340-354.

-----: Sex and the Penitentials, (Toronto, London 1984).

PIERCE, Rosamond, See MCKITTERICK

PLATELLE, Henri, "Le thème de la conversion à travers les oeuvres hagiographiques d'Hucbald de Saint-Amand", Revue du Nord, 68, (1986), pp.511-31.

PORTMANN, Marie Louise, Die Darstellung der Frau in der Geschichtschreibung des früheren Mittelalters, (Basel, 1958).

POULIN, Joseph-Claude, L'Idéal de sainteté dans l'Aquitaine carolingienne d'après les sources hagiographiques 750-950, (Quebec, 1975).

PRINZ, Freidrich, "Zur Geistigen Kultur des Mönchtums im spätantiken Gallien und im Merowingerreich" in Mönchtum und Gesellschaft im Frühmittelalter, (Darmstadt, 1976), pp.265-353.

REINLE, Adolf, Die heilige Verena von Zürzach: Legende, Kult, Denkmäler, (ed.), [Ars Docta, 6], (Basel, 1948).

RICHÉ, Pierre, Education et culture dans l'occident barbare, (Paris, 1973).

-----: Dhuoda: Manuel pour mon fils [Sources Chrésiennes 225], (Paris, 1975).

-----: Daily Life in the World of Charlemagne [trans. J.-A. McNamara], (Liverpool, 1978).

RITZER, K., Le Mariage dans les Églises chrétiennes du Ier au XIe siècle, (Paris, 1970), [Formen, Riten und religiöses Brauchtum der Eheschlusung in den Christlichen Kirchen des ersten Jahrtausend, (Münster, 1962)].

ROSENTHAL, Joel T., (ed.), Medieval Women and the Sources of Medieval History, (Athens, Georgia, 1990).

ROUCHE, Michel, "Miracles, maladies et psychologie de la foi à l'époque caroligienne en Francie", in P. Riché and E. Patleagean, (eds.), Hagiographie cultures et sociétés IVE-XIIe siècles, [CNRS], (Paris, 1981), pp.319-35.

-----: (ed.), Les Femmes au Moyen Age, (Maubeuge, 1990).

RUSSELL, Norman The Lives of the Desert Fathers, (trans.), Introduction by Benedicta Ward, (London, 1980).

SCHÄFER, K. Heinrich, Die Kanonissenstifter im deutschen Mittelalter. Ihre Entwicklung und innere Einrichtung im Zusammenhang mit dem altchristlichen Sanktimonialentum, [Kirchenrechtliche Abhandlung, Ulrich Stutz, (ed.), 43-44], (Stuttgart, 1907).

-----: "Kanonissen und Diakonissen, Ergänzungen und Erläuterungen", Römische Quartalschrift, 24, (1910), pp.49-90.

SCHMITZ, Dom Philibert, Histoire de l'ordre de St. Benoît, [7 vols], (Liège: Maredsous, 1942-56); vol.7, Les Moniales.

SCHMITZ, Gerhard, "Schuld und Strafe. Eine unbekannte Stellungnahme des Rathramnus von Corbie zur Kindestötung", DA, 38, (1982), pp.363-87.

SCHNEIDER, Dagmar B., Anglo-Saxon Women in the Religious Life. A study of the status and position of women in an

early medieval society, (unpublished D.Phil thesis for the University of Cambridge, 1985).

SCHRÖDER, Isolde, Die Westfränkischen Synoden von 888 bis 987 und ihrer Überlieferung, [MGH], (München, 1980).

SCHULENBURG, Jane Tibbetts, "Sexism and the Celestial Gynaecium - from 500 to 1200", J.Med.Hist., 4, (1978), pp.117-133.

-----: "Strict active enclosure and its effects on the female monastic experience (500-1100) in J.A. Nichols and L.T. Shank, (eds.), Distant Echoes, (Kalamazoo, 1984), pp.51-86.

-----: "Female Sanctity: Public and Private Roles ca.500-1100" in M. Erler and M. Kowaleski (eds.), Women and Power, (Athens, Georgia, 1988), pp.102-125.

-----: "Women's Monastic Communities, 500-1100: Patterns of Expansion and Decline", SIGNS, Journal of Women in Culture and Society, 14, (1988), pp.261-292.

-----: "Saint's Lives as a Source for the History of Women, 500-1100", in J.T. Rosenthal, (ed.), Medieval Women and the Sources of Medieval History, (Athens, Georgia, 1990), pp.285-320.

SCOTT, Joan, "Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis", American Historical Review, 91, (1986), p.1053-1075.

SEMMLER, Joseph, "Corvey und Herford in der benediktinischen Reformbewegung des 9. Jahrhunderts", FMS, 4, (1970), pp.289-319.

SETTIMANE DI STUDIO DEL CENTRO ITALIANO DI STUDI SULL'ALTO MEDIOEVO, [24], Il matrimonio nella società altomedievale, (Spoleto, 1977).

SHAHAR, Shulamith, The Fourth Estate. A History of Women in the Middle Ages, [trans. Chaya Galai], (London, 1983).

SKINNER, Mary, "Benedictine Life for Women in Central France, 850-1100: A Feminist Revival", in J.A. Nichols and L.T. Shank, (eds.), Distant Echoes, (Kalamazoo, 1984), pp.87-113.

STAFFORD, Pauline, "Sons and Mothers: Family Politics in the Early Middle Ages", in D. Baker, (ed.), Medieval Women, (Oxford, 1978), pp.79-100.

-----: "Charles the Bald, Judith and England", in M. Gibson and J.L. Nelson (eds.), Charles the Bald: Court and Kingdom, [BAR International Series, 101], (Oxford, 1981), pp.137-151.

-----: "The King's Wife in Wessex 800-1066", Past and Present, 91, (1981), pp.3-27.

-----: "The Laws of Cnut and the History of Anglo-Saxon Royal Promises", Anglo-Saxon England, 10, (1982), pp.173-90.

-----: Queens, Concubines and Dowagers: The King's Wife in the Early Middle Ages, (London, 1983).

-----: "Women in Domesday", Reading Medieval Studies, XV, (1989), pp.75-94.

STUARD, Susan Mosher (ed.), Women in Medieval Society, (Philadelphia 1976).

STUDIES IN CHURCH HISTORY: The Ministry: Clerical and Lay, SCH, 26, (London, 1989).

STUDIES IN CHURCH HISTORY: Women in the Church, SCH, 27, (London, 1990).

TALBOT, C.H., (ed. and trans.), The Anglo-Saxon Missionaries in Germany, (London, New York, 1954).

TOUBERT, Pierre, "La théorie du mariage chez les moralistes carolingiens", Il matrimonio nella società altomedievale, Spoletto, 24, (1977), pp.233-285.

ULLMANN, Walter, The Carolingian Renaissance and the Idea of Kingship, (London, 1969).

-----: Law and Politics in the Middle Ages, (London, 1975).

VERDON, Jean, "Notes sur le rôle économique de monastères féminins en France dans la seconde moitié du IXe et au début du Xe siècle", Revue Mabillon, 58, (1975), pp.329-43.

-----: "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du nord aux IXe-XIe siècles", Revue Mabillon, 59, (1976), pp.49-96.

-----: "Recherches sur les monastères féminins dans la France du sud aux IXe-XIe siècles", Annales du Midi, 88, (1976), pp.117-38.

-----: "Les Moniales dans la France de l'ouest aux XIe et XIIe siècles: Étude d'histoire sociale", CCM, 19, (1976), pp.247-64.

-----: "Les Femmes Laïques en Gaule au Temps des Mérovingiens: Les Réalités de la Vie Quotidienne", in W, Affeldt, (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalte, (Sigmaringen, 1990), pp.240-61.

VOGEL, Cyrille, Le pécheur et la pénitence au Moyen Age, (Paris, 1969).

-----: "Les rites de la célébration du mariage: leur signification dans la formation du lien durant le haut Moyen Age", Il matrimonio nella società

- altomedievale, Spoletto, 24, (1977), pp.399-472.
- : Les "Libri Poenitentiales", [Typologie des sources du moyen âge occidental, Fasc.27], (Turnhout, 1978).
- : Medieval Liturgy. An Introduction to the Sources. [Revised and trans. W.G. Storey and N. Rasmussen], (Washington, 1986).
- WALLACE-HADRILL, John Michael, The Frankish Church, (Oxford, 1983).
- WARD, Elizabeth, "Caesar's Wife: the Career of the Empress Judith, 819-829" in R. Collins and P. Godman, (eds.), Charlemagne's Heir. New Perspectives on the Reign of Louis the Pious, (Oxford, 1990), pp.205-27.
- : "Agobard of Lyons and Paschasius Radbertus as critics of the Empress Judith", SCH, 27 (1990), pp.15-25.
- WARD, Benedicta, Miracles and the Medieval Mind. Theory, Record and Event. 1000-1215. (London, 1982).
- WARNER, Marina, Alone of all her Sex: the myth and cult of the Virgin Mary, (London, 1976).
- : Joan of Arc. The image of female heroism, (London, 1981).
- WEINSTEIN, Donald and BELL, Rudolf M., Saints and Society (Chicago, London 1982).
- WEMPLE, Suzanne Fonay, Women in Frankish Society. Marriage and the Cloister 500 - 900, (Philadelphia, 1981).
- : "Sanctity and Power: the Dual Pursuit of Early Medieval Women", in R. Bridenthall, C. Koonz and S.M. Stuard, (eds.), Becoming Visible, (Boston, 1987), pp.131-51.
- : "Female Monasticism in Italy and its Comparison with France and Germany from the Ninth through the Eleventh Century" in W. Affeldt, (ed.), Frauen in Spätantike und Frühmittelalter, (Sigmaringen, 1990), pp.291-310.
- WERMINGHOFF, A., "Die Beschlüsse des Aachener Concils im Jahre 816", NA, 27 (1901), pp.605-75.
- WHITAKER, E.C., Documents of the Baptismal Liturgy, [Alcuin Club Collection 42], (London, 1960).
- WOLLASCH, J., "Eine adlige Familie des frühen Mittelalters: Ihr Selbstverständnis und ihre Wirklichkeit", Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, 39, (1957), pp.150-188.
- WORMALD, Patrick, "Lex Scripta and Verbum Regis: Legislation and Germanic Kingship, from Euric to Cnut", in P. Sawyer and I.N. Wood, (eds.), Early Medieval

Kingship, (Leeds, 1979), pp.105-138.

YORKE, Barbara, "Sisters under the Skin?", Anglo-Saxon Nuns and Nunneries in Southern England", Reading Medieval Studies, XV, (1989), pp.95-117.

ZIMMERMAN, Odo J. (trans.), Gregory the Great's Dialogues, [The Fathers of the Church, vol.39], (Washington, D.C., 1977).